

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by Brazil office: January, 2014

Country Name	Sustainable Use of Forest Resources in Estuary Tidal Floodplains in Amapá
Federal Republic of Brazil	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The floodplain areas covered the basins of the Amazon River and its branches reserves abundant forest resources and valuable ecological systems. In the estuary tidal floodplain areas in Amapá, which is located in the downstream basin of the Amazon River, no massive deforestation has been occurred yet. However, livelihoods of dwellers in the floodplain areas (“the riverbank dwellers”) have been depending on logging. The state of Amapá is one of the poorest states in Brazil. In particular, Mazagão Velho, the project site, had the third highest poverty ratio of 67% in the state. While the area had a potential to produce furniture using local timber, the inefficient use of timbers and the low skills for timber processing and furniture making hampered the sales price of timbers logged by the riverbank dwellers. The low sales price of timbers forced the riverbank dwellers uncontrolled logging for their livelihood. Therefore, there was a concern that the uncontrolled logging could induce rapid deforestation in the areas and adverse impacts on lives of the riverbank dwellers. On the other hand, the state government of Amapá did not have comprehensive policy and legislation to manage the floodplains and forests and adequate management system. Under those situation, it was necessary to take countermeasures for the issues.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: The livelihood of riverbank dwellers living in the Project Area will be improved through sustainable use of forest resources on the estuary tidal floodplains in Amapá. Project Purpose: The way of utilizing forest resources for improving the livelihood of riverbank dwellers will be improved in the project Area on the estuary tidal flood plains. Logical flow of how the project responses to development issues: The project prepares a basic guidelines for sustainable use of forest resources in the Project Area (note 1), establishes Agroforestry Association by the riverbank dwellers, develops and implements forest management plan and agroforestry system (SAF: Sistemas Agro-Forestal), and concludes legal timber supply contract. By implementing the activities for sustainable use of forests, the project aims at increases in the volume of legally logged timbers, the volume of improved agriculture and timber production, the volume of legal timbers to be standardized and sold as well as practices of agro-forestry. Those improvements attain sustainable use of forest resources and improved livelihoods of the riverbank dwellers. <p>(note 1) Floodplain Areas in Mazagão Velho and Maracá (Município de Mazagão)</p>										
Project Information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Floodplain areas in Mazagã Velho and Marazá (Município de Mazagão) Main activities: Development of basic guidelines for sustainable use of forest resources in the project areas, establishment of the Agroforestry Association by the riverbank dwellers, development of forest management plans and agroforestry action plans, conclusion of legal timber supply contracts between the Agroforestry Association and furniture production companies, and so on. Inputs: <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Brazilian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 7 experts</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 19 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 6 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: project office and office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Vehicles, small boat, outboard motor, PC, etc..</td> <td>3) equipment</td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Brazilian Side	1) Experts: 7 experts	1) Staff allocated: 19 persons	2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office and office	3) Equipment: Vehicles, small boat, outboard motor, PC, etc..	3) equipment
Japanese Side	Brazilian Side										
1) Experts: 7 experts	1) Staff allocated: 19 persons										
2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office and office										
3) Equipment: Vehicles, small boat, outboard motor, PC, etc..	3) equipment										
Project Period	November, 2005 – May, 2009	Project Cost	285 million yen								
Implementing Agency	State Institute of Forests (IEF: Instituto Estadual de Florestas), Amapá Institute of Rural Development (RURAP: Instituto de Desenvolvimento Rural de Amapá), Office of Industry, Commerce and Mining (SEICOM: Secretaria de Indústria, Comércio e Mineração)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Forestry Agency										
Related Projects	<p><u>Japan's cooperation:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dispatch of expert (Sustainable use of floodplains ecological system, 2002) Dispatch of expert (Modernization of furniture industry in Amapá, 2003) <p><u>Other donors' cooperation:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pilot Programme to Conserve the Brazilian Reinfores (PPG7, 1992-2009), Support for the Amazon Fund (the Norwegian Government, 2009-2015) 										

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
This project has been highly consistent with the Brazilian' development policy, such as conservation and

sustainable use of forest resources specified under “the Federal Government Multiannual Plan (2004-2007)” and “the Amapá State Multiannual Plan (2008-2011)”, and development needs to improve livelihoods by use of timbers and introduction of agroforestry, as well as Japan’s ODA policy prioritizing support for environment. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project aimed at improvement of utilization of forest resources contributing to improvement of livelihoods of the riverbank dwellers through development of forest management plan in the project area with approval of the Brazilian Institute of Environment and Renewable Natural Resources (IBAMA), promotion of legal logging by the community (the Agroforestry Association), expansion of production and sales of legally logged timbers as well as introduction of agroforestry. By the introduction of agroforestry, the total number of households participating in the agroforestry action plan reached 117 in Mazagão and 71 in Maracá during the project period. 93 ha in Mazagão and 55 ha in Maracá of the land were cultivated for agroforestry. At the time of terminal evaluation, the agroforestry production attained 801.9 tons in Mazagão and 318.1 tons in Maracá which significantly exceeded the target values. At the time of ex-post evaluation, 109 households in Mazagão and 127 in Maracá participated in the agroforestry action plan and the cultivated land of the project areas were expanded to 109 ha and 129 ha, respectively. The main product of the agroforestry in the project area is acai which are mainly harvested from natural forests of acai. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the annual production volume of acai was 112 tons in Magazão and 312 tons in Maracá. However, the forest management plan, which is a basic plan for the sustainable use of forest resources, was not approved during the project period because a) right of land use of farmers who were members of the Agroforestry Association has not been established¹, and b) the environment license was not been given to the Association without established right of land use (though the process to receive the license has been progressed). Therefore, the legal logging and sales of timbers was not able to start during the project period. (It was expected to establish the right of land use for Mazagão in September 2013 and Maracá in 2014. In the case of Maracá, entitlement of the right will be through the Association of Workers in Agro-extraction Settlement in Amapá (ATEXMA), which is an umbrella organization of the Agroforestry Association of Maracá.) As a result, the Project Purpose has been limitedly achieved due to the attainment of the project limited to the implementation of the agroforestry in the project areas.



Strainer of acai berries, a necessary time for the riverbank dwellers.

As for the Overall Goal, no sales amount from the sales of legally logged timbers has been resulted because legal logging and sales in the project areas has not been started yet. Also, no expected impact such as furniture production using timbers from the project areas, has not been realized though the project expected that the Agroforestry Associations would have supplied legally logged timbers produced in the project areas to the furniture associations in Amapá. On the other hand, the agroforestry activities introduced by the project contributed to increase in income of farmers participating in the agroforestry action plans through the production and sales of acai. At the time of ex-post evaluation, while the sales price of acai was 40 reais per 60kg, the annual revenue of the Mazagão Agroforestry Association and the Maracá Agroforestry Association were approximately 74,680 reais and 208,000 reais², respectively.

Besides that, the technologies introduced by the project, including agroforestry, have been disseminated by IEF through the Programme for Promotion of Forest Extraction (PROEXTRAVISMO) by the state government of Amapá. In addition, the importance of the floodplains in Amapá was recognized through the project. While the state government of Amapá reinforced the forest plan, the Brazilian Enterprise of Agricultural Research (EMBRAPA) conducted forest surveys and the National Institute of Colonization and Land Reform (INCRA) enhanced land readjustment. Furthermore, the SAF products have been supplied to schools by the strengthened access to food programs such as the National School Feeding Program (PNAE). In terms of control of illegal logging, IEF and RURAP reported effects of environmental education contributed to its reduction. However, while the Maracá Agroforestry Association reported 40% of reduction in illegal logging, the Mazagão Agroforestry Association reported that it increased in their area.

Although Counter Parts of the implementing agency and JICA made efforts to coordinate with the related organizations to accelerate the process of the environment license and the right of land use, the forest management plan has not been approved yet. As a result, despite of the effects of the introduction of agroforestry, other expected effect of legal logging and sales has not been realized. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project is low.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Improvement of use of	(Indicator 1) The volume of legally logged timbers in the project area (Maracá)	<u>Terminal Evaluation</u> : Unlikely to be achieved. Unlikely to start legal logging during the project period since the

¹ A typographical error was corrected (April 2015)

² The exchange rate as of September, 2013, 1 real is equivalent to 42 JPY. 74,680 reais = approximately 314,000 JPY and 208,000 reais = approximately 874,000 JPY.

forest resources to contribute to improvement of livelihood of the riverbank dwellers in the project areas	according to the approved forest management plan will be 200 m ³ .	forest management plan has not been approved. <u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> The production of legally logged timbers has not been started since the forest management plan which is a precondition of the legal timber production, has been still under preparation.
	(Indicator 2) The volume of agroforestry production introduced or improved by the project in the project area will increase to 500 tons.	<u>Terminal Evaluation:</u> Achieved. 801.9 tons/year in Mazagão and 318.1 tons/year in Maracá. <u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> Confirmed as the Overall Goal.
	(Indicator 3) The volume of legally logged timbers to be standardized and sold for furniture production in the project area (Maracá) will increased to 50m ³ .	<u>Terminal Evaluation:</u> Unlikely to be achieved. The delay of approval of the forest management plan constrained conclusion of the timber supply contract. <u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> No production and sales of legally logged timbers.
(Overall goal) Sustainable use of forest resources and improvement of livelihoods of the riverbank dwellers in the project areas in the floodplains in the state of Amapá	(Indicator 1) The forest management plan is continuously implemented by the Agroforestry Associations in the project areas in the floodplains in the state of Amapá	<u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> No implemented since the forest management plan has not been approved.
	(Indicator 2) In the Project areas, the volume of agroforestry production introduced or improved by the project will increase to at least 700 tons by 5 year after the project completion.	<u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> The production of acai: 112 tons/year in Mazagão and 312 tons/year in Maracá.

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report and the interviews with CPs.

3 Efficiency

While the inputs were appropriate for producing the outputs of the project and the project period was as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost was higher than the plan (ratio against the plan: 119%) due to the increases in the inputs for dispatch of separate experts of the chief advisor and the forest management expert after the mid-term evaluation, repair of the boat, rental of other boat less affected by waves for safety. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, the activities of the project has been supported since the state government of Amapá newly introduced the Community and Family Forest Management Program and enhanced the policy for promotion of forest management and agroforestry by communities which were introduced by the project at the time of review of the state multiannual plan in 2011. In addition, since the State Decree No.3325, providing for exploitation of natural forests, including legal reserved forests in the state of Amapá became effective since June, 2013, it is expected that the forest management plans elaborated by the Project can be legally endorsed. For the institutional aspect, IEF enhanced its implementation structure through newly establishment of the Mazagão Office to cover Maracá and Mazagão. Despite of sustaining the Agroforestry Association, the forest management plan and the timber supply contract have not been implemented yet since the plan has not been approved and the production and sales of legally logged timbers have not been started. In terms of the environment license for the riverbank dwellers, INCRA, a federal organization, and the State Environment Office (SEMA) jointly commit to licensing as the voice of INCRA has been enhanced. Since INCRA is responsible for support small scale farmers to obtain right of land, they cooperates with SEMA to accelerate procedures in SEMA. As a result, the process of licensing has been progressed. For the technical aspect, the technical report developed for dissemination of outputs by the project has been utilized and the activities of agroforestry introduced by the project have been adequately continued by the farmers who participated in the project. However, the trainings for logging by chainsaw which is necessary for adequate logging, has not been delivered since the forest management plan has not been approved. In terms of timber processing skills for furniture production companies, furniture workers who participated in technical trainings by the project utilized skills obtained. Also, SENAI continues technical trainings for furniture companies. For the financial aspect, the budget for implementation of forest management plan and agroforestry has been ensured by the state government of Amapá despite of the unapproved forest management plan. Some problems have been observed in the technical aspects since approval of the forest management plan has been still unclear despite of some positive factors such as expectation of the environment license. Therefore, sustainability of this project effect is fair.



A part of estuary tidal floodplain forests

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has partially achieved the project purpose to improve use of forest resources contributing to improvement of livelihood of the riverbank dwellers in the project areas. Although the agroforestry has been practiced, the planned production and sale of legally logged timbers by the community has not been realized yet since the forest management plan has not been approved due to the delays of establishment of right of land use

and the environment license. As for the Overall Goal, while the activities of agroforestry increased production and sales of acai and incomes of the participating farmers, the sales revenues from the legally logged timbers have not been generated since the production and sales of legal timbers has not been started. As for sustainability, despite of no problem in the policy, institutional and financial aspects, the unapproved forest management plan brought about some problems in the technical aspect. As for efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan due to the increases in inputs for dispatch of separate experts of chief advisor and forest management expert, repair of boat, rental of another boat less affected by waves for safety. In the light above, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

[IEF]

- IEF needs to jointly take actions with other governmental organizations supporting small scale producers, including INCRA in order not to miss the opportunity which enables to promote the process of establishment of right of land use for the riverbank dwellers in the project areas under the situation where the voice of INCRA for the environment license has been enhanced. Also, IEF should support and facilitate the Maracá Agroforestry Association to contact ATEXMA in order to give the Association the right of land use promptly.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- In the project, the expected outcome of the project such as production and sales of legally logged timbers has not been realized due to the delays of establishment of right of land use and the environment license and the unapproved forest management plan. Since the securement of right of land use is essential to realize the expected outcome of the project, it should have been a precondition for starting the project. Or the project with sufficient project period should have been designed to incorporate activities to support establishment of right of land use and to involve adequate organizations related to the issues.