

終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

I. Outline of the Project	
Country : The Republic of Guatemala	
Project title : The Project for Capacity Development of the Tourism Self-Management Committees	
Issue/Sector : Tourism Development	
Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation	
Division in charge : Industrial Development Department	
Total cost : 250 million Japanese yen (as of the time of evaluation)	
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): September 11, 2007 – September 10, 2010
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Guatemala Tourist Commission (INGUAT), Secretary of Planning and Programming of the Presidency (SEGEPLAN), Technical Institution for Training and Productivity (INTECAP), Tourism Self-Management Committee (CATs)
Supporting Organization in Japan :	
Related Cooperation : The Study of National Tourism Development (2000 – 2002)	
<p>1 Background of the Project</p> <p>Guatemala has rich tourism resources such as nature, heritage and indigenous cultures. The recent first field of foreign currency acquisition is tourism, surpassing traditional export goods like coffee, sugar, banana and cardamom, and the tourism industry is expected as a very promising sector for growth in demand.</p> <p>However, the potential tourism resources are not used for the regional development sufficiently and deforestation in rural and mountain areas is getting a serious problem. The protection for tourism resources such as natural environment is an urgent issue.</p> <p>JICA implemented “The Study of National Tourism Development” in 2002 for the social development through tourism and the promotion of natural and cultural conservation. The Guatemalan government introduced a system of the Local Tourism Committee in 2000 and changed the title to the Tourism Self-Management Committee (CAT) in 2004.</p> <p>Under these circumstances, the Guatemalan government requested for technical cooperation to the Japanese government in order to strengthen the organization of CAT, build a coalition with other organizations concerned and aim for the sustainable regional tourism development.</p> <p>2 Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>Sustainable tourism and conservation of natural and cultural tourism resources in the region are promoted, that contribute to the economic development and poverty reduction.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <p>The management capacity of the Tourism Self-Management Committees is strengthened, and tourism based on the use of local resources in the areas of las Verapaces and Petén is offered.</p>	

(3) Outputs

Component 1: Strengthening of Organization

The functions of Tourism Self-Management Committees are strengthened and the mechanism of cooperative support among the public sector, communities, micro and small enterprises of the tourism sector is established.

Component 2: Tourism Product Development

The tourism products and packets are identified and defined.

Component 3: Tourism Infrastructure and Service

Service and infrastructure to receive tourists and conserve the tourism resources are improved.

Component 4: Marketing and Promotion

The defined tourism products and packets are recognized at national and international levels.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side :

Long term expert: 1, Short term expert: 5, Counterpart training: 6 (training in Japan and 39 (training in Mexico), Provision of equipment: 1,076 thousand Japanese yen, Local cost: 2,615 thousand Quetzal

Guatemalan Side :

Counterpart assignment: 6, Offices and facilities: project office in INGUAT, Local cost: necessary expenses for holding events and others (the amount is unknown)

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	(1) Team Leader: Mr. Mitsunori Nishimoto, Senior Advisor to the Director General, Industrial Development Department, JICA (2) Evaluation Analysis: Ms. Sawa Hasegawa, Consultant, Japan Development Service (3) Cooperation Planning: Ms. Miho Ishida, Private Sector Development Division, Industrial Development Department, JICA	
Period of Evaluation	June 20 – 12 July, 2010	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

Tourism still remains the high priority in Guatemala since the time of Ex-ante Evaluation for the project conducted in January 2007 and the project purpose and overall goal are in line with the national plan that places the emphasis on regional development, economic development and poverty reduction in Guatemala.

The project is also consistent with the Japan's ODA policy towards Guatemala that regards the tourism sector as a key area of assistance and that puts a special focus on the improvement of local tourism administration.

The project was relevant to local needs and gender issue as well. Women participation to the project was very high.

According to the questionnaire survey and interviews, most answers were that the selection of target group for the project, CATs, was reasonable. However, CATs are very different from CAT to CAT in gender, occupation and educational level of members. In view of this, it is necessary to classify CATs through a similar aspect and deal with each CAT by changing the way of strengthening. In addition, there were possibilities to consider project activities more flexibly if the types of tourism resources were not limited strictly before the project starts.

The above relevance are summed up that the relevance of the project is high.

(2) Effectiveness

The project can be evaluated to have been effective as one approach to the tourism development in Guatemala.

As the visible examples of project achievement, the first example is that there are more CATs established in the project regions than in other regions. The second is that exchange, communication and cooperation among CATs in the project regions are more feasible compared to other regions. The third is that COMPETUR and other events were organized and held by the planning and execution committees formed by CATs members. CATs in Verapaces found some money from sponsors by their own.

However it was difficult to evaluate "Effectiveness" of the project objectively, because the degree of strengthening of CATs differed from CAT to CAT and the way of measuring the situation of capacity development of CATs was not decided.

(3) Efficiency

Inputs from both Japanese side and Guatemalan side were made as planned and the effects to the inputs were reasonable. Based on the results of the questionnaire survey, interviews and site visits, it can be said that inputs for the project and project activities were used in an efficient manner.

As noted in the Mid-term Evaluation, some issues were pointed out that some factors had disturbed the smooth implementation of the project in the first year. However, recommendations made by the Mid-term Evaluation were considered after the evaluation and some modifications and improvements have been made in the project implementation. The situation was improved by the efforts of both Guatemalan side and Japanese side and the achievement of outcomes could be obviously made in the second year. Most project outcomes were achieved in the second year.

Also noted in the Mid-term Evaluation, the assignment period for the short-term experts, three-month for one expert per year was short for covering the target area. Since the three districts of Petén, Alta Verapaz and Baja Verapaz are huge target area in size, the project management was relatively difficult with the limited assignment of experts. It also caused some difficulties in implementing the project sufficiently. According to the interviews with Japanese experts, four to five-month assignment period would be appropriate. Based on the result of Mid-term Evaluation, a few amount of assignment were added.

The efficiency of the project was basically good, but if more assignments for experts had been given to the project, it would have got better effects with more detailed assistance and instructions by them.

(4) Impact

Regarding the prospect for achievement of overall goal of the project, it would be prospective if the CATs experiences and know-how of the project are certainly spread to other regions in future.

There were some examples of positive impact arising during the implementation of the project. That is, the examples are that CAT members found some money from sponsors by their own at COMPETUR and that exchange, communication and cooperation among CATs members got more facilitated. As another example, the concept of “Road Station (Michi no Eki)” has been also prevalent to CATs members in the project regions. The successful results of training in Mexico is also the example of positive impact arising.

The future impact arising is thought to depend on each CAT situation. Some CATs might generate a positive impact in future since their motivation, energy and capacity as the organization are strong. On the other hand, it is difficult to think that the negative impact by the project could be brought about during and after the project.

The positive impact arising of the project is promising in future, whereas the negative impact seems not to be arisen.

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of CATs system and their activities shall be high if the issues below are considered.

- Policy

Tourism still remains the high priority in Guatemala and CATs system and their activities shall be continued in Guatemala.

- Structure

Considering the current situation of INGUAT, its implementation system for dealing with CATs, one CAT coordinator and CAT promoters is not weak, but in order to keep CATs activities sustainable, it would be better to strengthen the current system of INGUAT and put the CATs section to higher position than now. INGUAT should continue to support the self-management and autonomy of CATs. In addition, there is a tendency that whether or not CATs activities are efficient is influenced by the ability of CAT promoters. Developing good CAT promoters will be therefore the key for future development.

- Skill

The CAT manual will be completed before the end of the project in order to spread the project experiences and know-how to other regions.

It is necessary to manage the materials made by the project to utilize them after the project completion. It is desirable to make a guideline for this issue if possible.

- Finance

Financial support from INGUAT, such as the cost of training provided by INTECAP and other institutions to CATs, will be continued. In addition, it is necessary for CATs to strengthen the ability to find some money from sponsors by their own.

2. Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

There are more CATs established in the project regions than in other regions, and COMPETUR and other events were organized and held by the planning and execution committees formed by CATs members. CATs in Verapaces found some money from sponsors by their own. Therefore, the project can be evaluated to have been effective as one approach to the tourism development in Guatemala.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Communication and cooperation among CATs in the project regions which was built through the project is contributed to realization of effects. Women participation to the project is also promoted realization.

In addition, there is a tendency that whether or not CATs activities are efficient is influenced by the ability of CAT promoters.

3. Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

Through the activities regarding Output 3, tourism infrastructures such as the information board are installed. However Guatemalan sides have few interests in this component, because, generally, Guatemalan people consider the word “infrastructure” big infrastructures such as road, and there is a difference between their image and activities regarding Output 3.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Some issues, such as structure of the project and project monitoring, were pointed out. However, the situation was improved by the efforts of both Guatemalan side and Japanese side.

4. Conclusion

This project can be said to have achieved an effect in that it contributed to two things, building a mechanism for CATs and developing or strengthening CATs, with focusing on its system as one way of approach for tourism development in Guatemala. Since tourism development is an integrated result of efforts by different stakeholders, it is therefore reasonable to say that in aiming for tourism development in all project target regions or the whole country in Guatemala, it is better to consider other approaches as well.

In addition, CATs are very different from CAT to CAT in gender, occupation and educational level of members. While some CATs consist of members who are truly engaged in the tourism sector, some CATs consist of farmers. In view of this, it is not a strategic way to strengthen all CATs in a single uniform way and that it is necessary to classify CATs through a similar aspect and deal with each CAT by changing the way of strengthening. It is considered that while an example of the former CATs could be introduced to by many new tools for tourism development and that an example of the latter CATs could be taken as a different approach in order to aim for tourism development or regional development in Guatemala in future.

5. Recommendations

- Recommendations to INGUAT

- (1) Making the way of measuring the situation of capacity development of CATs
- (2) Finishing making the CAT manual before the end of the project in order to spread the project experiences and know-how to other regions
- (3) Emphasis on compliance with profile in selecting CAT promoters
- (4) Continuing to provide the training for CATs by INGUAT through INTECAP and other institutions training courses
- (5) Managing copyright of the marketing and promotion materials made by the project

- Recommendations to CAT

- (1) Strengthening an approach to the outsides to build a network of cooperation with outside organizations

6. Lessons Learned

The project got the following five lessons.

- (1) More detailed check and closer investigation in planning the project and review of the plan during the project implementation
- (2) Further consideration to the combination system of the expert directly managed by JICA and the consultant expert
- (3) Tips for designing the future tourism development and regional development project
- (4) Effective practice of joint evaluation
- (5) Importance of gathering indicators data and monitoring the project

7. Follow-up Situation

There are no activities which need new installations.