Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Indonesia office: March, 2013

Country Name	The Project for Expansion of Radio Broadcasting Coverage in the Remote Areas
Indonesia	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 357 million yen		Contract Amount: 352 million yen
E/N Date	July, 2007		
Completion Date	January, 2009		
Implementing Agency	Radio Republic Indonesia (RRI)		
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: November, 2005 – March, 2006		
Contracted Agencies	Consultant	NHK ITEC	
	Contractor		
	Supplier	Sumitomo Corporation	
Related Projects (if any)	[Japan's Cooperation] - Development Plan for Radio and Television Broadcasting (technical cooperation, 1984, 1989, 1997 (only preliminary study)) - Enhancement of Radio and Television Network Project (ODA Loan, 1985, 1987) - Radio and Television Networks Improvement Project (ODA Loan, 1990, 1993, 1995) [Other Donors' Cooperation] - Modernization and Extension of FM Transmitters (Phase II) (KfW, 2006)		
Background	In order to realize "provision of radio broadcasting service for all the population" specified in the National Development Plan, RRI had been establishing medium wave radio broadcasting facilities at three (3) broadcasting stations out of five (5) stations, which did not have such facilities, responding to the need to establish nationwide broadcasting network mainly by rapid set-up of relevant facilities. Because of the limited budget, however, it was difficult to establish medium wave broadcasting facilities at two (2) stations in Tolitoli of Central Sulawesi and Tarakan of East Kalimantan (Tarakan Station and Tolitoli Station), which are remote and poor areas.		
Project Objective	Outcome Medium wave broadcasting services are provided/improved at all the 58 RRI stations including Tolitoli of Central Sulawesi and Tarakan of East Kalimantan by establishing medium broadcasting system both at Tolitoli and Tarakan stations.		
	Outputs <u>Japanese side</u> Procurement of equipment of medium wave broadcasting system for Tarakan Station and Tolitoli Station (2 sets for each of the following equipment) ・10kW medium wave broadcasting transmitter ・Medium wave transmitter antenna system ・Program input equipment ・Studio Transmitter Link (STL) program transmission equipment ・Lightening protection transformer ・Automatic Voltage Regulator（AVR） ・Uninterruptible Power Supply (UPS） ・VHF Communication set ・Digital Audio Mixer ・Measuring equipment ・Spare parts <u>Indonesian side</u> ・Obtainment of frequency for medium wave broadcasting at Tarakan Station and Tolitoli Station ・Preparation (clearing, leveling and reclamation) of land for medium wave broadcasting at Tarakan Station and Tolitoli Station ・Construction of buildings for medium wave broadcasting at Tarakan Station and Tolitoli Station (including supplementary facilities), power source building (including emergency power generator), STL tower, etc.		

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
The Government of Indonesia aimed to provide radio broadcasting services for all the population in the country and RRI, which is a public broadcasting agency, attempted to enhance its service area with medium wave broadcasting. At the commencement of the project, 56 broadcasting stations out of 58 had medium broadcasting facilities or were establishing such facilities. Two (2) remaining stations were Tolitoli and Tarakan Stations, which were the target agencies of the project.

This project has largely achieved its objectives of “provision of radio medium wave broadcasting services in Tolitoli and Tarakan areas” since the number of population who are able to receive such broadcasting service has increased in both areas with the expansion of RRI service. As a consequence, population in these areas has become able to obtain information concerning natural disasters, incidents, accidents and so forth. As for sustainability, there was no problem observed in the project in terms of technical aspect and current status of operation and maintenance, since i) RRI is fully utilizing equipment provided by the project and providing daily medium wave broadcasting services, ii) manuals are prepared and iii) training are continuously conducted. Some problems have been observed in terms of structural aspect as both stations recognize that the number of maintenance and management staff is not sufficient. With regard to financial aspect, budget for maintenance and management has not been allocated to RRI so far, since authority to possess equipment was just transferred to RRI from the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology in 2012. Thus, it is necessary to ensure the adequate budget allocation from 2013. For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Indonesia’s development policy, development needs as well as Japan’s ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, although the project cost was within the plan, the project period slightly exceeded the plan.
In the light of above, the project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with Indonesia’s development policy “establishment of facilities for radio services that can be utilized by all the population”, as set in Medium-term National Development Plan (REPENAS 2004-2009, 2010-2014)”, development needs “expansion of radio broadcasting facilities” as well as Japan’s ODA policy “JICA Country Assistance Program”, at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has largely achieved its objectives of “realization of medium wave radio broadcasting services”. Qualitative effects are summarized in the below table. In the target year of 2008, the achievement was significantly below the planned figure since facilities had not yet been utilized. At the time of ex-post evaluation, however, broadcasting service areas were expanded to Tolitoli and Tarakan areas, and the number of population who are able to receive broadcasting service was exceeded the planned target figure. As for impact, according to personnel of Tolitoli and Tarakan Stations, residents in the remote areas can now obtain information concerning natural disasters, incidents, accidents and so forth. Such expected indirect impacts are recognized and no major negative impact on environment and society has been observed. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is high.

Qualitative effects

	Baseline Value 2006（BD）	Target Value 2008	Actual Valued Achieved at target year (2008)	Achievement 2010*
Indicator 1 : Increase in number of population who are able to receive broadcasting service in Tolitoli area with the expansion of RRI broadcasting service area	110,000	250,000	N.A.	489,000
Indicator 2 : Increase in number of population who are able to receive broadcasting service in Tarakan area with the expansion of RRI broadcasting service area	100,000	420,000	129,000	626,000

* Statistics/figure at the time of ex-post evaluation
Source: Responses to questionnaire

Transmitter Equipment for medium wave radio

Program input/monitoring equipment


Medium wave transmission antenna

3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (ratio against plan: 99%), the project period slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against plan: 112%) because of the delay in procurement of equipment due to the delayed budget allocation for the customs clearance. Outputs were produced mostly as planned. Therefore, efficiency of this project is fair.

4 Sustainability

The facilities/equipment provided by the project are maintained by Tolitoli and Tarakan Stations, the implementing agency. At the time of ex-post evaluation, i) both stations are fully utilizing equipment provided by the project and daily medium wave broadcasting services are continuously provided, ii) manuals concerning procured equipment, maintenance and management of facilities are prepared, and iii) training/re-training are conducted to fully utilize relevant facilities and equipment. Therefore, there are no problems concerning technical aspect and the current status of operation and management. However, with regard to structural aspect, both stations recognize that the number of maintenance and management staff is not sufficient. As for financial aspect, budget for maintenance and management has not been allocated to RRI since authority to possess equipment was just transferred to RRI from the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology in 2012. So far, there has been no problem and maintenance and management have been carried out with the ordinary budget allocated to each station. The project has some problems in structural and financial aspects due to the situations stated above; however, no problem has been observed in technical aspect and the current status of operation and management of the executing agency. Therefore, sustainability of this project is fair. It should be noted that budget is supposed to be allocated from 2013.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

It is recommended that budget for maintenance and management be properly allocated. In the future, it is inferred that the case of breakdowns and damages of equipment increases and the level of such inconveniences becomes higher. Therefore, it is desirable to continuously improve skills of maintenance and management staff in order to deal with such situations.

Lessons learned for JICA:

In Indonesia, according to a regulation, in case that the maintenance and management agency (implementing agency) is not a ministry or the central government office, the agency cannot request budget unless properties (facilities and equipment) are transferred from the central government to the agency. Although at the time of BD study, it was reported that there would be no problem in allocating budget for maintenance and management, it is desirable to fully recognize the maintenance and management system before the commencement of the project.

As for indicators, increase in the number of beneficiaries was set as an indicator to assess effectiveness and i) improvement of living environment, ii) promotion of economic activities and iii) poverty alleviation were set to assess impact at the time of BD study. It is difficult, however, to clearly explain a causal relationship between effectiveness and impact as well as the degree of contribution made by the provision of medium wave broadcasting equipment. Regarding effectiveness, for instance, “the ratio of population who are able to receive broadcasting service” is considered more appropriate as an indicator, since it is in line with the contents of the project. It is desirable to set up indicators of effectiveness and impact that directly correspond to the contents of the project.