

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Hideyuki TAKAGI (Ernst & Young Sustainability Co., Ltd.)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of Medical Care for Public Hospitals in West Kalimantan Province	October, 2011 - January, 2012

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia			
Project Period	June, 2005 - February 2006			
Executing Agency	Directorate General of Medical Care, Ministry of Health, Provincial Office for Health, West Kalimantan Province			
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 435 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 361 million yen		
Main Contractors	Mitsubishi Corporation			
Main Consultants	Fujita Planning Co., Ltd.			
Basic Design	“Basic Design Study on the Project for Improvement of Medical Care of Public Hospitals in West Kalimantan Province,” JICA and Fujita Planning Co., Ltd., March, 2005			
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, “ODA Loan to Healthcare and Nutrition Sector” (1999)			
Project Background	<p>In Indonesia efforts has been made to improve the public’s health level under the leadership of the central government, and this has attained some measure of outputs. However, the fact that regional disparities in the improvement status have been observed has presented a problem. Especially in West Kalimantan Province where there were delays in economic development, the health situation was lagging behind, and major health indicators all fell short of the national averages. The maternal mortality rate in particular substantially exceeded the national average because a large percentage of births were home deliveries and the majority of childbirths were performed with a help of a traditional midwife. Some signs of improvement have been noted in primary medical services in West Kalimantan Province on account of the implementation of countermeasures by the government, but due to factors like financial difficulties the improvement of facilities at secondary-level medical facilities such as provincial hospitals have not made adequate progress. Therefore, in this project medical equipment was upgraded at 11 medical facilities with the goal of improving the functions of secondary-level medical facilities in West Kalimantan Province.</p>			
Project Objective	The project of the project is to improve medical services—primarily Emergency Obstetric Care (EOC)—by providing medical equipment to secondary-level medical facilities (provincial hospitals) in West Kalimantan Province.			
Output (Japanese Side)	<table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; border: none; vertical-align: top;"> <p>(1) Upgrading Basic Medical Equipment A total of 458 pieces of medical equipment were provided to 11 medical facilities. <Outpatient Care Department> Instrument sets for dental treatment, ultrasonographs, scales, etc. <Emergency> Instrument sets for minor surgery, aspirators, medical examination lights, etc. <Obstetrics> Delivery tables, medical examination lights, fetal heart rate monitors, etc. <Neonatal Care> Bilirubin analyzers, infant warmers <Operation> Instrument sets for surgery, steam sterilizers, heat sterilizers, etc. <ICU> Bedside monitors, blood transfusion pumps, aspirators, etc.</p> </td> <td style="width: 50%; border: none; vertical-align: top;"> <p><Laboratory> Blood bank refrigerator, heat sterilizers, binocular microscopes, etc. <Imaging> X-ray equipment, ultrasonographs, etc.</p> <p>(2) Technical Cooperation Component <First Dispatch> Holding of a workshop Determine the current status regarding medical equipment, and create (draft) management ledgers and (draft) maintenance instructions to improve the problems <Second Dispatch> Holding of a seminar Hear about the results of the maintenance trial conducted based on the (draft) management ledgers and (draft) maintenance instructions from the concerned parties and finalize the management ledgers and maintenance instructions</p> </td> </tr> </table>		<p>(1) Upgrading Basic Medical Equipment A total of 458 pieces of medical equipment were provided to 11 medical facilities. <Outpatient Care Department> Instrument sets for dental treatment, ultrasonographs, scales, etc. <Emergency> Instrument sets for minor surgery, aspirators, medical examination lights, etc. <Obstetrics> Delivery tables, medical examination lights, fetal heart rate monitors, etc. <Neonatal Care> Bilirubin analyzers, infant warmers <Operation> Instrument sets for surgery, steam sterilizers, heat sterilizers, etc. <ICU> Bedside monitors, blood transfusion pumps, aspirators, etc.</p>	<p><Laboratory> Blood bank refrigerator, heat sterilizers, binocular microscopes, etc. <Imaging> X-ray equipment, ultrasonographs, etc.</p> <p>(2) Technical Cooperation Component <First Dispatch> Holding of a workshop Determine the current status regarding medical equipment, and create (draft) management ledgers and (draft) maintenance instructions to improve the problems <Second Dispatch> Holding of a seminar Hear about the results of the maintenance trial conducted based on the (draft) management ledgers and (draft) maintenance instructions from the concerned parties and finalize the management ledgers and maintenance instructions</p>
<p>(1) Upgrading Basic Medical Equipment A total of 458 pieces of medical equipment were provided to 11 medical facilities. <Outpatient Care Department> Instrument sets for dental treatment, ultrasonographs, scales, etc. <Emergency> Instrument sets for minor surgery, aspirators, medical examination lights, etc. <Obstetrics> Delivery tables, medical examination lights, fetal heart rate monitors, etc. <Neonatal Care> Bilirubin analyzers, infant warmers <Operation> Instrument sets for surgery, steam sterilizers, heat sterilizers, etc. <ICU> Bedside monitors, blood transfusion pumps, aspirators, etc.</p>	<p><Laboratory> Blood bank refrigerator, heat sterilizers, binocular microscopes, etc. <Imaging> X-ray equipment, ultrasonographs, etc.</p> <p>(2) Technical Cooperation Component <First Dispatch> Holding of a workshop Determine the current status regarding medical equipment, and create (draft) management ledgers and (draft) maintenance instructions to improve the problems <Second Dispatch> Holding of a seminar Hear about the results of the maintenance trial conducted based on the (draft) management ledgers and (draft) maintenance instructions from the concerned parties and finalize the management ledgers and maintenance instructions</p>			

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>Regional disparities had arisen in Indonesia with regard to its economic development. The upgrading of medical facilities in West Kalimantan, which was the target area for the project, was particularly far behind compared to the other regions due to financial difficulties. Moreover, this project was consistent with both Indonesia’s and Japan’s development policy; thus, the relevance of this project is high. Both the project period and project costs were within the plan, and therefore the efficiency of the project is high. It was recognized that the project has contributed to the improvement of access to secondary-level medical services of those who live in remote locations, together with its credibility and safety. The project is conducive to the decrease in the number of patient transportation to a large hospital in the capital of province, which was caused by insufficient medical equipment in provincial hospitals, and also increases in the number of patients in provincial hospitals thanks to the introduction of high-level medical equipment. These impacts demonstrate that the project has enhanced the credibility of secondary-level medical service in West Kalimantan Province. Regarding the sustainability of the project, equipment provided by the project has still been used through steady efforts of technicians, such as exchange information at their networks, despite of the limitations they face, namely insufficient manpower and budget for operation & maintenance (O&M).</p>

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendation to executing agency>

(Enhancement of network of O&M technicians)

In West Kalimantan Province, O&M technicians take advantage of opportunities for trainings and engage in exchange of information on O&M of medical electronics and the procurement of spare parts. These approaches became important factors for good maintenance and effective utilization of medical equipment under budget and manpower constraints. On the other hand, area of exchange of information is limited to the network of individual technicians, as it is now. Accordingly, there is a room for improvement to promote these efforts and enhance the network of technicians. For example, it would be effective for provincial office for Health to provide opportunities of periodic meetings and workshops to them.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Indonesia

Improving access to high quality medical services in order to emphasize preventive care and health management was set forth in Indonesia's 2005-2009 National Medium Term Development Plan. What is more, enhancing maternal and child health services, such as maternal and child health countermeasures, decreasing the stillbirth rate and the infant mortality rate, was taken up as a priority issue. These policies were carried over into the 2010-2014 National Medium Term Development Plan.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Indonesia

In the project's target area of West Kalimantan Province, the level of access to medical services has been low, owing to the delay in economic development and its adverse geographical factors. Health status of West Kalimantan Province lag behind that of Indonesia: infants' prevalence rate caused by malnutrition is 22.6%, which is higher than national target, and percentage of delivery at home is 66.6%, which is still high compared to national average. Under these circumstances, strategic plan in West Kalimantan Province (2008-2013), at the time of ex-post evaluation, was established with the purpose of improvement of secondary-medical services in the light of medical equipment and human resources. Therefore, the development needs and the objective of this project is relevant.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

According to the Country Assistance Program for the Republic of Indonesia (November 2004), Japan has committed to providing support to the Indonesian government around three areas that serve as priority issues, including the "creation of a democratic and fair society." As part of the "creation of a democratic and fair society," Japan has resolved to provide support for poverty reduction by improving public services like health and medical care.

This project has been highly relevant with the Indonesia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

In terms of outputs on the Japanese side, both the procurement of equipment and the technical cooperation component (clarification of person in charge and trainings of maintenance method), which was necessary for the enhancement of system and capability of O&M, went as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

Compared to the 10 months planned, the actual project period was 9 months, which was shorter than planned (90% of the plan). The technical cooperation components were implemented as planned (100% of the plan).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

Compared to the 435 million yen planned, the actual project costs amounted to 361 million yen, which was lower than planned (83% of the plan).

Both the project period and project cost were within the plan; therefore the efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

In almost all the target hospitals, the number of out-patients and caesarean operations, which were set up as quantitative indicators, has significantly increased. Greater availability of medical equipment thanks to the project, among others, is considered one of the main contributors, together with independent efforts of healthcare and medical organizations (expansion of facilities and increase of personnel). According to the observation of the West Kalimantan provincial office for health, the rate of stillbirth and in-hospital mortality rate of both expectant/nursing mothers and infants has decreased, although sufficient data was not acquired from the target hospitals.

In addition, it was confirmed that the medical equipment necessary for the improvement of secondary-medical services provided by the project has contributed to the supply of safe medical care to local residents. In this project, a preliminary survey was conducted to identify a particular need of target hospitals, and the target hospitals have been supplied with more advanced and reliable medical equipment, compared to existing obsolete equipment. As a result, the number of patient transportation to large hospitals in metropolitan area, caused by insufficient medical equipment in provincial hospitals, has been decreased. For example, the number of patient in target hospitals has increased, thanks to newly introduced or additional X-ray equipment, and so has the number of surgeries which need electric scalpel or patient monitoring system in remote hospitals. As for the enhancement of maternity emergency mentioned in the project objective, it was recognized that the introduction of safe and reliable medical equipment, such as ultrasonograph and mobile surgical beds, had lead to an increase in the number of patient in target hospitals.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

The utilization of medical equipment provided by the project has lead to the improvement of medical services and an increase in the number of patient in target hospitals, and so it is presumed that the project contributed to the enhanced reliability of residents in West Kalimantan Province to secondary-medical services.

As outlined above, the project has largely been achieved its effects as planned, and therefore the effectiveness of this project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Almost all the target hospitals have suffered from the problem of shortage of O&M technicians. Furthermore, in the event of fault of medical equipment, hospitals in remote area do not have a good access to representative agencies.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Training in provincial offices for Health, target hospitals, and external professional bodies has been conducted, together with basic training for O&M, which was provided as technical cooperation component. Accordingly, technicians in almost all hospitals have an ability to conduct ordinary maintenance and repair. However, regarding O&M of advanced computerized medical equipment, further development of ability would be imperative. Furthermore, voluntary network has been established among technicians, and they have engaged in exchange of information on repair method and component procurement at the opportunities of trainings.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Almost all the target hospitals have severe budget problems, both for operating budget and O&M budget. As for operating budget, calibration of computerized medical equipment has been prioritized, and so maintenance and repair has been partly conducted. Under the situation, budget for repair of medical equipment is not always secured readily immediately.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Under budget and manpower constraints, most of medical equipment provided by the project has still been used through steady efforts of technicians, such as exchange information at their networks.

Although there are awaiting solutions in terms of O&M, sustainability of the project is fair considering the fact that medical equipment has been utilized well in the target hospitals.