

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Indonesia Office: February, 2014

Country Name	The Project for Capacity-building of the Indonesian National Police
Republic of Indonesia	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The Government of Indonesia was actively promoting the organizational and functional enhancement of the Indonesian National Police (INP) that was separated from the National Armed Forces in 1999, based on the recognition that the development of democratic police administration services was essential. Japan implemented technical cooperation and grant aid projects mainly for the Bekasi Police Resort under the Program for Supporting Reform of the National Police. However, the still insufficient facilities and equipment were affecting the police activity.</p> <p>In INP, the major organ of counter-terrorism measures, the headquarters and provincial police were working together mainly through the special counter terrorism squad (Special Detachment 88 or Densus 88). However, equipment and knowledge that were essential to reinforce the fundamental criminal investigation capacity remained insufficient. Although INP had received assistance in enhancing its anti-terrorism skills through training, etc. from Australia and the United States, it was facing a serious shortage of equipment to support criminal investigation, especially those for criminal identification and scientific criminal investigation that were necessary for collecting evidence following a crime.</p>		
Objectives of the Project	<p>The project aims to enhance the criminal investigation capacity of the Indonesian National Police (INP) and to enable swift police action by procuring equipment related to counter-terrorism investigation for its headquarters and provincial police stations across the country and by developing KOBAN facilities and related equipment within the jurisdiction of the Bekasi Police Resort, thereby contributing to the improvement of the public security.</p>		
Outputs of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project Site: The headquarters (Jakarta) and provincial police stations of INP. The KOBAN facilities were developed in Bekasi Prefecture. 2. Japanese side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Construction of the following facility(s): KOBAN buildings in 11 locations in Bekasi Prefecture (within the jurisdiction of the Bekasi Metropolitan Police Resort and the Bekasi Prefecture Police Resort) 2) Procurement and installation of the following equipment^(Note): Equipment related to counter-terrorism investigation: radio communications system (radio communications vehicle and small radio communications system); equipment for criminal identification (magnifier with CCD camera, fingerprint collection sets, field photograph sets, etc.); and equipment for criminal scene investigation (X-ray inspector and fiberscope). The fingerprint collection sets and field photograph sets were provided to all provincial police stations, and all the other equipment were installed in either of the INP headquarters or the Jakarta Metropolitan Police. Within the jurisdiction of the Bekasi Police Resort: KOBAN set (radios, testing equipment, patrol car, etc.) <p>(Note) The followings are the changes from the original plan: the quantity of the small radio communication system was reduced from the planned 10 sets to 3 sets; a fingerprint photography (crime identification equipment) was planned but cancelled; within the KOBAN set, some specification was modified and items (e.g. furniture) were added. These changes were made as a result of the discussions with related ministries before the Exchange of Notes as well as the consideration of operation and maintenance and other aspects in the detailed design study.</p> 3. Indonesian side: Securing place to install the procured equipment; cost and procedures of custom clearance; etc. 		
E/N Date	September 15, 2005	Completion Date	February 13, 2007
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 449 million yen, Contract Amount: 448 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Indonesian National Police (INP)		
Contracted Agencies	Yachiyo Engineering Co., Ltd.; Kanto Bussan Co., Ltd.		
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: December 2004 – May 2005		
Related Projects (if any)	<p>Japan's Cooperation:</p> <p>The following projects were implemented under the Program for Supporting Reform of the National Police:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advisor to the Chief of Indonesian National Police (technical cooperation (dispatch of expert), 2001-) - Advisor in the field of on-site criminal identification and anti-drug measures (technical cooperation (dispatch of expert), 2002-) - Acceptance of trainees (2002-) - Support Program for Reform of Indonesian National Police (technical cooperation, 2002-2007) - Project on Enhancement of Civilian Police Activities (Phase 2) (technical cooperation, 2007-2012) <p>Other donors' Cooperation:</p> <p>Exchange of information, training and provision of investigation equipment in the field of anti-terrorism</p>		

	measures; training and provision of investigation equipment in the fields of crime identification and anti-drug measures (United States, Australia, Germany, United Kingdom, New Zealand, China, Singapore, etc.)
--	---

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance

This project has been highly consistent with Indonesia's development policy, such as "establishment of a law-abiding country" and "realization of security, peace and integration" as set in the National Development Plan (2000-2004) and the National Medium-Term Development Plan (2010-2014), development needs for reinforcement of counter-terrorism capacity, as well as Japan's ODA policy such as the Japan-Indonesia Joint Statement (2003) that promotes active assistance in anti-terrorism measures, at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

This project has achieved one of its objectives (outcomes), namely, enabling swift police action by developing KOBAN in Bekasi, as shown in the fact that the population per KOBAN has been significantly decreased and that the police has become able to respond to requests from the local residents promptly and in a sincere manner through the establishment of patrol and communication by police officers trained under the technical cooperation project. Also, an external survey found that the residents' degree of recognition of KOBAN increased from 3-8% in 2007 to 10-15% in 2011.

However, the other objective, i.e. enhancement of counter-terror investigation capacity, has been achieved to a limited extent: although there are certain results such as the response to the Marriott Hotel bombing in 2009, in which some of the equipment provided under this project was used, the overall frequency of utilization of the provided equipment is low. According to Densus 88 of INP and the Security Department of the Jakarta Metropolitan Police, the reasons for the low utilization included that the equipment was (i) attracting too much attention and too big in size (the radio communications vehicle and the equipment for criminal scene investigation), (ii) less convenient than motorcycles due to many traffic jams (the radio communications vehicle), and (iii) broken and thus not usable since 2010 (the magnifier with CCD camera). In particular, the original plan on the radio communications vehicle was to use it in investigations after the incidence of a terrorist attack, but at present it is deployed only occasionally for a security purpose to prevent terrorist attacks (at international conferences, etc.). On the other hand, use of the equipment for criminal scene investigation provided to all provincial police stations of the country was observed at the time of ex-post evaluation in Central Java Province and Bali Province where experts of the technical cooperation project visited. Replenishment of consumables by INP was confirmed, too.

The expected impact has been observed in Bekasi Prefecture: the numbers of both recognized cases of and arrests for criminal offences have been increasing. In some cases, effective utilization of the criminal identification and command communication skills transferred under the technical cooperation project and the facilities and equipment developed under this project led to the arrest of the criminals. In addition, according to the above-mentioned external survey, the function of KOBAN that was most highly rated by the residents was "contribution to maintenance of public peace". As for counter-terrorism investigation, however, the contribution of this project to resolution of terrorist cases is limited due to low frequency of use of the provided equipment. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is fair.

Quantitative Effects (Effectiveness)

Indicator	2004 (before the project) Actual value	2007 (target year) Planned value	2007 (target year) Actual value	2012 (ex-post evaluation year) Actual value
Indicators related to the investigation communications system (special counter-terrorism squad (Densus 88) and the Intelligence and Security Agency (Baintelkam) of INP)				
Indicator 1: Number of times the radio communications vehicle is dispatched	(not mentioned)	(not mentioned)	Densus 88: several times/year Baintelkam: several times/year	Densus 88: several times/year Baintelkam ^(Note 1) : several times/year
Indicator 2: Number of investigators per subscriber radio	117 persons	1 persons	Densus 88: unknown Baintelkam: unknown	Densus 88: the radios not used Baintelkam: unknown
Indicators related to the equipment for criminal identification (the Criminal Identification Agency (Bareskrim) under the Criminal Investigation Department of INP and the total of provincial police stations)				
Indicator 3: Number of items seized as evidence	(not mentioned)	(not mentioned)	Bareskrim: unknown Total provincial police stations: unknown	Bareskrim: unknown Total provincial police stations: unknown
Indicator 4: Number of evidential matters analyzed	(not mentioned)	(not mentioned)	Bareskrim: 13 Total provincial police stations: unknown	Bareskrim: 10 ^(Note 2) Total provincial police stations: unknown
Indicators related to the equipment for criminal scene investigation (Densus 88)				
Indicator 5: Number of times the investigation equipment was used	Around 1-2 times/ month in Jakarta	(not mentioned)	X-ray inspector : unknown Fiberscope: unknown	X-ray inspector : unknown Fiberscope: unknown
Indicator 6: Number of suspicious objects detected	(not mentioned)	(not mentioned)	Unknown	Unknown
Indicators related to KOBAN (within the jurisdictions of the Bekasi Metropolitan Police Resort and the Bekasi Prefecture Police Resort)				
Indicator 7 ^(Note 3) : Number of times of patrols by police officers	(not mentioned)	(not mentioned)	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 10,212 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 15,748	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 6,370 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 13,857
Indicator 8: Number of matters resolved at KOBAN	(not applicable)	(not mentioned)	Unknown	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 80 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 8

(* Replaced from the original indicator "the number of consultations")				
Indicator 9: Population per KOBAN	Approx. 1,100,000	Approx. 240,000	Unknown	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 29,003 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 45,959
(Supplementary indicator) ^(Note 4) Response time to notification to the police stations (minutes)	(not applicable)	(not mentioned)	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 15 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 5-15	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 15 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 5-15

Quantitative Effects (Impact)

Indicator	Before the project Actual value	2007 (target year) Planned value	2007 (target year) Actual value
Improvement of the public security (within the jurisdictions of the Bekasi Metropolitan Police and the Bekasi Prefecture Police)			
(Supplementary indicator) Number of recognized cases of criminal offences	(not applicable)	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 3,183 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 2,788	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 4,276 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 1,570
(Supplementary indicator) Number of arrests for criminal offences within the jurisdiction of the concerned police stations	(not applicable)	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 1,491 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 570	Bekasi Metropolitan Police: 1,543 Bekasi Prefecture Police: 814

Sources: Information provided by and interviews with INP, Bekasi Metropolitan Police Resort, Bekasi Prefecture Police Resort, and experts of the technical cooperation project.

Notes: (1) The equipment was originally provided to Baintelkam but moved to the Security Department of the Jakarta Metropolitan Police in 2010 since there would be more occasions of use.

(2) Since the magnifier with CCD camera provided under this grant aid project was broken, the figure represents the usage of the equipment that the Indonesian side purchased separately.

(3) The number of police officers assigned immediately after the opening of KOBAN could be said rather excessive. Over time, it was gradually reduced to the minimum number (appropriate number). Accordingly, the number of patrols decreased during the period from 2007 to 2012.

(4) The "supplementary indicators" are the ones that had not been envisaged in the original plan as indicators for evaluation but were newly set for this ex-post evaluation.

3 Efficiency

The outputs of the project were produced as planned except the partial cancellation or decrease in quantity and the partial modification in specification or increase in quantity of some of the Japanese-side outputs due to design changes mainly to save operation and maintenance cost (see "Outputs of the Project"). Although both the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100% and 90%), the project cost was slightly higher than it could have been considering the decrease of the output. Therefore, efficiency of this project is fair.

4 Sustainability

The operation and maintenance of the facilities and equipment developed under this project has been carried out by the headquarters, provincial police stations and/or the Bekasi Metropolitan Police Resort and the Bekasi Prefecture Police Resort (in relation to KOBAN) of INP, the implementing agency. The operation and maintenance structure for KOBAN in Bekasi has no problem as the sufficient number of personnel is assigned. Also, the organization and human resources for counter terrorism measures have been strengthened. In the technical aspect, while no problem is found in relation to KOBAN, no one is currently capable of operating the equipment for criminal scene investigation due to the transfer of the officers who were trained on the operation method immediately after the provision of the equipment. In the financial aspect, the overall INP budget is rapidly increasing, and there is no particular problem in terms of operation and maintenance cost for KOBAN. The budget arrangement for maintenance of the counter-terrorism equipment could be possible as well, though the budget as such is not needed due to the low degree of utilization of the equipment as mentioned above. As for the current status of operation and maintenance, among the equipment for counter-terrorism investigation, the whereabouts of one of the three sets of the small radio communication system is unknown (the other two sets are managed by Densus 88 and the Criminal Investigation Department, respectively). In addition, the magnifier with CCD camera has been left broken since 2010 reportedly because it could not be repaired in Indonesia.

In this way, there are some problems in the technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency and in the current status of operation and maintenance, especially regarding the counter-terrorism equipment. Therefore, sustainability of the effects of this project is low.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has partially achieved its objective, "to strengthen the criminal investigation capacity of the Indonesian National Police (INP) and to enable swift police action". Through the development of KOBAN in Bekasi Prefecture, the population per KOBAN has been significantly decreased and the police has become able to respond to requests from the local residents promptly and in a sincere manner through the establishment of patrol and communication by police officers trained under the technical cooperation project. However, the degree of achievement of the objective of enhancing counter-terrorism measures is limited due to the low degree of utilization of the provided equipment. With respect to impact, the number of arrests and other indicators show an increasing trend, and the local residents highly appreciated that the KOBAN contributed to public peace of their area. However, the contribution of the provided equipment for counter-terrorism investigation to resolution of terrorist cases is quite limited. As for sustainability, no problem is observed in the overall structure and financial situation of INP. Operation and maintenance of KOBAN developed in Bekasi is also good in terms of the technical and financial aspects as well as its current conditions. However, some problems are found in the technical and financial aspects and the current status of operation and maintenance of the counter-terrorism-related equipment due to the unknown whereabouts of some equipment provided, no need

for operation and maintenance budget due to low degree of utilization of the equipment, lack of human resources capable of operating certain equipment due to personnel transfer, and some equipment that is left broken because repair is impossible.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to implementing agency:

With regard to the equipment related counter-terrorism investigation that is not frequently used, consideration within INP should be made on possibility of utilization of such equipment for the originally-intended purpose of “counter-terrorism measures” and on necessary measures toward utilization (e.g. training by the manufacturer/supplier on operation methods one more time). If it becomes clear, in the process of such consideration, that the concerned equipment could be utilized more effectively for other purposes, INP should take the necessary procedure for change of use.

Lessons learned for JICA:

INP had had no or quite limited experience in using the equipment related to counter-terrorism investigation, especially, the radio communications system (radio communications vehicle and small radio communications system) and the equipment for criminal scene investigation (X-ray inspector and fiberscope). Therefore, it could not be denied that the specific use of such equipment in counter-terrorism activity may not have been well understood in the planning and implementation stages. It is inferred that the equipment could have been used more frequently if the Japanese side made more thorough explanation from “the way of thinking” and thus better ensured the effective use of the equipment before selecting it, and if it provided instructions not only on how to operate the equipment right after the procurement but also on how to use it in actual counter-terrorism operations as well as recommendations on what the counter-terrorism operations with the use of the concerned equipment should be. In order for a grant aid project to significantly affect the improvement of efficiency and effectiveness of the flow of operations in the concerned country, it is important to give the implementing agency details of the project in the planning stage to enhance their understanding. Assistance through a soft component and technical cooperation project should also be actively considered. Closer monitoring of the status of utilization of the equipment after provision is necessary as well.



Radio communications vehicle (outward appearance)



Radio communications vehicle (inside)



Magnifier with CCD camera



Fiberscope