

Republic of Ghana

Ex-Post Evaluation of Japanese Technical Cooperation Project

“Project for West African Centre for International Parasite Control”

External Evaluator: Jun Totsukawa, Sano Planning Co, Ltd

## **0. Summary**

This project aims to implement capacity building in parasitic diseases control of the member countries in the West African sub-region by WACIPAC. In terms of the necessity of parasite control, this objective is relevant with the country's policy and needs at the time of the project planning and of the ex-post evaluation. However, in terms of sustainable management of the centre, its relevance is only at fair level because the sustainable management is not clearly defined within the development policy of the government of Ghana. The efficiency of the project is fair because the project was carried out as per the original plan and it was completed within the planned period, but the project total budget exceeded the original plan. The effectiveness and impact of the project is at fair level because within the project period it achieved the project objective of WACIPAC's playing the role of capacity building for integrated parasite control activities of the member countries in the West African sub-region through frequent international capacity building workshops and follow-up visits, but the overall goal has not been fully achieved because the activity of WACIPAC is of limited scope after the project period. Sustainability of the project effects is low because there are large challenging issues in the government's policy background to support the institution despite sufficient technical level acquired throughout the project.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

## 1. Project Description



Project Locations



Putei elementary school of the model site

### 1.1 Background

At the 1997 Denver Summit of the G7 countries, Ryutaro Hashimoto, then the prime minister of Japan, advocated the importance of international co-operation in parasitic diseases control. At the subsequent G8 meeting in Birmingham in 1998, Japan submitted a report titled “International Parasite Control in the 21<sup>st</sup> century”, declared the intention to help developing countries strengthen their human and information network for parasitic diseases control based on its achievement in succeeding to put intestinal parasites under control in Japan. Following this declaration, the government of Japan decided to establish three regional centres in Thailand, Kenya and Ghana. Asia Centre of International Parasite Control (ACIPAC) was established at Mahidol University in Thailand in 2000. Then the Eastern and Southern Africa Centre for International Parasite Control (ESACIPAC) was established at Kenya Medical Research Institute, Kenya in 2001. In Ghana, Noguchi Memorial Institute for Medical Research (NMIMR), University of Ghana was selected as the Centre for promoting Global Parasite Control Initiative in West Africa. As NMIMR carried out Infectious Disease Control Project supported by JICA from 1999 to 2003, third country training programme was introduced to initiate GPCI and some related activities to parasite control were also incorporated into the Infectious Disease

Control Project. With aid of previous experiences and preparatory work, the Project for the West African Centre for International Parasite Control (WACIPAC) was launched in January 2004 for the duration of five years to build capacity of various level of target group such as policy makers and programme managers for parasite control and to promote network among relevant personnel and Centres for International Parasite Control (CIPACs).

## 1.2 Project Outline

Overall Goal		Parasitic diseases control programmes of the member countries in the West African sub-region are implemented by the capacity built by/at WACIPAC.
Project Objective		WACIPAC performs the role of building capacity for integrated parasite control activities of the member countries in the West African sub-region.
Output(s)	Output 1	Institutional capacity of WACIPAC is strengthened
	Output 2	A model for school health based intervention for parasite control is developed through field research activities in Ghana.
	Output 3	Policy makers and programme managers of the member countries acquire knowledge and skills concerning school health based intervention for parasite control through the international training courses and follow-up.
	Output 4	WACIPAC functions as a hub for information network within the member countries, and promotes networking among three CIPACs. (CIPAC: Centre for International Parasite Control*)
	Output 5	Supporting countries start activities on school health based intervention for parasite control.
Inputs		<p>Japanese Side:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 25 experts 7 for Long-Term, 18 for Short-Term</li> <li>2. 14 persons for counterpart training (12 in Japan, 2 in Japanese universities for long-term)</li> <li>3. 4 persons for training of third-country trainees</li> <li>4. Provision of equipment 34.6 million yen</li> <li>5. Local Cost 158.36 million Yen</li> <li>6. Others (1) Construction of a project office building and a field</li> </ol>

	<p>experiment room.</p> <p>(2) Capacity building for project management 4 times, Interim evaluation 1 time, Terminal evaluation 1 time.</p> <p>Ghanaian Side:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 16 appointed counterparts for WACIPAC</li> <li>2. Procurement of equipment</li> <li>3. Provision of land and training facility Project office, Seminar auditorium, electricity and water charge</li> <li>4. Salaries of counterparts</li> </ol>
Total cost	663.21 million yen
Period of Cooperation	January 2005 – December 2008
Implementing Agency	Noguchi Memorial Institute for Medical Research (NMIMR), University of Ghana, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Keio University, Nagasaki University, Tokyo Medical and Dental University, Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare, International Medical Centre of Japan, Japan Association of Parasite Control
Related Projects (if any)	Third Country Training (International Parasite Control) (JFY2001-2003), Grant Aid for NMIMR (P3 Laboratory, Conference Hall, etc)

\* Member countries are: Ghana, Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Togo. Ghana, Benin and Niger are the most intensively supported countries.

### 1.3 Outline of the Terminal Evaluation

#### 1.3.1 Prospect for the achievement of Overall Goal at the time of terminal evaluation

It was evaluated as "It is highly possible that the parasite control program will be implemented within member countries with the initiatives of the international training participants." Moreover, the project has left a visible impact, such as the full or trial implementation of de-worming program not only in the most intensively supported countries of Ghana, Niger, Benin, but also in some other member countries.

#### 1.3.2 Achievement of Project Objective

The project activity was accelerated in the latter half of the project period and it was evaluated as "The Project Purpose is likely to be achieved by the end of the Project". For each indicator, ①: Capacity building, ②: Heightening of recognition level of WACIPAC, ③: Establishment of information networks, ④:

Strengthening of policy framework and programmes on parasite control and school health in the Supporting countries, it is evaluated as “satisfactory”.

### **1.3.3 Recommendations**

Three recommendations were:

- 1) In order to ensure its sustainability as a regional centre, WACIPAC makes up and submits the solid proposal to WAHO for earlier authorization, and makes efforts to sustain solid collaboration with member countries.
- (2) WACIPAC continues playing a leading role in operational research, and publishes scientific articles in peer-reviewed journals by making use of the study results at the model sites.
- (3) WACIPAC closely monitors the planned activities of projects in the most intensively supported countries, aiming for further outcomes.

## **2. Outline of the Evaluation Study**

### **2.1 External Evaluator**

Jun Totsukawa, Sano Planning Co, Ltd

### **2.2 Duration of Evaluation Study**

Duration of the Study: November, 2011 – August, 2012

Duration of the Field Study: November 30, 2011 – December 22, 2011

May 06, 2102 – May 21, 2012

### **2.3 Constraints during the Evaluation Study**

In this evaluation study, questionnaires were sent to WACIPAC member countries, but four member countries (Benin, Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire; and Mali) did not respond to the questionnaire. Thus, the impact evaluation is performed based on the answers from the five countries which responded to the questionnaire.

## **3. Results of the Evaluation (Overall Rating: D<sup>1</sup>)**

### **3.1 Relevance (Rating: ②<sup>2</sup>)**

#### **3.1.1 Relevance with the Development Plan of the Republic of Ghana**

(1) At the time of the project initiation

In September 2000, the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) was adopted as the 21st century objectives of the international community. It provides a common

<sup>1</sup> A: Highly satisfactory, B: Satisfactory, C: Partially satisfactory, D: Unsatisfactory

<sup>2</sup> ③: High, ② Fair, ① Low

goal for development policies of the countries in the world. MDGs are comprised of eight chapters (main goals), one of which is "Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases". A concrete target of the Goal 6 is "Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases". The whole world is targeted, but the West African region was the most important target area because of its high incidence of malaria and other parasitic diseases. Given the above mentioned circumstances, this project's aim of parasitic diseases control in the West African region is considered to be relevant to the international community's common development policy.

However, at the time of the inception of this project, there was no policy document of the Republic of Ghana which clearly shows its political will to launch the regional center which widely serves the West African region.

(2) At the time of the termination of the project

This project is considered to have remained relevant to the international community's common development policy, because the project's completion year of 2008 was at the middle toward the MDGs target year of 2015<sup>3</sup>. However, we have not found any policy document of the Republic of Ghana which clearly declares its intention to make contribution to the West African region and to construct the regional centre.

As a whole, this project has consistently been relevant to the international community's common development policy in terms of the importance of parasitic diseases control. However, there has been no firm commitment (more concretely, the standing point of the center within the development policy and the plan to achieve it) on the side of the Republic of Ghana throughout the project period to launch the regional center and take actions for its sustainable management. This lack of clear policy supports to WACIPAC has appeared as the weakness in policy aspect of sustainability evaluation of this study.

### 3.1.2 Relevance with the Development Needs of the Republic of Ghana

(1) At the time of the project initiation (Needs for parasitic diseases control)

The West African region including Ghana is plagued with various parasitic diseases. Approximately 2 billion people, mainly in developing countries, are infected with intestinal tract parasitic worms, such as roundworms, and blood flukes. The West

---

<sup>3</sup> The United Nations assessed the achievement of MDGs in September, 2010, and ascertained to accelerate the activities for the goal. The assessment shows the Sub Sahara Africa's performance as "no progress or deteriorated".

African region is no exception. A high incidence especially among school children in the region is reported. As a persistent serious infection with intestinal parasitic diseases causes anemia and malnutrition, which then leads to poor learning performance, implementation of stool analysis and de-worming for all school children is recognized as an important issue in education sector.

However, in the past parasitic diseases control of member countries, there was no alignment between the Health sector and the Education sector and thus both sectors have been implementing parasitic diseases control independently. Unlike such antecedents, this project has promoted collaboration between the two sectors and has aimed for capacity building of policy makers and program officers. Therefore, the project is considered to be relevant to development needs of the member countries.

(2) At the time of the termination of the project (Needs for parasitic diseases control)

According to the data of WHO in 2010, which is close to the completion year of the project, nine out of the ten member countries (except Ghana) are ranked as "the most needed" in rankings of "necessity of parasitic diseases control". Incidence rates and the number of patients of soil spread parasitic diseases and blood flukes diseases are presumed to be different across countries, but general needs for further promotion of parasitic diseases control is estimated to have remained high.<sup>4</sup>

Given the above, this project is considered to be relevant to development policy needs. On the other hand, the following issues appear as to the needs for the establishment of the center.

(Background for the establishment of the center – from the viewpoint of relevance with the needs.)

What is notable in the background for the establishment of the center is the fact that, as was mentioned above and will be mentioned below, from the Hashimoto initiative in 1998, to "Japan's Action Plan in Combating Infectious Diseases in Africa" in 2006, Japan promised its support for parasitic diseases control to the international community, and took actions for its implementation by establishing

---

<sup>4</sup> Because of the characteristic features of its symptoms (it does not directly lead to death and carriers of parasites often do not recognize his/her infection and thus do not see doctors.), it is difficult to have correct numbers of patients. Thus, only the data of the number of patients in very limited areas, which was collected by out-reach activity, are available, but there is no nation-wide data. Even Ghana, known as a leading country for data collection, lacks nation-wide figures.

centers for the execution of the objectives in the East African region, the West African region and the South-East Asia. The center in the West African region was Noguchi Memorial Institute for Medical Research (NMIMR), to which Japan extended its support for long time thorough various aid modalities including grant-aid and with which Japan conducted various projects.

It is presumed that WACIPAC was established as an institute within NMIMR because Japan needed to launch an execution center for parasitic diseases control in the West African region while NMIMR judged that it can make contribution in terms of the relevance of its mission and its expertise<sup>5</sup>. Moreover, at the time of project planning, prior to the start-up of this project, Japan, in collaboration with NMIMR, was carrying out third-country trainings "parasitic diseases control" program. Such existing projects may have prompted the above decision.

The expected role of WACIPAC was capacity building and network promotion, which have been included as the main outputs in the PDM. As ex-post development of the project, an attempt was made so that WACIPAC may be recognized as an official institute of the University of Ghana, but was given up because the recognition was subject to clear funding resources to finance the center's management. Subsequently, an attempt has been made to keep WACIPAC's activities through its incorporation into West Africa Health Organization (WAHO) of Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS)<sup>6</sup>. (An attempt to incorporate WACIPAC into WAHO is still on-going.)

### 3.1.3 Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

This project started with the objective of capacity building for parasitic diseases control, based on International Parasite Control Initiative (Hashimoto Initiative) agreed in G8 summit meeting in Birmingham in 1998. In 2005, Japan made public "Health and Development" Initiative in the context of enhancing support for health problems in developing countries. In 2006, Japan, targeting Africa, announced "Japan's Action Plan in Combating Infectious Diseases in Africa". The action plan clearly mentions the promotion of training of medical sector employees and researchers, information exchanges and studies of international level, and also the promotion of parasitic diseases control through school healthcare model of WACIPAC.

Given the above, a support for parasitic diseases control is Japan's commitment to the international community, and therefore this project is relevant to Japan's ODA

---

<sup>5</sup> NMIMR sets the mission: 1) research, 2) education and training, and 3) extension (contribution to society).

<sup>6</sup> WAHO was established in 1987.



policy.

Concluding the above, while there have been some negative factors such as the lack of clear statement in Ghana's development policy about the launch of the regional center or its commitment to the project, the project is highly relevant both in development policies and needs of parasites control, therefore, its relevance is fair.

### **3.2 Effectiveness and Impact<sup>7</sup> (Rating: ②)**

#### **3.2.1 Project Outputs**

##### **3.2.1.1 Project Output**

1) Output 1: Institutional capacity of WACIPAC is strengthened

Institutional capacity of WACIPAC was strengthened through international training workshops and planning/management of field researches. In the latter half of the project period, WACIPAC well managed and implemented international training workshops and follow-up visits to the member countries. Thus, the output 1 was mostly achieved. "Mostly" instead of "Fully" comes from the incompleteness of the integration plan to West Africa Health Organization (WAHO), which corresponds to the indicator ①.

In terms of the indicators, despite its failure to achieve the indicator ①, management meetings and job seminars were held regularly in every week, thus the indicator ② is fully achieved. As to the indicator ③: WACIPAC staff acquire skills and knowledge for operational research and training management, the skills and knowledge on data management methods, arrangement of training workshops, and research protocol were transferred through practice learning and became solid working knowledge of participants.

2) Output 2: A model for school health based intervention for parasite control is developed through field research activities in Ghana.

The output 2 is considered to have mostly been achieved. "Mostly" instead of "Fully" comes from the fact that scientific evaluation of "Efficiency of 'school to community' approach" in the indicator 3 was partly infeasible before the end of the project. In the project, model sites (three elementary schools in Dangme East) were built and teacher training methods and the IEC materials were developed using these three model sites. After the interim evaluation study, the model sites accelerated field research and carried out school health based parasitic control activities. Moreover, through the field research, knowledge and skill on data

---

<sup>7</sup> Sub-rating for Effectiveness is to be put with consideration of Impact.

management and cost management were effectively transferred.

In terms of the indicators, eleven kinds of "IEC materials" of the indicator ① have been made. As to the indicator ②: School children and communities in the model project sites acquire their knowledge of parasite control and take preventive actions, the growing number of school children started to wash their hands regularly and stopped drinking worm-contaminated water. Regarding the indicator ③, the output was not achieved within the project period as mentioned above, but it is worth mentioning that a scientific study was completed and published in the end after the project termination.

3) Output 3: Policy makers and programme managers of the member countries acquire knowledge and skills concerning school health based intervention for parasite control through the international training courses and follow-up.

The output 3 is considered to have been fully achieved. Judging from the fact that the member countries' efforts in parasites control yielded various outputs such as the school education general assembly or the revision of the guidelines of school health, the participants' acquisition of knowledge and expertise are considered to be good. Its achievement can also be confirmed from the indicators. As to the indicator ①: At least 100 personnel from 10 member countries are trained through the international training courses, two meetings of policy makers and five workshops of program managers were held, making the number of total participants reach 137. Regarding the indicator ②: The participants of international training courses acquire experiences and confidence in practicing parasite control in the fields, training participants are making use of what they learned when practicing parasite control in their own countries. Some examples are; Burkina Faso held a school education general assembly which incorporates the concept of school health; Nigeria made the school health policy and the implementation guidelines.

4) Output 4: WACIPAC functions as a hub for information network within the member countries, and promotes networking among three GPCI International Centres (CIPACs)

The output 4 was mostly achieved. The project bolstered information exchanges among the international training participants, development partners, and CIPACs through various communication tools (phones, e-mails). Communication and public relations of WACIPAC is done by newsletters, web sites, and domestic and international academic conferences. Especially, the number of access to the web site has drastically increased after the opening of the French version. Closet to the

end of the Project period, 140 accesses per day were counted on average. However, the creation of database on parasitic diseases in the West African region was not completed, being hindered by various factors (difficulties in the disclosure permission of epidemiologic information and in IT infrastructures), which corresponds to the indicator ①. Thus, the achievement is evaluated as “mostly”.

Although the database was not completed (the indicator ①), the other indicators were satisfied. The indicator ②: Website based information sharing system is well realized as the contents of the website were expanded and the number of access increased. The Newsletters have already published 29 issues at the time of this ex-post evaluation (the indicator ③), aiming for dissemination of information to the member countries. As to the indicator ④: Two presentations at scientific conferences and at least five articles, three presentations at international scientific conferences and five presentations at domestic scientific conferences were done and one article in a peer-reviewed journal was published within the project period.

5) Output 5: Supporting countries start activities on school health based intervention for parasite control

The output 5 was largely achieved. In the most intensively supported countries (Benin, Niger, Ghana), parasite control activities were carried out vigorously with the support of WACIPAC, and these activities evolved into the national de-worming plan. Describing more in detail, a school based de-worming model was created in Benin and the government of Benin extended the de-worming to nation-wide activity. In Niger, school self-evaluation sheets for sanitary environment were made and empirical studies were done. In Ghana, in collaboration with UNICEF, national de-worming programmes were implemented involving 14,000 schools and 5,500 thousand students.

As to the indicators, the indicator ① is well attained as mentioned above. The indicator ②: At least 30 frontline officers are trained in the supporting countries, was satisfied as the 326 teachers in Benin participated in the trainings and the regional education officers and school supervisors participated in the trainings in 27 elementary schools in Niger.

Overall, although some parts of the outputs were not fully achieved, but the essential parts of the outputs were largely achieved at high levels.

### 3.2.1.2 Achievement of Project Objectives

Project objective: WACIPAC performs the role of building capacity for integrated

parasite control activities of the member countries in the West African sub-region. This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high, as WACIPAC played the role of building capacity for parasite control, as shown by the indicator achievements below.

- 1) Indicator 1: 60% of target personnel involved in parasite control and school health programmes (policy makers, managers) of the member countries successfully receive training.

(Status of achievement)

Compared with the planned number of participants of 100, there were 137 participants. During the project period, two trainings for policy makers (40 participants) and five trainings for project managers (97 participants) were implemented.

- 2) Indicator 2: Recognition level of WACIPAC in the member countries as a training centre of parasitic disease control is heightened.

(Status of achievement)

According to the responses of programme managers and other donor agencies to the questionnaire surveys done at the terminal evaluation, it is clear that WACIPAC was recognized not only as a training centre but also as an information centre and a field research institute.

- 3) Indicator 3: Communication among personnel working on parasite control is stimulated by WACIPAC.

(Status of achievement)

According to the responses of programme managers to the questionnaire surveys done at the terminal evaluation, about 40 % of contact persons communicate at least once a month with telephone, e-mail, and meetings. It is judged that, during the project period, WACIPAC stimulated communication among the concerned personnel by the information dissemination through their website, which was opened in January 2005 and counted 140 accesses per day on average, and 29 issues of the newsletters.

- 4) Indicator 4: Policy framework and programmes on parasite control and school health in the Supporting countries are strengthened by WACIPAC.

(Status of achievement)

WACIPAC supported activities of the most intensively supported countries through what they call “follow-up visits” on regular basis. In the visits, project

experts and the member countries' personnel, collaborated each other, made presentations of project activities and outputs to each country's policy makers and development partners, aiming to incorporate their activities into each country's policy framework or programmes. As a result, in Benin and Niger, both most intensively supported countries, IEC materials and various tools developed in the project have been reflected in both countries' parasite control and school health programmes. More in detail:

- Benin: Based on the project activities, the national de-worming programme has been initiated.
- Niger: Based on the project activities, an activity casebook, a school health activity guide, and a manual for the use of self-evaluation sheets were made.

Concluding from the above, this project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

Additionally, given the nature of the aid modality of 'technical assistance' of this project, the knowledge and skill transfer by this project can be summarized as: strengthening of management ability of trainings, creation of field research methods and research protocol, a making know-how of IEC materials, effective implementation of follow-up visits. These outputs, while playing an important role in the project objective of a training centre in the West African region, implanted the related knowledge and skill to NMIMR.

### **3.2.2 Impact**

#### 3.2.2.1 Achievement of Overall Goal

Overall Goal: Parasitic diseases control programmes of the member countries in the West African sub-region are implemented by the capacity built by/at WACIPAC.

\* It is mentioned in the PDM that this overall goal is to be evaluated in 3 to 5 years after the end of the 5 years project. Given this ex-post evaluation is being done in three and a half years after the end of the project, we evaluate the achievement status of the overall goal.

##### 1) Indicator 1

School-based Parasitic Control programmes are actively implemented in the member countries.

(Status of achievement)

It is found that four, which excludes Togo, out of five countries which responded to the questionnaire survey, are practicing parasite control activities. In many cases, it seems that distribution of de-worming drugs and enlightenment activities in collaboration with NGOs or International Organizations, are being done. To the contrary, Togo responded that parasite control activities are withering in their country after the end of the project.

NB) As of March 2012, we received answers from five WACIPAC member countries (In total, nine responses were received from Burkina Faso, Niger, Senegal, Togo, Nigeria). We have no information on the four countries from which we failed to obtain answers (Benin, Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Mali).

Though these activities were carried out with supports of NGOs and International Organizations as described in the following table, the participation of the WACIPAC trainees in these programmes indicates that WACIPAC made a contribution to the currently on-going parasite control activities.

Table 1 Parasite control activities of WACIPAC member countries after the project

Country	Items	Description
Burkina Faso	Period	2008 - present
	Programme name	Health and School Nutrition Programme in Ten Year Plan for Elementary Education Development
	Main activities	De-worming of all students of the project area
	Number of people treated	Approximately 800 thousand students
	Supporting organization	Consortium of NGOs (Helen Keller Institute: HKI, Foundation for Community Development: FDC, Catholic Relief Service : CRS)
Niger	Period	2009 – present
	Programme name	National campaign for the Neglected Tropical Diseases
	Main activities	Drug distribution, Enlightenment, Case investigation of dropsy and elephantiasis
	Number of people treated	All students of age 5 to 14 (students of elementary education) and non-school-attending children
	Supporting organization	WHO, Service Civil Int'l, RISEAL(Réseau International Schistosomiasis Environnement et. Lutte), USAID, Carter foundation, etc.
Senegal	Period	2011
	Programme name	Nutrition enhancement program
	Main activities	Programs against anemia for school children, De-worming for school children
	Number of people treated	Approximately 840 thousand students
	Supporting organization	World Bank, World Food Organization, United Nations World Food Programme, Plan International, Deworming the World

Nigeria	Period	2009 - present
	Programme name	School de-worming program
	Main activities	Advocacy to concerned ministries, Community Enlightenment Teacher and health worker training Distribution of de-worming drugs
	Number of people treated	17 out of the total 36 states
	Supporting organization	PCD, Deworming the World, UNICEF, Sightsavers International

Source: Ex-post evaluation study, Answers of questionnaire surveys

## 2) Indicator 2

80 % of target personnel involved in parasite control and school health programmes in the member countries successfully receive training at WACIPAC.

(Status of achievement)

Under the circumstances, which will be mentioned in the sustainability analysis below, the activities of WACIPAC are very limited after the project. Concretely, WACIPAC's activities are almost limited to the international parasite control workshops with financial supports by an international NGO, PCD<sup>8</sup> (partly funded by JICA) (the host country for 2009 and 2010, the participation as lecturers in 2011 workshop, which was held in Kenya). Thus, the achievement level so far is not satisfactory.

The indicator says "80 % of target personnel involved ... receive training", but there is no mention neither on the total number of target personnel nor on the institutions those target personnel belong to. In this respect, this indicator remains ambiguous. However, even if we take a position of making a favourable evaluation, forgetting about this ambiguity, the number of participating countries of four and participants of 12 in a workshop by NMIMR in 2010 in comparison with the 137 participants from all the ten member countries during the project period (simple average of 27 participants per year) shows how limited the ex-post activities are.

However, on the other hand, given the fact that parasite control methods are not something which evolve very quickly day by day, the numbers of above-mentioned participants for annual workshops can be thought sufficient. In

---

<sup>8</sup> PCD : Partnership for Child Development. It is an NGO with its headquarter office in the United Kingdom, which aims for improvement of education, health and nutrition of children. In 2009 and 2010, with financial support of PCD (partly funded by JICA) WACIPAC carried out a school health training course whose components includes parasite control. A training course is planned to be implemented every year with venues interchangeably in the East Africa and the West Africa every two years.

fact, in order to avoid a diminishing interest of participants due to repetition of the same topics, a new topic such as the relation with HIV-AIDS was added in the agenda (Put it differently, the number of participants decreases, if the same topics continue).<sup>9</sup> Moreover, the number of people in the field of parasite control is not larger than the ones in other infectious diseases. Taking these points into consideration, although WACIPAC declares a continual capacity building activity as one of its missions, in terms of frequency of workshops, the current level is deemed realistic. (However, because ex-post evaluations are supposed to make evaluation, closely sticking to the indicators set at the inception of projects, the evaluation itself of this ex-post evaluation study is not changed.)

Concluding the above, the overall goal was largely attained in terms of the indicator 1, but not achieved in terms of the indicator 2.

Summarizing the Effectiveness and Impacts, the project largely achieved its project objectives, while, in terms of the overall goal, the continual capacity building activities are limited.

In light of the above, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

### 3.3 Efficiency (Rating: ②)

#### 3.3.1 Inputs

Inputs	Plan	Actual performance
Japanese side		
Amount	380 million yen	663 million yen
Project duration	January 2004 ~ December 2008 (5 years)	January 2004 ~ December 2008 (5 years)
Experts	2 for long-term 3 for short-term/year	7 for long-term, 27 for short-term (among which 9 short-term inter-CIPACs experts)
Trainees received	3 per year	14 (12 in Japan, 2 in Japanese universities for long-term)
Third-Country	Not mentioned	4 (2 – Thailand, 2 – Kenya)

<sup>9</sup> Interviewed at NMIMR.



Training Programs		
Provision of equipment	Parasite tests, Materials for international training and public health activities, Vehicles	Ditto (291 items)
Local cost	130 million yen	158 million yen
Others	Construction of a project office	Ditto
Ghanaian Side		
Preparation of counterparts	NMIMR, Persons in charge at the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education, Persons in charge of health and education in model districts	Ditto
Facilities	Land for project office, Training venues, Offices in model districts, Test rooms, etc.	Ditto
Local cost	Local staff salaries, Utility costs for offices, Maintenance cost for the provided equipments	Ditto

Sources: JICA documents

### 3.3.1.1 Elements of Inputs

The inputs of equipment is as originally planned and is judged as appropriate amount to achieve this project's outputs. Most of the equipment is parasite test kits and vehicles for transport and were utilized effectively during the project period. As to the office appliance, the inputs have been continuously reviewed and have been minimized in the latter half of the period, thus achieving the rationalization of the inputs.

As to the trainees received, the project received in Japan trainees in the fields of the parasite control methods, the know-how for experiments, and the school health. Two trainees are received in Japan with the aim of obtaining PhD degree in immunology study of parasites.

The knowledge and skills earned in these trainings were reflected into the implementation of international training courses or technical advice to the most intensively supported countries. Therefore, the inputs were effective. Moreover, the dispatch of trainees to the other parasite control centres in Kenya and Thailand was effective since it has given an opportunity of observing centre management and activities in different regions.

The fields to which experts were sent were reasonably chosen, leading to the achievement of outputs. Especially, from the middle of the project period, the concerned personnel of the project recognized the necessity of improving the quality of research activities and thus sent short-term experts targeting the research quality upgrading. Consequently, the quality of the research activities was enhanced, which made a direct contribution to output achievement, such as presentations in scientific conferences and article publications (related especially to the output 2 and 4). The dispatch of experts from the parasite control centres in Kenya and Thailand, which share similar functionality and experience with WACIPAC, was efficient input in terms of not only the training of technical aspects but also the sharing of experience. On the other hand, there appeared a problem stemming mainly from human relations among some experts, negative effects of such a problem on the project outputs were eschewed by efforts of project personnel after the interim evaluation study.

#### 3.3.1.2 Project Cost

The disbursement amount was significantly higher than planned.

The main reason is the increase of long-term experts' inputs. While two long-term experts are planned originally, four long-term experts were dispatched in different sectors from the first year of the project. Considering that this project involves many activities and requires coordination works among many countries, it can be said that the original plan was not realistically set.

#### 3.3.1.3 Period of Cooperation

The cooperation was completed exactly as originally planned. It started in January 2004 and ended in December 2008 without any extension.

Concluding the above, although the period of cooperation was within the plan, elements of inputs were partially inappropriate and project cost exceeded the plan, therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

### **3.4 Sustainability (Rating: ①)**

#### 3.4.1 Related Policy towards the Project

Parasite control matches the needs of the West African region even at the time of this ex-post evaluation study and is considered to be an important issue in development policies. On the other hand, as to the prospects of sustainable activities of WACIPAC, the following can be said in terms of policy/institutional aspects.

As already mentioned above, because WACIPAC failed to be incorporated into the University of Ghana as an official institute of the University, at the end of the project, it made its original self-sustaining development plan, WACIPAC Sustainability Plan, to be a regional centre of the West African region by integrating itself into West Africa Health Organization (WAHO) of Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS). Namely, it aimed to retain its sustainability in terms of policy/institution by its incorporation into WAHO. This is because WACIPAC considered that WAHO's jurisdictional activity range and mission resonates with their own. For this objective, NMIMR made requests to the Ministry of Health of the government of Ghana, but there is no progress until this moment partly due to the changes of the Ministers of Health. Given the presidential election being slated in the end of 2012, it is highly likely that there will be limited progress on this attempt. As described above, integration into WAHO requires huge political efforts and thus may face many difficulties toward its realization.

Under the above mentioned circumstances, the policy sustainability of WACIPAC is not high as of now. Moreover, since the government of Ghana did not declare until now its intension to keep the regional centre by its own budget, we have to say that the chance of policy sustainability by the initiatives of the government of Ghana is unclear.

The fact that WACIPAC faces difficulties in its institutional sustainability because of the unsuccessful attempt of its integration into WAHO indicates that the main cause of this doom was the lack of 'exit strategy' the project must have envisaged at its planning stage. The ex-ante project study simply says "it is expected that the institutional sustainability in the future will be guaranteed through NMIMR's requests to other donor organizations for financial supports". It seems that the project was launched without sufficient imagination on the future of WACIPAC. Consequently, WACIPAC had to go hither and thither between the University of Ghana and WAHO and the future of WACIPAC became unstable.

While only the negative aspects were described above, it is worth mentioning that NMIMR's continuous attempts for its integration into WAHO and fund raising, although not yielding fruits yet, might work to improve its sustainability in the future. It should be added that the current national development policy of Ghana, in its paragraph on health care infrastructures, mentions an establishment of infectious disease control centre in the strategy, and thus there might be a chance of WACIPAC being utilized as parasitic diseases control centre.

### 3.4.2 Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Implementing Agency

At the time of the terminal evaluation study, WACIPAC exists only as a conceptual ‘function’ and owns no physical facilities, such as independent offices. Because institution/department as WACIPAC is not established, it is fair to say that a permanent organizational system does not exist. (When being requested from outside for a project activity, employees of the NMIMR as main actors worked to pursue the mission of WACIPAC as the West African regional centre, e.g., international workshops for parasite control in 2009 and 2010.)

However, the persons who have worked for the project are still being employed by NMIMR, and thus the human resources for trainers are secured within NMIMR. It is also possible that, for the planning and management of trainings, WACIPAC receives management support from the management department of NMIMR. Therefore, with the condition of ‘subject to requests’, the system for training implementation is basically still maintained.

Meanwhile, the functionality of the technical aspect of information network has dwindled after the project because the staffs, mainly employed by Japanese side, during the project duration, have left NMIMR after the project. Currently, the function as the hub of information network – the function of being the focal point of information exchange through WACIPAC’s website and newsletters – is practically in idle. There is no human resource to deal with this situation. Thus, the sustainability in this respect is low. In addition to that, the lack of francophone personnel needed for efficient information network and exchange is another problem from institutional and operational aspects. On the other hand, in the model sites established in Dangme East district, parasite control projects of school health based approach are still implemented by the district personnel, and thus the sites are maintained as training facilities.

### 3.4.3 Technical Aspects of the Implementing Agency

Judging from the achievement of implementing international workshops for parasite control as the main organizer in 2009 and 2010, it can be concluded that the implementing agency owns knowledge and skills for lectures, implementation and management needed to achieve the role as “capacity building institution for parasite control”.

### 3.4.4 Financial Aspects of the Implementing Agency

As a record for external fund raising after the project, the parasite control workshop sponsored by PCD is worth being mentioned. The workshops have been implemented every year with venues interchangeably in the East Africa and the West Africa every

two years. (JICA partly funded the activity with the scheme of ‘follow-up cooperation’.) Currently, PCD and NMIMR are conceiving a new middle-to-long-term joint activity. Depending on its progress, a sustainable activity which serves widely to certain areas may be feasible even without the integration into WAHO. PCD, as an international NGO, intends to expand its activities on school health and parasite control in Africa and envisages to appoint its proper staff within NMIMR.

As mentioned above, the financial sustainability highly depends on the fate of the joint activity plan with PCD. Thus, judging from the records in the past, in case the plan fails, the financial sustainability will be quite limited<sup>1011</sup>.

#### 3.4.5 Sustainability aspects of the effects

At the time of the ex-post evaluation study, the most feasible implementation system is the joint activity with PCD with financial support of PCD. However, as mentioned above, the prospect of the joint activity cannot be verified at this moment.

Because sufficient ability is observed in terms of operational and technical aspects, as long as financial and political supports are guaranteed, WACIPAC can keep playing its role as capacity building agency not only by the joint activity with PCD but also by collaboration with other organizations or by its own.

As such, there are some positive aspects for evaluation. However, the sustainability of the effects of this project is highly dependent on the availability of financial supports. Therefore, it is fair to judge that the sustainability of the effects of this project is low.

Concluding the above, major problems have been observed in the policy background and financial aspects of the executing agency, therefore, sustainability of the project effects is low.

## **4. Conclusion, Lessons Learned and Recommendations**

### **4.1 Conclusion**

This project aims to implement capacity building in parasitic diseases control of the member countries in the West African sub-region by/at WACIPAC. In terms of the necessity of parasite control, this overall goal is relevant with the country’s policy and needs at the time of the project planning and of the ex-post evaluation. However, in terms of sustainable management of the centre, its relevance is only at fair level because the

---

<sup>10</sup> Comparing with as of termination period of the Project, when there were no prospects of financial assistance, the current situation that keeps tight relation with PCD and approaches to Gates Foundation, is indicating the significant accomplishment by NMIMR.

<sup>11</sup> It was reported that the MOU with PCD was signed in August, 2012, though; a certain period must be necessary to see the effectiveness and its actual implementation of the MOU.

sustainable management is not clearly defined within the development policy of the government of Ghana. The efficiency of the project is fair because the project was carried out as per the original plan and it was completed within the planned period, but the project total budget exceeded the original plan. The effectiveness and impact of the project is at fair level because within the project period it achieved the project objective of WACIPAC's playing the role of capacity building for integrated parasite control activities of the member countries in the West African sub-region through frequent international capacity building workshops and follow-up visits, but the overall goal has not been fully achieved because the activity of WACIPAC is of limited scope after the project period. Sustainability of the project effects is low because there are large challenging issues in the government's policy background to support the institution despite sufficient technical level acquired throughout the project.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

## **4.2 Recommendations**

### **4.2.1 Recommendations to the Executing Agency**

① To secure the sustainability, stable supports of policy background and financial resources are indispensable. In this respect, the integration into WAHO is still a good option and thus should be pursued by NMIMR. Simultaneously, efforts to materialize the joint activity plan with PCD are called on because it will be an effective option to maintain the function of WACIPAC.

### **4.2.2 Recommendations to JICA**

None

## **4.3 Lessons Learned**

- ① It seems that this project was initiated without clearly defining the intension and responsibility on the part of Ghana, which affected negatively this project's sustainability, especially in terms of policy background. In fact, hosting a regional centre requires substantial human resources and financial resources. Thus, for sustainable management of the centre, a supportive policy background on the side of Ghana, a clearly defined position of the centre and a plan for its implementation are indispensable. In this respect, we should learn from this experience of having started the project without a firm verification of mid-to-long-term intension of Ghana.
- ② Moreover, in parallel to the verification of Ghana's intension, the prospect of how to sustain ex-post project activities should have been shared among the persons

involved in the initiation decision of this project.

- ③ It is imaginable that a region-wide project such as this requires a substantial amount of work for ex-post monitoring activities than a usual domestic project. It was necessary to terminate the project by drawing up a detailed monitoring plan instead of an abstract description as “WACIPAC performs”.
- ④ For a region-wide project in which two different languages are used as in this project, the sustainability of institutional activities highly depends on whether the project can secure bi-lingual personnel in long term. Moreover, for promotion of information networking, it is important not to out-source technical works such as website management but to internalize the work through technology transfer and/or employment of appropriate staff.