

終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

最終評価結果要約表（英文）

I. Outline of the Project		
Country: Republic of Mali		Project title: Project of supporting for school management committee
Issue/Sector: Basic Education		Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge: Human Development Department		Total cost Approximately 289 million Yen
Period of Cooperation	3 years (May 1, 2008 – April 30, 2011)	Partner Country’s Implementing Organization: Ministry of Education, Literacy and National Languages (MEALN), Promotion of Decentralization/Deconcentration of Education (CAD/DE)
		Supporting Organization in Japan: JICA
Related Cooperation :		
<p>1 Background of the Project</p> <p>The population of Mali is 13.5 million (as of year 2005) and GNI per capita is 380 US dollars (as of year 2005: the World Bank), which is one of the most poorest countries in the world. The Gross Enrollment Rate (GER) is 66% (as of year 2005: UNESCO) whereas the average GER in the Sub-Saharan Africa is 97%. Mali has been facing the challenges of improvement of access and quality of education. The Government of Mali gave education sector one of the highest priorities in Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) developed in 2002. The Government of Mali developed the Ten-year Education development Program (PRODEC) 1998-2008, which was extended until 2012. The three pillars of PRODEC are improvement of access of education, quality of education and decentralization. In addition, it was obliged to setup School management committees (CGS) at each school in 2004. Yet, less than half of the schools in Mali succeeded to setup CGS due to the insufficient communication between central government and local government as well as lack of local governmental ability. Taking this background into consideration, the Government of Mali requested a technical cooperation which aims to improve the school management through community participation.</p> <p>2 Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>School environments in all of the primary schools in Mali are improved through decentralized school management.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <p>School managements in the project target areas are improved through functional CGS.</p> <p>(3) Outputs</p> <p>a: The role, authority and responsibility of CGS and CGS related organizations are understood among people concerned.</p>		

b: The ability of CGS on school management are strengthened.

c: The monitoring system of CGS is developed and established.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side :

Long-term Expert: 2 experts (70.0M/M) Equipment: 12,623,000Yen

Short-term Expert: 4 experts (11.5M/M) Local cost: 111,079,000Yen

Trainees received: 2 participants Others: -

Total Cost: Approximately 289 million Yen

Malian Side :

Counterpart: CAD/DE 2 people, AE 7 people, CAP 9 people, commune 99 people

Equipment: -

Land and Facilities: Project office for Japanese experts

Local Cost: Utility costs for the project office for Japanese experts

Others: -

II. Evaluation Team

Leader: Kazuhiro Tambara(Mr.)

Director, Basic Education Division 2, Human Development Department, JICA

Cooperation Planning 1: Sayuri KODA (Ms.)

Program Officer, Basic Education Division 2, Human Development Department, JICA

Evaluation Analysis: Mai SUZUKI (Ms.)

Consultant, Oriental Consultants Co., LTD.

Education Cooperation: Mitsuko KUWAHATA (Ms.)

Education Officer, JICA Senegal Office

Cooperation Planning 2: Francoise THIAO (Ms.)

National Staff, JICA Senegal Office

III. Results of Evaluation

Achievement of Project Purpose

The Project Purpose was mostly achieved by fulfilling the Output 1 and 2 among the target communities of 1st and 2nd year. CGS was elected democratically in all CGS of the Project target communities in the 1st and 2nd year (456 schools). More than 90 percent of CGS (426 schools out of 456) made school action plan. The capacity of CGS in the school management has been strengthened and community participation in school management has been increased. The monitoring was done by CGS and CGS Group was established at the commune level and the meetings were regularly held. However, the monitoring system (output 3) needs the further improvement, such as holding the regular Commune-CAP meetings.

1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

This Project was implemented responding to both Mali's policy and the communities' needs for the improvement of the education status. Thus, relevance of the Project is high. The establishment of CGS was mandated at all schools in Mali in 2004 to improve educational management from community level. The Project aimed at exploring concrete processes and strategies to establish functional CGS in which CGS tackle their own problems by their own initiatives with community members. This attempt is proved to be effective because it mobilizes resources available in the community in order to improve the educational environment at the community level. The strategy is particularly meaningful when the government educational resources are limited and when sufficient support cannot reach to individual schools.

(2) Effectiveness

Project Purpose was mostly achieved by fulfilling the output 1 and 2 despite the fact that the monitoring system (Output 3) was not satisfactorily performed. CGS annual reports, which are important to monitor CGS activities, were not sufficiently collected to CAP since Commune-CAP meetings were not regularly held as planned due to the shortage of budget. On the other hand, monitoring of CGS activities was actively implemented by CGS members. The status of activities was reported and shared among all CGS members in CGS meetings. The results of the CGS activities were also informed to community members in the general meetings. CGS groups at commune level were also regularly held.

(3) Efficiency

The inputs from both Malian and Japanese sides were appropriate in terms of quantity, quality, and timing of inputs. The inputs and the activities appropriately produced the Outputs. Output 1 and Output 2 were achieved as scheduled for the target communities of 1st and 2nd year even though the timing of the input was a little bit behind the schedule due to the prolonged discussion on the content of the training module and the operation method of training. On the other hand, Output 3, monitoring system, has not been perfectly established yet. Regarding 1013 target schools added in the 3rd year, their activities have just started and it is too early to evaluate the achievements yet. The use of local NGO to provide communities with training increased the cost, but the training cost of the 2nd year was reduced almost by half of the 1st year. The training done by the local NGO enhanced the effective and efficient implementation of trainings since NGO moderators speak local languages and they were well trained to explain to communities. Thus, the efficiency is relatively high.

(4) Impact

Positive impact of this Project is high since it influenced the government policy and benefited the people at the community level. The approach and methodology utilized by the Project have been adopted in the policy of PISEIII (2010-2012) and generalization of the functional CGS is set as one

of the objectives of education sector in Mali. The attitude of community members has been changed from dependent into independent. The enrollment and attendance rate of children at school was improved. The information on education policy was obtained to CGS with the good communication with commune and CAP. Education officers of Communes and CAP are informed of the educational needs and the priorities of communities by the submission of school action plan from CGS. This facilitated Communes and CAP officers to understand what should be done for education in communities with clearer and more concrete means. The trainings done by local NGO moderators provoked the positive competition of the regional educational officers. This induced the motivation of the officers.

Prospects to achieve Overall Goal

Realization of the Overall Goal needs further coverage of the schools. The Overall Goal can be attained in the target schools, but not all the schools in Mali since there are approximately 9000 schools in Mali whereas the Project targeted 1469 schools for 3 years. Malian Government has decided the implementation of the generalization of the functional CGS across the country, however, the financial resource is essential and the failure of acquisition of finance may prevent the fulfillment of the Overall Goal. Consolidation of monitoring system and involvement of local NGO are also the keys to promote the achievement of the Overall Goal.

(5) Sustainability

Sustainability of the Project is moderate.

Institutional sustainability

<CGS and CGS Group> The established CGS and CGS Group will probably continue due to the successful capacity development of the involved people. CGS members were able to mobilize resources in community and conducted various activities with their own initiatives. CGS groups were established and CGS members attended CGS group meetings regularly. Thus, the sustainability of newly established CGS is high. CGS Group, however, is not existed based on any legal grounds in Mali. In order to maintain CGS Group firmly, it is important to legalize CGS Group in Mali.

<Communes> The involved officers of Commune participated in CGS trainings. However, trained officers may leave their positions after the next election because they are elected every five years and not permanent in their positions expect for secretary generals. The sustainability of Communes as a role of CGS supporter needs to be enhanced by assuring training for new officers.

<CADDE, AE and CAP> The officers of CADDE, AE and CAP participated in trainings conducted by the Project. They can play a lecturer's role if required since their understanding and skills were enhanced by the trainings. Their capacity was developed during the implementation of the Project.

<Commune-CAP meetings> Commune-CAP meetings have not been held regularly as planned due to the shortage of budget. It is important, however, to have the opportunity for communes and CAP to get gathered and share information. How to secure the budget and/or the establishment of alternative way need to be discussed further.

Financial sustainability

<CGS> As long as CGS activities are transparent and democratic, resource mobilization would not be a major challenge. The amount of the contribution from each community member is fixed relatively at the reasonable level since it is settled by the consensus between CGS members and community members. In this sense, financial sustainability of CGS is high.

<Monitoring> The cost for the meetings of CGS Group is contributed by each CGS, and the amount of contribution is discussed among different CGS at Commune level. This supports the sustainability of CGS Group meetings. On the other hand, Commune-CAP meeting needs the financial support from the government or an alternative monitoring system should be established.

<Generalization of the functional CGS> Fulfillment of the generalization of the functional CGS in Mali requires the further financial assistance. The prompt acquisition of the financial source, such as JSDF, is critical.

Technical sustainability

The simplified CGS model applied by the Project demonstrated the basic technical sustainability. The monitoring system needs the improvement. The clear and systematic information path among CGS, Communes, and CAP should be shared among the involved parties.

2 . Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

1. CGS group and Commune-CAP meeting: These monitoring systems contributed to share the information easily among involved people of communities, Communes and CAP. The meetings of CGS groups allowed different communities to share the experiences and difficulties and to learn from each other and find out the answers to their problems.
2. Workshop in Niger at the beginning of the Project: The officers of CADDE, AE and CAP visited “School for All” Project in Niger in 2008 and observed the outcomes there. This helped the officers to understand the role and effect of the functional CGS, and contributed to the smooth launch of the Project.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

1. The use of local NGO: The use of local NGO to provide communities with training increased the cost, but it enhanced the effective and efficient implementation of trainings since NGO moderators spoke local languages and they were well trained how to explain to communities.
2. Training modules in local languages: The training modules were translated into local languages. This facilitated community members to understand the content of trainings.
3. Active involvement of Community members: The local people were highly motivated and actively involved in CGS activities after they were trained by the local NGO. This attitude of people positively promoted the improvement of school management.
4. The location of the Project Office: The Project office was allocated in the premises of CADDE, which contributed to good communication with this main counterpart and to get sufficient support.
5. Field visit: The Project encouraged Ministry of Education to visit communities to see the results of the functional CGS. Their field visits helped them to recognize the effect of the Project and this resulted in inducing the policy support from them.
6. Experienced Japanese experts: Japanese experts had involved in the similar project in Niger,

which facilitated the implementation of the project with their experiences and knowhow.

7. Additional trainings: Although many trained administrative officers were retired, it was dealt with the additional trainings to the new officers. The officers who were trained in the Project were also actively involved.

3 . Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

1. Commune-CAP communication structure: Commune-CAP meetings were not regularly held and the communication structure of Commune-CAP was not clear for several CGS. This resulted in the insufficient collection of CGS annual reports at CAP level.

4 . Conclusion

The Project Purpose was mostly achieved. At the community level, people gained the benefits from their own activities with the functional CGS. The Project influenced the government education policy and the generalization of functional CGS is included into the objective of PISE III. The achievement of Overall Goal needs the further coverage of the schools and the financial source needs to be assured. The monitoring system (Output 3) also needs the improvement.

5. Recommendations

(1)Short-term Perspectives

a: alternative monitoring system trial

The consultation framework between commune and CAP is considered very important for sharing information between commune and CAP among people concerned of the project. On the other hand, the consultation framework is not regularly held as planned due to the difficulties of securing the budget and so on, which proves that the framework cannot be the sole CGS monitoring system. Thus, alternative monitoring systems need to be examined. These are some examples worth trying in the remaining project period; To make it widely known how to make and submit CGS documents among people concerned, to consider other opportunities to collect CGS documents instead of consultation framework, such as direct CGS visit by CAP officers in charge of CGS and/or participation of CGS Associations by CAP officers in charge of CGS.

In addition, the purpose of the consultation framework should be considered as sharing information opportunity rather than monitoring system. Securing budget and easier method of holding the framework need to be examined.

b: revision of training manuals and development of audiovisual aids for trainings

It is important to develop training tools to avoid the deterioration of the training quality at the nationwide expansion stage. Revision of training manuals and development of audiovisual aids for training need to be implemented. In addition, public relations activities, such as TV, radio, the internet, and pamphlets, will be a great help for the project to be well known among people in Mali

c: decision making and information sharing for nationwide expansion

MEALN is planning to organize a national workshop for the expansion of the functional CGS. It is necessary to discuss what to be expanded nationwide, how much budget to be secured, the stipulation of CGS Associations in the ministerial decree etc. at the workshop.

d: securing budget for nationwide expansion

To expand the functional CGS nationwide, approximately 1,530,000,000 Fcfa (0.27 billion Yen) will be needed for the trainings on CGS at 9,000 schools all over Mali. To make it come true, it is indispensable to secure the budget of MEALN and other donors, and the most possible fund is Japan Social Development Fund (JSDF). MEALN should take the initiatives to contact the World Bank and other donors to secure the fund while JICA will actively support MEALN to achieve it.

e: grasp on the project impact at schools

The survey confirmed that improvement of the enrollment rate and girls' attendance at school through the interviews at schools. It is desirable to grasp the changes, improvements, and impacts quantitatively.

For the smooth transition to nationwide expansion, it is necessary to correspond the recommendations above, and approximately six months-extension is needed.

(2) Middle-term and Long-term Perspectives**a: securing budget of MEALN**

MEALN should secure the budget for the consultation framework between commune and CAP and itinerant monitoring by CGS officers of CAP for the sustainability of functional CGS.

b: stipulation of ministerial decree regarding on CGS

The CGS Association is the important organization for the functional monitoring system of CGS. Yet, there is no legal document of CGS Association whereas setup of CGS is clearly mentioned in the ministerial decree. CGS Association should be stipulated in the ministerial decrees before the nationwide expansion.

6. Lessons Learned**(1) Application of local NGOs**

There are many kinds of local languages in Mali. Local NGOs have the strengths of understanding local culture, custom, and languages in each region. Thus, this project utilized local NGOs to develop training manuals and project documents in local languages, which contributed to community members' understanding on CGS.

(2) Counterparts' further understanding of similar projects

At the beginning of the project, counterparts visited Niger, where School for All project has been

implemented, and had an opportunity to understand the outputs and challenges of the project. They understood the project purpose and structure much better than before, which contributed to the smooth implementation of the project.

(3)Impact on education policy

The expansion of functional CGS is clearly mentioned in PISE III, which was developed in March 2010, based on the recommendations of the survey in September 2009.

7. Follow-up Situation

N/A