

# Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by Turkey office: November, 2013

Country Name	Improvement of Livelihood for Small-Scale Farmers in Eastern Black Sea Region
Republic of Turkey	

## I. Project Outline

Background	The Eastern Black Sea Region (DOKAP) covering the 6 mountainous provinces of Artvin, Giresun, Gümüşhane, Ordu, Rize and Trabzon, is one of the least developed areas in Turkey. 60% of the labor force was engaged in agriculture. On the other hand, most farmers had only limited productivity due to the small size of land and scattered location. In addition, since the geographical and meteorological conditions in the region constrained variety of crops to be cultivated, tea and hazelnuts were the main crops for the region. However, the over cropping induced lower qualities and prices. As a result, the farmers were facing difficulty to sustain their livelihood based on the cultivation of tea and hazelnuts.										
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Overall Goal: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Farming improvement method is extended to the small-scale farmers in the 6 provinces.</li> <li>2) The livelihoods of the small-scale farmers are improved in the model areas.</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. Project Purpose: Basic structure and systems of farming improvement for the 6 provinces is developed.</li> <li>3. Assumed steps for achieving the project goals<sup>1</sup> : The project develops agriculture information and extension system, implements multiple farming in the model areas and prepares farming improvement plan for small-scale farmers in the target areas. By practicing multiple farming, the project aims at establishment of methodology and capacity to develop farming improvement, namely stabilization or improvement of farmers' income through diversification of income sources. Through the reinforcement of capacity of extension staff and small-scale farmers, the farming improvement is disseminated in the 6 provinces and the livelihood of the small-scale farmers in the model area is improved.</li> </ol>										
Project Information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project site 6 provinces of Artvin Giresun, Gümüşhane, Ordu, Rize and Trabzon, including model areas of 3 villages (Kuruçm, Coşandere Uğurlu) in Trabzon Province.</li> <li>2. Main activities Trainings of farm improvement for extension staff, development of manuals for multiple farming and annual farming improvement plan, organizing farmers' groups and practicing multiple farming in the model areas.</li> <li>3. Inputs (to carry out above activities)  <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Turkish Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 8 Short term experts</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 20 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 8 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: project office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: 35 items, including vehicles, PCs, tea harvesting machine, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Turkish Side	1) Experts: 8 Short term experts	1) Staff allocated: 20 persons	2) Trainees received: 8 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office	3) Equipment: 35 items, including vehicles, PCs, tea harvesting machine, etc.	
Japanese Side	Turkish Side										
1) Experts: 8 Short term experts	1) Staff allocated: 20 persons										
2) Trainees received: 8 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office										
3) Equipment: 35 items, including vehicles, PCs, tea harvesting machine, etc.											
Project Period	January, 2007 – March, 2010	Project Cost	314 million yen								
Implementing Agency	General Directorate of Agricultural Production and Development (TUGEM, renamed as Agrarian Reform: TRGM) of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs (MARA, renamed as Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock: MoFAL), Trabzon Provincial Directorate of Agriculture (PDA), Artvin PDA, Giresun PDA, Gümüşhane PDA, Ordu PDA and Rize PDA										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	NTC International CO., Ltd.										
Related Projects (if any)	<p>Japan's cooperation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Study on Regional Development Plan for Eastern Black Sea Region(Technical Cooperation, Development Study,1999-2000)</li> <li>• Human Resource Development for Participatory Local Development in DOKAP Region (Technical Cooperation, 2005-2009)</li> <li>• Country Focused Training on Human Resources Development for DOKAP-TARIM Project (2010-2012)</li> <li>• Senior Volunteers(Vegetable Growing and Farmer's Co-operatives) were dispatched. (2011-2013)</li> </ul> <p>Other donors' cooperation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agricultural Reform Implementation Project (World Bank, 2001-2009)</li> </ul>										

<sup>1</sup> Reviewed at the time of the ex-post evaluation.

## II. Result of the Evaluation

### 1 Relevance

This project has been highly consistent with the Turkey's development policy, such as creating highly competitive agriculture structure specified under "the Development Plan (2001-2005, 2007-2013)", and development needs to improve agriculture structure in the Eastern Black Sea Region to stabilize and increase incomes of farmers, as well as Japan's ODA policy to support improvement of the agriculture and fishery sector including extension of agriculture technologies and the development of the Black Sea region. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

### 2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project focuses on i) establishment of basic structure and systems for farm improvement including multiple farming through the capacity development of extension staff and the farmers in the model villages and the extension villages in Trabzon Province as well as ii) enhancement and improvement of the extension services. The project purpose i) has been achieved by the introduction of multiple farming by the small-scale farmers in the model villages and the extension villages. At the time of ex-post evaluation, around 70% of the farmers introducing multiple farming in the model villages of Trabzon Province have continuously practiced multiple farming. For the efficient technical transfer and capacity development of the small-scale farmers, the farmers' groups were voluntarily formulated in a participatory approach. Such group activities arranged site visits to learn good practices of multiple farming and to enable successful dissemination of farming skills. Project purpose ii) has been also achieved; only 6% of farmers evaluated the agricultural extension services poor at the terminal evaluation and interviewed farmers were satisfied with the extension services developed by the project at the time of ex-post evaluation.



Kiwi Fruits planting for multiple farming in Trabzon

As for the overall goal, multiple farming has been practiced by 1,474 farmers in total in the target 6 provinces through the implementations of farm improvement plans elaborated by the Project for each province, including implementation of the model projects by the trained extension staffs. Also, the small-scale farmers in the model villages and the extension villages in Trabzon recognized improvement of their income through farm improvement.

Furthermore, there have been some positive changes in socioeconomic environment for rural women in the target provinces. For example, members of the Trabzon Cosandere Women's Group, which was established for the project activities, have started to generate income by selling handicrafts which they produce.

Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

#### Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Development of basic structure and systems of farming improvement for the 6 provinces in the Eastern Black Sea Region	(Indicator 1) More than half of small-scale farmers in the model areas and extension area, who participate in the project, determine to continue the activities.	<u>Terminal Evaluation:</u> Achieved. 86% of farmers' group members (594 farmers including 272 from the model villages and 322 from the extension area). <u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> In Trabzon Province, 510 farmers in the model villages have accessed agriculture information for farm improvement and 371 farmers have been still continuously practicing multiple farming.
	(Indicator 2) The evaluation grade of "poor" for agricultural extension services is decreased from 50% to 20% in the model areas.	<u>Terminal Evaluation:</u> Achieved. Only 6% of farmers evaluated that agricultural extension services was poor or not sufficient. <u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> According to the interviews with the farmers in the model areas, they are satisfied with the extension services developed by the project but they need further technical assistant for unfamiliar issues not covered by the project, such as disease control of plants.
(Overall Goal 1) Extension of farming improvement for small-scale farmers in the 6 provinces	(Indicator 1-1) Multiple farming is applied by more than 1,200 small-scale farmers in 6 provinces by the end of 2013.	<u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> In total, 1474 farmers applied multiple farming in 6 provinces. (Applied by 371 farmers in the model villages in Trabzon, 465 in extension villages in Trabzon, 638 in extension villages in other 5 provinces.)
	(Indicator 1-2) More than 75% of extension staff responsible for the extension area can instruct the farming improvement in each extension area by the end of 2013.	<u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> , 48 staffs, directly in charge of this project and succeeding project (38% of 125 of extension staff trained) assigned in the extension area are instructing multiple farming for farmers.
(Overall Goal 2) Improvement of the livelihoods of the small-scale farmers in the model areas	(Indicator 2-1) More than 70% of small-scale farmers in the model areas, who applies farming improvement through the project, fell stable or increased income by the end of 2013.	<u>Ex-post Evaluation:</u> All the interviewed farmers answered their income level improved through the practices of multiple farming despite of the differences of level of improvement.

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, PDAs of the 6 provinces, Interviews with farmers in 3 model villages (15 farmers) and 4 extension villages in Trabzon Province (16 farmers).

### 3 Efficiency

The inputs were appropriate for producing the outputs of the project, and both the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 98.1%, 97.5%). Therefore, efficiency of this project is high.

### 4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, dissemination of the farm improvement introduced by the project has been endorsed by the Ninth Development Plan which focuses on improvement of efficiency of the agricultural structure and creation of highly organized and competitive agricultural structure. As for institutional aspect, the extension system for farming improvement in the 6 provinces has been well-functioning. The sufficient number of staff, including both administrative and extension staffs, have been assigned. 3 administrative personnel at MoFAL and each PDA for the 6 provinces are responsible for the extension services. 125 extension staff were trained for the post project period between 2010 and 2012, and 48 extension staff have been engaged in instruction of multiple farming for the farmers in the 6 provinces. Also, the most of farmers' groups have been continuing their activities for farm improvement. From the technical aspect, according to MoFAL, the staffs of MoFAL and the PDAs, the extension staff as well as the farmers' groups have been sustaining their knowledge and techniques for farm improvement acquired through the project. Also, the trainings for the staffs and the farmers newly joining the activities have been continuously delivered by the Trabzon PDA. However, the farmers pointed out that further improvement in extension services is in need after the project completion since farmers have been facing unfamiliar issues, such as diseases or fluctuation in production. Furthermore, they need knowledge and skills for marketing of their new products, in particular fruits, which have been harvested after the project period for the first time. To respond to needs of the farmers, both MoFAL and JICA have been providing support to the project sites through dispatch of Senior Volunteers and training for extension staffs. In terms of the financial aspect, MoFAL has continuously allocated necessary budget to the PDAs of the 6 provinces in order to implement model projects of farming improvement and the PDAs have executed the budget for dissemination of farming improvement. The total budget for the 6 province increased 845.million Turkish liras in 2010 to 990 million Turkish liras in 2012. Therefore, sustainability of this project effect is high.



Newly introduced Green House in an extension village, Yalılıköy, Trabzon

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has largely achieved the project purpose and overall goal. The model of farm improvement based on multiple farming has been introduced and sustained by the small-scale farmers in the model villages and in the extension villages in Trabzon as well as in the extension villages of the other five provinces after the termination of the project. The farm improvement introduced by the project contributed to increase in the farmers' income in Trabzon. Also, the model of farm improvement has been disseminated to the small-scale farmers in the target 6 provinces through the enhancement of extension services. As for sustainability, the dissemination of the farm improvement is supported by the national development plan and the administration and the extension systems, including the training system for the extension staff and the farmers, have been well-functioning at the central and the provincial levels. In addition, the trained extension staff and farmers have been sustaining the knowledge and technologies for farm improvement. The some technical issues, which were not addressed by the project such as disease control and production control of newly introduced plants, have been tackled by MoFAL with support of JICA. Also, the necessary budget for dissemination of multiple farming have been allocated by MoFAL and been executed by the PDAs in the 6 provinces. In the light above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency,:

**【the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock】**

- It is recommended to continue providing technical support for the farmers since harvest of some crops, in particular, fruit trees, require at least a few years. In addition, it is necessary for the extension staff to obtain knowledge and skills to tackle issues of disease control and production control in order to stabilize agricultural production through collaboration with experts in such field.
- In order to generate income from agricultural production, marketing of products which are to be harvested for the first time is essential. Therefore, collaboration between the extension staff and experts in marketing is recommended.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- Since the project period was limited, some challenging issues such as disease control, measures to cope with fluctuation of production had been assumed to be tackled by MoFAL or the farmers after the project. However, in order to develop the project impact and sustainability, it is considered to be necessary to formulate project with sufficient length of the period to include those technical issues within the frame work of the project activities.
- Support for group activities is effective not only dissemination of agricultural technologies but also income generation activities. Farmers' groups facilitate to learn good practices through visit of model site and to practice them under the cooperation by the members. Also, the group activities facilitate other income generation, such as production and sales of handicrafts by rural women's groups.