

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

| 1. Outline of the Project | |
|---|--|
| Country: Kyrgyz Republic | Project title: The Community Empowerment Project in the Issyk-Kul Oblast of the Kyrgyz Republic |
| Issue/Sector: Social Development Sector | Cooperation scheme: Project-type Technical Cooperation |
| Division in charge: Economic Infrastructure Department, JICA | Total cost: US\$ 3,609,289 [approximately JPY 320 million] |
| Period of Cooperation: From January 4 th 2007 to September 24 th 2010 | Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Issyk-Kul Oblast state government |
| Related Cooperation: nil | |
| <p>1-1. Background</p> <p>With a view of accelerating the social and economic development of the Issyk-Kul Oblast, JICA conducted a study on Integrated Development of the Issyk-Kul Zone over the period from November 2003 to December 2004. The study proposed a Master Plan for Integrated Issyk-Kul Development, a program for community-driven development to enhance economic activities and improve social services at the village level with other three programs: agricultural development, tourism, and environmental conservation. The government of the Kyrgyz Republic placed the priority onto community empowerment among four programs, and requested a technical cooperation project to Japanese government in order to enhance economic activities and improve social services at the village level.</p> <p>The Project aimed at establishing a sustainable system to empower community through the One Village One Product movement. Pilot projects in selected some of villages are conducted as model communities to gain essential lessons for establishment of the sustainable system.</p> <p>JICA, the Issyk-Kul Oblast Administration, signed to the Record of Discussion for the Community Empowerment Project in the Issyk-Kul Oblast of the Kyrgyz Republic (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”) in August 10 2006 and this project started from January 2007 for approximately four years with Phase I and Phase II.</p> | |
| <p>1-2. Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal: Socio-economic revitalization in the Issyk-Kul Oblast in harmony with environmental preservation.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose: A sustainable system for the regional development through community empowerment is established with the OVOP Movement.</p> <p>(3) Outputs:</p> <p><u>Phase I (Preparatory Phase)</u></p> <p>1 Implementation system (Personnel, budget, capability, networks, etc.) which is capable for conducting Phase II is prepared.</p> | |

Phase II (Full-scale cooperation Phase)

- 2 Implementation system is well functional.
 - 3 Pilot communities are empowered through the OVOP Movement.
 - 4 The effectiveness of community empowerment method with the OVOP Movement is verified.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side:

a) Personnel

Experts 12 in total

Primary categories are: Team Leader/Community Empowerment/Poverty Alleviation, Community Empowerment / Gender / Participatory approach, OVOP promotion, Capacity Development (Institutional Development), Capacity Development (Human Resource Development), Coordinator

b) Equipment: Herb Dryer, PH Meter

Office Equipment, etc.

c) Counterpart training in Japan: 13 personnel

Kyrgyz Side:

a) Personnel

Counterpart:

Project Director, Project Manager, PIU members from Issyk-Kul Oblast state government

b) Facilities

Project office in the Oblast state government's office

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team:

1. Leader: Mr. Masahiko SUZUKI Senior Assistant to the Director for Economic infrastructure Department, JICA

2. Evaluation Planning : Mr. Yasuhisa TOMINAGA

Planning and Coordination Division/Economic Infrastructure Department, JICA

3. Evaluation Design : Ms. Yasuyo OKUMOTO

Private Sector Development Division, Private
Sector Development Group, Industrial
Development Department, JICA

4. Project Evaluation : Mr. Jun TOTSUKAWA

Senior Consultant , Sano Planning Co., Ltd

Period of Evaluation Study: 30 June, 2010 to 20 July, 2010

Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1. Relevance

(1) Policy priority

The government proclaimed Laws on CBOs and its Associations, which aimed at empowering

communities through forming CBOs at community level. The Issyk-Kul Oblast state government also newly stated the “necessity of expansion of the OVOP movement” as one of the crucial activities in its Strategic Development Plan in response to the Government Resolution P-172 in March 2010.

The Project also accords with the “Japan’s Country Assistance Program to Kyrgyz Republic” which shows the assistance to community empowerment is one of the key issues.

In this line, it is evaluated that the direction of the Project is consistent with the policy priority of both governments.

(Needs of Issyk-Kul Oblast state government)

The government had experiences to empower community by the approach that places more priority on material support in other projects. The Project, whose primary focus is capacity building of community people, was expected to show another possibility to effectively empower communities. In this line, it met with the needs of Issyk-Kul Oblast government.

(Appropriateness of counterparts)

Only the provincial government could take key roles to implement the Project under the Project’s framework. Although “inefficiency” is observed in terms of counterpart arrangement, the selection of counterparts is regarded as appropriate.

(Appropriateness of the number of the Pilot Projects)

The purpose of the pilot project implementation was to gain essential lessons in order to establish the sustainable system, therefore, 6 villages in total of the project sites is evaluated reasonable. In addition, the Project took a basic stance to train CBOs from the basic matters, which automatically require manpower. The number is reasonable from the viewpoint of the balance between the Project’s basic stance and necessary manpower.

(Japan’s technology experiences and advantage)

Japan has accumulated community development/empowerment experiences through the OVOP movement for the past decades. The Project took advantage of the experiences and skills collected in Japan.

3-2. Effectiveness

(1) Project Purpose

The system that the Project established/proposed for community empowerment through the OVOP movement is not evaluated as sustainable because it entails external condition for the system to function. The system has to require additional budgetary arrangement on the function of the OVOP promoter, assuming it NGO manpower, as indispensable input.

In this line, the Project purpose, which aimed at establishing sustainable system, was not achieved yet.

However, it should be noted that the approaches showed by the Project and various lessons accumulated in the pilot projects are evaluated highly useful.

(2) Output 1

The essential parts of the implementation system regarding personnel assignment and budget allocation were not prepared although the provincial government made sincere efforts such as submitting the proposals to the central government.

In this line, it is evaluated the Output 1 was not achieved.

(3) Output 2

The level of completion of the various indicators' requirements on Output 2 is mixed. Such as establishment of KSRS and a series of network activities are one of the highlighted outcomes and highly evaluated. However, looking at the expected output is “to function implementation system”, the level of completion is evaluated as lower than expected.

(4) Output 3

A series of activities in the pilot projects lead to significant performance in some of the communities. Actions such as mutual assistance within the communities are recently observed.

In this line, Output 3 is evaluated almost achieved.

(5) Output 4

The effectiveness of the method at community level is almost verified through the pilot project activities. The lessons accumulated are now able to show the indispensable entities and steps to promote the OVOP activities over looking at community empowerment.

On the other hand, verification of the total system including personnel assignment and budgetary arrangement was not carried out during the Project period.

In this line, although there are several highlighted outcomes, the level of the achievement of Output 4 is lower than expected.

(6) Contribution Factors

- NGO, FORWARD, contracted with the Project made significant contribution to the progress of the Project.
- Providing premises with free of charge by the province, AO and the university, and discounting permission and license fee were supportive factors to continue CBOs' business.
- Volunteers working at KSRS are also essential manpower to run KSRS activities.

(7) Inhibition Factors

- Unpredicted political events and movements for these years led to frequent change of counterpart personnel, which made negative influence on the effectiveness and efficiency of technical transfer.

3-3. Efficiency

(1) Input (manpower: Japanese side)

Long term experts are evaluated as reasonable input in terms of dispatched period, taking into consideration of co-work with project staffs, NGOs and others. As for the short term experts, there is an example that the expected manpower input on food processing could not be realized. On the other hand, the dispatched short term expert on designing felt products made significant contribution to improving

the product quality.

In this line, Japanese expert inputs are evaluated almost appropriate only except losing opportunity to dispatch a short term expert on food processing.

In addition, local human resources instead of Japanese experts reinforced technical instruction on food processing (dry fruit).

(2) Input (manpower: Kyrgyz side)

The province could not assign full time staff(s) to PIU members. It gave negative influences on technical transfer to provincial staffs as well as verification of sustainable system to empower communities with the OVOP movement.

(3) Input (equipment)

Material inputs were provided limited volume to the pilot projects. It is evaluated appropriate in line with the Project's concept, which promotes CBO's ownership mind.

(4) Training in Japan

Most of the participants from Rayon are now out of the administrative office due to political change in April 2010. It is, therefore, those trainings could not lead to expected effects.

In addition, if some of AO had been included in the training participants, the Project could have accelerated development in pilot projects and/or promoted the OVOP movement surrounding communities in their AO.

(5) Complementary effect

There were exchange of information and training/seminars with local NGO, Community Based Tourism. Such exchange also enhanced the capacity building of CBOs.

3-4. Impact

(1) Prospects of Achievement of Overall Goal (5 years after the Project ends)

Other integrated measures including economic sector as well as environmental sector's intervention and commitment are necessary in order to achieve what the Overall goal requires.

If there are no interventions and commitment in particular from the central government, it is evaluated difficult to achieve the overall goal within 5 years after the Project ends.

(2) Ripple effect

(Policy aspect)

- In the course of the Project implementation, many of government staffs at not only central but also provincial, Rayon and AO showed interests in promoting the OVOP movement for community empowerment tool. It is highlighted that the provincial strategic development plan newly presented in March 2010 inserted the OVOP movement as one of the important activities.

(Technical)

- The Project has received effective manpower input from contracted NGO, FORWARD. Vice versa, the series of experiences accumulated in the NGO also contributed to building their own capacity.

(Social aspect)

- Income growth is observed in some of the pilot project CBOs. In the case of CBO at Chong-Kyzyl-Suu village, they made sales of their jam products with more than 250 thousand som during the last two seasons with 8 members.
- Social impacts in the communities also can be observed. For example, the CBO in Tasma provided their products to socially vulnerable in the community. As another example, the CBO at Barskoon village receives intern students from vocational school. The cases such as mutual assistance within communities are gradually increasing.
- Working experiences in KSRS provided the University students with social experiences, which are regarded as one of the resourceful internship venues.
- Some of the volunteer students started to engage in NGO activities on the OVOP movement after graduated. The working experiences at KSRS led to expanding local human resources on community empowerment with the OVOP movement.

(Negative impacts)

- There are no negative impacts.

3-5. Sustainability

(1) Policy aspect

The new president of the government expressed the importance to accelerate the OVOP movement while visited Issyk-Kul Oblast this year, and the OVOP movement was placed as one of key activities in the new Strategic Development Plan of the Issyk-Kul Oblast state government.

In this line, the direction of the policy is matched with what the Project has aimed. It is expected for the policies to support the movement further on.

(2) Organizational aspect

Judging the current organizational situations, it has to be evaluated difficult for the provincial government as well as Rayon and AO to provide necessary manpower volume, which enables to continue or develop the OVOP movement further in the province.

Only if the OVOP movement can proceed together with NGO, a certain level of sustainability is expected because the assigned roles of the regional government are relatively limited.

(3) Technical aspect

Since the technical transfer to the provincial government staffs could not proceed as expected, it may be difficult for them to conduct the OVOP movement activities in the same manner as the Project implemented.

In the same assumption as Organizational aspect, a certain level of sustainability is expected if the regional government can work together with NGO.

(4) Financial aspect

Under the current government system to determine state government's budget, it is difficult for the province to secure enough budget stably on the OVOP movement. Intervention as well as commitment by the central government is indispensable for financial sustainability.

4. Conclusions

The concept of the Project, “Community Empowerment with OVOP Movement” was well-understood by stakeholders not only in Issyk-kul Oblast but also in central authorities. In addition, the Project almost established the relevant methodology on community empowerment by utilizing local resources as the OVOP movement.

On the other hand, taking into account the results of the evaluation based on five criteria, it is evaluated that the Project Purpose has not yet been achieved at a satisfactory level in specific areas. However, it is important to highlight the various positive impacts: 1) Remarkable empowerment of some CBOs that gave great impacts on the Project beyond expectations, 2) Enhanced roles and functions of KSRS with participation of students in management, 3) Empowerment of a local NGO that involved in the operation of the Project, and 4) Dissemination of the concept of Community empowerment methodology with OVOP Movement in the Kyrgyz Republic.

It is pertinent to provide continuous assistance to the activities in general, that enable to enhance those achievements and potentials.

5. Recommendations

(1) Dissemination and Utilization of Guideline

The project team should take relevant measures in order to disseminate the guidelines and to have fully utilized by the line ministry, local governments and CBOs.

(2) Active and responsible support from regional government entities

The regional government (Issyk-kul Oblast State Administration, Rayons, AOs) should play an active role in supporting CBOs who are involved or willing to be involved in OVOP activites by implementing necessary tasks recommended in guidelines such as providing information, technical training, marketing or financial (or in kind) support.

(3) Support for CBOs’ outreach activities

Since it is not easy for CBO members to regularly obtain the information on related marketing events especially if those events are held outside Issyk-kul Oblast. Regional government should provide information and support to CBOs so that they can participate in those events such as EXPOs and fairs.

(4) Sustaining KSRS activities

Marketing activities held at KSRS benefited not only CBO members but also students who worked there as interns. The Issyk-Kul Oblast state government and Issyk-kul state university should continue the activities at KSRS.

(5) Financial support for CBOs

Issyk-kul oblast state government should ensure financial support for CBO’s needs by establishing financial support system or by providing information of micro finance institutions who are able to provide small credit services.

(6) Reflection to the policies

For the future application of the OVOP movement, the experiences and outputs obtained from the

Project should be well comprehended and fully utilized in formulating relevant policies with stable securement of necessary budget.

(7)Establishment of sustainable certification system for “Issyk-kul Brand”

The establishment of “Issyk-kul Brand” had a positive effect to promote products made by pilot-CBOs. It is necessary that Issyk-kul Oblast state government continue to discuss the official establishment of certification system with parties concerned.