

Country Name	The Project for the Construction of Primary Schools in Phnom Penh, Phase II
Cambodia	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 510 million yen	Contract Amount: 509 million yen
E/N Date	August, 2005	
Completion Date	December, 2006	
Implementing Agency	Department of Education, Youth and Sports, Phnom Penh Municipality (PPDoE)	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: January 2005 - July, 2005	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	Yachiyo Engineering Co., Ltd.
	Contractor(s)	Kounoike Construction Co., Ltd.
	Supplier(s)	-
Related Projects	Japan's cooperation: Project for Construction of Primary Schools in Phnom Penh, Phase 1 (Grant Aid, 2004)	
Background	<p>Cambodia had been particularly emphasizing impartiality of access to primary education, improvement in the quality of education, and internal efficiency through the formulation of the "Education Strategic Plan 2004-2008 (ESP 2004-08)" and the "Education Sector Support Program 2004 -2008 (ESSP 2004-08)" with the aim of achieving education for all (EFA).</p> <p>In the last 10 years, the development of Phnom Penh (PP) Capital City of Cambodia had been attracting migrants from all over the country. As a result, population in PP has rapidly increased from 925,000 in 1995 to 2,100,000 in 2010. Stemming from this phenomenon, the number of students enrolled in primary schools increased from early 2000s. Many of primary schools in PP were facing a severe classroom shortage. For tackling the classroom shortage for improving learning and teaching environment, the Government of Cambodia requested the Government of Japan a grant aid (Phase I 2004-2005) for the reconstruction and extension of primary school buildings in PP in 2004. Since the classroom shortage continued, the implementation of additional school building construction was requested for Phase 2 (2005-2006) and 6 schools were selected which was considered as urgent at the time of ex-ante evaluation.</p>	
Project Objectives	<p>Outcome</p> <p>To improve the educational environment at target schools (implementation of lessons through an appropriate shift system, securing appropriate lesson time and providing lessons with the appropriate number of pupils) by increasing the number of classrooms.</p>	
	<p>Outputs(s)</p> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Constructing 113 classrooms and toilets and installing new equipment such as desks and chairs for pupils and teachers and white boards at 6 target primary schools: Phoum Russey, Chak Tomuk, Sophak Mongkul, Pochen Tong, Chamreun Rath and Chamreun Cheat • Technical assistance (soft component) for maintenance <p>Cambodian Side</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Removal of the existing dilapidated school buildings & ground leveling, sufficient ground leveling at construction lot, connection work to the switch board, piping work outside the lot and connecting work to sewerage pipes • Allocation of teachers • Human and financial resources for the appropriate operation and maintenance of the school facilities 	

II. Result of the Evaluation**Summary of the Evaluation**

With the rapid population growth in Phnom Penh (PP), the number of students enrolled in primary schools had increased from early 2000s. Many of primary schools in PP were facing a severe classroom shortage, which caused a situation that the classes were carried-out in three shift system or rotation schedule classes (mobile classes) with overcrowded students per class. Furthermore, school facilities including buildings have been becoming deteriorated, which was considered as emergency needs for both of schools and students.

This project has largely achieved its objectives. The number of classrooms of target schools has been increased; thereby the classes have become less crowded, and the mobile classes and three shift system have been abolished. Teachers and students are highly satisfied with the project that enables them to have the proper classroom, good environment and new facilities/equipment. At the same time, teachers and students have become more motivated in learning and teaching. However, the pupil-class ratio is becoming higher at some schools. As for sustainability, there was no problem observed in the project in terms of institutional and technical aspects, as well as current status of operation and maintenance; however, the project has some problems in financial aspects due to lack of financial resources at all schools. The 6 target school

secure human resources, have acquired maintenance skills through technical assistance, have multiple financial resources, and have operated and maintained facilities/equipment well.

For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Cambodia's development policy, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, both the project cost and project period were within the plan.

In the light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with Cambodia's development policy (Enhancing equitable access to education service and enhancing quality and efficiency of education service as set in Education Strategic Plan 2004-2008 and 2009-2013), development needs (improving access and physical school buildings in PP), as well as Japan's ODA policy "Country Assistant Policy 2002" at the time of ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has largely achieved its objectives of improvement of educational environment by eliminating 3 shift system and mobile classes and reducing the number of students per classroom and thereby reducing overcrowded students per class. In 2012 the average number of pupils per classrooms has achieved the target value significantly, partly because the number of students enrolled at some target schools has decreased because of housing relocation, which often occurs in the target areas where the mobility of labor is high; however, the schools would not have reached the target without the project. On the other hand, the number of students is increasing at 2 schools (Phoum Russey (Number of pupil-classroom: 97.5) and Pochentong (Number of pupil-classroom: 116.8), partly because people in the central city have moved to western and southern suburb where these two schools are located due to the increasing number of factory operation under foreign direct investment, and partly because the existing classrooms have been demolished or have been used for other purposes. The classes there are becoming overcrowded and the schools may face classroom shortage in the near future. This situation requires high attention and future proper planning of PPDoe.

Nevertheless, the expected positive effects and impacts have been observed at all target schools: Teachers and students are very satisfied with the safe and suitable education environment, and especially students have been motivated and thereby their scores have become higher and they have been absent less, according to the students and teachers. Also, local communities became able to use the classrooms constructed by the project for their activities (such as drug education campaign and charity ceremony), which thus improved significantly.

Therefore, effectiveness and impact of this project is high.

Quantitative effect

Indicator(unit)	baseline value (year of BD: 2005) (actual value)	target value (target year: 2007)	actual value (target year: 2008) SY(School Year 2007-2008)	actual value (at ex-post evaluation):2012 SY2011-12
Indicator 1: Number of pupils per classroom	126	80	68.8	67 at 6 schools (at Phoum Russey: 97.5; at Pochentong 116.8)
Indicator 2: Shift system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A triple shift at 3 schools A double shift at the other 3 schools 	A double-shift for 6 targeted schools	Double-shift at 6 schools	Double-shift at 6 schools
Indicator 3: Mobile classes	All 6 targeted schools have mobile classes	No more mobile classes	Mobile classes remain at 1 school	No more mobile classes

(Source: six target schools)

3 Efficiency

The outputs of the project were produced as planned, and both of project cost and project period were as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%, 96%). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

4 Sustainability

The facilities/equipment provided by the project are maintained by the 6 target schools themselves in accordance with the decentralization policy of the government. PPDoe is responsible for overall education sector administration in PP, and being involved with the monitoring of facility maintenance as a result of the technical assistance (soft component) of the project. This project has no problem in institutional and technical aspects, and the current status of operation and maintenance of the implementing agency. However, the project still has some challenges in financial aspects because financial resources at all schools are not sufficient.

With regards to institutional aspect teachers carry out daily maintenance and repair work in small scale with technical and financial support from the local School Supporting Committee (SSC). On the technical aspect, the implementing agency and 6 target schools have acquired the knowledge on maintenance work including sludge disposal of toilets, with the training and guidelines provided through implementation of technical assistance from the project, though they need to contract out to

private companies for large scale repairing. In addition, the guidelines developed by the project have been distributed to and utilized at 230 schools in PP, and in 2010, PPDoe carried-out a larger training in maintenance to all schools in PP.

As to the financial aspect, all schools have multiple sources for maintenance and repair: Program-based Budget (PB: the budget allocated to each school), support from SSC, and Phnom Penh Municipality for large scale repair. However, the amount of PB and SSC are barely enough for their expenditure, although the measures have been taken, as recently, Ministry of Education have formulated guidance to strengthen SSC, and capacity development to school directors concerning management and planning, including budgeting.

On the current status, the facilities/equipment provided by the project are maintained well. Broken equipment such as switches, whiteboard, and lock holders of doors have been replaced/have been repaired. All schools understand the importance of sludge disposal and 3 schools have disposed sludge of the toilet, while the remaining 3 schools are going to dispose the sludge in the near future. As a consequence of technical assistance, PPDoe monitors school facilities/buildings including the target schools 2 times a year (1st time; check and give advice for work needed; 2nd check and assess school performance). Schools always take actions in response to PPDoe advice. Although not a problem which casts an influence on sustainability, the electricity of the school buildings is always turned off at Phumrussey School because of high expenses for electricity, even after the broken lightning equipment and lights have been renewed. Even though the class is conducted during the day, re-operation of the electricity is desirable.

Therefore, sustainability of this project is fair.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency

1. Phnom Penh Department of Education (an implementing agency) should continue the existing mechanisms of schools monitoring or inspection because their technical advice is curtail for keeping facilities in good condition, as well as equipment in function.
2. The implementing agency should review and analyze the electricity problem and its necessity in school buildings, so that proper instruction can be provided to target schools and findings also can be reflected in future similar project.
3. Ministry of Education should continue its efforts to strengthen schools' capacity on school budget planning, thus the annual budget can be secured for operation and maintenance of facilities/equipment.



Side view of school building



In classroom



Cleaning activity