

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Pakistan Office: October, 2011

Country	The Project for the Renovation of Islamabad Children's Hospital
Pakistan	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 647 million yen	Contract Amount: 583 million yen
E/N Date	August, 2005	
Completion Date	March, 2007	
Implementing Agency	Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS)	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: November 2004 - March 2005	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	K.I.T.O Architects & Engineers
	Contractor(s)	Tobishima Corporation
	Supplier(s)	Itochu Corporation, Iwatani Corporation
Related Projects (if any)	The Project for Construction of Islamabad Children's Hospital (1982 and 1983) (JICA Grant Aid), Islamabad Children's Hospital (1986-1993) (JICA Technical Cooperation), The Project for Rehabilitation of the Children Hospital Islamabad (2003) (JICA Grant Aid)	
Background	In Pakistan, there was an increasing need for the neonatal, infant and child health services due mainly to a high population growth rate during the last three decades which is still estimated to be close to 2% per annum. Islamabad Children's Hospital, a tertiary health institution and an educational hospital constructed in 1885 with assistance from Japan, had two surgery beds per operating room considering insufficient number of medical staff. However, under the circumstances where the Hospital dealt with more advanced surgery than before and the application of international standards more strictly for infection prevention, the surgery beds had to be separated and the quantity and quality of the facilities had to be improved. Therefore, the government of Pakistan requested the government of Japan for grant aid to develop facilities for surgery.	
Project Objectives	Outcome To improve medical service provided by Islamabad Children's Hospital by construction of a new operation theater, renovation of the existing operation theaters and procurement of related medical equipment.	
	Outputs Japanese Side Construction of an operation theater, renovation of the existing operation theaters, rehabilitation of waste water treatment facilities, and replacement of medical equipment Pakistan Side Site clearance, temporary construction works, relocation of existing facilities and pipelines	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<p>In response to the increasing need for the neonatal, infant and child health services, Islamabad Children's Hospital needed to provide better services in terms of quantity and quality, but the existing facilities and equipment of operation rooms were insufficient.</p> <p>This project has achieved the improvement of medical services of the Children's Hospital due to the fact that the average number of operations per day increased to 24 in 2011 from the figure of 15 that was recorded at the time of the ex-ante evaluation, and a general feeling of satisfaction among the doctors and the patients on the provision of facilities under the project and quality of treatment extended. As for sustainability, problems have been observed in terms of structural, technical, financial and current status of operation and maintenance aspects due to several factors including the abolishment of the Ministry of Health, the former parent Ministry of the PIMS in June 2011, understaffing for maintenance and unavailability of manuals and refresher trainings for technical staff. Nevertheless, the PIMS is currently working on these issues such as formulation of policies/procedures of a new administrative agency, and the situation in operation and maintenance has much improved compared to the observation made last year.</p> <p>For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Pakistan's development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency as well, both the project cost and the project period were within the plan.</p> <p>In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance
<p>This project has been highly relevant with the Pakistan's development plan (decrease in child and maternal mortality as set in national five-year plans up to 1998, Medium-term Development Framework 2005-2010, Vision 2030), development needs (need for better child health care and importance of Islamabad Children's Hospital as a top referral not only for the region but also for nationwide), as well as Japan's ODA policy (decrease in child and maternal mortality and strengthening health services and infrastructure) at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.</p>
2 Efficiency
<p>Both project cost and project period were within the plan (ratio against plan: 90%, 100%). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.</p>

3 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has largely achieved its objectives. In the quantitative aspects, the number of surgery cases has shown a sharp increase in 2010 from the time of Ex-Ante. The number of tests has also shown a rise. However, operation waiting time was below the expected level at ex-post evaluation due to several reasons including the tremendous increase in outpatients and the consequent shortage of manpower, which also caused underutilization of OT5, one operation theater out of the three developed by this project. Currently, budget to employ additional human resources to run OT5 is not available due to the overall financial crunch of the country, but this issue is under consideration of PIMS with the related authorities. The number of ultrasonic tests did not increase due to installation of ultrasonic machines in other hospitals as well. In the qualitative aspects, there is a greater trust of patients in the health delivery services and in the ability of Islamabad Children's Hospital to handle complex cases in an expert manner. The inflow of patients from as far as Afghanistan reflects its visible effect and its position as the leading tertiary care hospital for child health for very large catchment areas. There is no apparent negative impact on the environment through the disposal of the waste water emitted from the hospital, though monitoring of quality of discharged water is currently not conducted. However, the PIMS has submitted a request to the government for budget appropriation for Hospital Waste Management. Therefore, its effectiveness / impact is high.



Operation Theater equipment has made doctors task of conducting operation easy



Pediatric surgeon examining report of patient suffering from upper lip cleft

Quantitative Effects

Indicator(unit)	2004 (BD year)	Plan	Actual results		
		2010 (Target year)	2009/2010* (Target year)	2011 (Ex-post evaluation year)	
No. of operations, minor & major (cases/year and cases/day)	4,500 per year or 15 per day	5,400 per year or 18.75 per day	6,699 per year	24 per day	
Waiting time for operation (months)	6	4.5	6	6	
No. of diagnoses and tests	X-ray (per day)	54-59	69-74	182	Not available
	Ultrasonic (per day)	12-15	18-23	13	
	Clinical test (per year)	189,400	353,500	338,567	Not available
Amount of waste water treatment (m ³ /day)	0	20	20	20	

Source: Statistics Section PIMS and Health Management Information System in Islamabad Children's Hospital.

Note: * Pakistan's fiscal year (July to June)

4 Sustainability

In the structural aspect, there is some uncertainty due to the abolishment of Ministry of Health under which PIMS used to be positioned. Currently the PIMS is in the phase of finalizing the policies and procedures with a new administrative/supervising agency. Apart from that, the project is facing problems in the technical aspect due to inadequate assignment of engineering staff for the upkeep of the equipment and unavailability of manuals and refresher trainings for the staff. Similarly the deficient budget has hindered the timely replacement of essential equipment and spare parts with the result that the O&M standards have become difficult to maintain. Nevertheless, these problems have not seriously affected the continuity of the project effectiveness as it was observed that the day to day working of the hospital is well managed and the number of surgical operations diagnoses/ tests has been increasing to date (see Effectiveness/Impact above). Therefore, the sustainability of the project is fair.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- The PIMS's efforts for effective utilization of OT5 should be accelerated in order to meet rising demand of the patients requiring surgical procedures.
- Continuous efforts to ensure proper and sustainable funding for operation and maintenance.
- Human Resource Development and Strategy (on the number of staff and refresher training) is required especially in the fields of neurosurgery, trauma and plastic surgery exclusively for Islamabad Children's Hospital.