

## SUMMARY REPORT OF THE TERMINAL EVALUATION

<b>Outline of the Project</b>	
<b>Country:</b> Kingdom of Cambodia	<b>Project Title:</b> Capacity Development of Provincial Rural Development in Northeastern Provinces (PRDNEP)
<b>Issue/Sector:</b> Governance	<b>Cooperation Scheme:</b> Technical Cooperation
Division in Charge: JICA Cambodia Office	<b>Japan's contribution:</b> 327million Yen
<b>Cooperation Period</b> (R/D): October 2007- March 2011	<b>Partner Country's Implementing Organization:</b> Department of Local Administration, General Department of Local Administration, Ministry of Interior (MoI) Executive Committees of Provincial Rural Development Committee (PRDC/ExComs) in Mondulakiri and Ratanakiri
<b>Related Cooperation Project:</b> None	<b>Supporting Organization in Japan:</b> IC Net Limited. Nippon Koei Limited.
<b>Background of the Project</b>	
<p>Mondulakiri and Ratanakiri Provinces are located in the Northeastern part of Cambodia. Though these Provinces possess adequate natural resources, less priority has been given towards development activities, possibly due to their remote locations as well as a high ratio of tribal population who favour a traditional way of living. In the National MDG Report of Cambodia (2003), the 2 Provinces ranked at the very last end of 24 Provinces in terms of their development level. The 2 Provinces suffered a significant shortage of human resources and local government lacked institutional capacity to promote rural development.</p> <p>Against this backdrop, the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) had requested to conduct development studies in order to formulate a comprehensive development plan in the Northeastern Provinces and technical cooperation projects to support the Provincial Rural Development Committees (PRDC). In response to the request, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) fielded 2 project formulation study missions in 2004 and 2005. Based on the recommendations of the missions, the RGC requested a technical cooperation project for the purpose of human resources development in the Northeastern Provinces. Subsequently, the Ministry of Interior (MoI) and JICA agreed on a 3 1/2 year Project "Capacity Development of Provincial Rural Development in Northeastern Provinces (PRDNEP)" ('the Project') in 2007. The Project commenced its operation in October 2007 and has been focusing on capacity development of local authorities with a view to implement sustainable rural development activities through on-the-job training (OJT) especially for personnel involved in implementing both small-scale infrastructure construction projects as well as managing non-infrastructure projects.</p>	

## Project Overview<sup>4</sup>

### 1 Overall Goal (5-10 years after the Project)

Provincial development is actively and strategically undertaken by the local governments.

### 2 Project Purpose

The capacity of the targeted local governments for promoting sustainable rural development is strengthened.

### 3 Outputs

- (1) Capacity of local government officials in developmental research and analysis is strengthened.
- (2) Capacity of local government officials in rural development planning is strengthened.
- (3) Capacity of local government officials in implementing and managing rural development projects is strengthened.
- (4) Capacity of local government officials in monitoring and evaluation is strengthened.

### 4 Inputs(As of October, 2010)

#### Japanese side:

Experts        8     Equipment        17 million Yen  
Project Implementation Cost     22 million Yen

#### Cambodian Side:

Counterpart   22        Land and Facilities: Project Office, Electricity and Water

### Evaluation Team

#### Members of the Evaluation Team

##### <Cambodian Side>

1. Team Leader: H.E.Mr. Leng Vy, Director General, General Department of Local Administration (GDLA), Ministry of Interior (MoI) (Project Director)
2. Member: Mr. Yin Malyna, Director, Department of Local Administration (DOLA), GDLA, MoI (Project Manager)
3. Member: H.E. Mr. Thang Savun, PRDC/ExCom Rattanakiri Province (Counterpart Personnel)
4. Member: Mr. Hiek Sophan, PRDC/ExCom Mondulakiri Province (Counterpart Personnel)

#### Members of the Evaluation Team

##### <Japanese side>

1. Team Leader: Mr. Yukiharu Kobayashi, Senior Representative, JICA Cambodia Office
2. Local Governance: Mr. Hirofumi Kawakita, JICA Senior Advisor
3. Small-scale Infrastructure: Mr. Osamu Yamada, JICA Senior Advisor

<sup>4</sup> Based on the Project Design Matrix (PDM) 3 as of July 2009, which was used as the basis for the present evaluation exercise.

	4. Evaluation Planning:Ms. Satoko Nadamoto, Project Formulation Advisor, JICA Cambodia Office	
	5. Evaluation Analysis:Ms. Hiroko Tanaka, Global Link Management, Co. Ltd.	
	6. Planning Assistant: Mr. Phok Phira, Program Officer, JICA Cambodia Office	
<b>Period of Evaluation</b>	12-28 October 2010	<b>Type of evaluation:</b> Terminal Evaluation
<b>Results of Evaluation</b>		
<p><b>1. Project Implementation Status</b></p> <p><b>Project Purpose:</b></p> <p>The level of achievement of the Project Purpose is good. Indicator (1) and (2) have been fully achieved.</p> <p>Indicator (1). Based on the needs survey, 22 non-infrastructure projects and 16 infrastructure projects have been implemented and monitored by the officials of the targeted districts in Ratanakiri. As for Indicator 1.1, the planning process to align district development activities with local needs and requirements has been formulated and implemented. These activities have been identified upon a thorough needs survey and situation analysis and included previously less prioritized once such as ambulance service, waste management, school construction, and library service.</p> <p>As for Indicator 1.2, the beneficiary officials conduct M&amp;E with a higher frequency than before because they are now more aware and understand the importance of M&amp;E as well as their responsibilities and obligations in the process.</p> <p>Indicator (2) Based on the needs survey, 26 non-infrastructure projects and 9 infrastructure projects have been implemented and monitored by the officials of the targeted sector departments and districts in Mondorkiri. As for Indicator 2.1, the sector departments' development plans have been reviewed and implemented based on the identified needs at the development plan workshop at the end of 2009. The basic knowledge and skill sets of district office and the sector department officials have been improved and focused mainly on training for proposal writing, contract development, accounting, and PC proficiency. As for 2.2, the officers of communes, districts and provinces, who are involved in sector development activities, are utilizing now monitoring sheets when conducting M&amp;E of sector department pilot projects .</p> <p>Indicator (3) has been achieved according to the expectations of the Project stakeholders. Specifically, the final draft of the District Development Planning Guidelines of NCDD Secretariat reflects the recommendations from the Project, including such items as simplification of the planning process, introduction of analytical methods, creating linkage with Commune Development Plans, cooperation with NGOs and mainstreaming gender considerations.</p>		

## **Achievement of Outputs;**

PDM3 is comprised of four (4) outputs “Capacity of local government officials” increased in developmental research and analysis, rural development planning, implementing and managing rural development projects, and monitoring & evaluation. Though the beneficial local government officials possessed limited expertise and skills necessary for implementing developing plans prior to the start of the project, , their capacity correlated with the four output requirements has been developed and improved as follows:

### **Output1 Capacity in developmental research and analysis**

Provincial situation survey reports were produced based on data analysis and survey results (Indicator 1.1). The targeted groups and counterparts demonstrated significant increase of their score between pre-test and post-test of the module training courses on SWOT analysis, district profiles, and provincial situation survey (Indicator 1.2).

At the development planning workshops in Ratanakiri and Mondolkiri, development plans were produced based on the existing quantitative data of provincial profiles and district profiles (indicator1.3).

### **Output2 Capacity in rural development planning**

District development plans were successfully developed by local government officials in three districts in Ratanakiri after they received required training throughout the project (indicator 2.1). Sector development plans were developed by the officials of the Department of Agriculture, Department of Tourism, and Department of Environment in Mondulkiri in the same successful manner (indicator 2.2). All implementation activities have been conducted by local government officials in Ranatakiri and Mondulkiri (indicator 2.3). Lastly, a report on improvement of the district development planning process was produced and submitted to MoI (indicator 2.4).

### **Output3 Capacity in implementing and managing rural development projects**

Provincial and district officials have obtained the capacity to manage professionally contract management, financial management, operational management, and technical management through the pilot projects in Mondolkiri and Ratanakiri (indicator 3.1). The knowledge of provincial and district officials has been improved through module training courses and OJT (indicator 3.2). A feedback report on improvement of the implementation process of development projects was developed and submitted to MoI in 2009 (indicator 3.3).

### **Output 4 Capacity in monitoring & evaluation (M&E)**

Monitoring and evaluation capacity has significantly increased and local government officials in three districts in Ratanakiri and three sector departments in Mondolkiri as they could exercise the development of M&E plans for pilot projects (indicator 4.1). Based on the M&E plans, monitoring and evaluation exercises on pilot projects have been conducted by local government officials in three

districts in Ratanakiri and three sector departments in Mondolkiri (indicator 4.2). The knowledge transfer through module trainings, workshops and OJT has improved officials' knowledge for monitoring and evaluation to a high extent.(indicator 4.3). An M&E manual was drafted by the project and counterparts (indicator 4.3).

## **2. Summary of Evaluation Results**

### **2.1 Relevance**

The relevance of the Project is high.

There are no major changes to the D&D Policy of the RGC since the time of the Mid-Term Review. Based on the Organic Laws on Capital, Province, Municipality, District and Commune/Sangkat administrations ('the Organic Law'), enacted in 2008, it is expected that the Provincial and District level local governments would play significant roles in planning and conducting subnational development activities in the near future. In the past, donor funding mainly focused on support for activities on the Commune level, however, the focus of future fiscal decentralization is expected to take place at the Provincial and District level. In terms of the capacity development plans of the Government, The First Three-Year Implementation Plan (IP 3 (2011-2013)), which is based on The National Program for Sub-National Democratic Development (NP-SNDD) (2010-2019), also focuses on human resources development at the Provincial and District levels. From this perspective, it is considered particularly relevant that the Project placed emphasis on capacity development of the Provincial and District government personnel in management of development activities.

The Government of Japan recognizes in its latest Cambodian Aid policies (2002) Good Governance as one of the important factors for the realization of sustainable economic development and stable society. JICA also considers Good Governance as one of the priority sectors of its assistance, focusing on strengthening administrative capacity, legal reform and public financial reform in Cambodia.

### **2.2 Effectiveness**

Effectiveness of the Project is high. The Project Purpose has been achieved through four outputs, which have also been almost achieved.

Effectiveness of the Project in enhancing capacity of the target groups has been improved with refocus on the target groups in Mondulkiri Province, following the recommendations of the Mid-Term Review. In Ratanakiri Province, the effectiveness continued to be high in line with the observation of the Mid-Term Review.

The status of achievement of the Project Purpose is good. Indicators 3.1 and 3.2 have been fully achieved. In the Project target areas, namely, in the 2 Districts in Ratanakiri Province and in the 3

priority Sectors, namely agriculture, environment and tourism, in Mondulkiri Province, development projects that are selected based on needs assessment have been planned, implemented and monitored by the respective local government personnel with great commitment and professionalism.

Whilst following the logical structure as outlined in PDM3, in order to achieve the Project Purpose the Outputs appears to be sufficient enough to accomplish the indicators 3.1 and 3.2. It, however, is not sufficient enough to achieve indicator 3.3 (concerning institutionalization at the national level) mainly because 4 Outputs are solely focusing on capacity development of local government personnel. In order to expect further institutionalization of Project knowledge at the national level, a long-term, strategic intervention by the Project and by JICA would have been required from the design stage of the Project onwards.

### **2.3 Efficiency**

Overall efficiency of the Project is considered reasonably high.

Outputs have been largely achieved, and the methods of capacity development adopted by the Project, namely, creating organic linkages between training sessions and OJT have proven effective. Most of the beneficiaries (both the direct target groups of the Project as well as the indirect target groups) testified the effectiveness of the training methods, which focused on practical use of the knowledge and skills, as opposed to theoretical orientations that most of the other training programmes have. Many beneficiaries also testified the importance of having opportunities to practice acquired knowledge and skills through OJT.

Activities have been largely implemented as planned and most of the training exercises have been conducted corresponding to the implementation progress of the pilot projects in a timely manner. Overall, inputs from the Japanese side to the activities have been made as scheduled.

Reflecting on the cost input versus output ratio it is notable that the Project has delivered satisfactory cost-effective technical cooperation and has made substantial contribution to the demographic area and the priority Sectors in the 2 Provinces. The pilot projects, although primarily implemented for OJT purposes, were appreciated by a large number of stakeholders in the Project areas for their wide range of developmental benefits (e.g. irrigation, rural roads, wells, community health education, etc.). The total number of pilot projects that the Project has delivered (A total of 25 infrastructure and 51 non-infrastructure projects) is impressive, particularly against the level of Inputs.

However, there are some financial aspects of the Project cost that should be mentioned. First, while the main Project activities focused on training of the target groups and management of OJT through implementation of pilot projects in the 2 Provinces, Project Inputs did not accurately corresponded with the allocation of man-months for experts. Second, until the Mid-Term Review, the activities in

Mondulkiri have been spread out throughout the Province and thus, the capacity development activities until the Mid-Term Review in Mondulkiri had to be largely disregarded under the present evaluation exercise.

## **2.4 Impact**

To assess the likelihood of achieving the Overall Project Goal is rather difficult, since it is set on a long term perspective (5-10 years) beyond the lifespan of the Project.

Since the Project activity areas and Sectors in the 2 Provinces are limited (i.e. 3 Districts in Ratanakiri and 2 Sectors in Mondolkiri), it is difficult to expect that the impact of the Project would spread to the Provincial level without further interventions under the existing environment. Moreover, the indicator 3.3 of the Project Purpose points to institutionalization at the national policy level, rather than aiming at disseminating the knowledge and lesson learnt from the Project to the Provincial level. Thus, it is questionable if it would be possible as described under PDM3 by simply achieving the Project Purpose indicators subsequently the Overall Goal can be achieved as well. Therefore, it is suggested that the Overall Goal be reformulated and set at a shorter timeframe (approximately 3 years) after completion of the Project, based on a realistic assessment of the present circumstances.

With respect to the positive ripple effect of the Project, the developmental benefit of the pilot project has been widely appreciated by the stakeholders in the target areas. Even though the pilot projects have been implemented primarily in order to provide OJT opportunities for the target groups, many of the projects (both infrastructure and non-infrastructure projects) have benefitted up to 108,660 people in Ratanakiri and 51,864 people in Mondolkiri. Another positive ripple effect is that awareness among police officer and NGO staff was increased after the workshop on gender mainstreaming and domestic violence law in Ratanakiri. In addition, some of the training materials developed by the Project have been adopted by MoI for general purposes and have been used for other training activities for local government officials.

## **2.5 Sustainability**

The sustainability of the Project is assessed as moderate.

The sustainability of policy is relatively high. The government has implemented the 10-year National Program for Sub-National Democratic Development (NP-SNDD) since 2010 after enacting 'the Organic Law' in 2008.

The First Three-Year Implementation Plan (IP 3) of NP-SNDD focuses on human resources development at the District levels and plans to strengthen the role of the provincial offices to supervise district offices.

It was fortunate that the Project focused on capacity development of District-level personnel and

Provincial Department personnel as target groups. There is a clear tendency that newly developed technical capacity among the target groups regarding their ability to plan, implement and monitor development activities will be sustained far beyond the lifespan of the project.

Institutional sustainability varies among organizations and is more difficult to achieve. It will be very challenging for provincial offices whilst the probability for provincial sector departments and district offices are to achieve long lasting sustainability is relatively high. Especially, the role of districts will become more important and vast in scope due to their now role strengthened by the Organic Law. On the other hand, provincial offices need to find a way to strengthen their capacity after ExCom will be dissolved.

It is expected that there will be budget allocated to the District-level government in the near future by the Government based on the Organic Law. Thus, the target groups will be able to utilize the acquired knowledge and skills from the Project, although it is unclear at this stage when this budget allocation will actually take place.

### **3. Factors promoting achievements of Outputs, Sustainability and Impact**

#### (1) Factors related to Planning

- The adopted methodology for capacity development was effective (focus on practical knowledge and a combination of OJT and timely introduction of knowledge through training).

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

- The project's activity is consistent with the strategy of the central government. For example, it has been implemented in NCDD's framework of District Initiative Programme (DIP). Thus, the project obtained the greatest cooperation from the stakeholders in districts.
- The communication and relationship between the Project Offices in the 2 Provinces and the target groups have been excellent. The levels of commitment and morale of the Project Teams in the 2 Provinces as well as the target groups were high.

### **4. Factors inhibiting achievements of Outputs, Sustainability and Impact**

#### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

- The long-term plan and activities to measure the development of the target groups' capacity were not included in the Plan of Operation.
- When the PDM was revised at the Mid-term review, a new indicator of the Project Purpose was added. However, additional outputs and activities were not installed to achieve this indicator. Thus, it was difficult for the Project to conduct the activities for achieving this indicator. However, this indicator was achieved through the activities of the long-term expert located in MoI.

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process



- The relationship between the long-term Japanese expert and the consulting team: it was difficult for both of them to collaborate for the project because they have different command structures.
- While pilot projects were implemented, all parties tended to be focused on the implementation of those projects. As a result, impact of CD through implementation of those pilot projects tends to become secondary.

## **5. Conclusions**

Overall, the Project has made good progress towards achieving the Project Purpose. The Project's relevance, effectiveness and efficiency are all assessed as high. In particular, the capacity development activities in the Project target areas have achieved significant results among the target groups. The selection of the target groups has been appropriate, in view of the future direction of decentralization policy in Cambodia. The Project has also benefitted from refocusing on target groups in Mondulkiri Province, following a recommendation of the Mid-Term Review. Pilot projects made positive impact on the people in the targeted area in two provinces. On the other hand, there remains a challenge as to how to achieve institutional sustainability.

## **6. Recommendations**

### **(1) Actions that are suggested to be taken prior to completion of the Project**

- a) Reformulate the Overall Goal, which is likely to be attained within 3-5 years after completion of the Project, based on realistic assessment of the existing environment in Cambodia. The Objectively Verifiable Indicators and Assumptions should be reviewed by the end of the Project.
- b) In terms of work required for institutionalization of the project experience, concerted work of the Project Implementation Team would be required to upgrade the existing draft outputs such as 'Collection of feedback from pilot project implementation' and to produce a document that clearly illustrate the experience of the Project to the external parties. In particular, the method of capacity development adopted by the Project, which has largely proven effective for the target groups of the Project, should be explained and presented clearly.
- c) Along with further efforts to institutionalize Project knowledge at the national level, it would be recommended that the Project focuses its attention on dissemination of the Project knowledge and lesson learnt at the Provincial level in the 2 Provinces during the remaining period until the completion of the Project.
- d) When the contract period with ExCom expires in December 2010, all construction work under pilot projects, etc. need to be completed within a few-month period. More importantly, the Evaluation Team encountered several cases during the study period that require support and advice for management, repair and maintenance of the equipment/infrastructure, etc provided/constructed under pilot projects. It is suggested that the Project Implementation Team review such needs and offers advisory services to assist them tackle the issues with a view to enhance possibilities for better management/maintenance of the work that has taken place so far. In this regard, workshops gathering stakeholders at each District might produce fruitful results. Necessary actions should also be

taken to repair the damage of the constructions done during the implementation period.

**(2) Actions that are suggested to be taken after completion of the Project**

- a) The Provincial Governments of the 2 Provinces are requested to support dissemination activities of the Project knowledge and experience accumulated within each Province.
- b) MoI is requested to extend its support for further institutionalization of Project knowledge at the national level, whenever such opportunities arise. In addition, MoI is requested to look into the work environment of local government personnel in general. This would include reassessment of the salary levels of local government officers as well as coverage of necessary costs to perform duties. For example, the Evaluation Team has received a number of grievances from officials about being not reimbursed for their duties to perform monitoring activities. These matters affect staff moral to a significant extent and influences the level of their productivity. In addition, MoI is requested to take into account the staff training and qualifications when reassignments of personnel take place for the new structure of the Provincial Government.
- c) It is requested that the stakeholders of the Project would look into possibilities to support follow-up activities to ensure sustainability of the developmental effects of the pilot project activities wherever necessary, by Provincial or Central government of Cambodia or by other donors including NGOs.

**7. Lessons learned**

- (1) Use of OJT through implementation of pilot project activities as a tool for capacity development has proven useful for Provincial and District-level personnel in the 2 Provinces. By combining inputs like knowledge obtained through training activities with OJT, the Evaluation Team has observed a substantial enhancement of knowledge and confidence among the target groups interviewed during the present Study. This method for CD, while not necessarily new at the global level does not appear to be practiced widely in the context of Cambodia.
- (2) It is important for a CD Project to ensure utilization of target groups and other stakeholders so they are participating in a CD Project and that the target groups' CD is the central concern of the project. When pilot projects are implemented, all parties tend to be focused on the implementation of those projects. As a result, impact of CD through implementation of those pilot projects tends to become secondary. In order to avoid this tendency, it is important for CD projects to have clear policy for measuring effectiveness of activities on CD and to ensure awareness of the project stakeholders during the design stage.
- (3) When CD projects aim at institutionalization of certain methodologies and project experience, it is important for the projects to have already strategies at the design stage and to plan activities related to institutionalization as part of the project implementation. Competitive environment among donors is an important external factor that exists in many countries, which cannot be taken lightly. Effective institutionalization can only succeed with a long-term, strategic vision and strategy.