

Summary

I. Outline of the Project	
Country : Republic of Indonesia	Project title : The Project on Strengthening Environmental Management Capacity of Local Governments in Indonesia
Issue / Sector : Environmental Management – Environmental Administration	Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge: JICA Indonesia Office	Total cost : about 2.63 million yen
Period of Cooperation	March 2009 to September 2011
	Partner Countries' Implementing Organization : Directorate General for Regional Development, Ministry of Home Affairs (BANGDA), Ministry of Environment (KLH), environmental institutions in the West Java province, the Banten province, the Bogor regency, the Bogor municipality, the Tangerang regency, the Tangerang municipality and the South Tangerang municipality
	Supporting Organization in Japan : Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.
Related Cooperation :	
<p>1. Background of the Project</p> <p>Indonesia has been experiencing environmental problems especially in the urban areas such as water pollution, air pollution and so on. Although Indonesia has already developed the legal systems on various environmental management including water quality management and environmental impact assessment, relevant laws are still not properly enforced. One of the reasons is the insufficient capacity of the local governments (i.e. province, regency and municipality) to fully enforce the relevant laws. Therefore, the capacity of the local governments needs to be strengthened to formulate and implement the policies for environmental management.</p> <p>Under these circumstances, the Government of Indonesia (GOI) requested the Government of Japan (GOJ) to implement a technical cooperation project to enhance capacities of local governments for environmental management. Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) implemented two preliminary studies in December, 2006 and March, 2007. Accordingly, GOI and GOJ have reached an agreement on a basic framework of the project focusing on capacity development in water quality management. The target area was decided as the Cisadane River, which is the first-grade river running through the West Java province and the Banten province. The Record of Discussion (R/D) for the Project on Strengthening Environmental Management Capacity of Local Governments in Indonesia (hereinafter referred to as the Project) was signed on 31 December 2008.</p>	
<p>2. Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal:</p> <p>The laws and regulations regarding water quality management and water pollution control (WQM/WPC) are enforced by local governments in the Cisadane River.</p>	

(2) Project Purposes:

Local governments develop their capacity of water quality management and water pollution control (WQM/WPC) to enforce the environmental laws and regulations in the pilot sites.(3) Outputs:

1. Responsibilities and mandates on WQM/WPC of local governments are clarified.
2. Draft of WQM/WPC plan is compiled by local governments in pilot sites.
3. Implementation of pilot activities along the WQM/WPC plan in pilot sites.

(3) Outputs:

4. Responsibilities and mandates on WQM/WPC of local governments are clarified.
5. Draft of WQM/WPC plan is compiled by local governments in pilot sites.
6. Implementation of pilot activities along the WQM/WPC plan in pilot sites.

(4) Inputs (as of this terminal evaluation)**Japanese side : Total cost: About JPY 2.63 million**

Short term expert:	9 persons (75.43 M/M)
No. of trainees:	18 persons (12 persons under the Project and 6 persons in JICA 's group training)
Provision of equipment:	Items such office equipment (Approximately JPY 3.5 million)
Local cost:	Approximately JPY 44 million

Indonesian side:

Counterpart (C/P) :	Officers in BANGDA, KLH, the West Java province, the Banten province, the Bogor regency, the Bogor municipality, the Tangerang regency, the Tangerang municipality and the South Tangerang municipality
Provision of land and facility:	For the project office space

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Review Team	Japanese Side
	(1) Mr. Jitsuya Ishiguro (Leader) Senior Representative, JICA Indonesia Office, JICA
	(2) Ms.Hiroko Kamata (Water Environment) Senior Advisor, JICA
	(3) Ms. Keiko Kitamura (Cooperation planning/ management) Project Formulation Advisor, JICA Indonesia Office
	(4) Ms. Juni Melani (Cooperation assistance) Project Officer, JICA Indonesia Office
	(5) Ms. Misa Oishi (Evaluation analysis) Consultant, Overseas Operations Department, Kokusai Kogyo Co., Ltd.
	Indonesian Side
	(1) Mr. Joel Palandi Staff of Head of Administration Division in Spatial and Environmental Facilitation, BANGDA
	(2) Ms. Yun Insiani Head of Division for Infrastructures and Services, Assistant Deputy for Pollution Control of Manufactures, Infrastructures and Services, KLH

Period of Evaluation : June 20, 2011~July 1, 2011	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation
III. Results of Evaluation	
<p data-bbox="185 331 384 360">1. Achievements</p> <p data-bbox="185 376 432 405">(1) Project Purposes</p> <p data-bbox="185 421 1414 495">The achievement level of the Project Purpose is by and large satisfactory and this is verified so from its indicators seen below:</p> <ul data-bbox="233 510 1414 757" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="233 510 1414 584">• C/Ps in the pilot local authorities are carrying out pilot activities together with JICA project team as planned (Indicator 1). <li data-bbox="233 600 1414 674">• The draft WQM/WPC plans in the pilot sites are recognized mainly by the environmental departments, and it is expected that the recognition at organization level will be soon further enhanced (Indicator 2). <li data-bbox="233 689 1414 757">• Some pilot activities has been implemented in accordance with the draft WQM/WPC plans in collaboration with other departments (Indicator 3). <p data-bbox="185 815 328 844">(2) Outputs</p> <p data-bbox="185 860 762 889">Output 1: Output 1 is being satisfactorily achieved.</p> <p data-bbox="185 904 1414 1196">In the first phase, C/Ps reviewed a wide range of laws, regulations and policies related to environmental management, especially WQM/WPC, and produced Booklets on the Environmental Laws and Regulations related to Water Quality Management and Water Pollution Control (first version)(Indicator 1.1). More than 100 copies of Booklets on the Environmental Laws and Regulations related to Water Quality Management and Water Pollution Control (first version) were printed and distributed among stakeholders at the time of seminars and workshops held by the Project (Indicator 1.2) and also on the occasions of workshops held by BANGDA and the Tangerang municipality (Indicator 1.3).</p> <p data-bbox="185 1211 762 1240">Output 2: Output 2 is being satisfactorily achieved.</p> <p data-bbox="185 1256 1414 1637">Based on the discussion with C/Ps, the Project selected the Bogor regency and the Tangerang municipality as pilot sites in September 2010, and started preparation of the draft WQM/WPC plan in these pilot sites. The plans were devised through the following steps; (i) implementation of water quality monitoring, (ii) development of pollution source inventory, (iii) estimation of current pollution load and assimilative capacity, (iv) setting target water quality, (v) water quality simulation and (vi) formulation of pollution control strategies. Technical Guideline for Water Quality Management Plan explains the details of these processes (Indicator 2.2). Currently, C/Ps in the pilot sites is implementing pilot activities in accordance with the draft WQM/WPC plans (Indicator 2.3). The experiences in pilot activities are planned to be incorporated into the revised WQM/WPC plan.</p> <p data-bbox="185 1695 922 1724">Output 3: Output 3 is being satisfactorily achieved as seen below.</p> <p data-bbox="185 1740 1414 1942">The first draft WQM/WPC plans incorporate the actions to be taken for water quality improvement in the Cisadane River. The urgently needed activities with feasible time frame, i.e., activities relating to public awareness raising, inspection, database development and area specific pollution control, were selected as pilot activities and they are currently being implemented (Indicator 3.1). The budget plan for FY2012 is expected to be prepared by the completion of the Project (Indicator 3.2).</p>	

2. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The Team concluded that the Project remains moderately relevant in terms of the policies of GOI, policy directions of GOJ and the needs of the C/P agencies.

- In accordance with the Law on Decentralization (Law No.32, 2004), primary responsibilities for environmental management are delegated to local authorities. Details are clarified and defined in Government Regulation regarding Water Quality Management and Water Pollution Control (No. 82 of 2001) and KLH Regulation No.1 of 2010. Primary C/Ps of the Project are offices of local authorities in the Cisadane River Basin, who actually undertake responsibilities of WQM/WPC at field level. Indeed, most C/Ps at field level have been aware of the urgent needs to improve their technical capacity in order to fulfill their duties in water quality management, which are delegated by the central agencies.
- In Japan, Government of Japan (COJ)' s Country Assistance Program for the Republic of Indonesia (November, 2004) announces "creation of a democratic and fair society" as one of priority areas for assistance. Under this thematic area, the importance in support for environmental preservation is emphasized. Also, environmental policies and regulations have been developed through tackling the severe pollutions and hazards in the 1960' s and 1970' s. In these periods, especially local authorities in the suffered areas had to deal with the issue at the forefront. The knowledge and experiences of pollution control in Japan are based on such tragic experiences and Japan has a technological advantage in the field of environmental management.

(2) Effectiveness

The Team concluded that the Project made maximum efforts to secure the effectiveness especially after the mid-term review, and indeed succeeded in securing certain effectiveness..

- Through the project activities, responsibilities and mandates on WQM/WPC of local governments are clarified (Output 1), the draft WQM/WPC plans are compiled by the local governments in the pilot sites (Output 2) and some pilot activities along the WQM/WPC plans are being implemented in the pilot sites (Output 3), indeed local governments developed their capacity of WQM/WPC to enforce the environmental laws and regulations in the pilot sites. Thus, the outputs in terms of numbers, contents and qualities were sufficient to achieve the project purpose.
- The Project aims to develop local governments' capacity of WQM/WPC to enforce the environmental laws and regulations. However, Indonesia' s decentralization process is still in transition and the entire environmental law system continuously needs revision and modification. Under such circumstances 'law enforcement' on water quality management was seen by many local government officers as new administrative tasks to be tackled without having adequate knowledge and background on their hands. The Japanese expert team guided counterparts to interpret implications of the laws, regulations and help them prepare water quality management plans.

(3) Efficiency

The Project has been implemented in an efficient manner.

A number of activities have been carried out and the outputs are being produced as mostly planned. In addition, the interview surveys reveal that overall satisfaction towards inputs such as human resources, trainings and the

provided equipment is high, and so is the level of utilization.

(4) Impact

The following is an example of some positive impacts, which are being emerged at the time of terminal evaluation.

- C/Ps in the environmental department of the West Java province has taken initiative to prepare Pollution Source Inventory (PSI) in the entire province.
- The governor, to whom the officers in the environmental department explained on the importance of PSI, issued a letter in September 2010 to all the regencies and municipalities in the West Java province and requested them to prepare PSI and submit the relevant information to the province once in a year.
- Currently the technical manual on PSI is under preparation in response to the requests by the regencies and municipalities.

- Sustainability

Considering the following points, the sustainability especially in terms of technical aspect should be further firmly secured through the project activities in the remaining three months before the completion of the Project.

- In river water quality management, an environmental institution alone cannot achieve a goal. Cooperation and coordination from relevant organizations such as the public works department, BAPPEDA, industrial department, agricultural and husbandry department are indispensable. In the Project, the collaboration with other departments in the pilot sites is being fostered through the implementation of pilot activities and coordination meetings especially after the mid-term review. Likewise, the enhancement of organizational sustainability is accelerated in the latter half of the project period.
- GOI's medium-term development plan (RPJM), 2010–2014 as well as the regional medium-term development plan set the environmental issues as one of the prioritized areas. In accordance with these development plans, both the national government and regional governments are expected to secure enough budgetary allocations for the environmental protection and management. In addition, in the short-term, both the Bogor regency and the Tangerang municipality have to allocate budgets to continue activities in accordance with the draft WQM/WPC Plan, and thus the Project is going to formulate the budgetary plan for 2012 to ensure financial sustainability. By the considering the fact that the plans covers the period until 2030, the continuous budgetary support is in need.
- The Project has been implementing a wide range of activities such as improvement of water quality monitoring, development of PSI in the whole Cisadane River Basin, the pilot WQM/WPC activities, laboratory management and so on. The Project has been making efforts to transfer technologies in align with the current laws and regulations and improve capacities in WQM/WPC of local authorities in order them to enforce the relevant laws and legislations properly. However, generally speaking, the overall capacities of local governments are not sufficient and indeed many of them are struggling to fill the gap between the capacity level required by the laws and their realities. In fact, according to the interviews with C/Ps in the pilot site, who actually formulated the WQM/WPC plan along with the JICA project team, it became apparent that they are not confident in carrying out, by themselves, some

techniques such as estimation of current pollution load and assimilative capacity and water quality simulation. The Project should pay attention to such a voice, and take some actions in order to firmly embed the technologies transferred.

2. Factors that promoted realization of effects

- C/Ps at field level have been aware of the needs to improve their technical capacity in order to fulfill their duties in water quality management; thus they are indeed eager to grasp this opportunity and learn from the Project.
- A pollution source inventory was developed by C/Ps along with the JICA project team for the entire Cisadane River and not limited for the pilot sites, Thus even at the time of terminal evaluation, performance on several WQM/WPC activities has been already improved.
- Active information sharing among C/Ps through JCC, WG meeting, seminars and workshops contribute to the smooth implementation of the Project.

3. Factors that impeded realization of effects

- The Project aims to develop local governments' capacity of WQM/WPC to enforce the environmental laws and regulations. However, some important laws and legislations were revised after the Project's inauguration and some others are still under revision; and these changeable and uncertain situations raise concerns about the validity of the project purpose itself. Under these circumstances, the Project implement activities in align with the ongoing laws and regulations.
- In the beginning, the target local authorities were unaware of the Project. Thus the Project team had to spend some time to let the local authorities know the Project and their expected roles in the Project.
- The Project expected to collaborate with EMC of Ministry of Environment and provide opportunities for local governments' capacity development together with EMC; however, in reality, EMC is not willing to play such a role. It also took some time to obtain concrete inputs from EMC.

4. Conclusion

As a part of Cisadane River Basin management, which is one of national strategic rivers in Indonesia, the Project has been tackling improvement of WQM/WPC. Local government responsibilities and mandates on WQM/WPC have been clarified by the Project. The draft WQM/WPC plans in two (2) pilot sites has been formulated, and is being formally recognized and internalized by the respective authorities. Most of the recommendations made at the time of Mid-term Review have been carried out and produced certain impacts. Considering the above, the Team is of the opinion that the Project has been progressing well and the Project Purpose will be achieved with continued efforts of the people concerned.

5. Recommendations

To make project activities sustainable, the Project should share the results of the project activities, i.e. importance of PSI, with the policy makers such as governors, mayors and head of regency, while the important activities shall be reviewed thoroughly again with the C/Ps and carry out wrap-up technical training before the completion of the Project. The WQM/WPC plans formulated by the Project shall be incorporated into Regional Medium-term Development Plan (RPJMD) of each province, regency and municipality in the

Cisadane River Basin.

BANGDA should create opportunities such as continuation of the working groups in order to enhance cooperation across provinces, regencies and municipalities, especially in the Cisadane River Basin, and facilitate dissemination of experiences of the pilot sites to the non-pilot sites by enhancing the existing mechanisms such as Cisadane River Water Quality Monitoring Network. Continuous information dissemination shall be sustained through the website constructed under the Project.

KLH should inform the Project as well as the local authorities concerned of the current progress and perspectives of the General Plan of the Cisadane River Basin. More active coordination and information sharing between KLH and local governments are expected.

6. Lessons Learned

- The activities as well as project duration in PDM prepared at the preparatory stage might not always reflect the actual institutional, legislative, financial and social situation of C/Ps at the time of implementation stage. Therefore, the content of PDM should be more flexibly designed.
- For the project which involved more than two regencies/municipalities, provincial governments shall be given more clear authority to play a role especially in disseminating the lessons and experiences obtained by the pilot projects.
- In case that the main C/Ps are local government(s), it may be important to explain the contents of project to them and to obtain their prior commitment for smooth implementation of the Project.