

## Summary of Evaluation Result

<b>1. Outline of the Project</b>															
Country: Socialist Republic of Vietnam	Project Title: the project on the Villager Support for Sustainable Forest Management in Ventral Highland														
Issue/ Sector: Natural Environment	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project														
Division in charge: JICA Vietnam office	Total Cost: 251 million Yen														
Period of Cooperation (R/D):	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 30%;">3 years and 3 months from June 20, 2005 to September 19, 2008 (R/D): Signed on April 12, 2005</td> <td style="width: 70%;"> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 30%; text-align: center;">Partner Organization:</td> <td style="width: 40%; text-align: center;">Country's</td> <td style="width: 30%; text-align: center;">Implementation</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)</li> <li>- Division of Forestry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) of Kon Tum province</li> <li>- Kon Tum province Forestry Project Management Board</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Related Cooperation: None</td> </tr> </table> </td> </tr> </table>	3 years and 3 months from June 20, 2005 to September 19, 2008 (R/D): Signed on April 12, 2005	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 30%; text-align: center;">Partner Organization:</td> <td style="width: 40%; text-align: center;">Country's</td> <td style="width: 30%; text-align: center;">Implementation</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)</li> <li>- Division of Forestry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) of Kon Tum province</li> <li>- Kon Tum province Forestry Project Management Board</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Related Cooperation: None</td> </tr> </table>	Partner Organization:	Country's	Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)</li> <li>- Division of Forestry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) of Kon Tum province</li> <li>- Kon Tum province Forestry Project Management Board</li> </ul>			Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries			Related Cooperation: None		
3 years and 3 months from June 20, 2005 to September 19, 2008 (R/D): Signed on April 12, 2005	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 30%; text-align: center;">Partner Organization:</td> <td style="width: 40%; text-align: center;">Country's</td> <td style="width: 30%; text-align: center;">Implementation</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)</li> <li>- Division of Forestry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) of Kon Tum province</li> <li>- Kon Tum province Forestry Project Management Board</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Related Cooperation: None</td> </tr> </table>	Partner Organization:	Country's	Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)</li> <li>- Division of Forestry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) of Kon Tum province</li> <li>- Kon Tum province Forestry Project Management Board</li> </ul>			Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries			Related Cooperation: None				
Partner Organization:	Country's	Implementation													
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)</li> <li>- Division of Forestry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) of Kon Tum province</li> <li>- Kon Tum province Forestry Project Management Board</li> </ul>															
Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries															
Related Cooperation: None															
<b>1-1 Background of the Project</b>															
<p>The Central Highlands in Vietnam is recognized as higher potential for forestry development because the area sustains large scale natural forest. The development on the forest resources in the area requires enough environmental consideration such as the ecological conservation, social and economical perspectives. This was recognized that the development of the forest resources also requires adequate forest management plan and its project implementation in accordance with the comprehensive development plan. Under those backgrounds, “The Feasibility Study on the Forest Management Plan in the Central Highlands in Socialist Republic of Vietnam” was conducted in Kon Tum Province from January 2000 to December 2002. The study targeted to Kon Plong district in the province. Based on the Forest resource inventory study and management condition of the forest enterprise, target area for the project implementation was identified and master plan for the forest management including plans for silvicultural development and support for villagers were proposed. However, concerning to the late progress of the plan due to the short of experience of the concerned local government in Kon Tum Province on the technical and capacity to implement the villagers support and forest management, the government of Vietnam requested to the Japanese government for the technical cooperation project.</p> <p>In respect to the request on the project, the government of Japan started the project on the Villager Support for Sustainable Forest Management in the Central Highlands since June 2005 in order to</p>															

improve agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry, and agroforestry activities of villagers in model villages.

## **1-2 Outline of the project**

### **(1) Super Goal**

Pressures on forest resources from villagers' slash and burn activities are alleviated in Kon Tum Province.

### **(2) Overall Goal:**

- 1) Successful models in model villages are expanded to other villages located in the two districts.
- 2) The living standard of villagers in two districts in which 5 model villages are located is improved.

### **(3) Project Purpose:**

Agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry, and agroforestry activities are improved in model villages.

### **(4) Outputs:**

- 1) Villager's knowledge and skills in agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry, and agroforestry are improved.
- 2) Capacity of government staff in implementation and management of livelihood improvement projects is strengthened.
- 3) Villagers' capacity in marketing agricultural, forestry, and livestock products is strengthened.
- 4) Knowledge of villagers and government staff on sustainable use of forest and land is improved.
- 5) Preparations are made for extending results of project activities to other regions.

### **(5) Inputs (as of June 2008):**

(Japanese side)

Short-term experts: 5 experts (47 M/M)

Provision of Equipment: JPY 13,843,000

C/P training : 16 persons (in Thailand)

Local Cost Support: JPY 60,265,000

(Vietnamese Side)

Total counter-budget is: 2,192,700,000 VND (approximately equivalent to USD 13,692)

C/P allocation: 13 C/Ps

Provision of office spaces and facilities in Sub-Department of Forestry in Kon Tum Province and 2 offices in District People's committee.

## **2. Evaluation Team (Japanese side)**

Team Members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Leader, Yasuhiro TOJO, Senior Deputy Resident Representative, JICA Vietnam Office</li><li>- Silviculture Techniques, Takayuki SATO, Assistant Director, International Forestry Cooperation Office, Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries</li><li>- Cooperation Planning, Katsuhiko ANDO, Senior Project Formulation Advisor, JICA Vietnam Office</li></ul>
--------------	---

	- Evaluation/Analysis, Kazuo IYAMA, Researcher, Social Development Dept., Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.	
Period	May 4 to May 13 in 2008	Type of Evaluation: Final Evaluation
<b>3. Summary of Evaluation</b>		
<b>3-1 Result of Cooperation</b>		
<b>(1) Achievement of Output</b>		
<b><u>Output 1: Villager's knowledge and skills in agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry, and agroforestry are improved.</u></b>		
<p>The output 1 was fully accomplished. Twenty (20) types of farming activities were introduced by the project. A hundred eighty one (181) households of all 297 households in model villages participated to the activities by the end of 2007. Approximately 95% of participants are continuing the project activities because of increase of the product through the activities at the end of 2007.</p>		
<b><u>Output 2: Capacity of government staff in implementation and management of livelihood improvement projects is strengthened.</u></b>		
<p>The Community Facilitators (CF) assigned by the DARD are independently able to work in the model villages at the time of the evaluation. By the end of March 2007, the livelihood improvement plan (LIP) had been prepared for 6 villages excluding the model villages. Since the LIP will be prepared for another 4 villages (excluding the model villages) by the end of the project period, it is expected to formulate the LIP of 10 other villages in total.</p>		
<b><u>Output 3: Villagers' capacity in marketing agricultural, forestry, and livestock products is strengthened.</u></b>		
<p>A marketing plan was not established at the time of the evaluation because most of agriculture products were self consumed in the five model villages. Thus, output 3 was evaluated as not fully accomplished at the evaluation. Instead of formulating a marketing plan, the "ideas on alternative sales methods" was prepared for one of the model village by the end of 2007. It is planned to prepare the "ideas on alternative sales methods" for two more villages by the end of project period.</p>		
<b><u>Output 4: Knowledge of villagers and government staff on sustainable use of forest and land is improved.</u></b>		
<p>This output was fairly accomplished at the time of the evaluation. The draft of "Community Forest Management (CFM) plan" was formulated for Vichring Village of Hieu Commune with the process of community participation. The District People's Committee of Kon Plong was preparing "the Red book" which would certificate the villagers to use the forest land for community forest purpose. It is expected that the CFM plan to be implemented after issuing the Red book.</p>		
<b><u>Output 5: Preparations are made for extending results of project activities to other regions</u></b>		
<p>This output was fairly accomplished at the time of the evaluation and will be fully accomplished by the end of the project period in 2008. During the JFY 2007, the extension seminar was held in 3 communes (out of 5 communes where the model villages are located), inviting villagers of other</p>		

village to the model villages; 14 other villages participated in the seminar. It is planned to hold seminars in another two of the model villages during the JFY 2008 and it is expected that 20 villages are to participate cumulatively. The guideline consists of the basic and advanced farming skill and the management of livelihood activities will be prepared by the end of the project period.

## **(2) Achievement of Project Purpose**

**Project Purpose:** Agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry, and agroforestry activities are improved in model villages.

The indicators for the project purpose were almost accomplished by the time of the final evaluation. The number of villagers who participated in the project activities is increasing, and 95 % of villagers among the 181 total households have continued their diversified agricultural activities until the time of evaluation. Over twenty (20) types of farming activities were implemented in the model villages.

Since increasing the amount of agriculture products, the distribution of products within a village has been activated instead of the self consumption.

## **(3) Prospect for achieving Overall Goal**

**Overall goal:**

- (1) Successful models in model villages are expanded to other villages located in the two districts.
- (2) The living standard of villagers in two districts in which 5 model villages are located is improved.

Farming skills have been shared and disseminated among villagers in the model villages at the time of the evaluation. In order to disseminate the farming skills to other villages, it is expected that trainings on farming skills to be done by officials and extension workers of the district People's committee.

With regard to the livelihood improvement, it can be considered that if above mentioned extension and dissemination system would be worked, the farming technologies could be introduced in villages in targeted two districts.

## **3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results**

### **(1) Relevance**

The project is relevant from the following perspectives.

- 1) The project purpose meets the policy of the government of Vietnam which aims to improve livelihood of the economically poor family of ethnic minority in sustainable way. The government of Vietnam has implemented the governmental programs such as 134,135 and 168 to support ethnical minority and poor household in rural area.
- 2) Regarding the forestry issue, the project aims to solve the deforestation in the area through creating alternative income opportunities to the slash and burn cultivation and other destructive manner to the natural environment. This can be recognized to contribute achievement of the objectives of the prioritized "sustainable forest management and development program" of the "Vietnam Forestry Development Strategy 2006 -2020".
- 3) Moreover, the Central highlands are designated areas to be prioritized in the development policy

of the production forest for 2007 – 2015. Target villages were selected through participated way ranking the priority among all villages in the commune.

## **(2) Effectiveness**

Effectiveness of the project is recognized as fairly good. The project purpose has been achieved through establishment of farming models and capacity building on the governmental staff and local villagers who are categorized as ethnic minorities in the Central Highlands. However, due to the project is implemented rather in small scale (1 village per 1 commune), the products produced from activities introduced is just used for self subsistence and not enough to sell to other villages or market.

## **(3) Efficiency**

The project was implemented efficiently by the effort of assigned Japanese experts and Vietnamese counterpart personnel to the project. However, during the project period, the input from the Vietnamese side was limited due to the delay of official project approval by the government of Vietnam. This delay also caused some influences to the project progress such as the delay of the procurement of the technical equipments (vehicles) and less financial contribution to daily activities by the Vietnamese counterparts.

## **(4) Impact**

Positive impact of the project activity was increasingly extended although it was not numerically confirmed. Improvement of livelihood within the model villages was confirmed visibly even in the outside of the model villages. According to the local government, the activities such as fish raisings, pig farming and vegetable home-garden are remarkably extended among villagers even in the other villages.

Impact of the project purpose toward the overall goal and super goal was not numerically confirmed in detail at the time of evaluation. As a reference on the current situation, the total forest area in the Kon Tum Province in 2005 and in 2006 are 656,204ha and 656,820ha respectively, and the forest area increased by 615ha (Forest area and unused area planed for forestry, MARD, 2006). Some government officials and villagers in model villages, who answered the interview at the evaluation, mentioned the possibility to decrease the area of slash and burn cultivation because the villager's livelihood changes to work around the village. This decreasing trend was similarly found in almost all model villages in their answers. Contrarily, in one of the five communes, the increase in slash and burn cultivation, which happened recently, was worried by interviewee due to increase cassava price in the area.

## **(5) Sustainability**

It can be evaluated that the sustainability of the project in activity level is secure. The management ability of the counterpart personnel, especially the Community Facilitators (CF) as well as the Village Development Board (VDB) members, have been improved regarding planning, monitoring and evaluation for the livelihood improvement program. The fund-raising from the animal bank system has been started in the model villages even though the amount raised has yet to be much

enough. Using the fund for the activities which should be continuously maintained, it can be considered that the fund can partially contribute to security of the sustainability.

The activity can be secure when the provincial government continues to support the local villagers using the developed system under the circumstance of no large negative changes in the villagers. As the level of project purpose, the concerned government, Kon Tum Province takes responsibility on the dissemination of the project results. The province enthusiastically intends to solve the poverty reduction of the area using the effective assistance from the other financial resources. There are two large scale projects currently implemented by the province for the poverty reduction. Also, financial allocation from the central government such as program 134, 135 and 168 were realized. It is expected that the government of Kon Tum Province utilize the result on the project effectively.

### **3-3 Promoting Factors**

#### **(1) Factors related to Planning**

Regarding the achievement of the project purpose, since the benefit of the activities has become visible, the villagers have been increasingly motivated to continue the activities, and the ability of the villagers to practice the farming activities has been improved. In particular, the livelihood and income in the project area is low and the proportion of ethnic minorities is high, the activities which directly connect to increase income could effectively bring up farmer' motivation.

#### **(2) Factors related to Implementation Process**

Although the amount of the dispatched experts was a minimum, the VDB and the CFs were continuously following up the project activities in the project sites. In addition, the CFs and the VDB managed the project activities by themselves, it could contribute the capacity development of them and the Vietnamese counterparts.

### **3-4 Hampering Factors**

#### **(1) Factors related to planning**

The implementation agencies of the central and provincial government are department associated with forestry. The super goal is set up as to focus on the forest and consistent with the responsibility of the implementation agencies. However, since the project purpose rather consists of elements on rural development, it tends to be considered that the project activities do not meet the needs of their organization. Therefore, when the super goal is to set, it is important to settle this matter with implementation agency to understand the process and long-term framework among the project purpose, overall goal and super goal.

#### **(2) Factors related to implementation process**

Due to the delay of the project approval by the government of Vietnam, it caused influences to the project progress such as the delay of the procurement of the technical equipments and daily activities with the Vietnamese counterparts.

### **3-5 Conclusion**

The evaluation result shows that the project purpose can be accomplished by the end of project

period. It is observed that some effective models including fish farming, nursery, vegetable garden, paddy cultivation, pig farming, duck raising, roofed animal house construction are implemented in the project areas, and to be needed to disseminate after the project completion.

The CFM plan has drafted in Vichiring village, and livelihood improvement activity through the CFM is expected in the village.

In terms of the project efficiency, some delay, especially for the project procedure, were found at the beginning of the project. Some of the activities implemented in the limited project period were influenced by the above delay. Therefore, this kind of delay should be avoided through the necessary coordination between two countries.

### **3-6 Recommendations**

#### **(1) By the end of project**

Regarding the activities in the marketing, the project should continue the current way that is formulating ideas for a better way of marketing through the training. Furthermore the project should support villagers to realize marketing ideas.

Regarding to the matter of the CFM plan, the project and the responsible agencies should discuss to get a common understanding on the plan for CFM. Based on the result of discussion, it should be decided which activities will be taken by the project by the end of the project.

#### **(2) Post-project activities**

In order to fully achieve the overall goal of the project, it is important to continue extending support to the dissemination of model activities to the other villages. The Vietnamese side should take responsibilities to ensure the sustainable institutional support mechanisms with referring the project framework such as the VDB and the CFs. It is also desirable that the Vietnamese side should take integrated approach to support other villages by using the alternative financial resources such as governmental poverty reduction programs as well as the other donor's assistance. The successful activities should be continued to disseminate to other villages in the communes and districts of Kon Plong and Kon Ray.

### **3-7 Lessons Learned**

(1) In this project, each short term expert had to be dispatched in relays, breaking the assignment into short periods, the experts had to spent time for transferring the works to other experts. Therefore, in order to continuously monitor the inputs and precisely examine the outputs that correspond with the input, especially rural and community development, it is considered that at least one long term expert to be dispatched to coordinate and monitor the project.

(2) Although the project implementation agencies are forestry related authorities, the project main activities are rather the rural development issues. Therefore, the project implementation agencies tended to think that the project does not match with the mandate of their organization. It is necessary to identify the appropriate organization depending on the project activities.

### **3-8 Follow-up status**

The implementation agencies of the project is considering applying a new project under the technical cooperation scheme of the government of Japan in order to follow the result on the community forest management which related to the output 4 of the project. It is important to evaluate the validity and the necessity of the new project based on this evaluation result.