

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by Paraguay office: October, 2011

Country	The Project for Strengthening Continuing Education in Nursing and Midwifery in the South of the Republic of Paraguay
Paraguay	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	685 million yen	
Project Period	February, 2001 - February, 2006	
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Public Health and Social Wellbeing (Ministerio de Salud Pública y Bienestar Social)	
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, National Center for Global Health and Medicine, St. Mary Hospital, Tenshi College	
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperations: Technical Cooperation Project: Project for Strengthening Continuing Education in Nursing and Midwifery (February 2008 - January 2011)	
Background	In Paraguay, the improvement of reproductive health was one of the priorities in the national health policy aiming at realizing the society with universal high quality health services. However, the southern region, where the larger rural population were scattered, had not received significant assistance by the international donors while the healthcare services in the northern, central and eastern regions of the country, where the population were concentrated, have been improved by the international assistance. Therefore, the government of Paraguay requested the government of Japan technical cooperation for human resource development in perinatal care in order to improve the health care service in the southern region, in particular in the three provinces of Ñeembucú, Misiones and Itapúa. Although the number of target provinces decreased to two (Ñeembucú and Misiones) due to the delay of progress after starting the project, it expanded to four provinces including Itapúa and Caazapá since the progress of the project was higher than the plan at the time of mid-term evaluation and the government of Paraguay requested the expansion of the target provinces.	
Inputs	Japanese Side	Paraguay Side
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Experts 10 experts in 8 areas for Long term, 8 experts in 5 areas for Short term 2. Trainees Received: 16 trainees 3. Third Country Training: None 4. Equipment: 109 million yen 5. Local Cost: 84 million yen 6. Others: 28 million yen 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Staff allocated: 18 counterparts 2. Equipment: None 3. Buildings and facilities: project office space in Asuncion, Itapúa and Caazapá 4. Others: approximately 14 million yen (751 million Gs)
Project Objectives	Overall Goal The continuous education system which is established in the target 4 provinces will be disseminated nationwide.	
	Project Purpose The continuous education for nurse and midwife is established and functioned in the 4 target provinces.	
	Outputs Output 1: The model of the continuous education for nurse and midwife is established in the pilot areas. Output 2: The monitoring standards for the continuous education is established and applied in the pilot areas. Output 3: The national test for nurse and midwife is developed. Output 4: The continuous education for nurse and midwife is institutionalized.	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<p>The 4 target provinces in the southern region of Paraguay had serious problems in maternal health care, including higher ratios of delivery at home and higher perinatal mortality rate than the national average. Therefore, it was essential to improve skills of birth attendants including assistant midwives and nurses at the health centers.</p> <p>The Project has achieved the executing rate of 100% for post monitoring for midwives and nurses who completed the continuous education training at all the health institution in the target provinces for the project purpose of establishment of the continuous education system for nurse and midwife in the target provinces. And the Project also achieved the dissemination of the continuous education system developed by the Project to 15 provinces for the overall goal of nationwide dissemination as an expected outcome. As for sustainability, the continuity of the continuous education trainings are ensured by the national policy prioritizing human resource development for health care services, the improved management capacity of INEPEO (the National Institution of Continuous Education for Nursing and Midwifery) and CREPEOs (the Regional Centers of Continuous Education for Nursing and Midwifery), the enhanced implementation capacity of coordinators and facilitators for the continuous education trainings as well as availability for financial resources despite of some problems of INEPEO including the limited independency of budget execution and the insufficient number of technical staff. For relevance, this project has been highly consistent with Paraguay's development policy, development needs and Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency as well, both the project period and the project cost were as planned. In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance

This project has been highly consistent with in the National Development Plan (2003-2008) aiming at improvement of reproductive health and child healthcare as well as the national health policy for improvement of healthcare services in remote areas, development needs in the county and the target areas for improvement of healthcare services by nurses and midwives, and the Japan's ODA policy including to support enhancement of healthcare and education for the poor. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

The Project Purpose, which did not have the clear target value, was largely achieved since the ex-post performance monitoring for nurses and midwives who had completed the continuous education training, including the checklist for infant health checkups, has been implemented at all the health institutions in the target provinces though the training monitoring format developed by the Project has not been widely used due to its complication. For the overall goal with target of the nationwide dissemination in 18 provinces, the continuous education system established by the Project was disseminated to 15 provinces in the country. In addition, INEPEO will be one of the counterpart organizations of the Project for Strengthening Primary Healthcare System, which will be started in February 2012, for the continuous education of nurse and midwife in order to make use of the outcomes resulted by the technical cooperation by JICA, including this project. Based on the experience and issues recognized through this project, it is expected that the coming project will revise the training programs and monitoring tools and make necessary adjustment for the continuous education system which can be applicable to the situations at local level, including budget and staff. Therefore, its effectiveness/ impact is high.

3 Efficiency

Both project period and project costs were mostly as planned and inputs were appropriate for producing outputs of the project. Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

4 Sustainability

For the policy aspect, although the continuous education for health staff is continuously focused in the Socioeconomic Strategic Plan, a long-term action plan for INEPEO has not been developed. In addition, the role and responsibility of INEPEO in the continuous education in Paraguay have not been clear yet while other institutions also provide similar trainings. For technical and financial aspects, there is no problem on implementation of continuous education trainings due to the sufficient management capacity of INEPEO and CREPEOs, the enhanced capacity of coordinators and facilitators for trainings as well as utilization of financial resources from local governments or international donors. However, INEPEO cannot independently control and execute own budget due to the institutional reform of the Ministry of Public Health and Social Wellbeing in 2010. Also INEPEO does not have the sufficient number of technical staff. Furthermore, there is a concern about future institutional framework of INEPEO, which was newly established for the Project, due to the limited organizational power and some cases of weaker coordination with other related directorates in the Ministry after the project completion. On the other hand, it is expected that the institutional capacity and activities of INEPEO and CREPEOs will be enhanced through the implementation of the coming PHC project by JICA. Therefore sustainability of this project is fair.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

It is strongly recommended that the Ministry of Public Health and Social Wellbeing prepare a mid-term action plan and allocate sufficient budget for the nationwide dissemination of the continuous education system established by the Project to all the 18 provinces in the country as well as for the extension of activities by INEPEO. Also, INEPEO will be required to continuously support the local facilitators and follow up trainings and monitoring at local level in order to sustain the system. In addition, it is inevitable for INEPEO to expand the number of technical staff and to enhance their capacity for development of new training programs and materials based on the continuous education program. For CREPEOs, it is strongly recommended to secure budget for continuous education by provincial government since CREPEOs depend on external funds for their activities despite that they are one of internal organization within the Provincial Health Departments.

Lessons learned for JICA:

INEPEO was established for the implementation of the Project. However, since INEPEO did not have enough power to coordinate among the relevant directorates in the Ministry, it took a lot of works for setting up coordination and cooperation among them for the implementation of continuous trainings and monitoring. After the project completion, such coordination and cooperation have been weakening in some cases. Therefore, it is necessary to carefully discuss and confirm implementation arrangement before starting a project in order to smoothly implement planned activities within a limited project period, to firmly result expected outcomes, as well as to ensure sustainability of those outcomes.

In addition, in the case that there are similar type organizations, it is key for a project to clearly define roles and responsibilities of the counterpart organization and to differentiate its activities until the project completion in order to ensure sustainability. Also, coordination with such similar organizations is essential to avoid duplication of activities. Thus, it is necessary for the coming PHC project to carefully consider an implementation arrangement for continuous education trainings in the target areas before starting.



Continuous Education Training at INEPEO



Training Material for Continuous Education