

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Shiro OTOMO (Ernst & Young Sustainability Co., Ltd)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Improvement of Small-scale Fishery Center in Lambarene	October 2011 – January 2012

I Project Outline

Country Name	Gabonese Republic	
Project Period	December 2003 (Detailed Design) – September 2005 (Completion of facility construction and installation of equipment, and handover)	
Executing agency	Ministère de l'Economie Forestière, des Eaux, de la Pêche et des Parcs Nationaux, Direction Générale des Pêches et de l'Aquaculture (DGPA)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 782 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 774 million yen
Main Contractors	Construction: TOA CORPORATION, Procurement: TOA CORPORATION	
Main Consultants	Fisheries Engineering Co. Ltd.	
Basic Design	“Basic Design Report for the Project for the Improvement of Small-scale Fishery Center in Lambarene,” Fisheries Engineering Co. Ltd., August 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Dispatch of Experts: 1999~ present, total of 8 fishery experts (4 short-term, 4 long-term). (Since 2002, at the time of preparation of this project up to present, long-term experts [an expert in training young fishermen and three fishery development advisors] have been continuously assisting with operations and management (hereinafter referred to as “O&M) of this project, as well as following up with all other fishery assistance, such as previous grant aid projects and Development Study. 2. Development Study, 2007~2009, “Formulation of Master Plan for the Small-scale Fish Farming” (covering fishery areas of Gabon in entirety, including this project area) 3. Dispatch of JOCVs (three rural development officers to the small-scale fishery center in Lambarene [Centre Communautaire des Pêches Artisanales de Lambaréné, hereinafter referred to as “CCPAL,” 2005~2007, 2008~2009, 2011~2012], a fishery production officer and a boat engine repairman to Port-Gentil fishery center.) 4. Grant Aid “Port-Gentil fishery center (2001),” “Libreville Small-scale Fishery Center (2009)” 5. Grassroots and Human Security Grant Aid Project “Port-Gentil fishery center (2006),” “Omboué fishery center (2001)” (All the above three fishery centers are in partnership with CCPAL [this project site]). 	
Project Background	The Gabonese population consumes a large amount of fish, which are an important source of their animal protein. On the other hand, the Gabonese Republic imports about 10,000MT of marine products due to lack of domestic supply, which aggravates the country's trade balance. Lambarene and its surrounding lakes along the Ogoue river are the largest sites of its national inland fisheries and account for 44% of its catch. However, the supply of fish was not stable because the catch amount heavily varied seasonally and there was no suitable unloading infrastructure.	
Project Objective	To construct a permanent fish unloading center with a space for the disposal of goods and sales, ice-making facilities, a facility to make repairs and equipment for markets in order to secure the regular distribution of fish in Libreville and inland and to prevent the loss of the quality of marine products and to improve the freshness of marine products by increasing the supply of ice at CCPAL.	
Output (Japanese Side)	<Facility> Floating pier, bank protection, facility for fish sales, block for repair, other facilities, block for office	<Equipment> Equipment for unloading, equipment for repair, office equipment, safety equipment

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan and development needs both at the time of planning and ex-post evaluation, as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of planning; therefore, its relevance is high.</p> <p>Both the project period and project costs were within the plan, and therefore the efficiency of the project is high.</p> <p>The fish catch in CCPAL has indeed increased with the facilities and equipment provided by the project, and accordingly the daily average fish catch in low fishing season has almost achieved the target, which had been set at the time of planning. On the other hand, annual fish catch and daily average fish catch in high fishing season could not achieve the targets. This evaluation study could not go far enough to identify the cause for the above. In addition, data of the ratio of ice production to catch in the high fishing season and the ratio of ice to fish distributed could not be obtained. However, the volume of ice production has been secured enough to achieve the target volume estimated at the time of planning for financial forecast, despite of frequent power cuts. Accordingly, ice-making plant is acknowledged as useful. Moreover, the number of fishermen who are wholesalers at CCPAL has been increased, together with that of middle men, and equipment and facilities other than ice-making plant also have been utilized for training and education for fishermen. According to the executing agency, indirect impacts have been observed, such as the creation of employment in fishery processing industry around CCPAL and the promotion of marine products distribution from Lambarene to outside.</p> <p>Regarding the sustainability of the project, CCPAL obtained sufficient personnel and is managed without any particular problems. CCPAL secured adequate technicians and worked on transfer of technology, through the communication between technicians in CCPAL and other fishery centers. Accordingly, no major problem has been observed from technical aspects. On the financial side, revenues from sales of ice have been secured greater</p>

than originally projected, and those from other than sales of ice also have been provided constantly. Those revenues covered the cost associated with spare parts. In addition, DGPA has encouraged the financial independence of CCPAL, and provided assistance as necessary. Therefore, there has been no serious concern from financial aspects. Regarding operation maintenance, daily cleaning and checkup have been conducted, and equipment and facilities are utilized and charged properly without particular problems.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

For recommendation to the executing agency, the necessity of reliable statistical data and its utilization for operation maintenance could be pointed out. According to the executing agency, demand for ice has not been fully covered in high fishing season, although ice-making machine was in full production. Getting to know how much volume of ice is necessary for a certain amount of fish catch, or for a certain period of time, with supporting data, it will make easier to determine the necessity of additional procurement of ice-making machine or to schedule a plan for overhauls. Therefore, it is recommended that executing agency establish the system for recording and analyzing necessary statistical data.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Gabon

The Three Year Development Plan (2000 ~2002) at the time of planning listed the improvement of food self-sufficiency and the diversification of economy as priorities, and was promoting the fishery industry by establishing a development plan for small-scale fishery and fish farming in marine areas. In the development plan implemented during the Development Study (2007~2009), the following objectives were included: [1] improved incomes for small-scale fisheries and fish farmers and [2] a stable supply of marine products to domestic and surrounding countries. Thus, this project was consistent with Gabon's development policy both at the time of planning and the ex-post evaluation.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Gabon

Lambarene and its surrounding lakes along the Ogoué river are the largest sites of its national inland fisheries, accounting for 44% of its catch. However, the unloading places of marine products were scattered, the catch varied heavily seasonally and there was no suitable unloading infrastructure and distribution facility for middlemen. As a result, the supply of fishes was not stable. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the strengthening of fishery infrastructure was still listed as a development issue in fishery area.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

According to the ODA Country Cooperation Data Book 2002 at the time of planning, the Government of Japan planned to provide development assistance in accepting trainees mainly in the area of capacity development and in providing Grassroots and Human Security Grant Aid Projects. In 2000, the Government of Japan started fishery grant aid cooperation. Since then, the technical assistance has been made in the fishing industry by development studies, grant aid projects, as well as dispatching experts and volunteers. Therefore, it can be said that this project was consistent with Japan's aid policies for Gabon when the project was planned.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan and development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The outputs of the Japanese side were as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The planned project period was 22 months, including the detailed design, whereas the actual was 22 months from December 2003 (Detailed Design of Phase 1) to September 2005 (completion of construction and handover of facility/equipment)). Thus, the project period was as planned (100% of the planned period).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The planned project cost was 782 million yen, whereas the actual cost was 774 million. Thus, the project cost was lower than planned (99% of the planned).

Both the project period and project costs were within the plan; therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness and Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

Comparing targets of indicators set at the time of planning with actual results of average from 2008 through 2010, [1] the average of annual fish catch was 871MT (target ratio of 79%), whereas the target was 1,100MT. [2] The daily average fish catch in the high fishing season was 4.3MT (target ratio of 58%), whereas the target was 7.4MT. [3] The daily average fish catch in the low fishing season was 2.8MT (target ratio of 117%), whereas the target was 2.4MT. Regarding [4] the ratio of ice production to catch in the high fishing season, and [5] the ratio of ice to fish distributed, it was not possible to obtain the data of them. Regarding the actual results of fish catch, the executing agency reported that the targets could not be achieved partly because some fishermen land a fish not at CCPAL but around CCPAL. Also, according to the executing agency, fish catch is affected by climate, so the evaluation was made based on the actual results of average of last three years. As for [4] and [5], they analyzed that the targets would probably not be achieved due to frequent power cuts in high fishing season. Consequently, actual fell below the target in every indicator, except for daily average fish

catch in the low fishing season. This evaluation study could not go far enough to identify the cause that target amount in fish catch had not been achieved.

However, according to the chief of CCPAL, ice-making machine has been in full production, except for the interrupt due to power cuts. The volume of ice production which was estimated from actual sales amount in 2010 was 917MT (target ratio of 92%), whereas the target volume of sales estimated at the time of planning for financial forecast was 993MT. Accordingly, ice-making facilities has been utilized. Furthermore, this field study found that facilities and equipment other than ice-making facility has been actually used.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

Regarding the number of beneficiary, the number of direct beneficiary was 2,350 (2,000 fishermen and 350 middlemen) and achieved the target ratio of 46% in 2011, whereas the target was 5,100 (5,000 fishermen and 100 middlemen). On the other hand, the number of indirect beneficiary was 1,040,000 and achieved the target ratio of 122% in 2011, whereas the target was 850,000. According to the executing agency, the planned number of direct beneficiaries included fishermen and middlemen who use not only CCPAL but also other ports in Lambarene, although the number of fishermen in the ex-post evaluation includes only the fishermen who are wholesalers at CCPAL. The latter amounted to 1,500 in 2010 and 2,000 in 2011, and seems to be on the rise. Similarly, the number of middlemen who visit CCPAL has continued to rise.

DGPA reported other indirect positive effects; namely [1] easier access to ice, [2] decrease in fish prices, [3] increase in the volume of fish and marine products distributed from Lambarene to outside (newly supplied to eight fish markets in Libreville), [4] increase in the number of visitor to CCPAL and increase in the sales of marine products in CCPAL, and [5] creation of employments in processing industry around CCPAL. In addition, CCPAL has been utilized a meeting room for training and education for fishermen, and thus has contributed to the promotion of proper fishing method and to the familiarization of regulations.

No specific negative impact has been reported.

In the light of the above, the target had not been achieved in terms of fish catch in high fishing season and annual fish catch, although positive effects has been acknowledged to a certain degree, therefore the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

At the time of planning, it was planned to entrust the management committee established jointly by DGPA, Lambarene agricultural and fishery cooperative and the City of Lambarene. Currently, the chief of CCPAL has been sent from DGPA and 14 full-time staff are employed under his supervision. CCPAL has seemed to have sufficient manpower, including technicians. The current chief of CCPAL reports to the regional governor and the mayor whenever necessary to consult with them and solves problems. He also copes with problems in consultation with DGPA. Thus, CCPAL is managed without any particular problems.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

CCPAL has secured adequate technicians: three electricians and one technician for ice-making facility are currently employed. According to the chief of CCPAL, technicians have worked on the sharing of techniques at the time of maintenance, and have directly interacted with technicians from other centers. As for the serious problems that the technicians at CCPAL cannot deal with, CCPAL asks DGPA's advice and address the problems by requesting support from Libreville. Thus, no major problem has been observed on technical aspects.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

On financial side, total revenues in 2011 amounted to 76,359 thousand Central African CFA franc (XAF); among them, revenue from sales of ice accounted for 70,775 thousand XAF (93% of total revenue) and exceed the amount in projected income statement at the time of planning. Expenses accounted for 64,199 thousand XAF, and consequently net income in 2011 ended up with 12,159 thousand XAF. Regarding expenses, utilities costs were originally included in the expenses of CCPAL at the time of planning. However, it is actually covered by the disbursement from the government of Gabon, and therefore no payment has been made to CCPAL's cost. On the other hand, cost for spare parts, necessary for operation maintenance, has currently been covered by the revenue of CCPAL.

Before the implementation of this project, revenue from sales of ice constituted 99% of total revenue. Currently, revenue from facilities and equipment provided by the project offers a regular source of income and contributes to the improvement of CCPAL's profit structure. Also, accounting practice has been improved at CCPAL: cash control and revenue & expense management are conducted properly, with the assistance of JICA experts, and reports are made to DGPA regularly.

According to DGPA, in case that CCPAL has financial difficulties, financial supports are ready from other centers or DGPA according to the circumstances, with due considerations to financial independence of CCPAL.

Therefore, there has been no major concern on financial side.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Regarding operation maintenance, CCPAL has been maintaining equipment and facilities properly by periodic disinfect, together with daily checkup and cleaning. Also, equipment and facilities at CCPAL are utilized and charged properly without particular problems.

Previously, it was pointed out that part of the floating pier was sinking because cracks at the welded part at the bottom of the floating pier caused submergence. The pier was fixed by tentative measures in October 2011, and currently is in use. As for the procurement system of spare parts, pointed out at the time of defect checking, the chief of CCPAL takes initiatives in conducting effective inventory control, in the consideration of necessity and lifetime of spare parts and also lead time for delivery.

No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance system, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.