

Summary Sheet for Terminal Evaluation

1. Outline of Project	
Country: The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	Project Title: Participatory Forest Management Project In Belete-Gera RFFA Phase 2
Issue/Sector: Forest sector	Cooperation scheme: Technical cooperation
Division in charge: JICA Ethiopia Office	Total Cost: 37 million Japanese Yen (in time of this final evaluation)
Period of Cooperation (R/D): October 2006 to September 2010 (4 years) (Extension): None	Implementing Agency in Partner Country: Oromia Forest and Wildlife Enterprise (OFWE)
	Supporting Organization in Japan: None
Related Cooperation: None	
1-1 Background of the Project	
<p>Currently, the Oromia Region represents approximately 70% of the forest resources of Ethiopia, however, its closed high forests are diminishing 50,000 ha to 100,000 ha per year due to agriculture expansion, fuel wood collection, illegal settlers, urbanization, forest fires, and poor logging practice. Unless effective measures are taken, the forest resources would disappear in a few decades.</p> <p>In this context, the Oromia Regional Government requested to the Government of Japan for a project-based technical cooperation in line with the results of the "Forest Resources Management Study in Southwestern Part of Ethiopia" which was conducted by JICA in 1998. The first phase of Belete-Gera PFM Project initiated in October 2003 for a three-year period, mainly focused on establishment of forest management system to be carried out by local people. In June 2006, the joint terminal evaluation concluded that the project purpose was mostly achieved since a system of participatory forest management (PFM) was mostly established in which Provisional-Forest Management Agreement (P-FMA) were signed between the Oromia Regional Government and WaBuBs in the target sub-villages.</p> <p>In order to further expand WaBuB PFM in Belete-Gera Regional Forest Priority Area (RFFA), JICA and the Oromia Regional Government has agreed to conduct the 2nd phase of PFM Project in Belete-Gera RFFA (hereinafter referred as "the Project"), which commenced on 1 October 2006 with the duration of four years. This terminal evaluation was conducted in June 2010 for assessing achievements of the Project and recommending exit strategies.</p>	
1-2 Project Overview	
<p>(1) Overall Goal Participatory forest management is carried out in a sustainable manner by the local people in Belete-Gera RFFA.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose WaBuB Participatory Forest Management (WaBuB PFM) is developed in selected areas in Belete-Gera RFFA.</p> <p>(3) Output</p> <p><i>Component 1: Institutional Development and Project Management</i> Output 1.1: Efficient and effective Project management and M&E mechanisms established Output 1.2: Institutional capacity of Oromia Forest and Wildlife Enterprise (OFWE)/Jimma Branch Office (OFWE-JBO) and District Agriculture and Rural Development Office (ARDO) strengthened</p> <p><i>Component 2: Establishment of Forest Management Associations</i> Output 2.1: WaBuBs established in each selected sub-village Output 2.2: Joint forest monitoring for WaBuBs carried out by WaBuBs and OFWE-JBO /ARDO Output 2.3: WaBuB By-laws and Participatory Forest Management Plans implemented</p> <p><i>Component 3: Improvement of livelihood for local communities in Belete-Gera RFFA</i></p>	

Output 3.1.1: International Coffee Certificate acquired
 Output 3.1.2: Pro-WaBuB Coffee Business Partnerships established
 Output 3.1.3: Organizational capacity of WaBuB Cooperatives strengthened
 Output 3.2.1: WFS Extension Platform established
 Output 3.2.2: WaBuB members acquired knowledge on improved agriculture techniques through WFS

(4) Inputs (in time of the final evaluation)

From Japan:

Experts: 107 person-months (planned)
 Local staff: 15 persons (as of June 2010)
 Local operation costs: 1.3 million US\$ (2006 to 2009 in fiscal year of Japan)
 Training in Japan: 24 persons (as of June 2010)
 Equipment: GPS, copier, desktop and laptop computers, etc.

From Ethiopia:

Project staff: 10 persons in zone and district level including 5 forest experts
 Project operation costs: 6,300 US\$ for supporting staff, utility charges, etc. (until May 2010)
 Land/Facilities: Project offices in Jimma and Gera

2. Evaluation Team

Members of the Team	Mr. ENDO Hiroaki (Team Leader), Director, Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 2, Global Environment Department, JICA Mr. NAKAMURA Takahiro (Evaluation Planning), Representative, JICA Ethiopia Mr. ARAI Yuki (Planning and Management), Program Officer, Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 2, Global Environment Department, JICA Mr. TERAO Toyomitsu (Evaluation Analysis), Consultant, Fisheries Engineering Co., Ltd.	
Period of Evaluation	3 to 18 June 2010	Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Achievements of the Project

(1) Achievements in Outputs

Component 1: Institutional Development and Project Management

The Component 1 is aimed at institutional development. Before beginning of the Project, it was thought that most difficult part of the activities under Component 1 will be formulation of WaBuB Field Manual and involvement of Development Agency (DA) in the Project. These two have been successfully achieved. On the other hand, less involvement of the Ethiopian project staffs (forestry experts of OFWE) have resulted in less achievement in the joint forest monitoring and in their less experience in activities in WaBuB level.

Component 2: Establishment of Forest Management Associations

The project Activities under the Component 2 are aimed at establishment of WaBuB. Tasks necessary for organizing WaBuB have been successfully being implemented. Until June 2010, as many as 93 WaBuBs have been established and remaining 32 WaBuBs have been on the steps towards their establishment around in September 2010. Meanwhile, tasks necessary for preparing and implementing Forest Management Plan (FMP) have not been progressed as initially planned.

Component 3: Improvement of livelihood for local communities in Belete-Gera RFPA

1) Forest coffee: Through implementation of Forest Coffee Certification Program (FCCP), the Project has assisted WaBuBs in marketing of forest coffee, one of the main non timber forest products in the forest of Gera and Shabe Sombo District. The crop season of 2009/2010 is the first season that OFWE has planned to purchase forest coffee from WaBuBs. As of June 2010, OFWE has been purchasing forest coffee from the WaBuB Cooperatives. Thus, in all the last three crop seasons, FCCP has been able to develop and maintain marketing of coffee for WaBuBs with premium selling prices.

2) Field School: All the activities for WaBuB Field School (WFS) have been well progressed and resulted in performing of all the achievement indicators. In fact, contribution of WFS for improving agriculture in the homestead of WaBuB is reported to be visibly recognized.

(2) Achievements in the Project Purpose

The Project is behind schedule at present. As a result, even the most advanced group of WaBuB may get approval on their FMP only by September 2010 and not leave experience to be gained through implementation of FMP. This situation can however be justified as the Project needed a certain time in course of formulating the manual that can guide most practicable form of FMP for WaBuB.

3-2 Results of Five Criteria Evaluation

(1) Relevance: Very high

The Project meets the proclamation of forest conservation, development and utilization (No.94/1994) of the Federal Government of Ethiopia and the forest proclamation (No.72/2003) of the Oromia Regional Government. Since villagers in Belete-Gera RFPAs have traditionally depended much of their livelihood on non timber forest products, sustainable use of these products that is one of the main objectives of the Project will meet their needs. The participatory forest management adopted by the Project can initiate and develop co-management of the natural resources that incorporates the traditional user rights. In this aspect, the Project is highly evaluated as well.

(2) Effectiveness: High

Some effects have been generated already through partial or full achievement of the Outputs. These include the boundaries to protect the natural forest, provisional FMA that can limit deforestation by the communities participated in WaBuB, FCCP that has attracted WaBuB members and generated their incentives for PFM, and effective WFS for developing agro-forestry in the homestead of WaBuBs and improving socioeconomic life in the communities.

(3) Efficiency: High

Inputs of the JICA experts and training in Japan and third countries were made mostly appropriately in terms of timing and volumes of input. In the field of project review, trainer training for WFS and planning of PFM, the Project could well utilize outsourcing from FAO, RECOFTC in Thailand and some institutions in Kenya.

(4) Impact: Prospected to be very high

Some spillover effects have been arising already, which include contribution of WFS in socialization of PFM and in update of knowledge and information of PFM for WaBuB members, another contribution of WFS to develop gender equality in local communities, and increased revenue of OFWE from forest coffee purchase that can be utilized for implementation of FMP in the project area.

(5) Sustainability: Prospected to be fair

One of the provisions of the Oromia Forest Proclamation (No.72 in 2003) directs needs of permission of the traditional user's rights for state forest resources. In the national level, Division of Natural Resources Management of Ministry of Agriculture is said to prepare for guidelines for management of forest of PFM approach. These may suggest PFM approach will be supported by the government in future as well.

The Project leaves a set of manuals that have been highly developed. These manuals can be fully utilized under the condition that OFWE is promoting PFM in other RFPAs. In addition, the Project has developed skilled DAs and farmer facilitators in many villages holding WaBuBs. These human resources will contribute to further development of PFM.

The implementation process of FMP of WaBuB will not be completed by end of the Project. Mainly by this reason, the sustainability cannot be assessed to be high.

3-3 Conclusion

Implementation of FMP is not expected to reach the achievement indicators by end of the Project, as

a certain time was needed to seek most practicable form of FMP so that forest can be managed by WaBuB for a long time. Since the impact and sustainability of the relevant activities can be maximized if the Project can have more time to work on FMP, the Joint Evaluation Study Team recommended to extend the project period. Extension period is suggested to be 1.5 years, as nearly 100% of the WaBuBs will be fairly given the opportunities to develop and implement FMP, and OFWE-JBO and WaBuB cooperatives will also be able to experience a full process of purchasing and shipping forest coffee by adding this period.

3-4 Recommendations

(1) A detailed activity plan for the extension phase should be prepared as soon as possible. PDM should be modified if necessary.

(2) Strengthening the Implementation Capacity of OFWE-JBO

- Effective utilization of well-trained and well-experienced staffs
- OFWE-JBO's further commitment to the Project as one of the important mandates
- Introduction of a training program concerning basic PFM for newly employed staffs
- Employment of the project coordinator and the field coordinators after project termination.
- More active involvement of OFWE-JBO experts in the Project

(3) Forest Management Planning and Implementation

- Provision of detailed explanation on the objectives and differences of P-FMA and FMP to farmers
- Further promotion of training of FFs who can contribute to develop, implement and monitor FMP
- Recognition by OFWE-JBO and ARDO on their roles and responsibilities in FMP
- Allocation of OFWE-JBO budget for implementation of FMP in advance
- Extension of P-FMA until conclusion of formal agreement

(4) Restriction of Commercial Coffee Plantation

- Provision of strict surveillance on the investors in Belete-Gera RPFA and necessary measures in order to prevent excessive commercial coffee plantations

(5) Forest Coffee

- Cooperation with a NGO purchasing coffee in Belete-Gera RPFA for supporting farmers and protecting the forests
- Further efforts by OFWE-JBO for timely purchasing forest coffee from the cooperatives
- Sharing of information with the cooperatives on costs and profits of coffee purchase by OFWE-JBO
- OFWE-JBO's more recognition on FCCP as one of their mandates

(6) Preparation for Expanding the WaBuB Approach

- Development of a strategy for expanding the project outcomes in other RFPAs
- Planning of public relations activities - promotion videos, seminars and workshops

(7) Promoting Communication among Project-related Offices

- Provision of sufficient opportunities for communication and information sharing among the JBO, Belete-Gera Unit Office and the Project Office for a better implementation of PFM activities