

Summary of the Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project		
Country : Afghanistan	Project Title : Strengthening of Teacher Education Program Phase 2	
Sector : Basic Education	Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project	
Division in Charge :	Basic Education Team I, Group I (Basic Education), Human Development Department	Total cost (as of the time of evaluation) : 551,079 thousand yen
		Implementing organization in Afghanistan : Teacher Education Department (TED) and Compilation and Translation Department (CTD), Ministry of Education (MOE), Afghanistan
Cooperation Period	(R/D) July 29, 2007	Organization in Japan : JICA
	Three years (Sep 20, 2007- Aug 31, 2010)	Related Cooperation : Expert (Educational Cooperation Planning)
<p>1. Background of the Project</p> <p>In the process of reconstruction in Afghanistan, improving the education sector is a foremost priority for development of social and economic activities. As the reconstruction progresses, explosive number of children enrolled in schools. In the meanwhile, a new curriculum is being introduced at the primary school level and new textbooks based on the new curriculum have been developed. On the other hand, most of the teachers have insufficient capacity of teaching skills due to unavailability of adequate pre-service/in-service teacher training as well as Teacher's Guides. In order to enhance teachers' capacities with subject-specific teaching methods, it is urgently needed to develop Teacher's Guides and to assist in the area of teacher training in which teachers can acquire skills to practically apply the Teacher's Guides. Under such a situation, 'The Strengthening of Teacher Education Program (STEP)' was implemented from June 2005 to August 2007, in which Teacher's Guides on Grade 1 to 3 at primary level were developed and in-service teacher training to introduce Teacher's Guides was conducted. Continuous assistance on teacher education is still needed to fulfill the needs of teachers, especially in the area of development of Teacher's Guides on up to Grade 6 at primary level as well as the pre-service teacher training at Teacher Training Collages (TTCs).</p> <p>The counterpart (C/P) of this project is MOE (TED and CTD). 12 short-term Japanese experts have been engaged in the area of Project Manager/Teacher Training, Pedagogy, Science education, Mathematics education, Biology, Chemistry, Physics, Mathematics Problem Solving, TG development and Training management</p>		

2. Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

Primary school teachers are able to teach in compliance with the new primary school curriculum using Teacher's Guides.

(2) Project Purpose

Developed Teacher's Guides are utilized at primary schools and lessons of teaching methodology using the concept of Teacher's Guides are conducted at TTC.

(3) Outputs of the Project (modified)

Output 1 :

G4-6 Teacher's Guides for 7 subjects (Islamic Studies, Dari, Pashto, English, Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies) and G3 Teacher's Guides for Islamic Studies are developed and distributed nationwide.

Output 2 :

Concerning the subjects of Joint Teaching Science (teaching method of physics, chemistry and biology), Teaching Method of Math, and Solving Math Problems, the syllabi are completed and the teaching resources, lesson plans and student resource books are developed and shared among TTCs.

(4) Inputs (As of the time of evaluation, including some fixed plans)

Japanese side :

Short-term experts 12 people 93.47M/M

Accepted trainees 9 people

Operation cost 158.33million yen

Afghan Side :

C/P staff 164 people in total (including the authors of Teacher's Guides)

Provision of project office with utilities

II. Evaluation Team

Members of the evaluation team	Leader : Mr. Hideo Eguchi	Team Leader, Basic Education Group, Human Development Dep., JICA
	Evaluation Planning : Ms. Chie Ezaki	Basic Education Division I, Basic Education Group, Human Development Dep., JICA
	Evaluation Analysis : Ms. Miho Ito	Consultant, INTEM Consulting, Inc.
Evaluation Period	19 May 2010 – 27 May 2010 (Consultant : 15 May – 27 May 2010)	Evaluation type : Terminal Evaluation

III. Overview of Evaluation Results

1. Current achievements of the Project

(1) Outputs

1) Output 1 : G4-6 Teacher's Guides for 7 subjects (Islamic Studies, Dari, Pashto, English, Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies) and G3 Teacher's Guides for Islamic Studies are developed and distributed nationwide.

< The current status of developing Teacher's Guides (TGs)>

As of the time of terminal evaluation, May 2010, although G3-6 Pashto TGs for Shiah of Islamic Studies are only being revised, all of other TGs have completed to develop and gained CTD's approval.

Grade		Grade 3		Grade 4		Grade 5		Grade 6		
		Dari	Pashto	Dari	Pashto	Dari	Pashto	Dari	Pashto	
1	Math	/	/	●	○	○	○	○	○	
2	Science			●	○	○	○	○	○	
3	Social Studies			○	○	○	○	○	○	
4	English			●	○	○	○	○	○	
5	Dari			1 st Dari	●	/	○	/	○	/
				2 nd Dari	○	/	○	/	○	/
6	Pashto			1 st Pashto	/	○	/	○	/	○
		2 nd Pashto	/	○	/	○	/	○		
7	Islamic Studies	Sunni	○	○	○	○	○	○		
		Shiah	○	△	●	△	○	△	○	

Note : ● stands for the status of having been already developed, approved and submitted to printing press.

○ stands for the status of having been already developed and approved by CTD.

△ stands for the status under revision by CTD.

< The timing of TG printing and distribution>

As of the time of terminal evaluation, all TGs have not been printed and distributed. It results from serious delay of TG approval. The reasons of delay of TG approval are that it took lots of time to reedit after the agreement was made at the third JCC (Joint Coordination Committee) on February 24, 2009 that printing could be commenced upon the final review and correction done by MOE, and that coordination inside MOE prolonged about the logo on the cover of TGs.

The timing of TG printing and distribution is planned below. (as of May, 2010)

	G3 for Islamic Studies and G4-6 Dari TGs for 7 subjects	G3 for Islamic Studies and G4-6 Pashto TGs for 7 subjects
Timing of submission to printing press	By the end of May 2010	By the middle of June 2010
Timing of Printing and Packing	By the end of July 2010	
Timing of Distribution	From August 2010	
Completion of distribution to PED	By the end of August 2010	

Based on the R/D (Record of Discussion) signed by the Government of Japan and the Government of Afghanistan in July 2007, Japan was initially born the cost of printing and packing whereas Afghanistan was assigned to take full responsibility for distribution. However, the comment given by Deputy Minister, at the fourth JCC on January 25, 2010 made it clear that it was fairly difficult for Afghanistan side to allocate sufficient budget for distribution. Therefore, Japanese side agreed to bear not only the cost of printing and packing but also the transportation cost up to PED (Provincial Education Department) in each province from warehouse of MOE whereas Afghanistan side takes responsibility for distribution from PED to schools.

<Number of schools by language and number of TGs to be printed>

It is planned that in accordance with increment of the number of schools, number of TGs to be printed increases, and three sets of TG per school in capital cities where there are more teachers and two sets per school in other areas are distributed. Moreover, the distribution is planned through the master trainer trainings of INSET2 by WB and NGO, and the In-service training at TTC.

	Capital city 3 sets	Other area 2 sets	Sub-total
TGs in Dari	1,351 schools×3= 4,053 sets	5,565 schools×2= 11,130 sets	15,183 sets
TGs in Pashto	439 schools×3= 1,317 sets	2,859 schools×2= 5,718 sets	7,035 sets
TTC G14 teachers			5,454 sets
Master trainings through WB/NGO			2,328 sets
Total			30,000 sets

< The result of response by sample primary teachers who utilize TGs regarding the quality of TG>

TGs have already distributed for the monitoring in 32 monitoring schools. In the 5 monitoring primary schools each in Kabul city, Nangarhar and Balkh province, the questionnaire survey was conducted by the Project to G4-6 primary school teachers in March and April 2010. The survey for other provinces is planned as well. The average responses of the questions regarding the quality of TG such as whether TG contains necessary knowledge for the lesson, whether lesson flow suits students' level, and whether the amount and level of end-of-chapter are adequate, exceed 3 that is the target indicator in PDM.

The average of response by sample primary teachers who utilize TGs regarding the quality of TG (N=The number of respondent teachers, the valuation of 1-4 : 1.Strongly disagree – 4.Strongly agree)

	Kabul city (N=44)	Nangarhar (N=57)	Balkh (N=68)
Quality of TG	3.46	3.74	3.68

Source : The monitoring report by the Project

Many teachers who have utilized TG appreciated for its sufficient knowledge and background information and the simple words which enhance the better understanding of the contents.

< The result of response by sample primary teachers who utilize TGs regarding usability of TG>

In the above questionnaire survey, The average responses of the questions regarding the usability of TG such as whether TG is useful to prepare and teach lessons, whether lesson flow help to manage the lesson time, and whether assignment is helpful when giving homework to students, exceed 3 that is the target indicator in PDM.

The average of response by sample primary teachers who utilize TGs regarding the usability of TG (N=The number of respondent teachers, the valuation of 1-4 : 1.Strongly disagree – 4.Strongly agree)

	Kabul city (N=44)	Nangarhar (N=57)	Balkh (N=46)
Usability of TG	3.57	3.83	3.73

Source : The monitoring report by the Project

Many teachers who have utilized TG also highly recognize for the lesson flow which helps teacher for better time management of lessons, usability for making a lesson plan and background information.

2) Output 2 : Concerning the subjects of Joint Teaching Science (teaching method of physics, chemistry and biology), Teaching Method of Math, and Solving Math Problems, the syllabi are completed and the teaching resources, lesson plans and student resource books are developed and shared among TTCs.

<The current status of developing TTC materials>

Regarding Syllabi, based on the agreement made with TED director in July 2008, syllabi for pre-service teacher education at TTC which had been developed in India were examined by Japanese expert. Based on the established syllabi, TTC materials are being developed, however, the final version of TTC materials have not been completed as of the terminal evaluation. As of May 2010, the current status of developing TTC materials is shown below.

Subject		Teaching Resources	Lesson Plan	Student Resource Book
Science	Joint Teaching Science (48hrs)	Developed in English Under way to translate in Dari	Developed in Dari Under way to edit discussing between experts and CP	Developed in Dari Under way to edit discussing between experts and CP
	-teaching method of physics (16hrs)			
	-teaching method of chemistry (16hrs) -teaching method of biology (16hrs)			
Math	Teaching Method of Math (32 hrs)	Same as above	Same as above	Same as above
	Solving Math Problems (32hrs)	Same as above	Same as above	Same as above
Timing of Completion		By the end of June 2010		

Source : Interview with STEP2

The reasons of delay in developing TTC materials are that the approval of TTC new curriculum was delayed (approved at the first quarter of 2008), TTC materials that initially had not been targeted were decided to be developed which brought the change of the output 2 at the JCC held on July 2008, and Japanese expert couldn't be dispatched due to the security reasons from July to October 2009.

<Sharing TTC materials>

Regarding the indicator 2-2 “70% lecturers of STTC and TTCs in monitored provinces utilize developed teaching resources and lesson plans.” and the indicator 2-3 “Average score in questionnaire regarding the quality of teaching resources, lesson plans and student resource books responded by lectures of STTC and TTCs in monitored provinces becomes more than 3.”, TTC materials have not been approved and distributed so that these indicators couldn't be verified.

However, the Project plans the workshop to introduce TTC materials at the end of June 2010. 42 TTC×5 people (Director, lecturers in charge of Math, Physics, Chemistry and Biology) 210 people in total are planned to participate. The work has been processing to introduce the final version of TTC materials approved by TED at this workshop.

(2) Project Purpose

Developed Teacher's Guides are utilized at primary schools and lessons of teaching methodology using the concept of Teacher's Guides are conducted at TTC.

<Teacher's Guides>

As Output 1 is produced, the results that exceeded the target indicators have come out about the quality and usability of TG. As a result, it is confirmed that more than 70% of teachers in average utilize TG in the 5 monitoring primary schools each in Kabul city, Nangarhar and Balkh province. Also improvement of lesson by the teachers who utilize TG, and improvement of the exam results of learners can be partly seen. Therefore utilization of TG is expected after distribution of TG. However considering the situation that TGs are printed from now on and distribution of TG is delayed, it seems difficult to achieve the project purpose within the remaining project period. To achieve the project purpose, it is necessary to distribute TGs nationwide as soon as possible, and to promote utilization of TG at primary schools in various occasions such as incorporating into in-service training organized by TED and also through cooperation with other development partners.

<TTC Materials>

At present, syllabi and three TTC materials have been developed, but it is still in the stage of approval and TTC materials are planned to be shared in the near future. Therefore the project purpose has not yet come out. However, some lecturers start to understand teaching methodology using the concept of TG through developing lecture notes, the counterpart training in Japan and distance TV lectures. When TTC materials are approved and shared as scheduled, it is expected to achieve the project purpose.

(3) Overall Goal

Primary school teachers are able to teach in compliance with the new primary school curriculum using Teacher's Guides.

The overall goal is considered to be achieved in 5 years after the completion of the Project.

At this moment, TGs are not distributed yet so that it will take some more time for the achievement of the overall goal. However, some encouraging points which will contribute to the achievement of the overall goal are as follow :

MoE regards TGs as highly valuable materials for teachers and understands the importance of monitoring and evaluation after the distribution of TGs, which will contribute to the change of teaching and learning of primary schools, and

In collaboration within MoE and other stakeholders, utilization of TG is expected to be promoted in various occasions such as the training combined with TG distribution.

2. Evaluation by Five Criteria

(1) Relevance : Very high

- The needs are high because TGs in line with new education curriculum are indispensable to maintain the quality of education and TTCs face the lack of teaching and learning materials especially in the area of pedagogy. Therefore, the needs of CTD and TED in MoE and the beneficiaries who are primary school teachers and TTC lectures were met by the Project.
- The National Education Strategic Plan for Afghanistan (NESP) places importance on development of TGs and teaching materials for pre-service teacher education which are in need of the beneficiaries, primary school teachers and TTC lecturers, due to lack of good materials for conducting the lessons in line with the new curriculum. Also, Japanese Government as well as JICA emphasizes the importance of teacher education for quality education. In this regard, the project has been consistent with the development policy of both the Government of Afghanistan and the Government of Japan.
- The target of the Project for distribution of TGs and TTC materials is nationwide, while the monitoring areas were set up and regular monitoring was conducted for accommodating the real needs and feedback from the beneficiaries, which was appropriate as an approach of the Project to address to the development issue.

(2) Effectiveness : Fair

- Two outputs are gradually produced as mentioned in the current achievements of the Project. However, it seems difficult to achieve the project purpose during the remaining period of time, because of the delay of producing the outputs.
- While two outputs are sufficient to achieve the project purpose, some factors such as a difficulty in collaboration with other stakeholders for enhancement of TG utilization affects effectiveness of the Project.
- Some promoting factors are that regular monitoring visits to sample schools kept motivation among teachers to utilize TGs and teachers who utilized TG 1-3 developed by STEP1 promote usage of TGs 4-6 because they know the effectiveness of the products.

(3) Efficiency : Fair

The inputs from both Afghanistan and Japanese side and all activities are contributing to producing the outputs. However, following factors are affecting the efficiency of the Project.

- Since the work processed with the lack of revision standard for developed material, reediting of TGs has taken long time.
- The approval of TTC new curriculum was delayed and the Project started to develop TTC materials when it has already passed one year after the Project commenced. Due to the security measures, Japanese experts could not be dispatched in a timely manner. These two factors affected serious delay on the development of TTC materials.
- Assets from STEP 1, namely CTD's capacity to develop TGs were fully utilized and regular

monitoring to get comments from primary school teachers contributed to develop TGs with good quality.

- By the Utilization of local personnel, appropriate monitoring and the project management at the time of the absence of Japanese experts were conducted efficiently. By the effective utilization of JICA-Net, the Japanese experts having necessary expertise were able to be inputted in accordance with the needs of the field. The cooperation with other JICA training program leads to more effective utilization of TG. These three factors contributed to improve the efficiency of output production.

(4) Impact : Positive impact is expected.

- Overall Goal is expected to be achieved if the activities for promoting utilization of TGs and TTC materials are smoothly continued with the initiative of MoE through wider coordination with other stakeholders.
- There are some good signs observed such as some school has spontaneously started lesson study utilizing TGs among teachers to improve their teaching. And most of the test users of TGs responded favourable to the quality and the usability of TGs, which indicates that there are good possibility that teachers would utilize TGs once they are distributed with TG User's Manual and/or appropriate supports from MoE.
- TED is now working on to include TGs utilization in other development partners' activities and some NGOs shows interests to utilize TGs in their own activities from the good experience of utilization of TG 1-3 developed by STEP1. In this regard, involving other stakeholders to maximize the result of the Project is the promoting factor to achieve the Overall Goal.
- A positive impact was found that TG development members were revising TG 7-9 which were developed by the other development partner applying the knowledge and skills gained from the Project.

(5) Sustainability :

Sustainability can be expected, if institutional capacity is further strengthened, including budget allocation and personnel.

- At Policy level, the draft NESP 1389-1393/2010-2014 clearly mentions about importance of teacher training for improvement of teaching and learners' achievements and development and revision of Teachers Guides based on the needs on the ground. In this regard, continuity in policy levels will be maintained after the Project period.
- Regarding the capacity of TG development members, their capacity has been steadily enhanced through STEP 1 and STEP 2 and now they're able to develop and revise TGs by themselves, which results from the sense of ownership strengthened through the Project. In this sense, it can be said that sustainability in terms of technical aspect is promising in CTD.
- Regarding the capacity of TTC lectures, as a result of practical activities through the Project, STTC lecturers are gradually improving their capacity to develop materials and it can be said

that they're equipped with basic capacity, however, their capacity and other TTC lecturers' capacity to conduct practical lessons need to be further strengthened with full utilization of developed materials.

- In financial aspect, considering the fact that Afghanistan is in the process of its reconstruction and it heavily relies on the financial support from the international communities, it still needs time to be self sustainable.

3. Factors Contributing in the Production of Effect

(1) Planning

The contents of the project's planning are in line with the needs of beneficiaries and consistent with the development policy and development plans of both countries.

(2) Implementation Process

The following factors contributed to produce outputs.

1. Strong ownership of MoE and CTD for the TG development
2. The approach of the Project to respect ownership of CP
3. The regular monitoring to contribute to develop TG with high quality and to improve utilization of TG
4. Utilization of asset from STEP 1 -Utilization of knowledge and skills to develop TG that are accumulated from STEP 1, and promotion of TG utilization by the teachers who utilize TG of G1-3

4. Problems and Factors that Raised Problems

(1) Planning

Inhibiting factors are especially not found.

(2) Implementation Process

The following factors inhibited to produce outputs.

1. The lack of cooperation and coordination among related departments inside MoE
2. Editing TG without standard
3. The delay of TTC new curriculum
4. Due to the security measures, Japanese experts could not be dispatched in a timely manner.

5. Conclusion

In spite of the constraints due to the security situation and others, tireless efforts both from Afghanistan and Japanese side have brought the achievements of the Project Purpose to a certain extent.

As regards tangible results, development of TGs have finished and followed by the approval by MoE, TGs have been printing at this very moment. High ownership of TG development members mainly consisted of CTD staff made it possible to develop all target TGs and their efforts are

worthy to get high appreciation from the teachers who used the TGs. In this regard, printing needs to be completed as earlier as possible, however, in fact, a delay of printing caused a delay of distribution nationwide. Due to this situation, the mission members found out that this whole process could not be achieved in the remaining period of the project. Therefore, the mission member concluded that the project period should be extended by December, 2010 in order to complete the distribution through efforts from Afghanistan side and the Project side.

Regarding TTC materials, some more process are necessary such as harmonization of developed materials among the Project staff and approval by TED so that continuous actions should be taken by concerned people. On the other hand, in the process of developing TTC materials, STTC lecturers have generated confidence and they are expecting devoutly that those materials developed by themselves with support from Japanese experts should be shared among other TTCs, which would promote positive actions among the project staff in the rest of the project period.

Fruits of the Project, TGs and TTC materials will have values when the teachers and the lectures have them and utilize them. Furthermore, the improvement of learning of school students and student teachers is essential as a result of improvement of teaching among teachers and lecturers

Through this terminal evaluation exercise, the mission members confirm that all the concerned parties had this same recognition and expect that their endeavors would be continuous for this ultimate purpose.

IV Recommendations

(1) Prompt distribution of TGs (during the Project period)

The Project has got a final approval of TGs printing after the tremendous works for revision of TGs. After the completion of the printing, it is necessary to pack the TGs smoothly and to be ready for distribution. Regarding the cost of distribution of TGs, it was a responsibility for Afghanistan side at the beginning of the Project. However, the terminal evaluation mission found out through the discussion with the counterparts that it could not be born by Afghanistan side due to lack of budget and most of their development budget relies on the assistance from other development partners at the stage of reconstruction of the country, which needs to get special attention. The mission members and the Project members as well as Afghanistan sides share the common view that TGs are meaningful to be handed to teachers and be utilized by teachers. In this regard, the mission members suggest JICA to bear the cost for distributing TGs to District level for schools to be more accessible to TGs. Even in this case, there should be a solid condition that MoE should take a thorough responsibility for distribution up to schools. Therefore, the Workshop for Provincial Education Department staff planned by the Project should be effectively utilized for this purpose and both the Project and the Afghanistan sides monitor this whole process carefully.

(2) Effective utilization of TGs(During and after the Project period)

1) Collaboration with various stakeholders

The Project has been making efforts to work with various stakeholders in order that TGs would be widely utilized. Currently, distribution through TTC and provision of master trainer training for INSET to be held by MoE with support of the other development partners are planned. In order to materialize these measures, a strong initiative of MoE especially, CTD and TED is indispensable. Therefore, concerned departments and the Project should consider the various ways to widely familiarize teachers with TGs and it is also suggested that, under the strong commitment of MoE, TG be institutionalized in teacher education to be fully utilized.

2) Necessity of Monitoring by the Afghanistan side

In order to develop useful and effective TGs, the Project actively engaged in monitoring activities. Now that the TGs are ready to be utilized by teachers, monitoring for effective utilization of TGs is important as well. While the Project developed the TG User's Manual for better use of TGs to be distributed together with TGs, more involvement of both CTD staff who developed TGs and TED who has a responsibility in teacher education is necessary for better use as well as Provincial and District Education Officers.

At present, monitoring has been conducted mainly by the Project staff, though, participation from the Afghanistan side in this exercise is also essential to grasp how far TGs are utilized and to support teachers for more effective utilization of TGs by themselves.

In this regard, during the remaining period of time, it is suggested that the Afghanistan counterparts to participate in monitoring activities and this activity should be continued even after the Project period.

(3) Approval of TTC Materials and Necessity for Workshop and Monitoring for Its Utilization (During the remaining project period)

Development of TTC materials has been almost finished and now they are waiting for the approval from TED. Because of the various change and progress regarding teacher education such as new curriculum development, development of TTC texts which could not be considered at the beginning of this project, it needs to be examined that how TTC materials developed by this Project could be utilized in this on-going efforts for teacher education program in a harmonized manner. In this regard, it is expected that TED would take lead to clarify it and approve TTC materials at an early date. After the approval by TED, a workshop to share these materials with other TTCs should be conducted as planned. After the workshop, it is also recommended that the Project should accumulate the achievements through monitoring on how these materials are utilized by TTC lectures and how these materials should be effectively utilized.

(4) Clarification of Revision Standard for Developed Materials (After the project period)

It had taken more than one year for the approval of TGs, while tremendous efforts had been made by staff concerned and currently at final stage of printing. It could be worthy of respect for a strong

commitment by the Afghanistan side for better quality materials, however, it could not be denied that sometimes almost same procedures had been taken repeatedly due to the absence of the standard for revision of developed materials . It is for sure that developed materials should meet a certain quality, at the same time, it should be considered that those materials would have a meaning to be utilized by the beneficiaries. In this regard, it is suggested to the Afghanistan side to set out a clear standard procedure for revision of development materials to be widely and promptly benefit the teachers in the future.

V Lesson Learned

(1) TG Development introducing multiple aspects

In the process of TG development, the Project introduced multiple aspects such as class observation, video-shooting, interviews with teachers and assessment of students, which make it possible to develop effective TGs. This approach could have a good implication to other similar projects.

(2) Promotion of Utilization of TG

The Project developed the TG User's Manual as well because the training component for promotion of TG utilization was not included in the Project framework. At this moment, the effect of this manual cannot be observed, though, its potential can be expected to substitute intensive trainings to some extent. Even this case, it should be considered that at least, minimum monitoring need to be combined for promotion of usage of TGs and TG manual.

(3) Utilization of Distance Education

Not only to overcome the constraints such as security issue, a distance education can be a useful tool to respond to the needs in a timely manner.

(4) Collaboration with various stakeholders

In the absence of a framework for aid coordination, to extend the project results from the difficulty that entails, with a broad and continuous range of stakeholders, is necessary to establish adequate communication.