Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Country	The Model Afforestation Project in Sichuan
China	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	About 932 million yen
Project Period	July 1, 2000 - June 30, 2005 (extension period July 1, 2005 - Oct. 31, 2007)
Implementing Agency	Responsible Agency: Sichuan Forestry Department Implementing Agencies: Forest Bureau, Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture, Forest Bureau of Xichang City, Forest Bureau of Xide Country, Forest Bureau of Zhaojue Country
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Forestry Agency
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperations: JICA Japanese Overseas Cooperation Volunteer JICA Development Studies: The Study on Reforestation in Anning Watershed in Sichuan Province (Sept 2000-July 2002) China: The Nature Forestland Protection Program (Aero seeding, Artificial planting, Mountain closure) The Land Conversion from Farmland back to Forestland Program Other donors' cooperations: World Bank: Project for the Preservation and Development of Forest Resources(1995-2000),Project for the Development of Forest Industries in the Deprived Areas (1999-2004)
Background	In Anning River basin, the forest destruction by deforestation, overgrazing and overcultivation, and serious soil erosion had been progressed and the conservation forest of that area had been urgently needed. As it is mentioned in the Sichuan Provincial Ecological Environment Construction Master Plan as well as the National Ecological Environmental Construction Master Plan, the Anning River basin is designated as the priority areas to implement the afforestation by the Chinese Government. Under these circumstances, the Chinese Government requested Japan to implement the project to establish the model afforestation area and model forestry nursing in the Anning River basin, as well as to train soil and water conservation for technical officers and the afforestation and nursing for local people. This is to protect the project area from the serious soil erosion, to promote the economic development for those minorities and to alleviate the poverty of local communities, especially farmers. It should be also noted that what was urgently needed is to develop the suitable way to improve the survival and preservation of nursery plants, since, in the Anning River area; it was very difficult to afforest the area because of its climatic and topographical constraints (such that the area is located more than 2,900 above sea level and the annual rainfall of the area is recorded as more than 400 mm.)

Inputs	Japanese Side	Chinese Side
	1. Experts: 10 Long-term experts (5 fields) 11 Short-term experts (5 fields) 2. Trainees Received: 30 CPs trained 3. Equipment: 7.9 million yen 4. Local Cost: 14 million Yuen (approximately 180 million yen)	1. Staff Allocated: 45 personnel (selected from Sichuan, Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture, Xichang city, Xide country and Zhaojue country) 2. Buildings and facilities: Project Office(5 offices) Land for forestry nursery(2 sites), Land for afforestation (3 sites in the city and countries),Training facilities (one site) 3. Local Cost: Project management costs

| Project Objectives | **Overall Goal**
Based on Sichuan Provincial Ecological Environment Construction Master Plan, afforestation activities are carried out by the government and local people in Anning River basin in a sustainable way.

Project Purpose
A basis of self-sustained afforestation activities is established in Xichang city, Xide country and Zhaojue country in Anning River basin.

Outputs
- Output 1: Techniques for raising seedlings for afforestation which are suitable for natural and social conditions in the Project Area are developed.
- Output 2: Techniques for afforestation aimed for soil and water conservation which are suitable for natural and social conditions in the Project Area are developed.
- Output 3: Technical officers, who manage, carry out and extend nursing and afforestation activities are trained.
- Output 4: Nursing and afforestation techniques are extended to the local people.
- Output 5: The importance of forest conservation is understood by local people. |

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation

The project was aimed to protect the project area in the Anning River basin from the serious soil erosion, to promote the economic development for minorities and to alleviate the poverty of local communities, by establishment of the model afforestation and model forestry and nursing in the Anning River basin, and by conducting the trainings on soil and water conservation for technical officers.

This project has achieved its project purpose of establishment of the basis of self-sustained afforestation activities in Xichang city, Xide country and Zhaojue country in Anning River basin. It is confirmed by the questionnaire survey that more than planned target of 500ha has been reforested at the time of terminal evaluation and that the reforested area has been increased even further at the time of ex-post evaluation. Survival rates and preservation rates for nursery plant have achieved their targets of 75% and 70% respectively in all targeted areas. As for the overall goal, "Based on Sichuan Provincial Ecological Environment Construction Master Plan, afforestation activities are carried out by the government and local people in Anning River basin in a sustainable way", the forest coverage ratio in the Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture was 43% which is higher than the planned ratio of 42.5%. As for the sustainability, the project has no problem in policy background, structural and technical aspects of the implementing agency. And the relevant budget has been continuously secured although the projection amount is not available.

For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with the development policy of the People's Republic of China, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, project period was longer than the plan, but it was deemed as relevant for firm establishment of the technique of nursing and afforestation. In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with development policy of the government of China, "ex. environmental conservation on forest ecology in Sichuan", development needs "ex. to develop the conservation forest to protect the forest from wasteland and soil erosion caused by the deforestation", as well as Japan's ODA policy, "ex. to assist the water resources management and forest conservation in order to protect the ecosystem on a global scale", at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has achieved its project purpose of establishment of the basis of self-sustained afforestation activities in Xichang city, Xide country and Zhaojue country in Anning River basin. It is confirmed by the questionnaire survey that more than planned target area of 500ha has been reforested at the time of terminal evaluation and that the reforested area has been increased even further at the time of ex-post evaluation. The forest coverage ratio in Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture has achieved 43% which is higher than the planned target of 42.5%. This is mainly due to that the reforestation was continuously conducted by the government and local population Furthermore, women's participation to the afforestation activities has promoted their understandings toward forest conservation and suppressed their deforestation to be used for fuel. In addition, the afforestation activities have helped to increase their income.

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

1) Reforested areas【At the Terminal Evaluation】
7,859 Mu＝524ha

Year	Xichang city	Xide Country	Zhaojue Country	Total
2001	45	35	-	80
2002	340	1,188	753	2,281
2003	955	995	1,788	3,738
2004	1,260	500	-	1,760
Total	2,600	2,718	2,541	**7,859**

2) Forest coverage ratio in Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture =43%【At the ex-post evaluation】

Conservation Forest：78,473 ha

To close hillsides to facilitate afforestation: 130,147 ha

Forestland nursing：2.85 million ha

Strengthening of the achievements of the land conversion from farmland back to forestland program: 109,006 ha

Data Source: Sichuan Forestry Department

Xide Country

Mixed forest in the Live Fence of the Zhao Zhaojue Country

Forestry Nursery in Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture

3 Efficiency

While inputs were appropriate for producing outputs of the project, project period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 146%) Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

It should be noted that the extension of the project period was deemed relevant because it requires a good amount of time to firmly establish the technique of nursing and afforestation for those technicians and local population.

4 Sustainability

In China, based on the forest ecology and forest development plan, the government of China and the Sichuan local government has consistently maintained the afforestation as one of the important projects along with the six priority projects, such as the conservation of natural forest, protection of plant and animal. It is confirmed by the questionnaire survey that the structure of implementing agency has been almost sustained as the major center to provide technical consultation, training and policy implementation, although there was a slight change of marginal level. Furthermore, in the technical aspect, it is confirmed that the implementation agency has been upgrading skills so that they has been awarded the prize for the technical advancement. The techniques of nursing and afforestation introduced by the project will be maintained through the technical manuals distributed by forest bureau of Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture and Sichuan Forestry Department, and the training program for managers and technicians systematically planned up to 2015.

As for the financial aspect, the relevant budget has been continuously secured although the projection amount is not available. In the light of the above, this project has no problem in policy background, structural, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, sustainability of this project is high.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Lessons learned for JICA:

For the smooth and sustainable afforestation, it is essential to win the full understanding of local community and to work in collaboration with them. It is recommended, therefore, that the interests and intentions of those local communities should be taken into consideration at the planning stage of afforestation. This was effectively exercised in this particular project, where the interests and intentions of those farmers and local people have been captured through the rural survey and they were clearly reflected on the afforestation plan. In the implementation process, the project has not only introduced the afforestation techniques to those local people, but it has also guided them to increase their income through the afforestation activities for poverty alleviation.