Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Honduras Office: October 2011

Country	The strengthening of the fire-fighting capacity project
Honduras	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 814 million yen	Contract Amount: 663 million yen
E/N Date	June,2006	
Completion Date	September, 2007	
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Justice and Interior, Fire Defense Agency (CBH)	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: June - December 2005	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	Incorporated Foundation Fire Equipment and Safety Center of Japan
	Contractor(s)	N/A
	Supplier(s)	Sojitz Corporation
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperations: Technical Cooperation - Provision of training in Japan(JICA Group Training) Grant Aid - The project for preparation of fire-fighting equipment(1989) Other donors' cooperations: - Korea(Fire-engine, man transit vehicle), Spain(Fire-engine), Spain (Fire-engine, Rescue truck, others)	
Background	In Honduras, the fire-station facilities, equipment and related human resource were focused to set up reliable fire-fighting system according to "Action plan for the strengthening of the fire-fighting capacity of CBH" in order to tackle increasing number of disaster. However, 30% of fire-engines was more than 20 years old. Thus, it was difficult for the fire-fighting capacity at that time to cope with the increasing number of disaster in urban area, caused by heavy population concentration as well as increasing large-scale/ multistory facilities.	
Project Objectives	Outcome To strengthen the fire-fighting capacity in targeted major cities (20 municipalities including Tegucigalpa, San Pedro Sula, La Ceiba, Puerto Cortes, etc.) by procurement of fire-fighting related equipment.	
	Outputs Japanese Side - Equipment: Procurement of 30 of Fire-engines (11 of leading fire-engine, 16 of cars, 2 of air working vehicle, a O&M guidance vehicle)and carried equipment, spare parts, 4 sets of wireless to targeted municipalities - Soft Component: O&M Training on Fire-engine and Fire-fighting equipment Honduran Side - Construction of garage for fire-engines together with guarantee of land, Construction of Fire Station, Guarantee of warehouse for spare parts, Arrangement of Infrastructure (Electricity, Water supply, and sewage, etc. for the procured equipment), Domestic transportation of vehicles	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation

The government of Honduras was trying to set up reliable fire-fighting system to deal with the increasing number of disaster due to heavy population concentration as well as increasing large-scale/ multistory facilities in urban area.
However, it was difficult for the fire-fighting capacity at that time to cope with above mentioned-situation because of very old fire-engine/equipment.

The project has largely achieved strengthening of the fire-fighting capacity in targeted 20 municipalities by procurement of fire-fighting related equipment. The ratio, to appropriate disposition, of Fire-engines ready to be dispatched in all 47 nationwide Fire-stations including new ones achieved to 100%. In addition, Operating ratio of wireless at Fire-stations nationwide is almost 100%. Therefore, this project has been contributing to not only targeted fire stations but also to strengthening of fire-fighting capacity of Honduras as a whole. As for sustainability, there was no problem observed in the project due to the fire-engine situation of being ready to be dispatched through daily practice of inspection in proper manner. For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Honduran development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency as well, both the project cost and project period were almost within the plan.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with the Honduran development plan (Action plan for the strengthening of the fire-fighting capacity of CBH), development needs (national as well as targeted areas' needs of the strengthening of the fire-fighting capacity), as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

Both project cost and project period were within the plan (ratio against plan: 81%, 100%). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

3 Effectiveness/Impact

The project has largely achieved its objective, strengthening of the fire-fighting capacity in targeted 20 municipalities by procurement of fire-fighting related equipment. The ratio, to appropriate disposition, of Fire-engines ready to be dispatched in all 47 nationwide Fire-stations including new ones increased from 70% at the time of ex-ante evaluation to 100% at the time of both target year and ex-post evaluation (actual achievement of targeted value). Also, the operating ratio of wireless at Fire-stations nationwide achieved 100% at target year as well as at the time of ex-post evaluation. During the site visit, it was confirmed that two wireless procured by this project were replaced to new ones by the implementing agency due to the unavailability of spare parts in domestic market. And the targeted number of prepared fire-fighting vehicles that are ready to be dispatched was achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Based on the interview with the implementing agency, timely arrivals to the fire scene have been realized after completion of the project because of its contribution to high operational rate of fire-engine. Consequently, the project has been contributing to improvement in the safety for the habitants as well as visitors from abroad in the targeted 20 municipalities. Therefore, its effectiveness/impact is high.

【Operational Indicators】

	2005(Year of BD)	Target Year(2007)	Target Year (2007 Actual Value)	Ex-post evaluation (2011)
Ratio, to appropriate disposition, of Fire-engines ready to be dispatched in all 47 nationwide Fire-stations including new ones.	63 Vehicles/90 (70%)	90Vehicles / 90(100%)	90Vehicles /90 (100%)	90Vehicles / 90(100%)
Operating ratio of wireless at Fire-stations nationwide	43Sta. /46Sta. (93%)	47Sta. /47Sta.(100%)	47Sta. / 47Sta.(100%)	47 Sta./47Sta.(100%)
Number of prepared fire-fighting vehicles that are ready to be dispatched		30 Vehicles / 30		30 Vehicles /30

(Source：CBH, Answer to the questionnaire and interview to Fire-stations in each related municipality ）

Ready to be dispatched for 24 hours due to Well maintenance

The exterior of the building of Tegucigalpa Central Fire Station

4 Sustainability

The structure of implementing agency is sustained in the similar manner of the implementation period, and it is considered enough for continuity of project effectiveness. The staff allocation has been improving because total number of allocated staffs in all stations has been increased and set optimum in each station (increase or decrease according to the each fire station's situation). As for technology for O&M, all of those who received the O&M technical training (soft-component of this project) remain as responsible persons for the equipment O&M of fire-stations. They regularly provide the trainings to persons in charge of O&M in neighboring areas. Thus, implementing agency has no problem in the technical aspect. In addition, all procured fire-engines are actually ready to be dispatched through practice of daily inspection in proper manner. Therefore, sustainability of the outcome by this project is high. As for the financial aspect in this project, expenses for personnel, fuel and O&M have been budgeted since CBH together with each municipality is expected to bear the fire-fighting cost. It was confirmed that such budget has been executed although some documented data of some targeted fire-stations could not be obtained.

A fireman in fire-fighting suit and fire-engine that is ready to be dispatched

In the light of above, this project has no problem in structural, technical, financial and current operation and maintenance aspects of implementing agency. Therefore, sustainability of this project is high.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

To assure deliberately the budget for future fire-engine procurement because procurement of new vehicles is definitely necessary as existing vehicles' deterioration go forward over time although O&M mechanism for the procured fire-engine and equipment have been well functioning.