

The summary of Terminal Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project		
Country : Indonesia		Project title : Capacity development project for river basin organizations (RBOs) in practical water resources management and technology in Indonesia
Issue/Sector : Water Resources		Cooperation scheme : Technical cooperation project
Division in charge : Water Resources and Disaster Management Group, Global environmental Dept.		Total cost : Approximately 200 million yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): June 9, 2008 July 2008 – July 2011	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : DUWRMT, Ministry of Public Works
		Supporting Organization in Japan : Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transportation and Tourism, Japan Water Agency
Related Cooperation :		
1 Background of the Project		
<p>The Government of the Republic of Indonesia (hereinafter simply referred to as Indonesia) enacted the Water Resources Law No.7/2004 to improve water resources management in its river basins. In 2006, 30 River Basin Organizations (RBOs)³ were established across the country under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Public Works.</p> <p>While the law states that authorities and responsibilities of the Government include “stipulating the norms, standard, criteria, and guidance in regard to managing the water resources”, they were not fully prepared at the time of the RBO's formation and many needed to be revised to better suit the actual conditions of river basins in Indonesia. In addition, while RBOs are responsible for the management of water resources, which is defined in the law as “effort of planning, implementation, observation, and evaluation in regard to the conservation of water resources, utilization of the water resources and the control of destructive force of water”, RBOs did not have a sufficient capacity to carry out the said responsibilities, partly due to the fact that they were founded on government project units, responsible for constructing facilities for river basins.</p> <p>Under such circumstances, in order to strengthen RBOs' organizational capacity and to strengthen their human resources, the Ministry of Public Works decided to set up the Dissemination Unit for Water Resources Management and Technology (DUWRMT) and requested the Government of Japan to form technical cooperation. In response to this request, JICA conducted a Preliminary Study on “the Capacity Development Project for River Basin Organizations in Practical Water Resources Management and Technology in Indonesia” in March 2008. Following the study, the Record of Discussions for implementing the Project was signed by both governments on June 9, 2008 and the Project commenced on July 23, 2008.</p>		
2 Project Overview		
(1) Overall Goal		
The capacity of RBOs related to implementation of practical water resources management is enhanced at the basin level.		
(2) Project Purpose		
The capacity development system for RBOs by DUWRMT in practical water resources management is established.		
(3) Outputs		
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. DUWRMT has sufficient capability to conduct the training to RBO staff. 2. Prioritized guidelines and manuals are developed and organized for practical water resources management of RBOs. 3. Mechanism of counseling to RBOs of water resources management through DUWRMT is established. 		
(4) Inputs		
Japanese side :		
Long-term Expert : 5 experts	Equipment : 5.0 million	Yen
Short-term Expert : 9 experts	Local cost : 27.7 million	Yen
Trainees received : 21 trainees	Others :	Yen

³ Another RBO under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Public Works was established in 2009. In total, there are 31 RBOs.

Indonesian Side :			
Counterpart : 34 officials		Equipment :	Yen
Land and Facilities	Yen	Local Cost : 86,8 million	Yen (2008-2010)
Others :	Yen		30,9 million Yen (2011)

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Team Leader: Hitoshi BABA, Senior Advisor, Global Environment Development Department, JICA Water Resources Management: Yoshihiro YAMASHITA, Manager, International Affairs Division, Water Resources Engineering Department, Japan Water Agency Task Manager: Kazushi FURUMOTO, Assistant Director, Water Resources Management Division 1, Global Environment Department, JICA Evaluation Analysis: Setsuko KANUKA, IMG Inc.	
Period of Evaluation	From February 16, 2011 to March 8, 2011	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The Government of Indonesia enacted the Water Resources Law No. 7 in 2004 to promote integrated water resources management. The Medium-Term National Development Plan (RPJMN) 2010-2014 promotes the coordination and cooperation among various stakeholders at national, local and community levels to appropriately manage water resources and manage natural disasters such as floods for the socio-economic development of Indonesia. Since RBOs were founded on the government project units responsible for constructing facilities for river basins, they did not have sufficient human resources to carry out wide ranging responsibilities assigned to them by the new law. In order to ensure that RBOs would be able to fulfill their newly assigned responsibilities, DUWRMT, a support unit to RBOs, needed to establish practical support services for RBOs.

Japan's basic ODA policy toward Indonesia comprises of three priority area including "assistance to create a democratic and fair society". Improving basic public services falls under the second priority area. The Country Assistance Program for Indonesia (2004) states that Japan will "assist in development measures to combat natural disasters such as frequent flooding, mud slides and droughts."

In the field of integrated water resources management, Japan has a world-leading class technology and experiences. It has a long history in supporting managing water resources in Indonesia, and in supporting organizational management and capacity building in many countries around the world. Also, as Japan is situated in a monsoon climatic region its experiences and expertise in water resources management are applicable to the Project.

(2) Effectiveness

Based on the achievement levels of the Project Purpose's OVI as well as the three Outputs, the prospect of the Project Purpose being mostly achieved by the end of the Project period is high.

Most of the planned activities have been carried out without significantly delays, and the main activities left for the remaining part of the Project period are ones in the pilot areas to ensure the practicality of guidelines and manuals in the field. The achievement level of the Project Purpose will be greater if **a clear and definite time-line of starting the new counseling mechanism is set and detailed arrangements for the new mechanism is agreed within the Ministry of Public Works by the completion of the Project period.**

The Project has established a solid foundation for DUWRMT to develop RBOs' capacity in practical water resources management. With the application of more findings from the pilot activities in the remaining period, the capacity development system is expected to be further strengthened.

(3) Efficiency

The Project's field, water resources management and technology, covers a wide-range of subjects, and involves a large number of C/Ps assigned from many organizations located in various cities. Despite the challenges that were associated with targeting such a comprehensive field, the Project Inputs have been successfully converted into the expected Outputs. Both the Indonesian and the Japanese sides have appropriately allocated sufficient human resources, budgets and facilities and/or equipment necessary for the Project implementation to bring about the planned Outputs and to achieve the Project Purpose.

The Indonesian side allocated 34 C/Ps and hired 12 local consultants to assist C/Ps to ensure that planned Outputs will be produced in a timely manner within the Project period. The construction of the building for capacity building in Solo, which contains offices, dormitory and classrooms, is very close to completion. From the Japanese

side, five long-term Experts and nine short-term Experts were assigned in various fields. In total, 21 C/Ps received training in Japan in four fields.

There has been effective cooperation with CRBOM, another JICA project (a Project on Strengthening Environmental Management Capacity of Local Governments in Indonesia [SEMACE]), the International Centre for Water Hazard and Risk Management (ICHARM), and local NGOs. As PJT 1 has advanced know-how in water resources management, its greater involvement would have further improved the Project's efficiency.

(4) Impact

The Project has significant potentials to achieve large scale impacts that will positively affect Indonesian socio-economic security. The Overall Goal will be achieved if RBOs have recognized DUWRMT as a trustworthy entity to routinely provide high quality services.

Considering how different of the mindset, capacity and expertise that RBOs are expected to have and that the DUWRMT's record of service provision to RBOs is still limited, the prospect of archiving the Overall Goal within three to five years after the completion of the Project is low. For it to be achieved, DUWRMT needs to have a stable operating environment, in which its institutional position is secured with a sufficient budget and human resources, and needs to routinely provide training and counseling services to RBOs so that it can continuously improve its training and counseling services based on the practices on service provision.

(5) Sustainability

The DUWRMT's institutional positioning is unstable as it still has not been granted with a permanent organization status with an Echelon ranking. The document proposes to combine DUWRMT with the Experimental Station for River (Balai Sungai) and to transform them into a new organization called "Technology Dissemination Center (Balai Besar Teknologi Persugaaian [BBTP])" with the ranking of Echelon II-b.

The DUWRMT's organizational development plan was drafted. This document covers the DUWRMT's internal human resources capacity development. Another effort to strengthen the DUWRMT's sustainability is its improvement of communication with RBOs and other related organizations. DUWRMT has launched its website. According to RCWR, the human resources allocation to DUWRMT is prioritized. These efforts indicate the Indonesian side's commitment; however, DUWRMT institutional positioning makes these efforts less binding.

The budget of DUWRMT has been prioritized in the five year budget proposal for 2009-2014. Based on this, it can be stated that a short-term financial sustainability of DUWRMT is high; however its long-term financial sustainability is still uncertain.

Through OJT, the Project has strengthened capacity of DUWRMT's staff in proving technical services to RBOs. As of the Terminal Evaluation, DUWRMT is at the stage where the foundation for its operations has been established by the Project. Since its practices in providing capacity development services to RBOs are limited and the guidelines/manuals prepared in the Project are still provisional, its technical sustainability is evaluated to be weak.

2. Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

Fieldwork-oriented approach of the Project design and implementation:

Those who are responsible for implementing the water resources management have to be familiar with a river as well as people who live in and around the river basins. Since the Project beginning, the approach to place the importance on fieldworks has been taken. The fieldwork focused approach has contributed to strengthening the linkage among DUWRMT, RBOs and people who live near the rivers.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Indonesian side's strong sense of ownership:

The C/Ps' drive for pursuing excellence or their desire to produce high quality outputs contributed to the achievement of the Project Purpose. Through the interview survey, it was observed that in order to produce assigned modules and guidelines/manuals of a high quality, C/Ps have proactively consulted with authoritative figures in their assigned field, such as university professors and Japanese Experts, and communicated frequently with each other and local consultants.

Revision of the PDM, mainly contributed to the achievement of the Project Purpose:

The process of revising the PDM gave an opportunity for the C/Ps and the Experts to ensure that the direction of the Project is shared among all Project related people. The revision made the linkage between Project activities and the Project Purpose stronger and strengthened the likelihood of the Project Purpose and the Outputs to be achieved within the Project period.

3. Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

The main hindering factor for achieving the Project Purpose is the DUWRMT's position in the Ministry of Public Works. Not having been established as a permanent organization with a sufficiently high Echelon ranking makes it difficult for DUWRMT to routinely provide its training and counseling services to RBOs.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Monitoring of the Project Purpose's achievement level has not been conducted periodically and systematically by the Project, which should be improved in the remaining Project period in order to share more detailed information regarding the Project progress in the fields other than their own since efficient and effective water resources management requires a tight collaboration and cooperation across different fields.

4. Conclusion

The Project was started in July 2008 to establish the capacity development system in practical water resources management in DUWRMT. The Project was appropriately implemented, especially in the latter half of the Project period.

From the perspectives of the five evaluation criteria, the Relevance of the Project is evaluated as high. Its Effectiveness and Efficiency are evaluated to be relatively high. The Project has significant potentials to achieve large scale impacts to the Indonesia's socio-economic security. The prospect of achieving the Overall Goal relies on whether DUWRMT will be able to obtain trust from RBOs through the routine provision of high quality services. Lastly the Project's sustainability is evaluated to be uncertain as the long-term sustainability of DUWRMT appears unstable from all institutional, organizational, financial, and technical aspects, but efforts have been made to enhance its sustainability.

The Team concludes that the prospect of the Project Purpose being achieved is high; therefore, the Project is to be completed as scheduled. On the other hand, DUWRMT is still in a fragile state from a technical point of view; therefore, continued supports for DUWRMT in its service provision to RBOs may be necessary, requiring further discussion by both sides.

5. Recommendations

Taking the above analysis into consideration, the following measures are recommended to be taken in order to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose and to increase the sustainability of the Project:

(1) Upgrading of the DUWRMT's institutional status

The current organizational status of DUWRMT, which has not been granted with a permanent status with an Echelon ranking in the Ministry of Public Works, negatively affects the Project sustainability. It is recommended that the DUWRMT's institutional arrangement be upgraded to enable its routine and sustainable provision of capacity development services to RBOs.

(2) Improvement in monitoring

The Team observed that the Project's monitoring based on the PDM and information sharing of project progress need to be improved. In order to do so, it is recommended that the Project be monitored based on all items covered in the PDM, i.e. project activities, OVIs of each Output, the Project Purpose, and the Overall Goal, et al. It is also recommended that each working group submit periodical reports to facilitate monitoring and the Project sends out electrical periodical reports to all C/Ps, informing them the progress of the Project implementation.

(3) Establishment of a strategic knowledge partner network

The amounts of C/Ps' regular tasks are demanding. The Team observed that a greater number of technical partners are needed for routine and systemic implementation of training and counseling. It is recommended that DUWRMT list up technical knowledge partners from a wide range of organizations including RBOs, PJT 1, PJT 2, and universities, for possible candidates of trainers/counseling. For the establishment of the domestic network, it is recommended that DUWRMT make the best use of RBO directors' meetings. For the establishment of the international network, it is recommended that the partnerships with such organizations as NARBO and CRBOM be strengthened.

(4) Establishment of a practical counseling mechanism

The planning of the new counseling mechanism is in progress but no concrete timeline is set for its establishment. It is recommended that a concrete timeline and roadmap for starting counseling services under the new mechanism, including administrative arrangement details, be set by the end of the Project. In order to ensure

the practically, it is recommended that the Project make a trial of the mechanism and revise its design upon necessity based on the feedback from a RBO that receives a counseling service delivered in the new mechanism.

6. Lessons Learned

(1) Memorandum of Understandings (MOU) with Authority concerned

The uncertainty of the strategic role of PJTs is one of the factors that the involvement of PJTs in the project activities was not promoted as expected. In the project which involve many authorities concerned, the project make a conclusion with such agencies at the beginning of the project in order to clarify the task and role of each authority based on its jurisdiction.

(2) Purpose of the C/P training in Japan

Some Trainees expressed that they had not learned the technology in Japan as expected due to the shortage of the period of training in Japan. In order to increase their understanding and satisfaction of the training, it is better to explain the purpose and target of the training sufficiently with restricted condition of training.