

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant-Aid Project

conducted by Honduras Office: October, 2011

Country	“El Proyecto del Mejoramiento del Puente Agua Caliente” and “El Proyecto de Reconstrucción del Puente Las Hormigas”
Honduras	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit : 788 million yen 1 st Phase (Puente de Las Hormigas) : 499 million yen 2 nd Phase (Puente de Agua Caliente) :289 million yen	Contract Amount : 779 million yen 1 st Phase (Puente de Las Hormigas) :497 million yen 2 nd Phase (Puente de Agua Caliente) :282 million yen
E/N Date	1 st Phase : August 2005, 2 nd Phase: June 2006	
Completion Date	1 st Phase : February 2007, 2 nd Phase: December, 2007	
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Public Works, Transport and Housing (Secretaria de Obras Publicas, Transporte y Vivienda (SOPTRAVI))	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: January - August 2005	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	Katahira & Engineers International
	Contractor(s)	Hazama Corporation
	Suppliers(s)	N/A
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperations: Grant-Aid Project:El Proyecto para la Reconstrucción de los Puentes en la Zona de Tegucigalpa(1999-2002), El Proyecto para la Construcción de los Puentes Ilama y Democracia(1999-2003), El Proyecto para la Construcción de los Puentes de la Carretera de Libramiento de Choluteca(1999-2002), El Proyecto de Reconstrucción del Puente Guasaule(1999-2002) Other donors' cooperations: After the devastations by the Hurricane Mitch in 1998, World Bank, IDB, AusAID, Government of Sweden and Government of Spain provided assistance to the rehabilitation of roads and bridges.	
Background	With the support of foreign donors, Honduras has almost recovered from the devastations by the Hurricane Mitch. In terms of road transportation, there are still more work to be done at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The traffic regulations and load restriction in some of main trunk roads had still been put in force because some bridges are still impromptu facilities. It was said that only 65.6% out of the entire length of 3,200 km had been renovated as of at the end of 2004. On the other hand, there was a pressing need to put distribution in place to cope with the increasing volume of the international cargos. This was attributable to the accelerated demands of international distribution of agricultural products among Central-American countries under the Sistema de Integracion Centroamericana (SICA). Under such circumstances, it has become imperative for the Government of Honduras to rehabilitate two bridges located along the Logistic Corridor.	
Project Objectives	Outcome To strengthen the main trunk roads and to secure the safe and sustainable transportation of goods and population by rehabilitation and replacement of two bridges along the Logistic Corridor	
	Outputs Japanese Side - 1 st Phase : Puente de Las Hormigas - (45.0m, Removal of whole set of existing bridge. Construction of new bridge for replacement) - 2 nd Phase : Puente de Agua Caliente - (46.3m, Removal of upper part of existing bridge and bridge pier. Construction of new upper part of bridge and bridge pier for replacement) Honduras Side - To secure the land for construction, temporary office, storage space for construction materials - To relocate the electric power lines, communication lines and water pipes - To construce the Bailey Bridge to be used for the roundabout way (Puente Las Hormigas)	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<p>Government of Honduras has put much effort to the road maintenance and improvement. However, there are still more work to be done to upgrade the road condition. It is said that only 65.6% out of main trunk roads with entire length of 3,200km, have been renovated as of at the end of 2004. On the other hand, there is a pressing need to gain the broad distribution to cope with the increasing volume of the international cargos. This is attributable to the accelerated demands of international distribution of agricultural products among Central-American countries under the SICA. Under such circumstances, it has become imperative for the Government of Honduras to rehabilitate two bridges located along the Logistic Corridor.</p> <p>This project has largely achieved its objectives; strengthening the main trunk roads and securing the safe and sustainable transportation of goods and population by rehabilitation and replacement of two bridges along the Logistic Corridor. The velocity for transit and weight limit of passing vehicle have been achieved their target values. As for sustainability, sufficient number of staff has been allocated to maintain the roads condition and no problems have been observed in institutional, technical, financial as well as operation & maintenance aspects. For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Honduras's development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, as well, both the project cost and project period were within the plan. In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance

This project is highly relevant with Honduras development plan (ex. Poverty Reduction Strategic Paper), development needs in improvement of road condition and maintenance in order to stimulate the economy domestically and internationally, as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

Both project period and project cost was within the plan (ratio against the plan 98% and 94% respectively).Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

3 Effectiveness/ Impact

This project has largely contributed to decrease the vehicles' transit time over the bridge and to improve the traffic flow. And the increase of the weight limit for passing vehicle has facilitated the sustainable and increasing transportation of goods and population. Interviews with those in charge at the implementing agency, it was confirmed that the project has also contributed to increasing the international transportation of goods. And main trunk roads have been strengthened and the safe and sustainable transportation of goods and population has been secured. Furthermore, it was observed that the embankment stabilization for Puente de Las Hormigas has led the mitigation of flood damage and the resolution of dust dispersion by roads. Therefore, its effectiveness/impacts is high.



Puente de Las Hormigas



Puente de Agua Caliente

Quantitative Effects

Indicators	Name of the bridge	Baseline value (2004:Basic Design year)	Target value (2007/2008:After completion)	Actual value (2008:Target year)	Actual value (2011:Ex-post evaluation year)
(1) Increase of velocity for transit	Puente de Las Hormigas	Below 10km/h	2007 (Designed)80km/h	80km/h	80km/h
	Puente de Agua Caliente	Below 30km/h	2008 (Designed)80km/h	80k /h	80km/h
(2) Weight limit of passing vehicle	Puente de Las Hormigas	32.7 ton	2007 40.9 ton	40.9 ton	40.9 ton
	Puente de Agua Caliente	32.7 ton	2008 40.9 ton	40.9 ton	40.9 ton

(Data source : SOPTRAVI)

4 Sustainability

With the sufficient number of staff allocated with specific terms of reference, the current operational and maintenance including the cleaning is properly conducted through whenever necessary. In case of maintenance and repair, the experienced private contractors selected under the bidding system is in charge with technical expertise under the supervision of Department of Maintenance and Repair (Fondo Vial) As for the financial aspect, it is likely that implementing agency can secure and complement the additional budget if the repair is urgently needed. It has been observed by site visits that two bridges have maintained the favorable condition. There are no problems in institutional, technical, financial and operation and maintenance aspects. Therefore, sustainability of the project is high.



Puente Las Hormigas



Puente Agua Caliente

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

Considering the possible effects by the climatic change such as hurricane in Honduras, it is recommended that the regular check-up on maintenance should be conducted in order to protect the bridge from such disasters by early detection of any damage. Such regular check-up system will eventually lead to the extension of expected lifetime of bridges.