

評価調査結果要約表（英文）

Summary of Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project	
Country: Cambodia	Project Name: The Capacity Building for the Forestry Sector Phase II
Issue/Sector: Natural Resource Management	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division or Office in charge: JICA Cambodia Office	Total Cost: 477 million yen
Duration of Cooperation	December 15, 2005 – December 14, 2010
	Partner Country's Implementing Agency: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries Supporting Agency in Japan: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
<p>1-1. Background of the Project</p> <p>The Kingdom of Cambodia is known as a country with rich forests and natural resources. According to the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nation (FAO), the forests in the country totalled over 13 million hectares, or more than 70% of the total land area (about 18 million ha) in the 1960s. However, for over 40 years, especially the last 20 years after the civil war, forests have been constantly damaged and devastated. In 2003, the total area of forest was estimated at about 11.4 million hectares or about 62.7% of the total land area¹. Forest cover ratio is very differs in each province and municipality, such as forest ratio of Preah Vihear is shown as 95.3% and Phnom Penh is no remaining of forest. The direct causes of deforestation, or degradation of forests, are mainly illegal logging and encroachment of the forests for expansion of agricultural land.</p> <p>On the other hand, poverty is widespread with 36 percent of the rural population, some 4.5 million people, are living below the poverty line², and the economic gap between the rich and poor is widening. The majority of the population is dependent on agriculture and access to natural resources. It means the majority people remain vulnerable and rely on natural resources due to land shortage, increasing population, poor harvest and others.</p> <p>Today is more serious issue relating to forest-clearing for personal land grabbing ambition of those rich and powerful individuals. In detail, there is on the increase along with the lack of lands for farming and building residential houses for the people. At the same time, forestland has been diminished because of illegal logging and land encroachment ruing the past decade. The forestland in concessions also were poorly managed and exploited by the companies.</p> <p>If forests are well managed, it is a great potential to lift millions of people out of poverty, through improved</p>	

¹ Forestry Statistics in Cambodia in 2004 (FA)

² Less than US\$1 per day

and enhanced livelihoods and indirectly, through their contribution to the national economy. In fact, forests in Cambodia are one of the important resources for the country's economy and for people. Over 90% of the households in Cambodia use firewood and charcoal for fuel³.

In this situation, proper forest resource management is one of the prime concerns in Cambodia's domestic policy. In parallel, there is a pressing need to train FA staff, but FA did not have a training system with regular courses for its own staff. In April 1999, the Cambodian government requested the Government of Japan to assist human resource development of FA.

The Capacity Building Project for the Forestry Sector in Kingdom of Cambodia (hereinafter referred to as the Phase I Project) commenced in December 2001 under the collaboration with JICA.

The Phase I Project trained in three years approximately 1,500 foresters on forestry law, community forestry, nursery, silviculture, forest/wildlife management and measurement. In successfully provided trainees with basic knowledge on the subjects and raised their awareness of their duties defined by the Forestry Law. However, the final evaluation team of the Phase I Project found out that trainees' application of acquired skills and knowledge needs improvement. This is partially due to the short course duration and insufficient field practice.

The Royal Government of Cambodia requested the Government of Japan to extend its technical assistance for five years. In response, JICA sent the preliminary study team to confirm the needs for assistance and to discuss the details of the Project. The Record of Discussion was signed on December 14, 2005.

1-2. Master Plan of the Project

Overall Goal

Sustainable community resources utilization by local people is secured in the area conducted participatory community resources management.

Project Purposes

Through the capacity building of Forestry Administration (FA) officers, sustainable utilization of community resources is secured for stabilizing the living of local people in the Field Project (FP) sites.

Outputs

Output 0

Preparation of the Project activities and the training for first FP sites and local FA who are not in the FP sites are completed.

Output 1

Community resources are managed properly in the FP sites through smooth implementation of the CF activities and other relevant activities.

Output 2

³ Cambodia Millennium Development Goals Report 2003 (Royal Government of Cambodia)

Importance of community resources, including forestry resources, is recognized by local people in the FP sites.

Output 3

Practical knowledge and skills, which can be utilized for local people's needs, are obtained by local FA officers in the FP sites.

Output 4

Practical knowledge and skills are obtained by local FA officers through efficient and effective training for their utilization in the office and/or fields.

1-3. Inputs

1-3-1. Cambodian side

1) Allocation of Counterparts (C/P)	Total	46 persons
2) Project office and other facilities		
3) Local Cost	Total	129,000 USD

1-3-2. Japanese Side

1) Dispatch of Experts

Long-term Experts

Chief Advisor	5.1 M/M
Chief Advisor / Participatory Forest Mgmt.	24.0 M/M
Chief Advisor / Training Plan and Mgmt	21.6 M/M
4) Village Resource Management	13.8 M/M
5) Coordinator / Village Dev. And Extension	19.7 M/M
6) Training in Forestry Sector / Coordinator	24.0 M/M
7) Community Forestry / Coordinator	35.0 M/M
8) Community Forestry II	29.6 M/M

Short-term Experts

1) Community Forestry	1.9M/M
2) Training Plan	1.0M/M
3) Community Forestry / Coordination w/WB PJ	7.6M/M
Total	183.3M/M

2) C/Ps Training in Japan

A total of twenty-nine (29) personnel trained in Japan.

3) Provision of Equipment

Total Amount of Provision Equipment	125,774USD
-------------------------------------	------------

4) Local Cost

Total Disbursement of Local Cost by Japanese side	785,517USD
---	------------

II. Members of Evaluation Team				
Mission Members	Team Leader	Mr. Hitoshi HIRATA	Senior Representative, JICA Cambodia Office	
	Forestry Management	Mr. Mikihiro INOUE	Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	
	Evaluation and Analysis	Ms. Yoshiko TAKAHASHI	Y's Consulting Office Co., Ltd.	
	Evaluation Management 1	Mr. Yukihiro SHIBUYA	Representative, JICA Cambodia Office	
	Evaluation Management 2	Ms. Ayako OSADA	National Staff, JICA Cambodia Office	
Period of Evaluation	June 13, 2010 – June 25, 2010		Type of Evaluation	Terminal Evaluation
III. Results of Evaluation				
<p>3-1. Summary of Evaluation Results</p> <p>3-1-1. Achievement of Outputs</p> <p>Output 0</p> <p>Output 0 has been produced.</p> <p>The guideline has been revised under Output 1 as “FP Manual (ver.2)”. The training curriculum and materials had revised and Training Plan had prepared and the trainers list has been prepared in 2006.</p> <p>Output 1</p> <p>Output 1 has been produced partly. In Boeng Kok CF, almost completed all planned activities. In 2nd targeted five (5) CFs, some livelihood and other activities are still under implementation. On CF legalization, none of the CF out of seven (7) CFs has reached to step 8 (Objectively Verifiable Indicator 1-a.), although there are some progress has been made in each CF. The Project confirmed that most of the CFs have exchanged information each other on a routine basis (OVI 1-b.). Some CFs have started collecting membership fees, they are facing difficulties on collection and the saving amount are still very small. The results of the survey indicate that 88% to 100% of CF members interviewed mentioned that the amount of forest resources has increased in each CF (OVI 1-c.). The 2nd targeted five (5) CFs had started FP activities in December 2008 and some activities have not been started yet at the time of Terminal Evaluation. It is uncertain if these activities would contribute to produce Output 1 and contribute to upper project purpose level by the end of the Project.</p> <p>Output 2</p> <p>Output 2 has been produced fully.</p> <p>It seems CF members understood clearly about the importance of community resources. The Project utilized the previous CF assistance by the other NGOs and donors since their establishment.</p>				

Output 3

Output 3 has been produced.

100% of interviewed CF members in each CF mentioned that all the techniques and information provided by local FA officers are “practical”. It is confirmed that the materials provided by FA offices are utilized by CF members.

In addition, the local FA officers have obtained practical knowledge and skills. According to the results of survey done by the Project on local FA officers in the FP sites (C/Ps of the Project), “FP implementation Affairs”, “Personal Consciousness on Duty” and “Self-evaluation of own work/ability through FP” are marked three highest points. FP Counterparts have been obtained skills and knowledge for CF implementation and they are confident on their work/ability to continue CF activities. On the other hand, there is big gap among local FA officers of their “Basic Administrative skills”.

Output 4

Output 4 has been produced, although it is lower than expected level on the indicators.

According to the results of questionnaire survey on three hundred thirty one (331) ex-trainees done by the Project in December 2009, the 22% of ex-trainees answers “Yes” to the question “Do you gained your knowledge and skills sufficiently assist you”, the 33% answers “No” and the 39% does not answer. The 55% of them answers “Happy with the gain knowledge”, “Remained unclear” 2%, “Do not solve your issue” 1%, “Need more training” 24% and the 18% does not answer for the question “After attending training course, how do you feel”. For the utilization of skills and knowledge, the 47% of ex-trainees utilized them, the 6% of them not utilized and the 47% does not answer. The 38% of the Chiefs answers to the quality of trained staff is “Applicable”, and the 61% answers “Some (skills & knowledge) applicable”. There were some comments from interviewees on trainees’ selection. Some selected trainees were not in charge of the activities relating to the training subjects.

3-1-2. Achievement of the Project Purpose

Project Purpose

Through the capacity building of Forestry Administration (FA) officers, sustainable utilization of community resources is secured for stabilizing the living of local people in the Field Project (FP) sites.

OVI: At each target CF, method and know-how to secure sustainable utilization of community resources are obtained by 70% of CF members by the end of the Project.

On average 51% of interviewed CF members are “applied” transferred techniques and information. In addition, 68% of interviewed CF members are “involved” in their planned activities. Through those activities, CF members are transferred practical method and know-how from the local FA officers and/or other trainers. In the new five (5) CFs targeted in December 2008 (2nd targeted CFs), although the activities related on Plan/Review, CF legalization, CF patrolling, Boundary demarcation / Boundary post setting / Map signboard installation have been implemented, livelihood activities and some other activities

have not been started yet at the time of Terminal Evaluation study. Therefore, it is still uncertain if these techniques are enough to secure sustainable utilization of community resources and it is difficult to prospect full achievement of the Project Purpose at the present moment.

3-2. Results of Evaluation by Five Criteria

Evaluation results are graded by five ranks of “Very High”, “High”, “Fair”, “Low” and “Very Low”.

3-2-1. Relevance

Relevance of the Project is evaluated “High”.

The Overall Goal is still relevant with needs of targeted area and society. The Project Purpose is still relevant with needs of Target Groups of the Project. Most of the local people in the FP sites have been depending on agriculture and community resources for their livelihood. However, it is well recognized that the land development has been expanding rapidly and it threatens the sustainable use of community resources by local people. The government of Cambodia regards CF as potential measures to sustainable community resources management. According to the Forest Law, the local FA office should fulfill roles supporting local people on CF legalization. In this manner, it is crucial to train local FA officers in Cambodia. The Overall Goal and the Project Purpose are still relevant with Cambodian National Policies. According to “National Forest Programme (NFP)” (2010), there are six (6) priority issues; 1)Forest Demarcation, Classification and Registration, 2)Conservation and Forest Resource Development and Biodiversity, 3)Forest Law Enforcement and Governance, 4)Community Forestry, 5)Capacity and Research Development and 6) Sustainable Forest Financing.

3-2-2. Effectiveness

Effectiveness of the Project is evaluated “Fair”.

On average 51% of interviewed CF members are “applied” transferred techniques and information. Through those activities, CF members are transferred practical method and know-how from the local FA officers and/or other trainers. In the new five (5) CFs targeted in December 2008 (2nd targeted CFs), although the activities related on Plan/Review, CF legalization, CF patrolling, Boundary demarcation / Boundary post setting / Map signboard installation have been implemented, livelihood activities and some other activities have not been started yet at the time of Terminal Evaluation study. Therefore, it is still uncertain if these techniques are enough to secure sustainable utilization of community resources and it is difficult to prospect achievement of the Project Purpose at the present moment.

Output 0, Output 1, Output 2 and Output 3 have contributed to the Project Purpose. Especially Output 3 has contributed directly to the Project Purpose and it also contributed to Output 1 and Output 2 through the CF/FP activities for the local people in the sites.

One constraint factor to achieve the Project Purpose was non-logical PDM of the each version. Especially, relation between the Project Purpose and their Objectively Verifiable Indicators, relation between the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal, and Output 1, Output 2, Output 3 and their Indicators. Additionally, one more Output for connecting experiences both CF/FP activities and trainings of FWTC should have been set in PDM. The other constraint factor was inappropriate timing for 2nd targeted FP/CF sites

selection to contribute achievement of the Project Purpose.

3-2-3. Efficiency

Efficiency of the Project is evaluated “Fair”.

The Inputs has been appropriate in terms of timing, quantity, quality and cost in order to produce the Outputs of the Project. Some contribution factors are that the provided equipment GPS to FWTC for trainings have transferred to (lend) local FA offices for their boundary measurement.

On the other hand, there are some constraint factors affected to efficiency such as 1) Six (6) C/Ps who were trained in phase I had left the Project in 2006, 2) born insufficient budget for trainings at FWTC by Cambodian side. The cooperation with RECOFTC (NGO) on CF Training of Trainers had delayed one year and C/Ps finally completed trainings in December 2008. Thus the 1st CF training by C/Ps was organized in September 2009. Although those trainers instructed in the four (4) CF trainings and trained eighty-one (81) trainees, this event was also one of the constraint factors affected to efficiency.

3-2-4. Impact

Impact of the Project is evaluated “Fair”.

1) Prospect to achieve Overall Goal

It is too early to prospect to achieve Overall Goal, although several positive impacts of the Project are observed.

2) Other unintended Impacts by the Project implementation

The following positive impacts are observed. A total of 54 % of ex-trainee (331) shared the skills and knowledge with other people after the training, and 43% of them shared with co-leagues. The result of interview survey shows many of them instructed or shared usage of GPS. A local FA officer in Krayea FAT mentioned that FA officer was invited to the meeting for commune development plan formulation.

3-2-5. Sustainability

Sustainability of the Project is evaluated “Low”.

1) Organizational sustainability (Fair)

From the result of questionnaire to the FA management in central, Acting Director of Institute of Forest-Wildlife Research and Development (IRD) (on behalf of Project director), Deputy Head of FA (Project Manager) and Deputy chief of IRD (Deputy Project manager) mentioned that FA will continue to provide trainings for the local FA officers and also to implement CF after the Project. FWTC has enough experiences to provide trainings on Forest Management Plan (FMP), silviculture and CF for FA officers.

The Project approach which carried out FP activities with C/Ps in line with FAC, FAD and FAT had contributed not only smooth implementation but also capacity development on individual local FA offices.

The CF members are likely continuing their livelihood improvement activities by themselves after completion of the Project assistance.

2) Technical Sustainability (high)

Four (4) C/Ps at FWTC have obtained enough technical capacity to organize trainings for FA officers on FMP, Silviculture and CF. C/Ps in FP sites have obtained skills and knowledge especially for CF implementation from the Project activities, although ability and knowledge vary in each local FA officers.

It is confirmed that most of the C/Ps in FP sites are confident with their skills and knowledge on CF/FP implementation as their duty. On the other hand, some of them are still not confident on their Basic administrative skills.

3) Financial Viability (very low)

Japanese side has provided 100% of training expense which cost about 3,500 USD/course and it was planned to be transferred to the Cambodian side gradually from the 3rd year. However, it has not started yet. If there is no financial support from donors or NGOs, then it become difficult for them to utilize their operational capacity developed through the Project activities.

3-3. Factors contributed to the Project

3-3-1. Related to the Project Plan

- The Project has implemented CF/FP activities at seven (7) CFs and all the activities have been carried out based on participatory approaches through the local FA officers. This approach effectively contributed the capacity building of local FA officers and CF groups.
- Livelihood approach as a component with CF legalization and Forestry activities on CF/FP implementation.

3-3-2. Related to the Implementation Process of the Project

- Cooperation with local authorities to implement CF/FP activities effectively.
- Good relationship and communication between local FA officers (C/Ps) and CF members by the role of local FA officers as facilitator.

3-4. Factors inhibited to the Project

3-4-1. Related to the Project Plan

- Although the PDM has been revised several times since preparation period, the logic of current PDM (ver.2) is still not clear. It made stakeholders confused and had negative affect to the Project smooth implementation as confirmed above.

3-4-2. Related to the Project Implementation Process

- Inappropriate timing of implementation for the second selected five (5) CFs in December 2008.
- Insufficient discussion and communication on financial viability among the Project stakeholders.
- Inappropriate project management of Monitoring on achievement of the Project by the Objectively Verifiable Indicators.

4. Conclusion

By the end of the Project duration, it is difficult to prospect full achievement of the Project Purpose at the present moment and it is still uncertain if these techniques are enough to secure sustainable utilization

of community resources. Accordance with sustainability, it is confirmed that the Project should suggest further effective utilization of FWTC from the year 2011 and should discuss on how to improve financial sustainability for the activities after the Project completion. Therefore, the evaluation team considers some recommendations to the Project and the Project will terminate in December 2010 as it planned.

Recommendation

- 1) The Project should compile the materials of trainings and CF/FP implementation in order to share the outcomes of the Project for dissemination.
- 2) The Project should organize a workshop for the stakeholders such as development partners, relevant FA offices and local authorities in Cambodia before December 2010 to share the outcomes and experiences of the Project.
- 3) The Project should suggest further effective utilization of FWTC from the year 2011 in order to sustain the function FWTC.
 - 4) The Project and the FA central should discuss on how to improve financial sustainability for the activities after the Project completion.
 - 5) FA central should make local FA offices continue to support (monitoring, technical support and coordination with other necessary agencies) to CF and the local people.

Lessons learnt

PDM formulation should be carefully examined with clear vision and approach before commencement the Project.

Promoting community resources management needs to involve both central and local authorities. This approach effectively contributes for the capacity building of local line agencies and CF groups.

Promoting legalized community forestry needs to involve both central and local authorities.

The approach to support local people or CF members in livelihood can facilitate CF development effectively. The local FA officers can play roles to facilitate local peoples' livelihood improvement as part of CF development.