

Summary of Evaluation Result

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Republic of Ecuador	Project title: Project on Strengthening of the Occupational Training for the Vulnerable Sector
Sector: Vocational Training	Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation
Division in charge: Social Security Division, Higher Education and Social Security Group, Human Development Department	Total cost: 270 million Japanese yen
Period of Cooperation November 2008 to October 2011	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Ecuadorian Professional Training Service (SECAP)
	Supporting Organization in Japan: None
	Related cooperation: None
1-1. Background of the Project	
<p>The Republic of Ecuador (Ecuador) has GNI 3,700 USD per capita (2008), and ranks 77th out of 169 countries on Human Development Index announced by United Nations Development Program (UNDP) in 2010. On the other hand, 38.3% of total population is living under National Poverty Line. There is big difference in the poverty rate between urban area and rural area and among the ethnicity, in particular it is considered that indigenous people in rural area and African Ecuadorian are affected by the poverty.</p> <p>The Correa Administration presents one of priority issues as the improvement of access to occupational training service for the Vulnerable Sector through strengthening the organization of Ecuadorian Professional Training Service (in Spanish, Servicio Ecuatoriano de Capacitación Profesional: SECAP) in order that the Vulnerable Sector can acquire occupational skills and improve their livelihood. In March 2007, the Presidential Decree was issued, which regulates that the budget of the basic occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector by SECAP is allocated from 30% of the Labor Tax levied by the National Council of Vocational Training (in Spanish, Consejo Nacional de Capacitación y Formación Profesional).</p> <p>SECAP implements training courses for the Industrial Sector, while it has little experience in the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector, so that the Ecuadorian government requested the technical cooperation to the Japanese government. With this request, the "Project of Strengthening of the Occupational Training for the Vulnerable Sector" (The Project) started in 2008.</p>	
1-2. Project Overview	
(1) Overall goal	
The occupational training system of the vulnerable sector is strengthened, the job opportunity is increased and the livelihood is improved.	
(2) Project purpose	
The model of the occupational training for the vulnerable sector and the structure for its diffusion to the non-participating training centers are established in SECAP.	
(3) Outputs	
Output 1: Curricula, educational materials and laboratories are improved.	
Output 2: Training system for facilitators is improved.	
Output 3: System of needs identification and impact evaluation of occupational training courses for the vulnerable sector is established.	
Output 4: Job accessing support system is established in the SECAP Headquarter and the participating training centers.	
Output 5: Inter-institutional cooperation system for the development of the activities for the Project is established.	
Output 6: Diffusion system of the model developed in the Project is established.	
(4) Inputs	
<Japanese Side>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Long term Expert: Two Experts (Chief Adviser/Training Management, Coordinator/Coordination of Committees) • Short term Expert: One Expert (Needs Identification and Impact Evaluation Analyst/Planning of Occupational Training) 	

- Equipment Cost: USD 1,060,342
- Third Country Expert: One from Paraguay and Two from Brazil
- Training in third countries: 17 in total (Peru, Colombia, Brazil and Paraguay)
- Local Cost: USD 420,449

<Ecuadorian Side>

- Allocation of Counterpart: 18
- Operational Cost:
(2008) USD 9,979,419 (2009) USD 9,555,195 (2010) USD 10,901,704 (2011) USD 11,580,000
- Facility: Class rooms and laboratories in SECAP training centers, Office for the Japanese experts and Vehicles.

2. Evaluation team

Members	(Team Leader) Chiharu Morita, Assistant Director, Social Security Division, Higher Education and Social Security Group, Human Development Department (Vocational Training) Hirotake Iida, Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan (Evaluation/Analysis) Yuki Fukuda, Binko International Ltd. (Translator) Atsuko Yoshikawa, Japan International Cooperation Center	
Period	June 20, 2011 – July 10, 2011	Type of Evaluation: Final Evaluation

3. Result of Evaluation

3-1. Result of Cooperation

3-1-1 Achievement of Activities

(1) Output 1

[Indicator 1] At least 300 pilot courses implemented in the participating training centers.

[Indicator 2] Updated courses based on its results.

The number of curriculum and educational materials of the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector developed by the Project is 20 courses and 70 modules. With these curriculum, the equipment was procured, and 323 courses were implemented by June 30 2011. Of them, the number of updated curriculum and educational materials is 17 courses and 60 modules on basis of questionnaires for facilitators.

As mentioned above, curriculum and educational materials necessary for the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector were developed and updated, and the equipment was procured; therefore, curricula, educational materials and laboratories are improved.

(2) Output 2

[Indicator 1] Training courses for 100 or more facilitators are implemented.

[Indicator 2] The satisfaction rate of the participants of the occupational training courses for the facilitators are improved.

At the final evaluation, 230 facilitators were received training courses of teaching method. Curriculum and educational materials of training courses for facilitators were also developed. Not only training courses for the teaching method but also technical training, such as industrial sewing, welding, security management and 5S (Seiri: Orderliness, Seiton: Neatness & Tidiness, Seiketsu: Cleanliness, Seisou: Cleaning, Shitsuke: Good mannaer) were implemented. Additionally, in comparison between the baseline survey and the impact evaluation, the satisfaction rate of the participants for the facilitators are improved as the following chart.

The satisfaction rate of the participants for the facilitators

	Baseline Survey (2009)	Impact Evaluation (2011)
Very good	20.1%	61.9%
Good	28.4%	35.3%
Regular	35.6%	2.5%
Bad	10.6%	0.2%
Very Bad	5.2%	0.1%

As mentioned above, curriculum and educational materials of training courses for facilitators were elaborated, training courses were implemented, and the satisfaction rate of the participants for facilitators are improved; therefore, the training system for facilitators is improved.

(3) Output 3

[Indicator 1] The needs identification and impact evaluation, with cooperation of the involved institutions, are executed at least twice during the Project period.

[Indicator 2] The system of needs identification and impact evaluation are reflected to the Technical-Pedagogical Norms of SECAP.

By the Final Evaluation, the planning department of SECAP executed two needs identifications and two impact evaluations in collaboration with the involved institutions, such as Ministry of Labour Relation, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNCHR) and National Council for the disabled (in Spanish, el Consejo Nacional de Discapacidades: CONADIS). The third need identification and impact evaluation are planning to be implemented in August 2011 and the second half of the year 2011, respectively. Guidelines for needs identification and impact evaluation has been elaborated, and the President of SECAP will approve by the termination of the Project.

As mentioned above, needs identifications and impact evaluations were executed and these guidelines will be approved; therefore, system of needs identification and impact evaluation of occupational training courses for the vulnerable sector will be established

(4) Output 4

[Indicator 1] The satisfaction rate of participants for the job accessing support is improved.

[Indicator 2] The guideline for job accessing support is elaborated and diffused to SECAP Headquarters and the participating training centers.

The job accessing support is classified into two categories: job accessing support to enterprises; and support for micro-enterprise. Of them, support for micro-enterprise is implemented as the micro-enterprise course. The system of job accessing support to enterprise is that the SECAP Headquarter provides individual data of participants collected from each SECAP training centers through the information system to other institutions such as Ministry of Labor Relations and that these institutions provides information on support for employment (e.g. recruitment information) to participants. At present, as the information system is being developing, the job accessing support to enterprise is not started (By July 31st 2011, the information system will be completed). The satisfaction rate of participants for the job accessing support is high as the following chart.

The satisfaction rate of participants for the job accessing support

	Goal Indicator	Impact Evaluation (2011)
Very good	40%	29%
Good	30%	71%
Regular	15%	0%
Bad	10%	0%
Very Bad	5%	0%

The President of SECAP will approve the guideline for the job accessing support by termination of the Project.

As mentioned above, one type of job accessing support has been already established and implemented. In addition, another of job accessing support will be started shortly; therefore, job accessing support system will be established in the SECAP Headquarter and the participating training centers.

(5) Output 5

[Indicator 1] The Inter-Institutional Committees for the development of the activities indicated in the item 3. and . are established.

[Indicator 2] The guideline for the Inter-Institutional Committees is elaborated.

The Inter-Institutional Committees (the Committee of support for the Disabled and the Committee of the Refugees) were established, and they had been held three times and four times respectively by the Final Evaluation. There is another method of communication (e.g. telephone and e-mails) between the Project team and these institutions. Besides, SECAP implemented needs identifications and impact evaluations with these institutions, and provides information on the occupational training courses to them. The President of SECAP will approve the guideline for the Inter-Institutional Committees by termination of the Project.

As mentioned above, the Inter-Institutional Committees were established, and these institutions participate in activities of the Project; therefore, inter-institutional cooperation system for the development of the activities for

the Project will be established.

(6) Output 6

[Indicator 1] Diffusion system of the model developed in the SECAP Headquarters is established.

[Indicator 2] The guideline for diffusion of the model developed in the Project is elaborated.

[Indicator 3] The activities indicated in the elaborated guideline have been initiated.

The planning department of SECAP is in charge of diffusing the model, such as planning activities for development of curriculum and educational materials, needs identification and impact evaluation and job accessing support, and supervising all training centres of SECAP. The President of SECAP will approve the guideline for diffusion of the model by the termination of the Project. Activities for diffusing the model are: distribution of curriculum and education materials; implementation of need identification and impact evaluation; and implementation of job accessing support. Distribution of curriculum and educational materials had been completed already, and needs identification is executed in the non-participating training centres. Impact evaluation will be implemented in all training centres of SECAP in the second half of 2011.

Therefore, diffusion system of the model developed in the Project will be established.

3-1-2 Achievement of Project Purpose

[Indicator 1] Technical-Pedagogical Norms of SECAP are updated on the basis of the model developed in the Project

SECAP implements the occupational training referring to the Technical-Pedagogical Norms (TPN). There are also guidelines mentioned some detail regulations which are not able to be stipulated in TPN. The Project works not on updating TNP itself but on elaborating and approving guidelines. If these guidelines are approved, the model will be diffused thoroughly. Namely, output 1 will be achieved if output 2 is.

[Indicator 2] Guidelines of the model of the occupational training for the vulnerable sector is elaborated.

Eighteen guidelines are being elaborated on basis of the model developed in the Project. These guidelines will be approved by the President of SECAP until termination of the Project.

[Indicator 3] Personnel in charge of the diffusion of the model are allocated in the planning department of SECAP.

Personnel in charge of the diffusion of the model is allocated in the planning department of SECAP, and the diffusion of the model to non-participating training centres has been already started.

[Indicator 4] The satisfaction rate of the participants and enterprises for the occupational training courses are improved.

In comparison between the baseline survey and the impact evaluation, the satisfaction rate of the participants and enterprises for the occupational training courses improves as following;

The satisfaction rate the occupational training courses

	Participants		Enterprises	
	Baseline	Impact Evaluation	Baseline	Impact Evaluation
Very Good	5.2%	53.2%	9.3%	50.9%
Good	17.5%	40.3%	11.9%	46.8%
Regular	31%	5.3%	42.4%	2.3%
Bad	23.9%	0.9%	13.2%	0%
Very Bad	22.4%	0.2%	23.2%	0%

As mentioned above, guidelines are being elaborated on the basis on the model, the President of SECAP will approve these guidelines, and personnel in charge of the diffusion of the model is allocated in the planning department of SECAP; therefore, the Project Purpose will be achieved by the termination of the Project.

3-1-3 Achievement of Overall Goal

[Indicator 1] Curriculum and educational materials are diffused and applied in the training centers.

Curriculum and educational materials have been distributed to all training centers of SECAP (18 centers) already. If facilitators and equipments necessary for training courses are a full set, this indicator will be achieved.

[Indicator 2] Increased job opportunity of the vulnerable sector

According to the impact evaluation, the employment rate of participants is the following;

The Employment rate of participants by training areas

	Sewing Fabrication	Civil Construction	Cooking	Electricity	Machine	Automobile Maintenance
Employment Rate	45.8%	61.1%	41.5%	72.5%	88.9%	72.7%
Employment Rate	n/a	n/a	n/a	40%	66.7%	49.1%

The Employment rate is higher than that of the mid-term evaluation (34%). Besides, 71.2% of the respondents said that they could received additional benefit after finishing courses, such as improving income, start of micro-enterprise, and job-chaging.

As mentioned above, if the model is diffused and the occupational training is implemented, it is possible that job opportunity of the vulnerable sector be increased and their livelihood be improved.

3-2 Result of Evaluation

(1) Relevance: High

Not only in the Constitution of Republic of Ecuador 2008 but also in Government Plan 2007-2011, National Development Plan for good livelihood 2009-2013 (in Spanish, Plan Nacional para Buen Vivir 2009-2013) and National Plan for the Occupational Training 2010-2013 (in Spanish, Plan Nacional de Capacitación y Formación Profesional 2010-2013), one of the priority areas is to promote process of the Occupational Training in order to improve the job opportunity, the quality of employment and the enterprise opportunity for all Ecuadorian people, including the Vulnerable Sector. The unemployment rate and the sub unemployment rate are high during the Project. Besides, seven areas of training courses developed by the Project were determined on the basis of the results of needs identification implemented at the beginning of the Project.

According to the Country Databook published by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 2010, the basic policy for development assistance to Ecuador is identified as reduction of social disparity and improvement of productivity, and one of priorities is poverty reduction.

The targeted group of the Project is the Vulnerable Sector (e.g. the Refugees, the Disabled, the young people and the Unemployed). The selection criteria of participating training centres are its capacity (existence of full-time facilitators and laboratories), existence of the office of involved institutions and the targeted group.

As mentioned above, the Project is consistent with Ecuadorian policies, Japanese ODA policies, and the development needs; therefore, the relevance is high.

(2) Effectiveness: High

The Project has six outputs, which will be achieved until termination of the Project. In order to establish the model in the SECAP Headquarter and training centers, it is important to improve the occupational training courses (curriculum and educational materials, facilitators and laboratories), to execute needs identifications and impact evaluations, and establish the job support system. Besides, it is essential to establish the system for diffusing the model to non-participating training centers. Hence, it can be said that there is the causal relation in the Project Design Matrix (PDM).

According to interviews and questionnaires, any hindrance is not identified. There are some contributing factors, for example, good communication among people involved in the Project and high commitment to the Project by the SECAP Headquarter and its training centres. And, any important assumption is not identified, which affected to the Project activities.

As mentioned above, there is no problem on the causal relation in PDM, and the Project Purpose will be achieved until termination of the Project; therefore, the effectiveness is high.

(3) Efficiency: High

Although the input was planned that three Japanese experts were dispatched, the actual result is two long-term experts and one short-term. While two long-term experts engage in the Project, the lack of input has little affect to the Project activities.

During the Project, the counterpart is always designated. According to project documents, there are some

changes in the project director (the President of SECAP) and the project manager (the director of the planning department). However, these changes have not affected to progress of the Project.

It is realized that dispatched equipments are sufficient for implementing basic occupational training courses. The quality and quantity of these equipments are evaluated highly. In addition, as the input of equipments is completed before beginning of training courses, they were not delayed due to lack of equipments.

At the Final Evaluation, there are 17 participants for training courses in third-countries. According to interviews and questionnaires, all of them are satisfied with contents of training courses.

The planned cooperation cost for the Project is 270 million Japanese yen. The Project costs are USD 1,060,342 (for equipments) and USD 420,449 (for local cost).

As mentioned above, it can be said that Japanese Experts, counterparts, equipments and training in third-countries are appropriate for achieving outputs of the Project; therefore, the efficiency is high.

(4) Impact: High

The model of the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector and the basic structure for its diffusion in the SECAP Headquarter has been established. With this, some activities of diffusion of the model have already started. Through the occupational training, job opportunity and livelihood of the Vulnerable Sector are improved. So, if the model is diffused to all training centres of SECAP, it is expected to have similar impact in theses centres.

Additionally, through interviews and document reviews, following impacts are identified as well;

- The cooperation agreement on the occupational training and the job accessing support for the disabled was concluded among inter-institutions (SECAP, the Vice-President of Ecuador, Ministry of Labour Relation, CONAIDS etc). The cooperation agreement for the Refugees will be concluded as well.
- As for refugee participants, as they can participate in the occupational training with Ecuadorians, the refugees can not only acquire occupational skills but also integrate in the Ecuadorian society.

As mentioned above, the Overall Goal will be achieved and any negative impact is not identified; therefore, impact of the Project is high.

(5) Sustainability: Intermediate

As the Ecuadorian policy of the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector (e.g. the Constitution of Republic of Ecuador 2008, National Development Plan for good livelihood 2009-2013 and National Plan for the Occupational Training 2010-2013) is valid after termination of the Project, the sustainability of policies towards the Project is high.

As for operational aspect of the counterpart, the structure for diffusion of the model has been established in the SECAP Headquarter, and some activities for diffusion of the model have started. However, as there are some case of changes in managerial personnel and staffs and delay in distributing the budget to training centres, the SECAP Headquarter needs improvement in its management system.

The budget for the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector is allocated from 30% of labour tax, that is why there are fluctuation due to salary and employment population. The financial situation since 2008 is the following.

The financial situation of the Occupational Training for the Vulnerable Sector

Currency: US dollar

	Budget	Expenditure	Surplus
2008	9,979,419	9,849,716	129,703
2009	9,555,195	8,702,244	852,951
2010	10,901,704	8,816,171	1,848,408
2011	11,580,000	n/a	n/a

As the chart mentions, around ten million US dollars are ensured every year, and there is retained surplus. In addition, as the budget of the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector is regulated in the Presidential Decree, it can be considered that the budget will be made continually. According to the administration department of SECAP, the budget of the occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector in 2012 will be 14 million US dollars. As the budget amount is the highest, and people involved in the Project mentioned that the present budget amount is sufficient for the occupational training, it can be concluded that there is the sufficient budget.

The sustainability of technical aspect of SECAP is intermediate. As SECAP had already implemented more than 300 occupational training courses with curriculum and educational materials developed by the Project, it can be said that SECAP has already had the capacity for implementing the occupational training program. Through

visiting some training centres, the usage of equipments and laboratories was observed, and it is recognized that they have the capacity of maintenance. However, according to questionnaires, half of respondents of training centres think that there are still some points of improvement, for example allocation of a technical staffs for the maintenance, elaboration of the equipment inspection sheets and plan of equipment maintenance. As for the security and hygiene, questionnaires identified that as staffs start to clean and order through technical training for facilitators (security, hygiene and 5S), the security and hygiene in training centres is improved. On the other hand, there are some staffs in training centres recognizing that some improvements are needed, for example installation of signal in all laboratories and lack of cleaning equipment.

While SECAP has already had the technique to continue the basic occupational training program for the Vulnerable Sector, SECAP needs to improve its technique more and to overcome some awaiting solutions (e.g. management system of SECAP) for the sustainability,

As mentioned above, as there are some awaiting solutions in terms of operation and technique (while the sustainability is high from policy and financial aspect), the sustainability of the Project is intermediate.

3-3 Promoting factors

Promoting factors for implementing the Project are good communication among people related the Project (Japanese Experts, Counterparts and Involved institutions) and high commitment to the Project by counterparts. These are identified in interviews and questionnaires.

3-4 Hampering factors

The hampering factor for implementing the Project is the delay of completion of information system in SECAP. The information system is related with the activity for job accessing support (especially, job access to enterprise). If the information system is completed, job access to enterprise will start.

3-5. Conclusion

It is evaluated that the Project will be able to achieve its outputs and the Project Purpose. The model developed in the Project is consistent with needs of the Vulnerable Sector, and it is recognized that the occupational training contributes to job opportunity and improvement of livelihood.

The contributing factor is identified as high commitment to the Project by counterparts and good communication among people involved in the Project.

The occupational training for the Vulnerable Sector is considered as priority of the Ecuadorian policy, and financial situation is stable. To achieve the Overall Goal, it is essential for SECAP to diffuse the model and for training centres to implement training courses appropriately.

3-6 Recommendation

(1) Recommendation to achieve the Project Goal

It is necessary that the Project continue to work on the following activities with counterparts in order to complete them until termination of the Project.

- Verification of all guidelines elaborated in the Project with the committee and approval by the President of SECAP.
- Initiation and monitoring the structure of job insertion support in SECAP with the information system which are being developed at the Final Evaluation.
- Completion of the report of impact evaluation.

(2) Recommendation to achieve the Overall Goal

1) Diffusion of the basic occupational training course

The SECAP Headquarter and its training centres need the following preparation for implementing the basic occupational training course for the Vulnerable Sector developed in the Project.

- Installation of the necessary equipments in the laboratories.
- Reservation and raising facilitators.

In order to implement these activities, access by the Disabled should be considered such as improvement of facility access and designation of sign-language interpret.

2) Expansion of the basic occupational training course

On the basis of the model developed in the Project, it is expected that the SECAP Headquarter and its training centres try to grasp various needs and to increase the basic occupational training courses.

(3) Recommendation to the counterparts.

In order to establish the management system in SECAP, on-going restructure of the organization system will be completed and its effect is expected. It is recommendable that provision of the information on training for the Vulnerable Sector be more improved through the appropriate strategy to enable for people strongly motivated to work to participate in training courses preferentially.

3-7 Lessons learnt

(1) Development of the model, aiming at the diffusion to all training centres of SECAP

The Project developed curriculum and educational materials in collaboration with staffs of the SECAP Headquarter and its training centres. The SECAP Headquarter requested that educational materials be registered to International Standard Book Number and the Ecuadorian Intellectual Property Institute (el Instituto Ecuatoriano de la Propiedad Interlectual).

With extracting ownerships not only from staffs of training centres but also from the SECAP Headquarter, these activities were implemented. This is a special feature of the Project.

(2) Utilization of human resources from third-countries.

The Project utilized willingly human resources in third-countries. The fruit of past technical cooperation by JICA and technical trainings in third-countries sharing cultural and social background contribute to the effectiveness and the efficiency.

(3) Technical cooperation to the priority theme of the national policy.

The content and timing of the Project is consistent with the priority theme of the Ecuadorian policy. That is why the commitment to the Project by counterparts and inter-institutions is high, and the financial situation is stable.