Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Country Name Bangladesh	The Project for Enhancing Capacity of Public Service Training in Bangladesh

I. Project Outline

Background	In Bangladesh, civil service reform has been a priority area of the Government of Bangladesh (GOB). The GOB identified two specific approaches to improve management capacity in public sector, namely those of Total Quality Management (TQM) and Human Relations (HR). TQM requires every individual within an organization to be involved and all activities directed to satisfy customers. TQM also encompasses Human Relations element, which could contribute to changes in attitudes of individual public servants towards customers. The knowledge and techniques of TQM was expected to help public organizations increase their managerial effectiveness, thereby improving quality of their services through organizational and individual changes.
Objectives of the Project	1. Overall Goal: Improvement of quality of services delivered by public sector organizations in Bangladesh through practicing Total Quality Management (TQM). 2. Project Purpose: Enhancing the Institutional capacity of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center (BPATC) [note 1] to train public servants in TQM to manage public sector. 3. Assumed steps for achieving the project goals[1]: The project implements (i) development of Total Quality Management (TQM) training program [Note 2], training to faculty members (trainers) of BPATC and other 4 training institutions (NAEM, BARD, RDA, APD; hereafter referred to partner institutions) [Note 3], and (ii) demonstration of model projects [Note 4]. Through these activities, BPATC is able to regularly organize TQM-SC and regular core training programs with their faculty members and to play a role for facilitating the trainees to practice TQM in their work place. The civil services who receive TQM training by BPATC and other 4 training institutions introduce TQM approach at their work place and then quality of their services is improved. (Note 1) BPATC is a central training institution in Bangladesh under the Ministry of Public Administration (MOPA), which provide the key training programs for the government officers. (Note 2) Short courses on TQM (TQM-SC) and TQM modules within BPATC's regular core training program. (Note 3) NAEM: National Academy for Educational Management, BARD: Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development, RDA: Rural Development Academy, APD: Academy for Planning and Development (Note 4) Model projects are case studies to demonstrate the application of TQM approach to the public sector services. Model projects are selected from the Action Plans proposed by BPATC and the participants of TQM-SC. The results of model projects are also feedbacked to improvement and modification of the TQM course manuals and materials.
Activities of the project	1. Project site: Dhaka 2. Main activities Development of training of a concise module on TQM for regular core training programs and short courses, development of Training of Trainers (TOT), promotion activities for TQM, and implementation of model projects. 3. Inputs (to carry out above activities) **Japanese Side** 1) Experts: 12 persons 2) Trainees received: 19 persons 3) Equipment: Office and OA equipment **Bangladesh Side** 1) Staff allocated: 6 persons and 33 resource persons 2) Land and facilities: project office, seminar room, electricity, water supply, LAN system 3) Others: Salaries to counterpart personnel
Project Period	January 2007 – January 2010	Project Cost	229 million yen
Implementing Agency	Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center (BPATC), Ministry of Public Administration (MOPA)
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Padeco
Related Projects	Japan's cooperation: • Dispatch of a short-term JICA expert for follow-up of the project (Technical Cooperation, 2010-2011); • Project for Improving Public Services through Total Quality Management (Technical Cooperation, 2012-2017; hereafter referred to "the succeeding project") Other donors' cooperation: • Managing at the Top 2 (MATT2) (DFID, 2005-2012); • Developing Civil Service Capacity for 21st Century Administration (UNDP, 2005-2007)

II. Result of the Evaluation[2]

1 Relevance

---

[1] Reviewed at the time of the ex-post evaluation.
[2] Constraint of Evaluation: The ex-post evaluation reexamined the appropriateness of the indicators for project purpose and overall goal, and added alternative indicators in order to assess their achievement appropriately.

This project has been highly relevant with Bangladesh development policy ("improvement of public service through civil service reform" in the First National Strategy for Accelerated Poverty Reduction (NSAPR)(2005) and the Second NSAPR (2009)), development needs ("improvement of BPATC's capacity in order to introduce TQM approach in the public sector organization in Bangladesh"), as well as Japan's ODA policy for Bangladesh, "the Japan's PDA Strategy to Bangladesh" (2005), with the priority area of improvement of service quality of public sector organizations, at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion.　Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

This project focuses on improvement of institutional capacity of BPATC in order to promote the introduction of TQM in the public sector organization in Bangladesh.　The project developed TQM-SC course manual and TQM modules and course materials within the regular core training program.　The TQM-SC and TQM modules were authorized by BPATC academic council and integrated into the official training programs for the public servant in Bangladesh.　Through the TOT training, the project trained 67 faculty members of BPATC and partner institutions as qualified TQM trainers who were capable to conduct TQM training course.　By the project completion, eight TQM-SC with 250 participants and six TQM courses for Upazila officials with 137 participants were organized.　Therefore, this project achieved the project purpose "enhancing the institutional capacity of BPATC to train public servants in TQM to manage public sector".

As for overall goal, 269 TQM training courses (28 in TQM-SC, 235 in TQM modules within regular core training program and 6 in pilot Upazila course) were conducted cumulatively by July 2013 and the cumulative number of participants was 9,967.　Around 230 action plans on improvement of service quality in Upazila level by introducing TQM approach were prepared by the trainees, and 150 action plans out of them were actually implemented successfully.　Furthermore, 40 out of 150 successful action plans were presented in the seminars, workshops, newsletters, brochures etc.　According to the implementing agency, these action plans brought about positive impact of application of TQM at the workplace in Upazila level such as (a) reduction of time for land mutation (change of title ownership of land) from three months to 25 days, (b) increase of primary school attendance rate from 70% to 80%, (c) increase of hygienic latrine usage rate from 30% to 50%, (d) increase in information collection rate for cattle and poultry diseases from 40% to 70%, (e) increase in Fishery Act compliance rate from 70% to 95%, (f) increase in arsenic screened tube-wells rate from 22% to 30%, and (g) increase in allowance distribution rate for old aged citizen to 100%.　On the other hand, the degree of satisfaction on above mentioned improved service quality by the beneficiaries (e.g. landowners, school teachers and students, local residents, pensioners, etc.) has not been examined due to lack of the survey.　As mentioned above, successful action plans that demonstrate improvement in quality of services through practicing TQM are observed in some Upazila.　In addition, it is observed that number of public servants in the central level have initiated to review their individual work routine for improvement of services applying the concept of TQM.　Therefore, this project somewhat achieved its overall goal "improvement of quality of services delivered by public sector organizations in Bangladesh through practicing TQM".　However, realization of such outcomes remains in a limited extent in Upazila level.　Therefore, the outcome of this project has not been disseminated to nationwide yet.　Base on the successful outcome of this project, currently the JICA's technical cooperation named "Project for Improving Public Services through Total Quality Management (2012-2017)" is being implemented as the second phase of this project in order to further disseminate the outcome of the project to nationwide.

In this way, this project has sufficiently achieved the project purpose and partially achieved the overall goal. Therefore, effectiveness of the project is high.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Enhancing the Institutional capacity of BPATC to train public servants in TQM to manage public sector.	Faculty members are able to implement TQM training courses.	(Project Completion) Total 67 faculty members (48 of BPATC and 19 of partner institutions) was trained as qualified TQM trainers. (Ex-post Evaluation) Total 77 faculty members (48 of BPATC and 29 of partner institutions) were awarded as TQM Certified Trainers.
	TQM modules are developed in the institutes.	(Project Completion) The TQM-SC course manual and TQM modules and course materials were developed by BPATC and partner institutes.
(Overall goal) Improvement of quality of services delivered by public sector organizations in Bangladesh through practicing TQM	200 Public Servants receiving training use TQM in the job.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Total 9,967 public servants received TQM training from Jan.2007 to July 2013.　It is assumed that at least 150 public servants used TQM in the job because 150 action plans were actually implemented in Upazila level.
	Customer satisfaction in those organizations improves.	(Ex-post Evaluation) No information available because no customer satisfaction survey has not been conducted.

Source: Project Completion Report and BPATC/MOPA.
Note: The indicators for overall goal and project purpose are original ones stipulated in Project Design Matrix (PDM) at ex-ante evaluation.

3 Efficiency

Although the project period was within the plan (ration against the plan: 100%), the project cost was significantly exceeded the plan (ration against the plan: 159%).　The project inputs were appropriate for producing the outputs of the project. Therefore, efficiency of this project is fair.

4 Sustainability

In policy aspect, this project is still given importance in the current development policy such as the Second NSAPR (2009-2011).　Regarding the institutional aspect, BPATC and partner institutes have enough manpower to continue to provide TQM trainings.　After the project completion, total 77 faculty members (48 of BPATC and 29 of partner institutions) were awarded as TQM Certified Trainers by the training institutes, and 75 of them continue to provide lectures on TQM training course at present.　BPATC continues mentoring system [Note 1] for the TQM-SC in selected cases and to organize

dissemination seminars to the policy makers and high level government officers as well as up-dates public brief and PR material.   Regarding the technical aspect, faculty members of BPATC and partner institutions disseminate and learn mutually acquired knowledge and skills on TQM as well as established manuals in order to keep them as their institutional memories.   New case studies derived from model projects based on action plans have been incorporated in training curriculum as continuous process for modification of training modules.   Regarding financial aspect, an appropriate budget is provided to BPATC to continue the TQM training. But there is a lack of training budget for partner institutions since the budget is not recurrent but project-based.   In this regard, the succeeding project tries to sensitize high ranking officials to the successful cases which were demonstrated in several Upazila by the project and to the importance of the TQM trainings. This project has some problem in financial aspect, hence sustainability of this project effect is fair.

(Note 1) The purpose of mentoring system is to provide supports to the participants who implement the action plans in their work place.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

   The project has largely achieved the project purpose and somewhat achieved overall goal.   The project successfully established the institutional capacity of BPATC and partner institutions for conducting TQM training to the public services. For example, the project established the course manual of TQM-SC and developed different TQM modules in regular core-courses, which were authorized as official training program for the public sector organization offices in Bangladesh. Totally 67 faculty members were developed as TQM quality trainers and eight TQM-SC with 250 participants and six TQM course for Upazila with 137 participants were organized during the project period.   After the project completion, TQM training courses have been provided by the training institutions continuously and 150 action plans for improvement in quality of public service delivered in Upazila level were implemented, which brought about positive impact in some Upazila.   As for sustainability, there is some problem in the financial aspect because partner training institutions have a difficulty to continue the TQM training due to lack of training budget.   As for efficiency, the project cost significantly exceeded the plan.
   In the light of above, this project is evaluated to satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:
• The implementing agency is expected to make an effort to respond to the above mentioned issues in collaboration with on-going JICA's technical cooperation project.   In particular, it is important to maintain and further strengthen BPATC's capacity as a focal point to promote the TQM approach to public servants through improving faculty members' teaching quality and motivations and reinforcing the mentoring system.
• It is recommended to develop mechanism to motivate trainees of TQM training for implementing their action plans and further improving their hands-on activities.   Platform or networking for information sharing and mutual learning will be useful for ex-trainees who are minded to carry out their action plans.

An example of Before and After situation
of the file management at office

A "KAIZEN" action for ensuring formalin free fish in a fish market
through trainings of retailers and distribution of leaflets.