Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Country	The Duriest for Improvement of Sefety Laboratory for National Institute of Hydrone and Enidemiology
Viet Nam	The Project for improvement of Safety Laboratory for National Institute of Hygiene and Epidemiology

conducted by Vietnam Office: October, 2011

I. Project Outline							
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 891 million	n yen	Contract Amount: 874 million yen				
EN Date	September, 2006						
Completion Date	January, 2008						
Implementing Agency	National Institute of Hygiene and Epidemiology (NIHE)						
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: January - June 2006						
Contracted	Consultant(s) Nihon Sek	kei - Fujita Planning (JV)					
	Contractor(s) Toda Corp	oration					
Agencies	Supplier(s) Mitsubishi	Corporation					
Related Projects (if any)	Japanese cooperations: Capacity Development for National Institute of Hygiene and Epidemiology to Control Emerging and Re-emerging Infectious Diseases (2006-2010) (JICA Technical Cooperation) and a number of joint collaboration researches and projects between NIHE and bilateral donors, UN agencies and NGOs						
Background	SARS outbreak occurred in Vietnam in 2003. In 2005, 65 cases of human avian influenza were reported. The country had the largest infections and fatalities caused by H5N1 avian influenza from the end of 2003 to 2005, and further spreading of the infection was being feared. The high-risk pathogens including avian influenza virus, SARS, HIV were mainly handled at NIHE. In 2005, NIHE received 2,346 clinical specimens of avian influenza. Those specimens were tested at the existing BSL-2+ laboratories for diagnosis. However, in accordance with WHO regulation, high risk pathogens must be handled at BSL-3 laboratories, but at that time, there was no BSL-3 laboratory in Vietnam.						
Project Objectives	Outcome To enhance capabilities of the research on dangerous pathererererererererererererererererererer	e National Institute of Hyg ogens such as avian influe) Biosafety level (BSL)-3 rooms) on the 3rd and 4th ry equipment chnical transfer on new fac ilding 4th floors	giene and Epidemiology (NIHE) in testing and conducting enza virus by construction of laboratories and procuring laboratories and supporting facilities (BSL-2 laboratories floors of High Tech Center (HTC) of NIHE ilities)				

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation

The establishment of BSL-3 laboratories which enables safe and appropriate examination of high-risk pathogens was the most priority in the infectious disease control in Vietnam. However, NIHE, the Vietnam's leading research institution in this field, did not have the one.

The project has largely achieved its objectives set in the basic design: i) BSL-3 and its associated facilities were established and ii) these facilities have been operated in a proper way to test and conduct researches on dangerous pathogens as well as to train other institutions. As for sustainability, there was no problem observed in the project due to NIHE's good commitment in ensuring necessary manpower as well as necessary expense for its operation and maintenance.

For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Vietnam country development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, it is evaluated as fair because project implementation period slightly exceeded the plan.

In the light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with the Vietnam's development plan (national development plans and programs for emerging and re-emerging infectious diseases; five-year plan of the health sector 2011-2015), development needs (continuous threat against hazardous pathogens and important role of BSL-3 laboratories), as well as Japan's ODA policy (Country Assistance Program for Vietnam), at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

The project cost was within the plan (ratio against plan: 98%). However, project implementation period was slightly longer than planned (ratio against plan: 124%) due to the delay of the construction of HTC building and the interior work on 3rd and 4th floor by Vietnamese side because of prolonged administrative procedures. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair. Nevertheless, the extension of the period was somehow inevitable due to some technical adjustments in the context that BSL-3 laboratories are the first ones in Vietnam, which required complicated operation regulations.

3 Effectiveness/Impact

BSL-3 laboratories have been certified in accordance with WHO's standard by Directorate for Standards, Metrology and Quantity (STAMEQ), and become a model for other institutions nationwide. The decrease in the number of tests for dangerous pathogens in 2010, after sharp increase in 2009 due to the receipt of pathogens including H5N1, H1N1 and H1N3 from all institutions of the country, can be explained by that (i) other institutes, particularly the HCMC Pasteur started receiving suspected pathogens for testing, (ii) the number of suspected pathogens decreased in 2010, and (iii) NIHE has been sustained a leading role in the national epidemiological network, conducting a number of training courses and collaborating with domestic and foreign institutions in development of biosafety regulations and joint researches, and thus the indicator/target set at the ex-ante evaluation (i.e. increased number of tests at NIHE) cannot fully capture outcomes of this project. In that way, despite the non-achievement of the target of the quantitative indicator in 2010, this project has largely achieved its objective of enhancing capabilities of NIHE in testing and conducting research on dangerous pathogens and brought a good impact to the whole network of epidemiological institutions in Vietnam. Therefore, its effectiveness/impact is high.

Quantitative Effects

Indicator(unit)	2005	2007 and thereafter	Actual results		
	(BD year)	(Target year)	2008	2009	2010
			(Target year)		
Number of tests for dangerous pathogens (such	2,346	increase	1,663	8,196	235
as avian influenza virus)	(avian influenza)				

Source: NIHE







NIHE building

Entrance to the BSL-3 laboratory

No. of joint-researches with national and international institutions

4 Sustainability

Since the establishment of BSL-3 in 2008, NIHE has shown a good commitment in ensuring necessary manpower as well as necessary expense for its operation and maintenance. In addition, within a framework of the JICA technical cooperation project, short term experts on BSL-3 operation were assigned to provide technical advices, which has contributed to the high technical level of the staffs. The deficiencies of some equipment that were found during an evaluation of that technical cooperation project have been fixed by the time of this ex-post evaluation. By this time, this project has no problem in structural, technical, financial and current operation and maintenance aspects of the implementing agency, and it is deemed that there is no specific concern for continuity of project effectiveness for future perspective. Therefore, the sustainability is evaluated as high.



Researcher working in a BSL-3 laboratory

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

A continuous effort in ensuring manpower for operation and maintenance and necessary expense is needed to maintain the proper operation of BSL-3.

Lessons learned for JICA:

This project was to bring highly advanced facilities and equipment that had never been in the country before, but attained high sustainability, possibly due to the combination of several factors as follows: (i) urgent and exclusive needs for the subject matter (in case of this project, handling of highly dangerous pathogens that had not been practiced by other entities in the country), (ii) collaboration between hardware development (this grant aid project) and software (capacity) development (software component and the technical cooperation project), and (iii) good capacity of the implementing agency to absorb the new techniques. Future projects involving advanced technology are advised to suffice these conditions as much as possible.