

# Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Zambia office: October, 2011

Country	The Project for the Improvement and Maintenance of Lusaka City Roads, Phase III
Zambia	

## I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 679 million yen	Contract Amount: 678 million yen									
E/N Date	July, 2005										
Completion Date	November, 2006										
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Local Government and Housing (MLGH)										
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: August 2004 (Implementation Review Study)										
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	Japan Engineering Consultants									
	Contractor(s)	Shimizu Corporation									
	Supplier(s)	N/A									
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperations: The Project for the Improvement and Maintenance of Lusaka City Roads, Phase I (1995) and Phase II (2000) (JICA Grant Aid)										
Background	In Lusaka City, the capital of Zambia, 47% (750km) of total 1,600km roads were unpaved, and the rest got low-cost pavement 25 years ago. Roads were heavily damaged. Following the rapid growth in population and socio-economic activities, rehabilitation of city roads was urgent. The preceding phases of the project (Phase I and II) improved a total 51km of arterial, industrial and commercial roads as well as connection roads to compounds. However, large portions, especially collector roads, still remained in poor conditions.										
Project Objectives	<b>Outcome</b> To ensure year-round smooth traffic by improving four selected collector roads in the City of Lusaka.										
	<b>Outputs</b> Japanese Side Improvement of four collector roads in Lusaka City. <table border="1" data-bbox="327 981 791 1149"> <tr> <td>Bauleni Road</td> <td>1.08km</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kaleya-Ngombe Road</td> <td>0.88km</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kasangula Road</td> <td>5.26km</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Chitanda Road</td> <td>3.32km</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>10.50km</td> </tr> </table> Zambia Side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Relocation of two poles along Kasangula road</li> <li>• Coordination with related organizations (bus companies, police, utility companies)</li> </ul>		Bauleni Road	1.08km	Kaleya-Ngombe Road	0.88km	Kasangula Road	5.26km	Chitanda Road	3.32km	Total
Bauleni Road	1.08km										
Kaleya-Ngombe Road	0.88km										
Kasangula Road	5.26km										
Chitanda Road	3.32km										
Total	10.50km										

## II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<p>In Lusaka City, nearly half of the roads were still unpaved and many roads were heavily damaged, and thus rehabilitation of city roads was urgent.</p> <p>Following the two preceding phases, this project has largely achieved the objective of ensuring year-round smooth traffic as shown by the fact that vehicle travel speed mostly achieved the target and that there is no impassability any more. As for sustainability, there was no serious problem observed in structural, technical and financial aspects for continuity of the project effectiveness as well as the current good status of operation and maintenance: the project roads are generally well maintained under the outsourced contract by Lusaka City Council, which allocates a budget for road maintenance.</p> <p>For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Zambia's development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency as well, both the project cost and project period were almost within the plan. In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

I Relevance
<p>The project has been highly relevant with Zambia's development plan (infrastructure development strategies as set in national development plans: 2006-2010 and 2011-2015), development needs (urgent rehabilitation of unmaintainable roads), as well as Japan's ODA policy (Country Assistance Policy for Zambia in 2002), at the time of planning and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.</p>

## 2 Efficiency

Both project period and project costs were as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%, 100%). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

## 3 Effectiveness/Impact

The project has largely achieved its objectives as shown by the good surface conditions which ensured year-round smooth traffic flows as anticipated in the ex-ante period.

Regarding vehicle travel speed, data was not available from Lusaka City Council (LCC) that is in charge of operation and maintenance of the roads developed by the project, since they do not collect such data officially. However, based on the driving survey by JICA at the time of the ex-post evaluation, it was found that the average travel speed was slightly lower than the target value, i.e., 40Km/h target value against 35Km/h actual in the survey at the ex-post evaluation. This could be attributed to the fact that Kaleya-Ngombe road recorded the lowest average travel speed presumably because of the prolonged curve it has towards Ngombe. However, on the other roads (Bauleni road, Kasangula road and Chitanda road), the target was achieved.

Also, it was observed that the project roads generally have good surface conditions. Based on interviews with residents and shop owners near the project sites, it is understood that the improvement of the roads have contributed to better living environment of the compounds, providing them better access to social facilities such as schools and clinics, and that economic activities involving transportation and shops have increased as a result of the project.

No significant negative impact was observed in terms of the natural environment. There were no resident relocations reported.

Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is high.

### Quantitative Effects

Indicator(unit)	2004 (Baseline year)	Target value	Actual value	
		2008	2008(Target year)	2011 (Ex-post evaluation year)
Vehicle travel speed (km/h)	approx. 20	approx. 40 <sup>(*)</sup>  *intended for commune travel time by bus	not available	Bauleni Road: 40 Kaleya-Ngombe Road: 20 Kasangula Road: 40 Chitanda Road: 40 Average: 35
Number of days of impassability on bus routes (days/year)	83	-	not available	No days impassable.

Data Source: Project site visit and assessment on 6 October 2011



**Bauleni Road.** This road leads to community market and schools. Road is effectively used as Public Bus route (Blue mini-buses are shown). The project roads are generally well maintained.



**Kasangula Road.** This road is effectively functioning as by-pass between two trunk roads within the Lusaka City. The project roads are generally well maintained.



**Chitanda Road.** This road leads to schools. Road is effectively used as Public Bus route (Blue mini-buses are shown) and providing safety to the students. The project roads are generally well maintained.

## 4 Sustainability

The organization responsible for operation and maintenance of city roads in Lusaka City is Technical Department of LCC. No major concerns were noted in the structural, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency as well as current status of operation and maintenance: routine maintenance of city roads is outsourced to private companies through performance contracts, and LCC allocates a budget for it. The roads developed by the project have generally good surface conditions. Although Bauleni road has some problems in maintenance (i.e., erratic maintenance by the contractor on some of the portions is reported), it is not a serious problem for continuity of the project effects. Therefore, sustainability of this project is high.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for the Implementing agency:

It is recommended that LCC supervise the outsourced maintenance contractor's performance more frequently, as during the site interview, some road users and residents raised concern on the erratic maintenance carried out by the contractor on some of the portions.