

## Terminal Evaluation Results

<b>1. Outline of the Project</b>		
Country: Islamic Republic of Iran	Project title: Project on Strengthening Technical and Vocational Training Management Skills in TVTO	
Issue/Sector: Technical and Vocational Education and Training	Cooperation scheme: Technical cooperation project	
Division in charge: Higher and Technical Education Division, Higher Education and Social Security Group, Human Development Department, JICA	Total cost (as of the time of evaluation):295,014,000 yen	
Period of cooperation:	(R/D): From July 1, 2007 to December 31, 2010	Partner country's implementing organization: Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO)
	(Extended): (F/U): (E/N):	Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare (MHLW), Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan
		Related cooperation:
<p><b>1-1. Background of the Project</b></p> <p>Youth unemployment rate is a social problem in Iran, with the level around 10%. Development of human resources for building a stable economy is stated as the prioritized issue in the Fourth Five-Year Development Plan (2005-2009), and the government has been taking approaches such as the creation of employment opportunity and the reformation of the vocational training mechanism.</p> <p>Vocational training in Iran is implemented mainly by the Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO) under the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA). TVTO is a governmental agency serving an important role in the vocational training of Iran, having 588 technical training centers throughout the country and provides vocational training to about 1.8 million people a year. However, it faces problems such as the mismatch between training standards and courses and the needs of the labor market and employment, and inefficiency of the improvement process of training evaluation and courses. Based on such conditions, a project to improve TVTO's capacity of training management was requested to the Government of Japan.</p> <p>Receiving the request, JICA implemented the Project on Strengthening Technical and Vocational Training Management Skills in TVTO, scheduled for three years and six months from July 2007 to December 2010. The project, with TVTO as a counterpart organization, dispatched experts for</p>		

the preparation of the launch of the project and provided counterpart training in Japan to eight trainees in total. From November 2008, a team of six experts (leader, vice leader/vocational training management expert (1), experts for vocational training management (2), the needs analysis /evaluation of training courses, monitoring and evaluation of training, and training standards and curriculum) was dispatched. The team is currently engaged in the improvement of training management, including the understanding and analysis of training needs, review of training standards and curriculum, implementation of pilot training, monitoring and evaluation of training courses and the formulation of training improvement plans.

### **1-2. Project Overview**

#### (1) Overall Goal

CBT<sup>1</sup> method becomes the fundamental of training system for TVTO.

#### (2) Project Purpose

Training management cycle of TVTO is improved.

#### (3) Outputs

- 1) TVTO understands the training needs of labor market effectively.
- 2) TVTO develops, reviews and updates the training course standards and curriculum based on the result of the labor market needs assessment.
- 3) TVTO improves the training monitoring and evaluation system.
- 4) TVTO prepares the training management improvement plan based on the review of the pilot training course.

---

<sup>1</sup> CBT stands for competency-based training, and is the training based on the needs in the industry. The CBT method is merely an instrument, and its purpose is to establish a training management cycle for implementing training that reflects the needs in the industry (gathering information on the needs in the labor market, development of curriculum and training materials based on labor needs, implementation of training, monitoring/evaluation after the training and reflecting the results in the training).

(4) Inputs (as of the time of evaluation)

Japanese side:

Total cost of the project (as of the time of evaluation): 295,014,000 yen

Dispatch of experts: one chief advisor (preparation of launch), one leader of work implementation, one vice leader/vocational training management (1) expert, one vocational training management (2) expert, one training needs evaluation and analysis expert, one training monitoring/evaluation expert, one training standards and curriculum/CBT advisor, two training standards and curriculum/auto mechanics advisors

Equipment: PC, printer, etc.

Iranian side:

Assignment of project personnel: TVTO Deputy, Director General of the Curriculum Development Center (CDC), and three personnel including the instructors at the Technical and Vocational Training Center (TVTC)

Provision of facilities and equipment: Project office space within the TVTO and the TVTC, equipment for pilot training course

**2. Evaluation Team**

Members of evaluation team	<p>Team leader: Mr. Nobuyuki KONISHI, Head of the Higher and Technical Education Division, Human Development Department, JICA</p> <p>Vocational training: Mr. Toshio OSA Executive Advisor, Kyoto Center of the Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan</p> <p>Cooperation planning: Mr. Kenichiro KOMATSU, Higher and Technical Education Division, Human Development Department, JICA</p> <p>Evaluation analysis: Ms. Kinuko MITSUYA, Consultant, IC Net Limited</p>	
Period of evaluation	From October 22 to November 3, 2010	Type of evaluation: Terminal evaluation

**3. Results of Evaluation**

**3-1. Confirmation of achievements**

(1) Outputs

(Output 1) TVTO understands the training needs of labor market effectively.

The training management method was understood by the TVTO staff through the training implemented in Japan under the Project, and guidance was provided to the instructors for

which the Project was implemented directly by the experts. The Training needs study was conducted using the training needs assessment method developed by the Project at the time when each pilot training course was planned or when the target area was considered. It was decided that both the first and second pilot training courses cover the “auto mechanics area.” Thus, it can be judged that Output 1 was achieved.

(Output 2) TVTO develops, reviews and updates the training course standards and curriculum based on the result of the labor market needs assessment.

Based on the implementation of needs surveys to companies in the auto mechanics industry and to automobile repair garages, it was decided that the trainings will be provided for the “repair of electric system in auto mechanics” and the “inspection and maintenance of automobiles,” and competency selection was conducted. As a result, credits for the first and second training courses were decided, curriculum for each credit decided, and the courses were implemented. Therefore, it is judged that Outcome 2 was achieved.

(Output 3) TVTO improves the training monitoring and evaluation system.

Draft version of training monitoring and evaluation manual was prepared within the period of the project. It is scheduled that the final version will be completed by the self-reliant effort of the Iranian side after the project is terminated. The training monitoring and evaluation system for the pilot training course was also developed and put into practice. With these systems being utilized for the two pilot training courses, it is judged that Output 3 was achieved.

(Output 4) TVTO prepares the training management improvement plan based on the review of the pilot training course.

Based on the experiences of and lessons learned from the two pilot training courses implemented by the Project, TVTO training management improvement plan (English version) was prepared. After the completion of the first edition, the second edition is currently being prepared based on the result of discussions between the Japanese and Iranian sides. This improvement plan is a tool to support the improvement of training management by TVTO, and is scheduled to be translated by the Iranian side after the termination of the Project. Because it is scheduled that the content of the training management improvement plan (second and final edition) will be included in the final report submitted by Japanese experts after the termination of the Project, it is expected that indicators 4-1 and 4-2 will be achieved before the termination of the Project.

(2) Project Purpose (Training management cycle of TVTO is improved.)

It was confirmed that among the four Outputs to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose, Outputs 1 to 3 are smoothly being achieved. Thus, it is expected that it is highly probable that the Project Purpose will be achieved.

(3) Overall Goal (CBT method becomes the basis of the training system for TVTO.)

As a result of the discussions for this evaluation, it is suggested that there is only low possibility that the original Overall Goal, “framework for national standards of profession is improved,” will be achieved within the three to five years from the termination of the Project (2013-2015). Therefore, under the agreement between Japan and Iran, the Overall Goal was revised as “CBT method becomes the basis of the training system for TVTO.” It is scheduled that the English version (draft final) of the CBT method manual will be completed before the end of this Project. Thus, if the Persian version of the CBT method manual is prepared by the self-reliant effort of the Iranian side after the project is terminated, and the manual will be utilized appropriately and strategically according to the training management improvement plan suggested by the project, it is judged that the probability of the Overall Goal being achieved will be higher.

Placing the CBT method as the base for TVTO’s training system means that training based on an appropriate vocational training management cycle will be implemented in relevant organizations under TVTO.

### **3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results**

(1) Relevance

The relevance of the Project is evaluated as high for the following reason.

- The Project is consistent with the policy of the Government of Iran, the aid policy of Japan and the needs of target group.

(2) Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the Project is evaluated as relatively high for the following reason.

- The outputs of the Project are contributing in the achievement of the Project Purpose.
- The ownership at the Iranian side is improving.
- On the other hand, the number of instructors who directly received technical transfer eventually decreased to three. The project implementation and management system on the Iranian side changed frequently.

(3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is evaluated as moderate for the following reason.

- Inputs from the Japanese side were carried forward as planned. Upon the introduction of CBT method, an Australian expert was promoted to improve efficiency.
- On the other hand, the management system on the Iranian side changed frequently, and the number of C/P instructors was reduced at the midway of the Project.

#### (4) Impact

It is expected that the positive impact of the Project is ensured if the following conditions and environment are fulfilled within three to five years from now. However, it is required that a follow-up study for the pilot training course be implemented and the result analyzed by the self-reliant effort of Iranian side after the termination of the Project. By implementing the follow-up study, it is assumed that the issues for the future will be clarified. At the same time, it is judged that the implementation policy and system on the Iranian side for the achievement of the Overall Goal is improved and reinforced.

- There is no stagnation of Iranian economy caused by factors such as the stagnation of world economy or the continuation and expansion of economic sanction to Iran in the future.
- Organizational reform of vocational training area in Iran is carried forward smoothly.
- When the CBT method is fully introduced, the national standards of profession will be prepared according to the method.
- The number of instructors who acquired the practical manner of the utilization of CBT method increases.
- Using the IRG (Industrial Reference Group) in the auto mechanics area that is established in this Project as a model, IRG promoting the similar public-private collaboration in other areas will be established.

#### (5) Sustainability

Sustainability was evaluated from three aspects, namely “organizational and institutional sustainability,” “financial sustainability” and “technical sustainability.” The results are as follows.

##### (1) Organizational and institutional sustainability

In order to ensure the sustainability of the Project, there is an urgent need to reinforce and revise the management and implementation system on the Iranian side in terms of organization and institution. In addition, in order to continuously utilize the IRG established under the Project, it is necessary that the IRG coordination services assumed by the JICA project team are taken over by the TVTO.

##### (2) Financial sustainability

There were no major problems in the operational expenses paid by the Iranian side for the implementation of this Project. In this Project, no large-sized equipment was supplied from the Japanese side, and it was possible to implement pilot training courses by utilizing the existing facilities. Also in order for the Iranian side to continuously utilize the outputs of the Project on their own even after the termination of the Project, it is expected that TVTO will formulate an action plan and budget blueprint.

(3) Technical sustainability

TVTO regards CBT method as an adequate and effective training method for the area of vocational training in Iran. Through the two pilot training courses implemented under this Project, the introduction of the CBT method in Iran was confirmed as relevant and effective. Also, it was confirmed that instructors who received technical instructions directly from experts acquired skills that are more practical than before, which became clear through the planning, implementing, evaluating and monitoring of these pilot training courses. It is expected that the counterparts acquire further knowledge and know-how on the introduction of the CBT method before the termination of the Project, and support relevant organizations and parties under the TVTO as master instructors who are essential for the expansion of the CBT method throughout Iran, which should be implemented by Iran alone.

**3-3. Conclusion**

Because the project management and implementation system on the Iranian side was frequently changed since the start of the Project, it could not be necessarily judged that the ownership of the Project on the Iranian side is high. However, it was confirmed that the ownership on the Iranian side is improving since July 2010 due to factors such as the effect of CBT method being further understood among the relevant parties of the Project, and that the possibility of the full introduction of CBT method within the Instructor Training Center (ITC) increased with the implementation of the second pilot training course in ITC, where the training of instructors for vocational training centers is implemented. Thus, with the practical know-how of the CBT method being transmitted in sequence, starting from the three instructors to whom the technique was transferred directly under the Project, to other ITC instructors, instructors at the district level and to instructors in each training center, it is expected that the sustainability of the Project is ensured.

While it is good that these issues are being addressed, it was confirmed as of the time of this survey that activities to achieve the Project Purpose are being implemented almost completely as planned, and the expected outputs are being achieved in general. Therefore, it is concluded that

the Project Purpose is achieved by the termination of the Project.

### **3-4. Recommendations (specific measures, suggestions and advice on this project)**

#### **(1) Implementation of the remaining units of auto mechanics courses**

The units of the second pilot training course actually implemented during the Project period were 10 units out of 21.

Technical transfer to the local counterpart was implemented securely through the process of implementing the pilot training course twice. However, in order to further establish the techniques transferred, it is desirable that the ITC will autonomously implement the remaining 11 units and complete the packages compiling all units.

Upon the implementation, the development of personnel in charge of the CBT method introduction and the diffusion and expansion to other areas can be promoted by implementing a project involving other instructors on auto mechanics belonging to ITC and the instructors for other professions as the assistants of the instructors who were engaged in this Project.

In addition, it is necessary that ITC actively approaches the industry so that the IRG is operated adequately, and to maintain the relationship between the two parties.

#### **(2) Diffusion of the CBT method within the ITC**

It is recommended that the diffusion of the CBT method is implemented as an independent program by the ITC. As mentioned in above (1), it is desirable that diffusion is first implemented within the area of auto mechanics, and then applying the CBT method gradually to areas other than auto mechanics, so that the CBT method is diffused broadly within the ITC.

Introduction of the CBT method is a tool for responding adequately to human resources development needs in the industry, and the method itself is not the purpose. It is important to construct a mechanism where the needs in the industry are understood from time to time, the needs are reflected in the curriculum, practical training is implement based on such curriculum, and the result of the training is monitored and reflected in the implementation of the upcoming training.

Further, it may be more effective for some categories of businesses and professions to use methods other than CBT. The CBT method may not necessarily apply to the professions without the need of curriculum reform, such as the training of traditional skills that do not accompany technological innovation. Rather, the introduction should be decided as needed.

#### **(3) Introduction of CBT method throughout the country**

As the next step after the CBT method being diffused within the ITC, it is recommended to



diffuse the method throughout the country. An effective mechanism is necessary in order to diffuse the method nationwide. For example, it would be effective to establish a training course on the CBT method within the ITC and let the instructors at TVTCs throughout the country take the course.

It is a mechanism where instructors who went through the course return to each TVTC, diffuse the CBT method there, and work as the local version of the personnel in charge of the introduction of the CBT method.

(4) Reinforcing the collaboration between the CDC and the ITC

In order to diffuse the CBT method in Iran, collaboration between the CDC, which assumes the role of developing the national curriculum for vocational training in Iran, and the ITC, is highly important. Also for reflecting the achievement of curriculum reform at the actual working site of the ITC in the national standards of curriculum from time to time, the CDC and the ITC should maintain close communication and carry forward realistic discussions for the diffusion of the CBT method.

### **3-5. Lessons learned**

The following lessons learned were identified as of the time of the terminal evaluation.

(1) Selection of the project implementation organization

This Project originally assumed the administrative institution that controls the entire framework of the training, namely the TVTO, to be the implementation organization, and the high-level executives of the TVTO to be counterparts. Although this was adequate according to the Project Purpose, technical transfer requires the stable allocation of human resources and the accumulation of experience. In this Project, the post of the counterparts frequently became the target of personnel reshuffling, which became the factor to reduce the efficiency of the Project. It is virtually impossible for the project to control the personnel affairs in the administrative organization on the counterpart side, so inconvenience to a certain extent is inevitable. However, it is very important for improving the efficiency of the project that the project implementation organization is selected by also considering the frequency of personnel reshuffling in the future to the utmost extent at the start of the project.

In addition, the project implementation organization was switched to the ITC at the final stage of the Project, and the ITC has the past experience of being provided with assistance from Japan. The management of the ITC is very familiar with the framework of cooperation from Japan, and also had strong awareness in participating in the Project. One of the staff who was employed as the local staff of the Project used to work as a counterpart of a previous project, and thoroughly understood the position of Japan in the Project and

contributed greatly in the implementation of project activities. Thus, utilizing the past achievements of the cooperation in such style is very important in order to efficiently implement the project. In order to achieve outputs efficiently and effectively, it is desirable to consider whether the framework of the cooperation can utilize the past assets sufficiently or not when planning a project.

(2) Utilization of helpful local human resources

In this Project, human resources who retired from the TVTO were employed as advisors at the project site. This individual contributed greatly in establishing a very smooth coordination with the TVTO, which used to be rather difficult due to the frequent personnel reshuffling, and this was one of the major factors for the Project's achievement of outputs. There is always a necessity to employ local human resources in various occasions through the course of implementing a project, and it may be no exaggeration to say that the excavation of helpful local human resources has a large influence on the success of a project.

(3) Cooperation on the introduction of the CBT method

In this Project, an Australian expert was employed as the expert for the CBT method, which resulted in achieving an efficient technical transfer. While the CBT method is a system that is difficult to be accepted in Japan due to its governmental framework and corporate culture, it is recognized widely throughout the world as an effective concept/method for vocational training. It can be easily assumed that many requests for aid related to the CBT method will come in from different countries in the future, and it is necessary for Japan to decide its policy on how to respond to such requests.

As a general rule, we should not adhere to a single type of method, and should react flexibly according to the details of the cooperation. We obtained experience in implementing a project by successfully combining human resources in and out of Japan. The CBT method is merely a tool, and for those who try to introduce and realize the CBT method it is important to pursue an ideal way of cooperation by identifying the parts where know-how and experience of Japan can be utilized and the parts where they cannot be utilized.