

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Pacific Department (Palau Representative Office): October, 2011

Country	The Project for the Improvement of North Dock of Peleliu State
Palau	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 581 million yen	Contract Amount: 577 million yen
E/N Date	December 2005 (Extension: October 2006)	
Completion Date	February 2007	
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Resources and Development, Department of Marine Resources	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: July 2005 to January 2006	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant	Echo Corporation
	Contractor	Penta-Ocean Construction Co., Ltd.
	Supplier	N/A
Related Projects (if any)	Project for the Development of the Fishing Community in Peleliu State (1998) Project for the Improvement of Fishery Infrastructure in Kayangel State (2002) Embassy of Japan Grant Assistance for Grassroots Project(GCP) for Peleliu State Emergency Boat	
Background	<p>The Republic of Palau consists of many small islands with population of 19,129 (according to the 2000's national census). The State of Peleliu which constitutes 3% of total population has 5% of total fishing hauls of Palau, next to the Koror State and the Airai State. And the stimulation of the fishing industry was the key for its regional development of the State.</p> <p>North Dock in the Peleliu State, which has served as a major base for promoting the fishing industry, has had multiple function, such as the port of landing of fish catches, the supply and refill base for boats and the anchorage areas for passengers and cargos. Having been deteriorated across the ages, the North Dock could not serve well enough to meet the current demand. In order to secure the smooth distribution of goods and population, and thus to activate the fishing industry, it is imperative, therefore, to renovate the North Dock.</p>	
Project Objectives	<p>Outcome</p> <p>To increase the efficiency in landing of fish catches and in operation of regular liners by renovation and upgrading the North Dock of the Peleliu State such as renovating the fishing boats dock, dredging of anchorage and water channel and having beacons equipped, etc.</p>	
	<p>Outputs</p> <p>Japanese side</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To extend and renovate the existing pier - To dredge the water channel and anchorage - To have beacon equipped <p>Palau side</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To provide the temporary construction yard to be used during the construction period - To secure the land for disposing of boulders removed from dredging and construction waste soil - To obtain the approvals related to the administrative proceedings, such as banking - To renovate the existing roads (in case of any defects due to the construction) 	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<p>In the Republic of Palau, 70% of total population is concentrated on the Koror State, thus strong ties with the State in supply of fishery products and transportations, is absolutely imperative for rural states to vitalize the local economy. Main industries in the State of Peleliu are tourism and fishery; however, the port facilities such as the North Dock had not served well to meet the current demand. Vessels often had to wait at off-island while the port has been congested with many vessels. Or the large vessels had to slow down at the certain tidal range. Such inconveniences and insufficient capacity of the North Dock has become an issue for the regional development of the Peleliu State.</p> <p>The project has achieved its objectives in reduction of waiting time at off-island and increasing number of days for large vessel laden with to travel, thus the economy of the state has been activated by increasing the efficiency in landing of fish catches and in increasing the number of tourists, As for the sustainability, there are some problems such that engineers have not received sufficient trainings to maintain the skills for dredging and bathymetry, and costly maintenance work such as dredging has been often procrastinated due to the budgetary constraint. For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Palau's development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, both the project cost and the project period were almost as planned.</p> <p>In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance

The project is highly relevant with Palau's development plan in increasing the employment and the revenues of the fishing industry and improving the port facilities and distribution channels to cope with the domestic demands, development needs in securing the smooth distribution of goods and population by renovation of North Dock, as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

Both project cost and project period were almost as planned (ratio against the plan 99% and 100% respectively). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

3 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has largely achieved its objectives in increasing the efficiency in landing of fish catches and in improving the operation of regular liners. As a result, the waiting time for vessels at off-island was reduced, the large vessels can travel on a daily basis, and time required for vessels to travel over the port was reduced. According to the interviews with those concerned at the Peleliu State Government, (1) with the pier expansion, many vessels can berth along with large vessels and safety of operation and landing has been improved; (2) reduction of waiting time for vessels at off-island has greatly contributed to saving time for storage work, at the same time, fishing products can easily be stored in fresh condition; and (3) the time of distribution for the fish product to the point of consumption, Koror, was minimized.

Furthermore, the project has also stimulated the economy by increasing the number of tourists, by activating fisheries (number of fishing vessels increased from 18 in 2008 to 22 in 2011), by securing the supplies of ordinary goods. In addition, it was confirmed that the aid to navigation equipped at the off-shore has helped increase the safety for vessels to travel in the harbor.

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.



Expanded part and large vessel



Aid to navigation

Quantitative Effects

Indicators	Baseline value (2005:Basic Design year)	Target value (2008:Target year)	Actual value (2008:Target year)	Actual value (2011:Ex-post evaluation year)
1) Reduction of waiting time at off-island	Impossible to berthing while the vessel is tied up.	Possible to berthing	No waiting time at off-island	No waiting time at off-island
2) Number of days for large vessel laden with to travel	44 days	323 days	365 days	365 days
3) Time required for large vessel to travel (5.5km)	55 minutes	30 minutes	15-30 minutes	In general, 15 to 30 minutes If the low tide coincides with spring tide, the ship needs to travel in slow pace (30 to 60 minutes) to protect the body.

(Data Source : Questionnaires and interviews with those concerned of Peleliu State Government)

Additional information : The number of tourists by year who visited Peleliu Island

Year	2008	2009	2010
Number of tourists	1,069	2,955	3,875

(Data Source : Provincial Office of Peleliu State Government)

4 Sustainability

The North Dock has been well-maintained since its completion on February 2007. According to the interviews with those concerned at the Peleliu State Government and the site visits, it was confirmed that there was no problem on institutional and operational aspect; however, some problems on the technical and financial aspects, and current status were identified. Engineers have not received the sufficient trainings to maintain skills for dredging and bathymetry, and costly maintenance work such as dredging has been often procrastinated due to the budgetary constraint. Therefore, the sustainability of the project is fair. No dredging has been done after the completion of the project, and the large vessels should slow down at the limited tidal range, but this has not had any negative impact on the port operation.



Partially delaminated concrete

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

In order to cope with the situation of which large vessels should slow down at the certain tidal range, it is recommended that the project should take into consideration of the cost-effective way for dredging, such as simply vacuuming up the seabed sand. And it is recommended that the Department of Marine Resources should secure the budget for such dredging work.

Lessons learned for JICA:

Dredging project often requires the large scale of funds as well as the procurement of specialized equipment. It is recommended, therefore, that JICA should also think of alternative measures which may fit into the technical capacity of counterpart agency, such as the measure of simply vacuuming up the seabed sand.