

Terminal Evaluation Summary Sheet

1 Outline of the Project	
Country: Federative Republic of Brazil	Project Title : The Jalapão Region Ecological Corridor Project
Thematic Area : Natural Environment and Biodiversity	
Division in Charge : JICA Brazil Office	Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Project Period : Apr 2010～Apr 2013	Total Cost : 350 million Japanese Yen
Supporting Organization in Japan : Ministry of Environment, Forestry Agency	Counterpart Agency : Chico Mendes Institute for Biodiversity Conservation (ICMBio)
<p>1.1 Background of the Project</p> <p>The Cerrado, situated in the Midwestern part of Brazil, is a vast tropical savannah and significantly rich in biodiversity. It is, however, considered one of the most seriously threatened areas in terms of the loss of biodiversity in the world. Located in the Cerrado, the Jalapão region boasts particularly rich biodiversity because it is within a transitional zone among Cerrado, Amazon rainforests, and Caatinga that is characterized by small, thorny trees.</p> <p>but human activities such as agricultural development and livestock farming are giving pressures on natural ecosystems in the region. Under such situation, the Federal Government of Brazil (GOB) has designated three conservation units including the Serra Geral do Tocantins Ecological Station (EESGT) and the Nascentes do Rio Parnaíba National Park (PNNRP) in order to protect the nature in the Jalapão region. Bahia and Tocantins state governments also have set up four state conservation units in the region.¹</p> <p>The effectiveness of conservation can be enhanced by connecting these conservation units with ecological corridors and managing these units in a strategic and coordinated manner. As such, it is important to coordinate related governmental organizations at the federal, state and municipal level, as well as NGOs and citizen groups, but ICMBio, the federal organization that is expected to play a leading role in the coordination for conservation, requires organizational or individual capacity development to implement it.</p> <p>To address such issues, the GOB requested a technical cooperation project to the Government of Japan (GOJ) for strengthening ICMBio's capacity to assume the coordination role towards the establishment of regional conservation mechanism in Jalapão.</p> <p>In response to the request, JICA dispatched a detailed planning survey in November 2008, and the R/D for the Project was signed in November 2009 following the discussions with Brazilian authorities concerned. Jalapão Region Ecological Corridor Project (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”) started in April 2010 with 3-year cooperation period.</p>	
<p>1.2 Project Overview</p> <p>1) Overall Goal The ecosystem conservation in the Jalapão region is enhanced through the introduction of the Ecological Corridor.</p> <p>2) Project Purpose The institutional capacity of ICMBio is strengthened to introduce and implement Ecological Corridor in the Jalapão region.</p> <p>3) Outputs</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Information necessary for JREC management, including the Conservation Units buffer zones, is collected, analyzed and organized. 2. Institutional arrangements for the JREC management are structured. 3. Capacity development of personnel from ICMBio and other institutions, focused on implementation needs of the JREC, are conducted. 4. The linkage between local populations and institutions concerned with JREC conservation is strengthened. 5. The strategic plan/guideline for introducing and managing JREC is developed. <p>4) Inputs</p> <p>(Japanese Side)</p> <p>Dispatch of Expert: 7 experts (52 MM) in April 2010 - April 2013 (52 MM includes those planned during the period after this evaluation study)</p> <p>Counterpart training in Japan: 3 ICMBio staffs in June 2011 (3 more staffs planned in November 2012)</p> <p>Provision of Equipment: GIS data server, GIS software, Software for Remote Sensing, 2 vehicles</p> <p>Local Cost: 77.2 million Japanese Yen (It covered the expenses for hiring local staffs and local consultants, printed materials, meeting and W/S)</p> <p>(Brazilian Side)</p>	

¹ They are Jalapão Environmental Protected Area (APA), State Park of Jalapão, Rio Preto Environmental Protected Area, and Rio Preto Ecological Park.

<p>Counterpart: ICMBio Brasilia HQ (Project Director, Project Manager and 2 more staffs), EESGT office (4 staffs) and PNNRP office (2 staffs), totaling 10. Also as the state level counterparts² in the Tocantins State, staffs from the Secretariat of Environment and Sustainable Development (SEMADES), Secretariat of Planning and Public Management Modernization (SEPLAN), and Nature Institute of Tocantins (NATURATINS) have been involved in the Project.</p>		
<p>5) Target Area The Jalapão region, i.e. connecting area between EESGT and PNNRP</p>		
<p>2 Evaluation Team</p>		
<p>Member of the Evaluation Team</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mr. Ichiro Sato (Japanese Team Leader) Senior Representative, JICA Brazil Office 2. Mr. Kazuaki Komazawa (Project Evaluation) Project Coordinator, JICA Brazil Office 3. Mr. Hiroyuki Okuda (Evaluation and Analysis) Tekizaitekisho LLC 4. Ms. Ilze Maeda (Interpreter) 5. Mr. Fernando Antonio Rodrigues Lima (Project Evaluation) Department of Protected Area, Ministry of Environment (MMA) 6. Mr. Frederico Dimas de Paiva (Project Evaluation) Coordination of Received Bilateral Cooperation, Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC) 	
<p>Evaluation Period</p>	<p>14 October 2012~3 November 2012</p>	<p>Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation</p>
<p>3 Project Performance</p>		
<p>3.1 Project Progress</p>		
<p>(1) Output 1 : Achieved (there are four indicators set for Output 1 and the Project has achieved all the indicators)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Web-GIS system developed by the Project for the Jalapão region was originally set up in ICMBio's computer network, then later transferred to the SEPLAN network for its effective utilization for the conservation and management of the Jalapão region. At present, SEPLAN's homepage is being modified to become the portal to the Web-GIS. (Indicator 1.1) http://corredorjalapao.seplan.to.gov.br/jalapao/ • The project homepage was created in ICMBio website and has been constantly updated with the addition of new information, news-release and publications/maps for downloads. (related to Indicator 1.2) http://www.icmbio.gov.br/projetojalapao/ • Many kinds and types of information/promotion materials were developed and distributed, e.g. project brochures, ATLAS of Jalapão, banners and panels for the introduction of the Project, an environmental education book, and an educational video. (related to Indicator 1.3 and 1.4) 		
<p>(2) Output 2 : Achieved (there are two indicators set for Output 2, and the Project has already achieved these two indicators as of the terminal evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Reciprocity Term No.06/2011 on the introduction and implementation of Jalapão Ecological Corridor was signed on 29 September 2011 by the President of ICMBio, the Secretary of MMA, the Secretary of SEMADES, the President of NATURATINS, the Secretary of SEPLAN and the Governor of the State of Tocantins. (related to Indicator 2.1) • Based on the Reciprocity Term, the coordination committee has gathered 4 times from November 2011 through August 2012. (related to Indicator 2.2) • Furthermore, the Project has advanced to the creation of the "Jalapão Mosaic"³ - agreement on the Mosaic participation was signed by the authorities of nine protected areas (federal, state, municipal, and private protected areas) located in the Jalapão region by August 2012, and a proposal to establish the "Jalapão Mosaic" was submitted to MMA in September 2012 for its recognition by a ministerial ordinance. 		
<p>(3) Output 3 : Achieved (there are two indicators set for Output 3, and the Project has already achieved these two indicators as of the terminal evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainings for counterparts have been conducted on such areas as GPS/GIS, Private Reserve of Natural Heritage (RPPN), prevention/control of forest fire, participatory biodiversity conservation and municipal Natural Monument 		

² Despite the fact that only ICMBio is an official counterpart defined in the R /D above, staffs of Tocantins State Relations Department are positioned as "state counterparts" since they play an important role and will continue to implement the Project.

³ As a result of the clarifications of the concepts and definitions of "ecological corridor" and "mosaic" through the implementation of the Project and considering the definitions of terminology used in Brazil, it was determined that the concept of the term "JREC" in the PDM should be described as "Jalapão Mosaic", which is a mechanism of integrated and participatory management of protected areas. Therefore, the term, "Jalapão Mosaic", is used in this document with the same meaning as the term, "JREC"

<p>(MONA), totaling 20 times as of the terminal evaluation, including the training in Japan. (related to Indicator 3.1)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four open seminars were held. (related to Indicator 3.2) <p>(4) Output 4 : Achieved (There are two indicators set for Output 4, and the Project has already achieved these two indicators as of the terminal evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The municipal councils for the environment and tourism have been constituted and begun operation in the 4 target municipalities - Ponte Alta, Rio da Conceição, São Félix and Mateiros - along with the creation of the necessary legislation assisted by the Project: Municipal Council for Tourism and the Environment (COMTURMA) in São Félix and Municipal Council for the Environment and Tourism (COMATUR) in the other 3 municipalities. (related to Indicator 4.2) • Training programs have been carried out in 2011 for the capacity development of the COMATUR/COMTURMA on planning/implementation, organizational management, and the utilization of ICMS Ecológico⁴. Also, the training program for school teachers about environmental education (ASAS) has been carried out in cooperation with Lutheran University of Brazil. (related to Indicator 4.1) • Commitment Terms on the use of ICMS Ecológico were officially signed by mayors and representatives of COMATUR/COMTURMA at four municipalities in October 2012. • MONA was established in São Félix along Soninho River on 2 July 2012 by the signing by the mayor of São Félix of the municipal decree No 034/2012 based on the Municipal System of Conservation Units (SMUC). This became the first municipal protected area in the State of Tocantins. • Furthermore, the Council of EESGT was officially registered (approved) by ICMBio's institutional ordinance No. 45/2012 in April 2012. <p>(5) Output 5 : Almost achieved (there is one indicator set for Output 5, and the Project has almost achieved the indicator)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The development of the Strategic Plan⁵ for the “Jalapão Mosaic” will be completed by the end of The Project. (related to Indicator 5.1)

3.2 Achievements of Project Purpose

The Project Purpose was almost achieved (there are two indicators set for the Project Purpose, and the Project has almost achieved the first indicator, and has achieved the second indicator as of the terminal evaluation)

- The Strategic Plan for “Jalapão Mosaic” is currently under finalizing process, thus the consensus is being built. (related to Project Purpose Indicator 1)
- The biodiversity conservation mechanism, which was defined by the Project to consist of the integration/cooperation framework among federal and state institutions, directions of conservation efforts to be shared among concerned actors, and instruments which enable communities to participate in conservation, has been developed. (related to Project Purpose Indicator 2)

3.3 Progress toward Overall Goal

- The implementation of the Strategic Plan for the “Jalapão Mosaic” will start once the Council of the “Jalapão Mosaic” is established and the Strategic Plan is approved.
- The mechanism to promote biodiversity conservation established by the Project is expected to contribute to the enhancement of the ecosystem conservation of the Jalapão region.

4 Review Based on the 5 Criteria

4.1 Relevance

The relevance of the Project is high.

- 1) The policy importance of conserving the Cerrado, in particular the Jalapão region, remains unchanged for MMA and ICMBio since the beginning of the Project. The Jalapão region continues to be one of the priority conservation areas of ICMBio and MMA. Therefore, the Project is aligned with the related Brazilian policies.
- 2) Both ICMBio and state organizations related to Jalapão region recognize the need for establishing an effective mechanism to facilitate concerted efforts to conserve the Jalapão region among all the conservation units in the region. The municipalities were motivated to conserve nature and subsequently promote tourism. Therefore, the Project fulfills such development needs of the stakeholders at the federal, state and municipal level.

⁴ ICMS Ecológico is a revenue sharing scheme, designed to promote the conservation and management of protected areas. The financial source of this scheme is a state tax, ICMS (Merchandise and Service Circulation Tax).

⁵ Strategic Plan is a document defined by Chapter III of the Decree No. 4.340 of 22 August 2002 that regulates National System of Conservation Units: SNUC (federal law of No. 9985 of 18 July 2000) and sets the guidelines/actions to harmonize, integrate and optimize the management of the “mosaic” of protected areas.

3) Japan's ODA Rolling Plan for Brazil dated June 2011 gives a priority to the environmental conservation, recognizing the fact that Brazil's valuable flora & fauna, including those in the Cerrado, are threatened by development activities. In the Rolling Plan, the Project is included in the Climate Change Program under the priority area of environmental conservation. Therefore, the Project is relevant in terms of the Japanese ODA policies for Brazil.

4.2 Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the Project is high.

- 1) The Project has already delivered most of its Outputs as summarized in the "3.1 Project Progress" above. These Outputs are essential components for the mechanism to promote Jalapão's biodiversity conservation and the Project is designed effectively to achieve its Purpose by delivering these Outputs. This means the Project has achieved the Project Purpose Indicator 2.
- 2) On the other hand, as to the Project Purpose Indicator 1, the proposal to create "Jalapão Mosaic" is expected to be recognized by MMA.
- 3) With the reasons above, the Project is expected to attain the Project Purpose by the end of project period. It is emphasized by ICMBio that all the results of the Project are of great value to the management of conservation of the Jalapão region.

4.3 Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is high.

- 1) The initial PDM was revised on 5 May 2011. Activities have since been implemented according to the revised PDM and PO, and there has since been no notable delay of the implementation. The PDM is fully understood by the counterparts.
- 2) Inputs from Japanese side (i.e. expert team, provision of equipment, and training in Japan) are properly used for project activities and are highly appreciated by the Brazilian side. Portuguese speaking Japanese experts have certainly contributed to a better communication with Brazilian counterparts and, in particular, with local stakeholders.
- 3) The periodical and daily communication between the Japanese experts and counterparts are very good: four JCC meetings were held to date and there have been many periodical counterpart meetings held about every four months.

4.4 Impact

The impact of the Project to date is high.

- 1) It is widely indicated that the establishment and continuation of the conservation mechanism developed by the Project, including the "Jalapão Mosaic", will lead to the enhanced ecosystem conservation in the Jalapão region, thus having a good potential to achieve the Overall Goal within 5 years after the Project comes to an end.
- 2) The current cooperation period will not allow the Project to capacitate the Mosaic Council members to become capable of implementing the Strategic Plan, and undertake some actions in accordance with the Strategic Plan, which provides feedback for improvement of the mechanism and the Strategic Plan of "Jalapão Mosaic".
- 3) There are some effects produced outside of PDM activities. For example, EESGT/ICMBio and Lutheran University of Brazil (CEULP/ULBRA) signed a memorandum of three-year cooperation to promote environmental education in April 2011. Activities of ASAS had significant benefits by the input from CEULP, which was based on this memorandum.
- 4) To ensure the sustainability of some outputs/activities of the Project, ICMBio has decided to utilize German Agency for International Cooperation (GIZ)'s technical cooperation "Prevention, control and monitoring of forest fires and illegal burning in the Cerrado" (2012 – 2015) which is implemented in the Jalapão region.
- 5) MMA is promoting the establishment of "mosaics" for biodiversity conservation, and regarding the proposal for creating the "Jalapão Mosaic" as a good model example that can be applied for other 13 existing mosaics as well as new mosaics to be established in the future in the country.

4.5 Sustainability

The prospect of sustainability of the Project is medium at present.

- 1) From institutional viewpoint, the prospect of sustainability is high, for the integrated conservation mechanism established by the Project is based on legislation and formal agreements between related organizations. In the four municipalities, the Commitment Terms on use of ICMS Ecológico were also signed between the mayor and the COMATUR/COMTURMA. That gives significant motivation and incentives for the activities by COMATUR/COMTURMA. Most importantly for the sustainability of the Project, the official establishment of "Jalapão Mosaic" is expected by the end of the Project.
- 2) The development of technical management capacity of the "Jalapão Mosaic" to implement the Strategic Plan (Output 2 and 5) may require more time for training, and actual operational practices and experiences to ensure its sustainability. Likewise, COMATUR/COMTURMA also requires more time to accumulate actual operational practices and experiences to ensure its sustainability.
- 3) From human resource point of view, there are concerns about the sustainability considering future possible transfer and change of staffs of federal/state governments as well as of municipalities. The Project can deal with this issue in part by producing documents, such as technical manuals, training texts, and handover procedures.
- 4) Financial capacity to sustain the effects and benefits of the Project is regarded as a challenge. The Jalapão Mosaic will involve people from municipalities, civil societies, NGOs and the private sector, whose travel expenses to attend

the council meetings are not always covered by federal/state government budgets. As such, it is important to prepare a financial plan to minimize costs and help to sustain the management and activities of the “Jalapão Mosaic”.

4.6 Factors that have promoted or hindered the implementation of project

(1) Promoting factors

Japanese experts, through their frequent visits to Palmas, have ensured the coordination and cooperation between ICMBio and the state counterparts in project implementation, which is recognized by ICMBio as a significant promoting factor for smooth and effective project execution.

(2) Hindering factors

In the target 4 municipalities, along with the election of mayors in 2012, member of municipal environmental council changed and some staffs of municipalities in charge of the environment were transferred. The Project had to do the training over again, and this interruption of continuity was pointed out as a hindering factor for project efficiency.

5 Results of the Terminal Evaluation

5.1 Conclusion

The relevance of the Project is high as the ecosystem conservation of the Jalapão region is aligned with the policies of Brazil’s Ministry of Environment and ICMBio, not to mention its global importance as a hotspot of biodiversity. The effectiveness of the Project is high as the Project is properly constructed and is making a good progress towards achieving its Purpose by the end of project duration. The efficiency of the Project is also high due to the efforts of both Japanese and Brazilian teams and effective communication and smooth cooperation among all participating organizations. The impact of the Project is high due to the various expected and unexpected positive effects of the Project. The prospect of sustainability is medium at present because there are some concerns about the sustainability from technical, human resource, and financial viewpoints. The Team recommends the extension of the project cooperation period to reinforce the Project in terms of “Impact” and “Sustainability”.

5.2 Recommendations

1) Extension of the project cooperation period

Although the Project is considered to attain the Project Purpose by the end of the current cooperation period, the evaluation results from the aspects of “Impact” and “Sustainability” suggest that the Project needs further efforts (1) to consolidate the institutional capacity of “Jalapão Mosaic” through the capacity development of mosaic council members and implementation of priority actions of the Strategic Plan, including the support for local negotiations towards the creation of a new strictly protected area in Bahia State, in order to facilitate the achievement of the Overall Goal, and (2) to strengthen the capacity of the Jalapão Mosaic Council and COMATUR/COMTURMA to enhance sustainability of the Project. Therefore, the Team recommends the extension of the project cooperation period to reinforce the Project in terms of “Impact” and “Sustainability”.

2) Leadership of ICMBio to operationalize “Jalapão Mosaic”

Regardless of the extension of the Project, the Team recommends that, once “Jalapão Mosaic” is officially established, ICMBio should play a leading role to coordinate the related organizations for implementation of the activities under “Jalapão Mosaic”. Particularly, municipalities in Jalapão Region absolutely require assistance to undertake conservation activities and, hence, ICMBio should extend necessary assistance to such municipalities through the mechanism of “Jalapão Mosaic”.

5.3 Lessons Learnt

1) Counterparts indicate that the project activities are fully aligned with their own roles and responsibilities in their organizations, thus being able to undertake them as a part of their daily duties. This apparently contributes to a high effectiveness and efficiency of the Project implementation.

2) The revised PDM is well constructed for the Project with achievable and realistic goal, outputs and number/selection of target municipalities for three years of the cooperation period. It is important to prepare a good and realistic PDM for the Project to be successful.

3) The Project was managed in a flexible and timely manner (e.g. revision of PDM, change of work schedules, and quick decision-making), which can be attributed to the significant decision making power of the Project Manager and the management of the Project by the JICA overseas office that is well aware of the local situations in the field and conversant with related organizations.

4) The Project has invested a lot of time and efforts in the interlocution with local partners and stakeholders, which contributed to the smooth implementation of the Project. The Project could have been even more efficiently implemented if such interlocution efforts had been made in the planning stage of the Project.