

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Dominican Republic office: March, 2014

Country Name	The Project for Artisanal Fisheries Development
Saint Christopher and Nevis	

I. Project Outline

Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit:617 million yen	Contract Amount: 616 million yen
E/N Date	July, 2005	
Completion Date	December, 2006	
Implementing Agency	Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Housing, Agriculture, Fisheries and Consumer Affairs(Currently, Department of Marine Resources Ministry of Agriculture, Marine Resources and Constituency Empowerment)	
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: August, 2004-May, 2005	
Contracted Agencies	Consultant(s)	ICONS Inc.
	Contractor(s)	Toa Corporation
	Supplier(s)	-
Related Projects (if any)	<u>Cooperation by Japan</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Project for Construction of the Basseterre Fisheries Complex (Grant, Phase I: 2000, Phase II: 2001) • The Project for Construction of Fishermen' s Warehouse (Grant, 2006) • The project for Construction of Fishermen' s Warehouse (Grassroots Grant, 2006) 	
Background	<p>Fishery is one of the major industries in Saint Christopher and Nevis. However, the main marine products, such as dried cod, have been imported because the traditional artisanal coastal fishery brought about unstable supply and variation of freshness and quality. The government of Saint Christopher and Nevis elaborated a basic policy to promote artisanal coastal fishery, to supply marine products as food in order to improve nutrition of the people in the country as well as to realize sustainable use of marine resources. One of the action plans in the policy was consolidation and construction of landing sites, which have been scattered in the island. Therefore, the government requested the government of Japan, which had supported construction of fisheries complex in Basseterre, the capitol of the country, and dissemination and trainings of fishery skills, to support construction of St. Kitts Island</p>	
Project Objectives	<u>Outcome</u> To increase efficiency landing and discharge works by construction of the Old Road Community Fishery Centre (CFC-OL) in Old Road of St. Kitts Island.	
	<u>Outputs(s)</u> Japanese Side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction of Facilities: Boat yard, slipway, Community fishery center building, Fishermen' s locker building • Equipment: Insulated boxes, Truck with crane 	
	Saint Christopher and Nevis Side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Securement of construction site for marine products and water area for jetty 	

II. Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the Evaluation
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In Saint Christopher and Nevis, the main actor of the fishery industry of the country is artisanal coastal fishery which limited to the annual production of about 550 tons (2001). In addition, effective and sustainable use of marine resource in the exclusive economic zone was a main issue for the country and construction of facility to provide intensive landing and sales of marine products was an urgent matter. On the other hand, the country had only one fisheries complex in Basseterre (St. Kitts Island) and no other landing site in other fishing village. The situation brought about inefficient distribution of marine products in the Island. Based on the request by the government of Saint Christopher and Nevis, the Project was implemented to develop Old Road, one of the major landing sites in the Island, in order to increase efficiency of landing and discharge works as well as to promote the artisanal coastal fishery by linkage with the Basseterre Fisheries Complex. 2. For relevance, despite that the Project is consistent with the background referred as above as well as the Japan's ODA policies, the project design is not sufficiently appropriate. Therefore, its relevance is fair. 3. For effectiveness/impacts, a decreased time for preparation and landing per day contributed to improvement of efficiency of landing and discharge works. However, since the number of fishery boats landing and the volume of catch fish to be handled at CFC-OL are below the target, its effectiveness is low. On the other hand, some positive impacts, such as improvement of marine product quality by using ice, dissemination of using ice to the consumer public, as well as secured safety of fish boats and equipment, have been observed.

4. For efficiency, since the both of the project cost and the project period were within the plan. Therefore, its efficiency is high.
5. For sustainability, there are some problems such as poor drainage from the complex as well as drains behind the fisherman locker and malfunctioning concrete hatches for the jetty, difficulty of using the jetty due to the large difference in height between the jetty for landing and the sea surface, in particular, at the east side of jetty on windy days. Since the maintenance conditions of the facilities have not been sufficient, its sustainability is fair.
6. In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with Saint Christopher and Nevis's development policy to consolidate and develop landing sites by construction of marine product facilities, a Japan's ODA policy to Saint Christopher and Nevis for supporting promotion of fishery industry as well as the basic framework for cooperation with the Caribbean Community and Common Market (CARICOM) countries of "the New Framework for Cooperation between Japan and CARICOM in the 21st Century" prioritizing development of tourism, fishery and agriculture at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. However, landing at Basseterre where purchase and sales of marine products is better for the fishermen and the number of landing boats and catch fish at CFC-OL has been limited due to the jetty with difficulty for prolonged time berthing. All indications are that the project design has not been sufficiently appropriate to the development needs of the fishermen. Therefore, its relevance is fair.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

- 1) This project has limitedly achieved the target number of the fishing boats landing at CFC-OL: the number of fishing boats in 2009 and 2012 at the time of ex-post evaluation was 6-10 boats which was considerably below the target. Since the jetty is unable to serve the expected number of boats, some boats have been moved to Basseterre. As a result of this, the catch of some boats need to be transported back to CFC-OL via road using pick-up trucks, which makes the cost of their operations higher. The causes are difficulty to berth at the jetty for long hours due to the constant high waves, comparative disadvantage of CFC-OL in terms of landing catch fish against the Basseterre Fisheries Complex where the catch fish are purchased and sold, the concrete hatches removed and not reinstalled due to the rust causing difficulty in appropriate detachment (The follow-up project in the financial year of 2013 has been fixing the problem of the malfunctioning hatches.)
- 2) According to the Japanese experts engaged in the JICA technical cooperation in the fishery sector, all the boats except one boat using dragline fishing achieved the target of the necessary hours per day for preparation and landing.
- 3) The volume of catch fish handled at CFC-OL limited to 116 kg in 2012 which was below the target value since the number of the fishery boats landing at CFC-OL was below the target as mentioned in 1).
- 4) The volume of ice production increased from 0.34 tons in 2009 to 0.39 tons in 2012, but it was below the target of 0.6 tons. In terms of the proportion of the iced catch fish handled at CFC-OL, it was difficult to obtain accurate data. However, according to the interview with the officer of the Department of Marine Resource, the landed marine products are processed on site and carried them out from CFC-OL and the iced marine products with freshness are sold to the local hotels and restaurants. For the general consumers, when the marine products are sold at the side of CFC-OL just after the landing, the products are also iced. Some landed products are temporarily stored in the refrigerator or freezer of CFC-OL then sold to customers. The ice production made understanding of not only fishermen but also the general consumers on advantages of iced marine products. Such understandings promoted utilization of ice for marine products as an indirect effect of the Project.
- 5) According to the interview with the fishermen organization, the fishermen enable to procure necessary ice before going fishing and they acquired knowledge about freshness control through technical guidance by the Japanese expert dispatched by JICA. The marine products with freshness can be landed at CFC-OL. As a result, the Project brought about quality improvement of marine products landed at CFC-OL.
- 6) Also, according to the interviews with the officer of the Department of Marine Resources and the member of the Old Road fishermen organization, the Project enabled repair and maintenance works for fishing boats in the safe space within CFC-OL and provision of safety by evacuation of fishing boats to the protected space by the tetrapod for hurricanes. In addition, since the lockers were installed by the Japan's glass roots aid in the fishermen's locker building constructed by the Project, the fishing equipment can be securely stored. The fact can be also considered as positive impacts of the Project.
- 7) At the disposal space of the marine products building, there are some problems in sanitation, such as odor caused by a structural failure and inadequate cleaning. However, the follow-up project by JICA has dealt with those issues in addition to the repair of the jetty.
- 8) Although no resettlement has been required for the Project because of no resident on the project site, the land acquisition has not been completed since the land owners have been requesting compensation by cash instead of equivalent exchange of land which has been proposed by the government of Saint Christopher and Nevis.
- 9) In the light above, despite of incidental impacts by the reduction of landing hours and the ice production, the facilities constructed by the Project have not been fully utilized. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project was low.

10) Quantitative Effects

	Actual (2004, BD)	Target (2009)	Actual (2009)	Actual Ex-Post Evaluation (2012)
Indicator 1: The number of boats to land catch fish at CFC-OL	(Actual) -	(Plan) 24 boats	(Actual) 6-10 boats	(Actual) 6-10 boats
Indicator 2: Hours per day for preparation and landing at CFC-OL	(Actual) 60-90 minutes	(Plan) About 20 minutes	(Actual) 20 minutes in average	(Actual) 20 minutes in average
Indicator 3: The volume of catch fish handled at CFC-OL	(Actual) -	(Plan) 300kg/day in average 87.5 tons/year	(Actual) N.A.	(Actual) 116kg/day in average*
Indicator 4: The volume of ice production (daily)	(Actual) -	(Plan) 0.6 tons/day	(Actual) 0.34 tons/day**	(Actual) 0.39 tons/day***
Indicator 5: The proportion of iced catch fish landed at CFC-OL	(Actual) 0%	(Plan) 100%	(Actual) N.A.	(Actual) N.A.

(Source) Statistical data and information provided by the Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Housing, Agriculture, Fisheries and Consumer Affairs for ex-post evaluation

(Note 1) *The actual data of the volume of catch fish handled at CFC-OL in 2012 is the average for the period between January to June, 2012.

(Note 2) **The actual data of the ice production at CFC-OL in the target year is estimated by the sales of ice (12,293 EC\$) in 2010.

(Note 3) *** The actual data of the ice production at CFC-OL in 2012 is estimated by the sales of ice (7,058 EC\$) for the period between January to June, 2012.



A fishery boat mooring at the west side of the jetty



A fisherman taking ices for fishing



Constant ice making at CFC-OL

3 Efficiency

The outputs were produced as planned and the project cost and period were within the plan (the ratio against the plan: 99%, 98%). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

4 Sustainability

1) The facilities of CFC-OL constructed by the Project have been operated and maintained by staff of the Department of Marine Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture, Marine Resources and Empowerment, the executing agency of the Project. At the planning stage, it was planned that the organizational structure including the Business Department in charge of purchase and sales of catch fish landed at CFC-OL and 8 staff including the Manager would have been assigned. However, since no purchase and sales of catch fish landed at CFC-OL has been implemented, there is no problem to operate the facilities by the 5 existing staff. The support staff is not permanent staff but the officer of the Department of Marine Resources who comes to the office of CFC-OL for the hours in the afternoon to administrative works such as recording landing data and management of CFC-OL. Also the maintenance staff and the cleaning staff are double as the staff of the Basseterre Fisheries Center.

2) At the planning stage, the operation and maintenance of the facilities of CFC-OL had been planned to be transferred to the fishermen's organization. However, the Department of Marine Resources judged that the organization has not been fully functioned and did not cover all fishers who would use the facility and had difficulties in management capacity. Thus, at the basic design stage, it was designed that the Department of Marine Resources was in charge of operation and management of the facilities by the government budget. All the expenses of CFC-OL, including electricity tariff and payrolls of the staffs, have been covered by the government budget and it is expected that the government budget for CFC-OL will be continuously allocated in future (The expenses for the fiscal year of 2011 amounted 46,130 EC\$.) The annual revenue of CFC-OL is 14,543 EC\$ (about 480,000 JPY) from ice sales and rental fee of lockers.



The malfunctioning hatch due to rusts on the metal part

- 3) There is no problem on the current conditions of the equipment in CFC-OL, such as ice making machine, since the staff trained in Japan is assigned for maintenance and those equipment has been functioning. However, the rusty concrete hatch of the jetty induces difficulty in detaching of the hatches (currently fixing the troubles by the follow-up scheme in the financial year of 2013 by JICA) and poor drainage from the complex as well as drains behind the fisherman locker was confirmed. All the situations indicate that the maintenance system for a part of the facilities of CFC-OL has not been inadequate. In addition, there is a problem for utilization of the jetty. The large difference in height between the jetty and the surface water is at risk for fishing boats hitting the jetty at the time of berthing. In particular, the east side of the jetty has more problem of difficulty to use because it is on the windward.
- 4) The Project has problems in the maintenance situation for the part of the facilities. Therefore, sustainability of this project is fair.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency

In order to increase effectiveness and impacts of project as well as to ensure sustainability, the Department of Marine Resources needs to make efforts to let local fisher organization be functional and introduce the management system with reflecting local needs more effective way to the organization.

Lessons learned for JICA

The less comparative advantage of CFC-OL against the other fishery complex and the failure of the jetty for landing, which were observed by the ex-post evaluation, brought about the limited number of fishery boats using CFC-OL. At the time of basic design, it is necessary to appropriately assess natural conditions as well as the needs of beneficiaries, to sufficiently consider difficulty level of operation and maintenance of facilities and an institutional system of the executing agency and to examine and propose to fishermen a system to promote safe and sustainable use of the facilities (including implementation of the soft component to promote implementation of the proposed system).