

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by China Office: October, 2011

Country	The Human Resources Development Project for Water Resources
China	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	910.5 million yen	
Project Period	July 1, 2000 to June 30, 2005 (Extension Period: July 1, 2005 to June 30, 2007)	
Implementing Agency	Human Resources Development Center, Ministry of Water Resources (Beijing Water Resources Training Center in Shane will be used for the training purpose.)	
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism Japan Institute of Construction Engineering	
Related Projects (if any)	<p>Japanese cooperations:</p> <p>Grant Aid Project: Provision of Equipment on Flood Countermeasures (洪水対策支援機材)(1999)</p> <p>Technical Cooperation Project: The Pilot Scheme for Technological Development on River Information System Project in China (June1993 - May 1998)</p> <p>Follow-up project (June1998 - May 2000)</p> <p>The Irrigation and Drainage Engineering Training Center Project in the People's Republic of China (June 1993 - June 1998) Follow-up Project (June1998 - June2000)</p>	
Background	<p>In the People's Republic of China, the people have continuously suffered from the frequent occurrence of floods, sediment disaster, etc. Under "the 9th Five-Year Development Plan (1995-2000)" and "the Long-Term Development Plan up to the year 2010", the government of China proclaimed the policy to strengthen the water resource facilities as a basis of economic development. The Ministry of Water Resources has set the priority issues, such as the increase of reservoir capacity by renovating the aging dams, watershed protection by strengthening the linkage between flood control facilities and sediment control facilities, and the quality improvement and proper maintenances of those facilities. The Human Resources Development Center was established in 1997 as a base to work out the priority issues.</p> <p>Under such circumstances, the government of China requested to the Japanese government of the technical cooperation on the human resourced development in which instructors are trained through training courses in the field of training program management, water resource management, construction management and sabo engineering (sediment control). The project was implemented from July 2000 for the period of seven years (including two years as an extension).</p>	
Inputs	Japanese Side	Chinese Side
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 9 Long-term experts for 4 areas 43 Short-term experts for 5 areas Trainees Received: 38 CPs Equipment Provision: 112 million yen Local Cost: 161 million yen 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocation: 7 CPs for full-time, 30 CPs for part-time, interpreters, accountants and other administrative staff Buildings and facilities: Project Office for experts and training facilities Local Cost: About 13 million Yuan (cumulative amounts up to the year 2004)
Project Objectives	Overall Goal	
	Knowledge and skills of personnel in charge of water resource are increased.	
	<p>Project Purpose</p> <p>Training courses of water resources for instructors, who train middle and primary level engineers, on training program management, water resource management, construction and management and sabo engineering (sediment control) are improved, and 2000 instructors in these fields are trained at the for Human Resources Development Center, Ministry of Water Resource. (Hereinafter referred to as "the center").</p>	
Project Objectives	Outputs	
	Output 1: Training system of the Center is improved.	
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Training management system is formulated. 2) Learning materials and educational facilities are fully utilized among related training centers. 3) Exchanges of information among training centers under the Ministry of Water Resources and related organizations are promoted. 	
Project Objectives	Output 2: Training courses for the instructors who train middle and primary level engineers are established.	
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Teaching materials for the training are improved. 2) Training facilities are improved. 	
	<p>Output 3: Instructors who train middle and primary level engineers for each training field are trained.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Skill level of trainers is raised. 	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of Evaluation

This project was aimed to improve the facility management for flood control and sediment control and to mitigate the damages caused by the flood and draught by strengthening the human resources in the water resources management.

This project has achieved its project purpose of improvement of training courses of water resources for instructors, who train middle and primary level engineers, on training program management, water resource management, construction management and sabo engineering (sediment control), and training of 2000 instructors in these fields at the center. At the time of terminal evaluation, 2,371 instructors received the trainings and more than 90% of them have now working as trainers. As for the overall goal of increasing the knowledge and skills of instructors in charge of water resource, 12,745 instructors have received training for the period of 2007 to 2010. And 15,746 instructors have been newly qualified as the middle or upper level engineers in the same period. As for sustainability, the project has no problems in policy background, structural, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with the development policy of China, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, the project period was longer than the plan, but it was deemed as relevant for the technology to be taken root in the trainees. In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project is highly relevant with development policy of the government of China, "ex. strengthening of water resources infrastructure, conservation of ecosystem, human resources development of water resources management and the infrastructure development for flood control as a basis of economic development", development needs, "ex. to human resources development in the field of water resource management, as well as Japan's ODA policy, "ex. to assist the water resources management and forest conservation in order to protect the ecosystem on a global scale", at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project purpose of training 2,000 instructors has been achieved at the time of Terminal Evaluation. According to the center, more than 90% of those instructors have been working as trainers. As for the overall goal of cumulative number of trainees has reached to 12,745 achieving the target of more than 10,000 for the period of five years. During the period of 2007 to 2010, 15,476 instructors have been newly qualified as middle level or upper level engineers.

Out of those, 8,164 instructors were trained by the project and all of them have engaged in the training-related works. Furthermore, the questionnaire survey conducted by the center revealed some positive impacts by the project, such that the center provided the technical assistance to the formulation of water resources management plan with trainers trained by the project, and expanded in application of advanced technology, such as for safety improvement, observation, water-saving, etc. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of this project is high.



Trainings on sustainable water resource management (2010)

1) Trainings of Trainers 【At the time of Terminal Evaluation】

Training Subject	Number of trainings conducted	Targeted number of trainees	Actual number of trainees
Training Management	7	200	367
Water Resources Management	8	800	883
Construction Management	10	700	793
Sediment Control	4	300	328
Total		2,000	2,371

Data Source: Human Resources Development Center for both 1) and 2)

2) Actual performance of training for 5 years 【At the time of Ex-post Evaluation】

Year	Number of trainees		Total
	Mid-Level	Upper-level	
2007	1,513	564	2,077
2008	2,140	592	2,732
2009	2,570	738	3,308
2010	3,782	846	4,628
Total	10,005	2,740	12,745

3 Efficiency

While inputs were appropriate for producing outputs of the project, the project period was longer than the plan (ratio against plan: 140%). Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

It should be noted that the extension of the project period was deemed relevant because it requires a good amount of time to respond to the increasing needs of human resources development and the dissemination of positive effects.

4 Sustainability

Under the 10th Five-Year Development Plan, the water resource management is one of priority areas. According to the center, the structure of implementing agency has been strengthened even after the termination of the project, since the number of instructors was increased by ten and collaboration with other technical agencies and regional training centers has been further strengthened. The center has played the important role as a core center for human resources development of water resources. As for the technical aspect, the center itself has originally developed the training program; the center has provided the in-service trainings for instructors and the maintenance of training equipment have been properly managed. As for the financial aspect, the annual budget of more than 5 million Yuan will be allocated from the Ministry of Water Resources as the budget for training education. The project has no problem in structural, technical and financial aspects and current status of the implementing agency. Therefore, sustainability of this project is high.