

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by Senegal office: March, 2014

Country Name	Project on the Safe Water and the Support on Community Activities Phase 2 (PEPTAC 2: Proj et Eau Potable Pour Tous et Appui aux Activités Communautaires Phase 2)
Republic of Senegal	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Senegal, the Japanese government has provided grant aid for construction and rehabilitation of water supply facilities in more than 110 sites. As a result, more than 300,000 villagers had access to safe water and hygienic environment. On the other hand, establishment of community-based management system became a key issue to self-reliantly maintain sustainable water supply facilities. Under those situation, for the period from 2003 to 2006, JICA conducted technical cooperation for PEPTAC 1 aiming at establishment of Water Users' Association (ASUFOR: Association des Usagers de Forage) and maintenance system under cooperation among ASUFOR, government, and private agents in 24 sites. Also, other donors supported capacity building and extension of ASUFORs. However, there were remaining sites to extend ASUFORs in Tambacounda Region due to its remoteness.</p>												
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overall Goal: The system for sustainable utilization of drinking water is deployed in the target area (40 sites in Tambacounda Region to be extended by the Senegal side) 2. Project Purpose: The system for sustainable utilization of drinking water is implemented in the project site (35 sites in Tambacounda Region) 3. Logical flow of how the project responses to development issues: The project establishes O&M system for the water supply facilities based on ASUFORs and promotes adequate utilization of water as well as introduces community activities (small animal raising and market gardening). By activating the O&M system based on ASUFORs and community activities, the project aims at sustainable utilization of safe drinking water and improvement of living conditions in the project sites in Tambacounda Region. Through the extension of the O&M system introduced by the project, sustainable utilization of safe drinking water and community activities are disseminated to other target sites in the Region. 												
Project Information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project site: 35 sites in Tambacounda 2. Main activities: trainings of O&M and water utilization for operators of water supply facilities and the members of ASUFORs, development of maintenance plan for the facilities and guidelines for water utilization and implementation of community activities at the pilot sites 3. Inputs: <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Senegal Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 10 experts</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 19 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 4 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Construction of project office in Tambacounda, liaison office in Dakar, furniture, electricity and water supply.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Third country training: 5 persons</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Equipment: water meters, water pumps, water pipes, generators, equipment for agriculture and livestock farming.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Senegal Side	1) Experts: 10 experts	1) Staff allocated: 19 persons	2) Trainees received: 4 persons	2) Land and facilities: Construction of project office in Tambacounda, liaison office in Dakar, furniture, electricity and water supply.	3) Third country training: 5 persons		4) Equipment: water meters, water pumps, water pipes, generators, equipment for agriculture and livestock farming.	
Japanese Side	Senegal Side												
1) Experts: 10 experts	1) Staff allocated: 19 persons												
2) Trainees received: 4 persons	2) Land and facilities: Construction of project office in Tambacounda, liaison office in Dakar, furniture, electricity and water supply.												
3) Third country training: 5 persons													
4) Equipment: water meters, water pumps, water pipes, generators, equipment for agriculture and livestock farming.													
Project Period	November, 2006 – March, 2010	Project Cost	568 million yen										
Implementing Agency	<p>Ministry of Urbanization, Habitat, Construction, Water (MUHCH: Ministère de l'Urbanisme, de l'Habitat, de la Construction, de l'Hydraulique)*, Ministry of Health and Medical Prevention (Ministère de Santé et Prévention Médicale), Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries, and Biofuel (Ministère de l'agriculture, de la Pisciculture et des Biocarburants), Ministry of Livestock (Ministère de l'Élevage)</p> <p>*While the ministry was restructured in October, 2009, there was no influence on the project. And since 2012 (after the project), the name of the Implementing Agency was changed to "Ministry of Water and Sanitation" (MHA: Ministère de l'Hydraulique et de l'Assainissement).</p>												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Earth and Human Corporation, Kokusai Kogyo Co., Ltd.												
Related Projects	<p><u>Japan's cooperation:</u> (Technical Cooperation: TC, Grant Aid: GA)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project of Water Supply in Rural Area (GA, 2004-2007) • Project for Safe Water and the Support on Community Activities (PEPTAC I) (TC, 2003-2006), • Project of Drinking Water Supply in Tambacounda Region (GA, 2010-2012) <p><u>Other donors' cooperation:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PEPAM-Luxembourg SEN/026 (Luxembourg - Thiès, Louga regions) • PEPAM-BAD-2 (Banque Africaine de Développement - Kaffline, Tambacounda, Kolda, Sedhiou, Ziguinchor regions) • PEPAM-BA (Belgium - Diourbel, Kaolack, Fatick, Kaffrine regions) • PEPAM-IDA (World Bank - Matam, Saint-Louis, Tambacounda regions) 												

II. Result of the Evaluation¹

¹ The site survey was not able to cover all the 35 projects sites because they were scattered in the Region.

1 Relevance

This project has been highly consistent with the Senegal's development policy, such as increase in population with access to safe water in rural areas specified under "Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP)" and the Millennium Water and Sanitation Program (PEPAM), and development needs to establish community based O&M system for sustainable utilization of safe water, as well as Japan's ODA policy to prioritize water supply. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project focuses on establishment of O&M system based on ASUFOR under collaboration with the public and private sector at the project sites as well as community activities for sustainable utilization of safe water at the pilot sites in Tambacounda Region. By the end of the project, ASUFORs functioned to provide adequate water supply service. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the capacity of the ASUFORs strengthened by the project was verified by the check points defined by the project and it is confirmed the majority of them have been well-functioning. In general, the water supply facilities in the project sites have been well maintained and the hygiene practices including consumption of safe water source, safe water storage and clean water points, have been sustained. During the project, the community activities were introduced and carried out by female members of ASUFORs in 5 pilot sites. After the project completion, those activities have been continued by the female members of ASUFORs.

As for the overall goal, 80% of ASUFORs established after the project by Senegal side have been well-functioning in the target area. The coverage of safe water supply has been increased and population with access to safe drinking water is 547,374 people with a coverage rate of 51% of the whole region population at the time of ex-post evaluation. Also, the project contributed to reduction of workload of water fetching by women. According to the 12 sample visited sites, the improved hygiene practices successfully decreased water-borne disease. Furthermore, the community activities were introduced to and have been continued in some surrounding sites other than the target area.



Dialacoto Water Tank

Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Establishment of system for sustainable utilization of safe water in the project sites in Tambacounda Region	ASUFOR is adequately entrenched in the 35 project sites. [Check Points] 1. The water facilities are well operated. 2. The regular meeting of the Steering Committee is held more than once a month. 3. The Executive Board is held once a month. 4. The monthly accounting record is prepared. (in note book or form of meeting minutes) 5. The metered system is implemented. 6. (1) The bank account of ASUFOR is opened. (2) Reserves is regularly deposited in the bank account except the case of serious breakdown. 7. The collection rate of water tariff is 100% 8. Adequate unit tariff for operation and maintenance of the water supply facilities is established. 9. General Assembly is held annually. 10. The water supply facilities are cleaned up.	<u>Terminal Evaluation</u> : Mostly achieved. Out of 35 sites, 31 sites with adequate water supply service. In average, 8.5 point (35 sites) fulfilled in the project sites. <u>Ex-post Evaluation</u> : 90% of ASUFORs established by the project have been well-functioning. According to the sites visit for the ex-post evaluation, 10 out of 12 sites were well-functioning as 8 points fulfilled in average at these 12 visited project sites.
(Overall goal) Extension of system for sustainable utilization of safe water in the target area in Tambacounda Region	The number of sites where ASUFOR are adequately operated and sustained in other than the project sites (as least 40 sites) The number of villages sustaining the community activities in other than the project sites (at least 5 sites)	<u>Ex-post Evaluation</u> : 83 ASUFORs were established after the project and 80% of them well-functioning. <u>Ex-post Evaluation</u> : According to 12 villages, community activities have been introduced to some surrounding sites after the project. The activities are still continued in all these sites.

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Interviews at the ex-post survey, and data from MHA

3 Efficiency

While the inputs were appropriate for producing the outputs of the project and the project period was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost was higher than the plan (ratio against the plan: 118%) because of additional cost for procurement of equipment for rehabilitation works of the existing water supply facilities. Therefore, efficiency of this project is fair.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, the Water & Sanitation Program "PEPAM" endorsed institutional support for ASUFORs. Also, a consultant team was established in each district through PEPAM by the MHA who is responsible for

monitoring ASUFORs. No policy issue was observed at this ex-post evaluation; however, there is a plan to introduce a policy management reform in future that will transfer maintenance and water production works to the private sector.

For the institutional aspect, there was no change in the institutional and organizational arrangements. ASUFORs are responsible for daily O&M of water supply facilities, small scale repairs and water tariff collection. If the reform comes to be effective, the role of ASUFORs related to maintenance and water production will be transferred to the private sector and therefore ASUFORs would focus on providing services for boreholes users. The Team for Wells and Boreholes (BPF: Brigade des Puits et Forage) is in charge of support for ASUFORs and repairs of water facilities which ASUFORs cannot deal with. However, the monitoring system by BPFs has not been fully functioning due to the limited number of staff and limited budget for field visits. The Subdivision of Maintenance (SM: Subdivision de Maintenance) of the Directorate of Exploitation and Maintenance (DEM: Direction de l'Exploitation et de la Maintenance)/MHA deals with large scale repairs.



Maleme Niani Maintenance Guidelines

From the technical aspect, the technical staffs of SM/DEM and BPFs have sufficient technical knowledge and skills to adequately support ASUFORs. The project trained the borehole operators for small repair works and they properly maintain aging equipment. They also have sustained their technical knowledge and skills through use of manuals developed by the project as well as refresher training session at the training center of Tambacounda delivered by DEM.

As for the financial aspect, the budget for activities of BPFs has not been sufficient to conduct adequate monitoring of ASUFORs because of the tight national budget. However, most of ASUFORs in the project sites are able to cover the cost of spare parts and repair of minor breakdown since they have the sufficient tariff level varying from 200 FCFA/m³ to 400 FCFA/m³ and the sufficient collection rate of more than 80%. In sum, while there are some concerns in each aspect of the project sustainability due to the forthcoming reform, not severe issues are observed except for budget constraints at the time of the ex-post evaluation. Therefore, sustainability of this project effect is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has largely achieved the project purpose to establish sustainable O&M system based on ASUFORs in the project sites and the overall goal to extend the system to other sites in Tambacounda region in order to promote utilization of safe water. Also, the community activities introduced by the project brought about improvement of living conditions in villages through more participation of women in socio-economic activities. As for sustainability, safe water supply system based on ASUFORs is endorsed by the national water and sanitation program, the well-functioning institutional setting and the sufficient financial capacity of ASUFORs despite the budget constraints on the BPF activities and changes in the roles by the forthcoming policy reform. As for efficiency, the project cost was slightly exceeded the plan due to the additional procurement of equipment to replace obsolete ones.

In the light above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

To MHA (Ministère de l'Hydraulique et de l'Assainissement)

- It is recommended to increase the number of staff and the budget for BPF to conduct regular site visits for monitoring of ASUFORs under the new Agency that will be established to replace the current Direction de l'Exploitation et de la Maintenance "DEM" by the planned reform.
- It is necessary to accelerate the process of getting a contract of maintenance works for boreholes with the private service providers. The agreement of private companies will take over the role initially performed by SM and BPF and is expected to lead to improved repairing works on the field.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- The inclusion of training of small repair works for borehole operators in the project was important to maintain aging equipment in a proper condition. It prevents facilities from frequent breakdowns and helps having a continuous water service as well as generates better care management and maintenance.