Summary of Evaluation

<table>
<tr><td colspan="3">I. Outline of the Project</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">Country: Indonesia</td><td>Project title: The Beef Cattle Development Project Utilizing Local Resources in the Eastern Part of Indonesia</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">Issue/Sector:
Agriculture/Forestry/Fisheries-Livestock Industry</td><td>Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">Division in charge:
Rural Development Department</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td rowspan="2">Period of Cooperation</td><td rowspan="2">(R/D): Oct.11, 2006
Nov. 15, 2006 – Nov. 14, 2011 (Five years)</td><td>Partner Country’s Implementing Organization:
- Directorate General of Livestock and Animal Health Services, Ministry of Agriculture (DGLAHS, MoA),
- Provincial Livestock Services, Government of West Nusa Tenggara Province (NTB Province)</td></tr>
<tr><td>Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry & Fisheries</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="3">Related Cooperation: None</td></tr>
</table>

1. Background of the Evaluation Study

In Indonesia, correction of disparities among regions is an important issue. West Nusa Tenggara Province (hereinafter referred to as “NTB”) is one of the least developed provinces and has a substantial need for assistance in rural development. Among NTB rural area, water-poor areas are in severe situation because of difficulty of increasing productivity of paddy, a main product for farmers. In those areas, beef cattle production has a potential to increase income of farmers. NTB is famous for beef cattle production and small-scale farmers raise cattle in groups. To start beef cattle production and to increase the numbers of cattle they raise are effective way for increasing their income, however, small-scale farmers have difficulty in beef cattle production, such as shortage of forage, insufficient level of technology and shortage of initial investment. Some supports against these problems are required. Empowerment of groups of small-scale farmers and their farming improvement are also important for poverty reduction because they earn a livelihood by not only beef cattle production but also rice cropping and upland cropping.

Under these circumstances, the Government of Indonesia made an official request for technical cooperation strengthening beef cattle production. The Government of Japan, through Japan International cooperation Agency (hereinafter referred to as “JICA”), dispatched the Preparatory Study Team twice in September 2005 and May 2006 to formulate the framework of the Project , and clarified the Project concept as “to aim at increasing income of small-scale farmers through promoting beef cattle production through the establishment of beef cattle production system in NTB”.The Record of Discussions (R/D), which officially determined the framework of the Project, was signed by both sides on October 11, 2006 and the Project commenced from November 15, 2006 for the period of 5 years.

2. Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

Number and income of beef cattle farmers increase in NTB.

(2) Project Purpose

Income of farmers in the pilot project increases through beef cattle production in NTB.

(3) Outputs

1) Beef cattle production models which are appropriate for Lombok island and Sumbawa island Respectively, namely "Lombok model" and "Sumbawa model" are formulated.
2) System for dissemination of "Lombok model" and "Sumbawa model" are established.
3) System for dissemination of "Lombok model" and "Sumbawa model" are implemented and supporting system for improving both models is established.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Long-term Expert: 5 Persons (180 MM)
Short-term Expert: 7 Persons (21.5MM)
Trainee received: 28 Persons
Equipment: Yen 38,486,769
Local Lost: Rp 6,152,892,317

Indonesian Side:

Counterpart: 15 Persons
Land and facilities: Office spaces, training facilities, laboratory spaces, etc.
Local cost: Rp. 1,045,346,500

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	The Japanese side		
	Dr. Hiroshi Saito	Leader/ Livestock Development	Senior Advisor, JICA
	Mr. Jun Yamazaki	Cooperation Planning	Rural Development Department, JICA
	Mr. Yasuyuki Maeda	Beef Cattle Production/ Extension	Rural Development Department, JICA
	Ms. Yoshiko Takahashi	Evaluation & Analysis	Y's Consulting Office Co., Ltd.
	The Indonesian side		
	Mr. Krisnandana	Leader / Livestock Policy	
	Mr. Vierman	Livestock Farming	
	Prof. Dr. Suhubdy	Animal Nutrition and Feeding System / Pasture	
Period of Evaluation	May. 9 – 28, 2011		Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1. Project Performance

1-1. Inputs

The Inputs borne by the both sides as mentioned above. The actual ratio of the Indonesian side local cost

inputs to the Project implementation which has been decreasing from 24% in 2007 to 10% in 2010.

1-2. Outputs

(1) Output 1

The both "Lombok model" and "Sumbawa model" have been formulated and accepted by the NTB provincial government. However, when the 1st edition of the "technical manual" had compiled in November 2008 the proof activities had not been completed on the selected four (4) Model farmer groups in different types of beef cattle production in the four regencies.

On the other hand, the forty (40) Pilot farmer groups were selected in early 2008 which was one year ahead than the original schedule due to SKR-CF fund brought into the project budget for the Pilot farmer groups. Therefore, the results of proof activities have been extracted both from the Model farmer groups and the Pilot farmer groups. It has been reflected to the revision of the "technical manual", newly compiled "dissemination manuals" in February 2009 and other leaflets developed by the Project. Moreover, proof activities on the Model farmer group by the counterparts have not been implemented in 2009 as planned because of insufficient budget by the Indonesian side for operational expenses of the counterparts.

(2) Output 2

A part of the dissemination system, organizing Training of Trainers (TOT) has been established in BIBD/BPLPKH Banumulek and BPTHMT Serading. TOT is targeted to gain beef cattle production knowledge and skills of the technical officers, extension workers in four (4) regencies and leaders of the Model farmer groups as the trainers of farmers. Currently most of all ten (10) counterparts are able to prepare the trainings as a lecturer and instructor for their respective specialized fields. As the result of TOT trainings, currently ninety-five (95) technical officers (including Artificial Inseminators, veterinarians), extension workers and leaders of model farmer groups were trained as the trainer of the method. These trained trainers have disseminating their gained knowledge and skills to the farmers.

The other part of the dissemination system is organizing Demonstrations, Farm Day for the farmer groups. Most of them were arranged and instructed by the Japanese experts, counterparts and regency technical officers. Some local experts were invited as the lecturers to the demonstrations.

Each counterpart is also involving annual revision of his specialized part of "Dissemination manuals" which have been used as TOT training manual. And also they are involving revisions of leaflets, booklets and posters.

(3) Output 3

Dissemination activities have been implemented on the selected forty (40) Pilot farmer groups in the four (4) regencies (in West Lombok:10 groups, Central Lombok:10 groups, East Lombok:10 groups and Sumbawa: 10 groups). The project has assigned one "Field Officer" in each Regency Livestock Service office for technical distribution and monitoring the Pilot farmer groups' activities. The project has been developed database of the Pilot farmer groups from the monitoring data (number of beef cattle, income of the group members).

Farmers' adoption rates of introduced new method were studied by the Project. The result shows that farmers have adopted the breeding methods introduced by the project. On the other hand, most of the farmers hardly accept to have regular meeting among the members. The result of interview survey, most of the farmer groups members are cutting grasses, feeding cattle, and cleaning cowshed individually.

The Project is planning to prepare the recommendations to the related agencies on measures for promoting beef cattle production ranging from initial investment supporting system to beef cattle marketing system.

1-3. Achievement of Project Purpose

The total number of the beef cattle of Pilot farmer groups has increased from 2,776 in September 2008 (before the implementation) to 4,983 in March 2011 which made an 80% increase among 4 regencies. Since October 2008, the Pilot farmer groups have received a total of 360 beef cattle from the project (=SKR-CF), central government, Regency office and SMD program. After subtraction of these provided beef cattle, the total number of the beef cattle is 4,623 in March 2011 which made a 67% increase compared with 2008.

1-4. Implementation process

(1) Dissemination activities on the Pilot farmer groups have started in 2008, which was one year ahead than the original schedule due to the contribution from the central government of Indonesia utilizing SKR-CF for the Pilot farmer groups. The change of the schedule has an effect on the formulation of "Lombok model" and "Sumbawa model". The models were introduced to the Pilot farmer groups without enough proof activities on the Model farmer groups.

(2) PDM and Plan of Operation (PO) should be changed when such a major change has happened.

(3) The strong initiative activities of the Provincial Livestock Office was not displayed and affected the Project implementation.

(4) During the Project implementation, the extension workers in NTB Provincial Livestock Office were shifted to the Extension Workers Coordination Agency under the Governor of NTB and the extension workers in Regency Livestock Service Office are no longer under the livestock office. This organizational change made the Project implementation difficult in coordination among related institutions.

2. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

Relevance of the Project is fairly high.

Overall Goal and Project Purpose are consistent with the needs of target groups of the Project as well as national government policy for poverty reduction and increase self-sufficient rate of beef cattle started from 2010 to 2014. NTB has implemented "Land of Million Cattle Program" (NTB-BSS) since 2008 and the program will continue to 2013. However, in line with NTB-BSS program, the provincial office enforces regulation of prohibiting the sales of beef cattle to outside the province. The Project is also consistent with Japan's ODA policy to Indonesia which considers supporting rural development and rural employment creation as one of its priority areas. JICA's assistance priority area to Indonesia also considers poverty reduction, local resources utilization and rural economy development.

As for the appropriateness of the project approach, however, decentralized structure of Indonesia was not well considered in the selection of counterpart organization and the role of Regency was not clarified in the project design.

(2) Effectiveness

Effectiveness of the Project is high.

The number of beef cattle of the Pilot farmer groups (the indicator for the Project Purpose) has increased 67% from 2008 to 2011. The counterparts in BIBD/BRSHLV Banyumulek and BPTHMT Serading have obtained sufficient knowledge and skills on beef cattle production from the Experts. They also gained experiences through the farmer visit activities. BIBD/BRSHLV Banyumulek and BPTHMT Serading have

been equipped and the counterparts obtained technical capacity to organize TOT trainings for trainers.

The regency level Field Officers, technical officers, extension workers and leaders of the model farmers have obtained beef cattle production knowledge and skills to instruct farmers. Famers in the Pilot groups have adopted the transferred method by the project on average 72% among the three 3 Lombok regencies and 80% in Sumbawa. Most of the farmers are still not aware of the benefits of working together in a group.

(3) Efficiency

Efficiency of the Project is low.

The project activities had not been implemented efficiently in the first two years due to inappropriate allocation of counterpart in the provincial office, insufficient number and specialized field of Experts allocated, and insufficient allocation of budget by Indonesian side. Some equipment provided by the Japanese side are still not fully utilized. Trained counterparts have frequently been shifted to other position resulting in less contribution to the achievement of the Outputs. In the selection of trainees for training in Japan were partly inappropriate due to their low contribution to the Project activities.

(4) Impact

Some positive and negative impacts are observed.

All the indicators for Overall Goal had already been attained by 2009. However, the income of beef cattle farmers will not increase easily due to the decrease of beef cattle prices since 2009. It is necessary to revise indicators to measure the impacts of the Project implementation appropriately. Positive impacts are observed in the compost production. It has reduced dung pollutions in neighbor, has generated income from the compost by selling and by utilizing for their agricultural production, and has saved their expenses by reducing usage of fertilizer. There are many visitors to the model and pilot farmer groups to learn new method. Negative impact was also observed in neighbors due to the excessive input on the model farmers.

(5) Sustainability

Sustainability of the Project is fair.

It seems that the institutional sustainability has not been considered by the project during the Project implementation period. Most of the stakeholders interviewed expect the continuous support from JICA. Therefore, institutional sustainability of Provincial Livestock Office, BIBD/ BPLPKH Banyumulek and BPTHMT Serading to maintain the systems developed by the Project depends upon the financial conditions.

Financial sustainability of the Provincial Livestock Service Office is likely critical based on the actual ratio of the local inputs to the Project implementation which has been decreasing from 24% in 2007 to 10% in 2010. Therefore, prospect of the operational budget for maintaining developed technologies by the Project at BIBD/ BPLPKH Banyumlek and BPTHMT Serading will also face difficulties.

Technical sustainability has been confirmed very high with the significant improvements of the trained counterparts, field officers, technical officers, extension workers in the regencies and members of model and pilot farmer groups by the Project. The performance of AI section in BIBD Banyumulek has been lessen in these days which can be a negative factor of technical sustainability.

3. Factors promoting better sustainability and impact

(1) Factors concerning the planning

Establishment of the TOT training system had planned for dissemination personnel (human resource development) in the regency level.

(2) Factors concerning the implementation process

1) Although the capacity development of BIBD/ BPLPKH Banyumlek and BPTHMT Serading have had not planned clearly in PDM, the long term expert had decided to implement activities at first.
2) Assignment of Field Officer (FO) in each regency livestock office for the monitoring activities on the Pilot farmers groups.
3) Strong efforts to catch up the delayed activities by the second dispatched three Japanese Experts and C/Ps.

4. Factors inhibiting better sustainability and impact

(1) Factors concerning the planning

1) The project was not designed with sufficient consideration of different authority and responsibility of organizations concerned under decentralized administrative structure of Indonesia.
2) Insufficient dispatch of the long-term experts for the system issues such as initial investment supporting system and marketing of beef cattle.

(2) Factors concerning the implementation process

1) The change of the schedule has an effect on the formulation of "Lombok model" and "Sumbawa model". The models were introduced to the Pilot farmer groups without enough proof activities on the Model farmer groups.
2) PDM and Plan of Operation (PO) has not been changed when such a major change has happened.

5. Conclusion

The evaluation team came to the following conclusion:

It can be judged that the project purpose is achieved, judging from the indicators in PDM. Despite of the logical irrelevance between the purpose and its indicators, the net increase of the number of beef cattle has achieved 67% during in the Pilot Farmers Groups the Project. All three Outputs are also almost achieved whereas some activities need to be implemented by the termination of the project.

As described in the previous sections, the relevance of the Project is fairly high due to the consistency with the policies of Indonesia and Japan. The effectiveness of the Project is also judged as high because of the achievement level of the project purpose. The efficiency can be regarded as low from various viewpoints including allocation of finance and human resources. As for Impact, some positive impacts are observed in environmental improvement and income generation by compost and biogas production, although excessive input to model farmers caused negative impact for neighboring farmers. The sustainability of the Project is fair due to insufficient institutional and financial prospect. However, the significant improvement of technical capacity of C/Ps, field officers, technical officers, and extension workers is a positive factor of sustainability.

6. Recommendations

The evaluation team recommends the following points based on this survey.

(1) Measures to be implemented before the termination of the Project

To the Project Team

1) Compiling recommendations on measures for the improvement of beef cattle production

To the Provincial Livestock Services

2) Certifying training texts by Governor's Ordinance
3) Discussion on the utilization of the Model farmers group and Pilot farmers group

(2) Measures to be taken for the post Project

To the Provincial and Regency Livestock Services and the Mayer of Regencies

1) Budget allocation for TOT training and extension activities
2) Obtaining information to find the reasons for price change of beef cattle
3) Strengthening of AI program including frozen semen production at BIBD Banyumulek
4) Utilizing and Strengthening BPTHMT Serading and BIBD Banyumulek as a base of Technical Diffusion Center

7. Lessons learned

(1) Project planning under decentralization

This project was not designed with sufficient consideration of different authority and responsibility of organizations concerned under decentralized administrative structure of Indonesia. As a result, the role of central government as a counterpart was limited and the initiative and involvement of Regency office turned to be a critical factor. The provincial government couldn't sufficiently play the role of coordination of the project at Regency level under the decentralized structure. Since authorities and responsibility including technical, administrative and financial aspects are diffused to different levels under decentralized country, appropriate management structure need to be discussed before implementation of the project with a strategy of capacity development and clear role and responsibility at different levels.

(2) Special Input required for establishing supporting system

A long-term effort is required for the system issues such as initial investment supporting system and marketing of beef cattle. Specialized experts should have been assigned to this project to cope with these issues.