

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Vietnam Office: October, 2011

Country	The Project for the Improvement of Hoa Binh General Hospital
Viet Nam	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 967 million yen	Contract Amount: 941 million yen
E/N Date	August, 2005	
Completion Date	March, 2007	
Implementing Agency	Hoa Binh General Hospital	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: November 2004 - July 2005	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	Nihon Sekkei – Medical Engineering Planning (JV)
	Contractor(s)	Toda Corporation
	Supplier(s)	Sirius Corporation
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperation: The Project for Strengthening Health Service Provision in Hoa Binh Province (2004-2009) (JICA Technical Cooperation)	
Background	Hoa Binh province is located in the mountainous North West region, where health conditions were poorer than other areas in the Northern Vietnam. Hoa Binh General Hospital was the only secondary health institution in the province, while the tertiary institution was located in Hanoi, two-hour away by car. Due to old and obsolete facilities/equipment and poor human resources, the Hospital could not play a role as a secondary health institution. Therefore, the government of Vietnam requested the government of Japan for grant aid to renovate the Hospital.	
Project Objectives	Outcome To improve medical services of Hoa Binh General Hospital by construction of facilities and procurement of medical equipment.	
	Outputs Japanese Side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilities: High Tech Block (operation theaters, laboratory, ICU, etc) and Mechanical Block (incinerator, sewage treatment, etc.) - Equipment: X ray, sterilizers, centrifuge, etc. - Software component: awareness raising and technical transfer in operation and maintenance and medical waste treatment Vietnam Side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Demolition of existing wards - Connection of utilities (approx. 500m) - Drainage - Others (blinds, general furniture, etc) 	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<p>Hoa Binh General Hospital had difficulties in playing a role of the only secondary health institution of Hoa Binh Province, where health conditions were poor but there was no tertiary institution, because of its old and obsolete facilities/equipment and poor human resources. Therefore, the renovation of the Hospital was of urgent need at the time of ex-ante evaluation.</p> <p>The project has largely achieved its objectives as expected in the basic design. It has achieved the improved medical services of Hoa Binh General Hospital. Nowadays, the Hospital has been playing a leading role in the health system of the province, supporting 9 district hospitals in transferring new technique, providing refresh training for hospital staff and enhancing the function of referral system. As for sustainability, several problems have been observed in maintenance of facility and medical equipment due to difficulties in budget allocation.</p> <p>Regarding the relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Vietnam's and the province's development policy, development needs as well as Japan' ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For the efficiency, project cost and implementation period were within the plan.</p> <p>In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance
<p>This project has been highly relevant with the Vietnam's development plan, namely the Five-year Plan (2001-2005 and 2006-2010) of the Health Sector Development of Vietnam, development needs, namely the Action Plan of Health Sector of Hoa Binh Province, as well as Japan's ODA policy (Country Assistance Program for Vietnam), at the time of planning/ ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the relevance is high.</p>
2 Efficiency
<p>Both project period and project cost were within the plan. Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.</p>

3 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has largely achieved its objective of improving medical services of Hoa Binh General Hospital as shown in the improvement in basic hospital performance indicators (such as the number of referred patients and the number of examinations) year by year. Also, based on questionnaire answers by- and interviewing with officers of Department of Health (DOH) of Hoa Binh Province and of Hoa Binh General Hospital, the examination and treatment capacity was increased by the new facilities and equipment, and efficiency of services was improved by centralization of medical care. Furthermore, education and training for primary health institutions as well as collaboration with tertiary health institutions have improved. A JICA technical cooperation project also utilized by use of the equipment to strengthen the referral system in the province. In consequence, it is deemed that the project contributed to the improvement of the referral system and training of medical staff belonging to other hospitals in the Province. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact is high.

Quantitative Effects

Indicator(unit)	2003 (BD year)	2007 (Target year)	Actual results	
			2007 (Target year)	2010
No. of patients referred from lower-level health institutions (cases/year)	335	Increase	2,338	6,334
No. of X ray photography (cases/year)	3,300	Increase	26,741	43,444
No. of ultrasonic examinations (cases/year)	8,800	Increase	25,124	29,315

Data source: DOH Hoa Binh Province/Hoa Binh General Hospital



High Tech Block of Hoa Binh General Hospital



Operation theater



Patients at Clinical Imaging Department

4 Sustainability

The institutional aspect of operation and maintenance (O&M) of the facilities and equipment developed by this project has no problem. However, some problems were observed in technical, financial and operation and maintenance aspects mainly due to insufficient staff capacity for preventive maintenance and repair of high-tech medical equipment and the difficulty in allocating sufficient O&M budget. Despite the increasing trend in hospital revenue, the allocation of budget from the central and local governments has been unchanged in current years, and the balance between total revenue and expenditure is still in red. As the budget approval is time-consuming, regular maintenance is not yet done at the time of ex-post evaluation, and replacement of spare parts is still slow. Although some equipment such as biochemical analyzer and anesthesia apparatus with ventilator are taking time to repair, most of provided equipments are in good condition. Therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

The budget allocation to O&M is not sufficient, which is leading to slow response in replacing spare parts and repairing broken down equipments. Thus, it is recommended that the hospital should try further to ensure necessary budget for O&M.

Lessons learned for JICA:

This project is a good example of combination of grant aid and technical cooperation in a way that the facilities and equipment developed by the grant aid project created an incentive for the recipient organization to be proactive in the technical cooperation project and thus to strengthen their capacity in a sustainable way.