

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by India Office/ Dec, 2013

Country Name	Conservation and wise-use of natural resources of Chilika lagoon through Community Participation
India	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The State of Odisha (formerly known as Orissa until 2011) was one of the least developed states in India, and small-scale fishers who depended on fishery resources of the Chilika lagoon for their livelihood were among the poorest population. On the other hand, the Chilika lagoon was designated as a Ramsar site in 1981, and it was an important issue to improve and stabilize the livelihood of people in and around the lagoon while simultaneously conserving the wetland. The Chilika Development Authority (CDA) was responsible for environmental conservation and development of the lagoon, and had to take a major role to establish a system of support and collaboration among stakeholders in natural resource management and livelihood improvement of fishers in and around the lagoon</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Sustainable rural development activities are expanded in and around Chilika lagoon. Project Purpose: Strengthening the capacity of CDA to plan and carry out sustainable development of rural communities inhabiting in and around Chilika lagoon. Assumed steps for achieving the project goals¹: This project develops the fishery resource management plan (FRMP) through surveys and collaboration with fishers and concerned agencies, and implements pilot projects for alternative livelihood for fishers that would show ways to compensate fishers' losses due to the FRMP. As a result, it is expected that CDA and concerned agencies implement FRMP, and CDA implements alternative livelihood improvement activities in more villages in Chilika. 										
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Rural areas in and around Chilika lagoon in the state of Odisha, with four pilot villages. Main activities: Surveys and data management, sensitization of fishing communities, preparation of FRMP, implementation and monitoring/evaluation of pilot projects, preparation of manuals, etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">India Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 7 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 10 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 9 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: project office in CDA</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Vehicles, portable water meters, GPS data loggers, etc.</td> <td>3) Local cost</td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	India Side	1) Experts: 7 persons	1) Staff allocated: 10 persons	2) Trainees received: 9 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office in CDA	3) Equipment: Vehicles, portable water meters, GPS data loggers, etc.	3) Local cost
Japanese Side	India Side										
1) Experts: 7 persons	1) Staff allocated: 10 persons										
2) Trainees received: 9 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office in CDA										
3) Equipment: Vehicles, portable water meters, GPS data loggers, etc.	3) Local cost										
Project Period	October 2006 to October 2009	Project Cost	255 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Chilika Development Authority (CDA)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	None										
Related Projects (if any)	Other donors' cooperation: The India Integrated Coastal Zone Management Project (ICZMP) (World Bank, 2010-2015)										

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance	<p>This project has been highly relevant with India's development policy "poverty reduction" and "environmental conservation including measures of sustainable use of natural resources through community participation" as set in the 10th (2002-2007) and 11th (2007-2012) Five Year Plan, development needs "improved livelihood of fishers while conserving the natural environment of the Chilika lagoon", as well as Japan's ODA policy; the Country Assistance Program (drafted in 2006), at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact	<p>The project purpose of strengthening the capacity of CDA was achieved: CDA became able to conduct fishery survey using the techniques of data collection and database management transferred by the Japanese side. Also, pilot activities for improvement of alternative livelihood, such as goat farming, dairy, dry fish and vegetable marketing and irrigation, were implemented in the four pilot villages involving 37 self-help groups (SHGs) participated by 403 individuals. Based on the results and lessons of those surveys and activities, CDA completed the FRMP and started arrangements for implementation in coordination with relevant organizations including the Department of Fisheries and Animal Resource Development (DoFARD) of the Government of Odisha by the end of the project.</p> <p>After project completion, the FRMP was implemented in terms of research and livelihood improvement. CDA has continued water quality monitoring and fishery surveys, and managed the database developed under this project. It has also conducted various environmental education and awareness workshops/meetings for stakeholders including fishers. Further, a more</p>

¹ Reviewed at the time of the ex-post evaluation.

rational approach in promoting alternative livelihood options has been taken by the World Bank assisted ICZMP after JICA project. Meanwhile, the enforcement of the fishery regulation, the remaining part of the FRMP, has not been realized yet: in 2012, the Chilika Fishery Regulation Bill with penal provisions was drafted, and draft legislation is now under active consideration of the Government of Odisha.

The overall goal, expansion of sustainable rural development activities in and around the Chilika lagoon, was achieved as well, for the alternative livelihood activities in 30 fishing villages involving 250 SHGs have been implemented under the ICZMP, with DoFARD as the nodal agency. The baseline information and the experiences learnt from this project paved the way for guiding the selection of livelihood projects for implementation under the ICZMP (e.g. dairy and dry fish marketing). In the pilot villages, about half of the SHGs have been continuing the same activities they started under this project. In the successful cases, after they received the initial financial and technical input from CDA during the project implementation, they became independent to do business by themselves. Now CDA is only supervising the activity by monitoring the SHGs in the pilot villages, as its primary mandate is not protecting the livelihood of fishers but in conservation of the lake environment (DoFARD takes care of improving livelihood).

As to the impact the environment and livelihood of fishers in the project site, assessment of the data that CDA has collected is under progress at the time of ex-post evaluation.

In this way, this project achieved the project purpose, and impacted the overall goal, which was achieved by another project based on the outcome of this project. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is high.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Strengthening the capacity of CDA to plan and carry out sustainable development of rural communities in and around the Chilika lagoon	A fishery resource management plan (FRMP) is prepared and proposed to the concerned agencies	(Project Completion) CDA completed the FRMP, and issued an instruction/started arrangements for the implementation. (Ex-post Evaluation) Part of FRMP related to research and livelihood improvement were implemented, while enforcement of the fishery regulation is under way.
	The final completion report is presented to ensure the sustainable implementation of livelihood improvement activities	(Project Completion) CDA completed relevant reports. (Ex-post Evaluation) The reports have been used in formulating the plan for alternative livelihood activities for Chilika fishers under the World Bank's ICZMP.
(Overall goal) Expansion of sustainable rural development activities in and around the Chilika lagoon	The numbers of villages in which envisaged action plans for development of rural livelihood will be implemented	(Ex-post Evaluation) With the support under the ICZMP, alternative livelihood activities have been implemented in 30 fishing villages involving 250 SHGs.

Sources: Terminal Evaluation Report, Final Report, answer from the implementing agency to the questionnaire, interviews with SHGs and NGOs in pilot villages.

3 Efficiency

The inputs were appropriate for producing the outputs of the project, and both the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 91%, 100%). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, this project is still given importance in the the 12th Five Year Plan (2012-2017), which is promoting alternative livelihoods and resource management protocols, particularly stock assessment in fisheries. Institutionally, the structure of CDA, the implementing agency, has been sustained in a similar manner with the implementation period with more full time staff currently allocated, and is considered appropriate for continuity of project effectiveness. Other key organizations also perform their roles in implementing the FRMP. As for the technical aspect, it was observed that CDA secures necessary technical level and skills of its staff for fishery resource management as there are in total 14 temporary staff/ landing surveyors in CDA at present, and they are regularly trained by CDA and the ICZMP. Also, all the equipment provided under this project are in good working condition and they are properly maintained. On the financial aspect, the budget provision and expenditure for CDA's activities related to fishery resource management were/are being made with the financial support of Finance Commission Grant (Rs 790lakhs earmarked for the period during 2010-2015 and a proposal being considered for the period thereafter) and the State Plan Scheme under the component "Fishery Resource Development". In addition, funds are also received from external agencies for the various research and developmental activities and project funding including the ICZMP funded by the World Bank.

From these findings, it is considered that this project has no problem in policy background, institutional, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, sustainability of effectiveness of this project is high.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has achieved the project purpose of strengthening the capacity of the Chilika Development Authority (CDA) to plan and carry out sustainable development of rural communities in and around the Chilika lagoon: using the transferred techniques, it developed the fishery resource management plan (FRMP), and the FRMP is now being implemented by CDA and other related agencies. For the overall goal, based on the FRMP and the experience of the pilot activities of this project, a World Bank assisted project expanded alternative livelihood activities to other villages in Chilika. As for sustainability, no problems were found in the policy background as well as the institutional, technical, and financial aspects of the implementing agency: fishery resource management has been supported in development policies, and CDA has maintained its organizational structure, capable human resources and budget to fulfill its mandate.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

CDA should not only continue to monitor the water quality, hydro-biological parameters as well as fishing activities in the Chilika lagoon but also play proactive role in conservation by coordinating with various stakeholders for reinforcement of the fishery regulation. It is further recommended that CDA effectively utilize survey data to assess the impact of various conservation activities on the natural resources in the lake as well as on the livelihood of fishermen.

Lessons learned for JICA

In the pilot villages, some of the livelihood activities that this project started were discontinued, and no new livelihood activities were started after this project, while similar activities are being implemented in other villages by DoFARD under the World Bank assisted ICZMP. Such a difference may be attributed to the fact that CDA's primary mandate is not protecting the livelihood of fishers but in conservation of the lake environment, while DoFARD is responsible for livelihood of fishers. Even though the discontinued activities played a role as pilot trials, and both CDA and DoFARD as well as other organizations concerned play their respective roles in implementation of the FRMP, a more concrete coordination mechanism between CDA and DoFARD could have created a synergy between lake conservation and alternative livelihood activities for fishermen. Therefore, in case the expected outcome of the project is to be achieved by more than two different organizations, the project should develop and establish an official coordination mechanism that can sustain after project completion.



Dry Fish Marketing



YSI Data buoy