Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Uzbekistan Office:March 2013

| Country Name | The Project for Improvement of Medical Equipment for Obstetrics and Gynecology Research Institute |
|---|---|
| Uzbekistan | |

**I. Project Outline**

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Project Cost | E/N Grant Limit: 367 million yen | Contract Amount: 354 million yen |
| E/N Date | August, 2007 | |
| Completion Date | September, 2008 | |
| Implementing Agency | Obstetric and Gynecologic Research Institution | |
| Related Studies | Basic Design Study: December, 2006 - July, 2007 | |
| Contracted Agencies | Consultant | International Techno Center Co., Ltd |
| | Contractor | - |
| | Supplier | Ogawa Seiki Co., Ltd |
| Related Projects (if any) | - | |
| Background | The Uzbekistan government had drafted the "State Public Health Reform Program (1998-2005)" (partly revised in 2003). This program defined the improvement in maternal and child healthcare services as one of its policies, which puts special emphasis on health education for expectant and nursing mothers, training of healthcare workers and provision of healthcare facilities.<br>The Uzbekistan Ministry of Health had worked to improve the situation of primary and secondary healthcare in the field of maternal and child healthcare mainly in rural districts with the assistance of the UNICEF, the ADB and others. However, it had been unable to start any work for tertiary-level healthcare. Japan had provided medical apparatuses and appliances to important facilities for maternal and child healthcare in rural areas in Uzbekistan thereby helping major rural referral hospitals improve their obstetric, gynecologic and pediatric healthcare apparatuses and appliances. However, in recent years, improvement of tertiary healthcare facilities in the capital region, which served a large number of patients but had not yet been revamped, had become an important issue.<br>Against this background, the Uzbekistan government requested Japan to conduct a project for improving healthcare apparatuses and appliances for Obstetric and Gynecologic Research Institution located in Tashkent, the capital, which is a top referral facility among the country's obstetric and gynecologic facilities. | |
| Project Objectives | Outcome<br>To improve the quality of medical service of Obstetrics and Gynecology Research Institution in Tashkent, a top referral medical facility in the maternal and child healthcare field by providing medical equipment | |
| | Outputs<br>Japanese Side:<br>● Procuring apparatuses and appliances necessary for diagnoses and treatment activities for obstetrics and gynecology (68 items): narcotizing units, hysteroscope, incubators, infant warmers, sets of surgery apparatuses for obstetrics and gynecology, laparoscopes, operating tables, hanging-type operating lamps, respirators, biochemistry analyzers, blood electrolyte and blood gas analyzers, tissue processor, ultrasonic diagnosis units, general radiographic cameras, radioscopic units, mammography equipment, High-pressure steam sterilizers, and others.<br>Uzbekistani Side:<br>● Removal of existing equipment<br>● Repair of X-ray room and Central Sterile Supply Department | |

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

| Summary of the Evaluation |
|---|
| Obstetric and Gynecologic Research Institution (the "Hospital") is a top referral medical facility in the maternal and child healthcare field of Uzbekistan and provides advanced medical services such as difficult delivery, and treatment for patients with cancers. However, more than 30 years had passed since its establishment, and the medical equipment within the facility had greatly exceeded usability. Due to aging of equipment, there had been a decline in accuracy of treatment in the area of obstetrics and gynecology.<br>This project has somewhat achieved its objective. The quality of examination, diagnosis and treatment of the Hospital has improved and such services have become efficient. The number of patients who are diagnosed as uterine cancer patients has increased and the Hospital are able to provide advanced medical services which had not been offered before the project. With respect to impact, the referral system has been improved as a result of the project. However, some indicators such as the number of inpatients and the number of radiologic diagnoses have not been achieved because facilities and equipment of primary and secondary healthcare services have improved. As for sustainability, no problem has been observed in institutional, technical and financial aspects as well as the current status of operation and |

maintenance. Sufficient number of staff for continuity of the project is secured, the staff has good skills for operation and maintenance, the Hospital has good financial performance, and equipment operates well with a few exceptions.

For relevance, the project has been highly relevant with Uzbekistan's development policy, development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. For efficiency, both the project cost and the project period were within the plan.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with Uzbekistan's development policy, "improvement of maternal and child healthcare services" as set in the State Public Health Reform Program (1998-2005) and the Welfare Improvement Strategy (2008-2010), and development needs of "improving the quality of medical service of the Hospital, a top referral medical facility in the maternal and child healthcare field", as well as Japan's ODA policy "support for the reconstruction of social sector (healthcare)" at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation.

Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has somewhat achieved its objective. The quality of examination, diagnosis and treatment of the Hospital has improved and such services have become efficient by replacing damaged or aging equipment to new medical equipment including equipment for advanced medical treatment. The number of patients who are diagnosed as uterine cancer patients has increased and the Hospital are able to provide advanced medical services which had not been offered before the project. On the other hand, some indicators have not been achieved as the number of inpatients has decreased and the number of radiologic diagnoses has been halved, because facilities and equipment of primary and secondary healthcare services have improved and therefore the referral system have become functional. Although the data for the number of breast cancer patents was not available at the Hospital, the Hospital provides services of the breast cancer diagnoses.

As for impact, according to the director of the Hospital and doctors, the Hospital takes in increasing number of critically-ill patients, and the Hospital receives good reputation from other hospitals since the Hospital's takes in more referred patients. The director and the doctors also say that patients feel safe, and the improvement of services contribute to the decrease in infant mortality rate and maternal mortality rate, although data is not available. There is no negative impact, as the medical waste and the drainage water are disposed properly.

Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is fair.

Quantitative Effect

| | 2006 Actual (BD) | 2009 Plan *1 (Target year) | 2012 Actual (Year of ex-post evaluation) *2 |
|---|---|---|---|
| Indicator 1 : The number of inpatients | 12,276/year | increase | Approximately 9,000/year |
| Indicator 2 : The income from healthcare services | 604 million sum/year | increase | 469 million sum/year |
| Indicator 3 : The number of referrals of breast cancer patients to a specialized hospital | 12/year | increase | N/A |
| Indicator 4 : The number of referrals of uterine cancer patients to a specialized hospital | 17/year | increase | 118/year |
| Indicator 5 : The number of laparoscopic operations | 757/year | increase | 820/year |
| Indicator 6 : The number of radiologic diagnoses | 7,804/year | increase | 3,200/year |
| Indicator 7 : The number of electrocardiographic diagnoses | 5,625/year | increase | 7,040/year |

*1 Actual values for the target year (2009) were not obtained.

*2 Actual values for January – November, 2012

(Source) Obstetric and Gynecologic Research Institution

3 Efficiency

The outputs of the project were produced as planned, and both the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 96%, 91%).

Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

4 Sustainability

The equipment provided by the project is maintained by the Hospital. The institutional structure is sustained what it was

considered desirable at the time of ex-ante evaluation as there is no change in the number and composition of the staff, and is considered enough for continuity of project effectiveness. No problem has been observed in the technical aspect because the staff operates the equipment provided by the project without any troubles, carries out maintenance and inspection whenever necessary. The technical training is also implemented.

On financial issues, although an additional budget for the equipment provided by the project has not been allocated, sufficient amount of budget is secured for continuity of project effectiveness, according to the Hospital, and no problem has been observed in the profit/loss of the Hospital. There is no problem in the current status of operation and maintenance, as the equipment provided by the project operates well. Three of equipment were found to be broken at the time of ex-post evaluation study, however, the Hospital had already arranged necessary actions (a budget for repair was being allocated and parts were being supplied).

As stated above, this project has no problem in structural, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency, as well as the current status of operation and maintenance. Therefore, sustainability of this project is high.

**III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned**

Recommendations for implementing agency:

1. The implementing agency needs to submit an order to agents of equipment manufacturers to repair the broken equipment as soon as possible.
2. The implementing agency needs to collect and manage the important indictors/data including maternal mortality rate, infant mortality rate, and the number of patients for each disease, and the actual budget allocation for the maintenance.

Lessons Learned to JICA

Improvement of facility and equipment for primary and secondary healthcare services may improve the referral system in the healthcare field and result in the reduction of inpatients at the top referral hospital. In case of a project for procuring equipment for a hospital at the tertiary level, JICA needs to consider how the improvement of the healthcare services in the lower levels may have impact on the tertiary levels. Also, the indicators which result from the provision of advanced medical services should be set and collected for a project for the medical services at the tertiary level.