

評価調査結果要約表（英文）

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Indonesia	Project title: Sulawesi Capacity Development Project
Issue/Sector: Poverty Reduction / Regional Development	Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge: Indonesia Office Supporting Department: Industrial Development and Public Policy Department	Total cost (as of evaluation): JPY 690 Million
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Ministry of Home Affairs (MoHA, Center for Management of Overseas Cooperation), BAPPENAS (Directorate of Regional Development), and Six provincial BAPPEDAs in Sulawesi
Period of Cooperation (R/D signed on 7 August, 2007) (Original): 16 September, 2007- 15 September, 2010 (Extended): 16 September, 2010 – 15 September, 2012	Supporting Organization in Japan: Nihon Fukushi University
	Related Cooperation: Northeastern Indonesia Regional Development Program
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>Since 1999, Indonesian political system has been decentralized. Enactment of Law No. 25 and No. 32 of 2004 regarding development planning system and regional autonomy respectively indicates that national development planning should be implemented by central, provincial and district/city governments based on the roles and functions as prescribed in the aforesaid laws.</p> <p>Under such circumstances, the role as coordinator and intermediate policy channel in a new bottom-up policy process to district/city governments while maintaining consistency with national development plan is required for provincial governments. For district/city governments, on the other hand, the role to execute bottom-up regional development planning and implementation reflecting communities' needs is required.</p> <p>Thus, six provincial governments of Sulawesi requested a Technical Cooperation Project which promotes regional development based on local governments' initiatives. In response to this request, Sulawesi Capacity Development Project (hereinafter referred to as CDP) which aims to establish collaboration mechanisms among the stakeholders of regional development in six provinces in Sulawesi has been implemented from September 2007, for three-years duration.</p> <p>Since its commencement, the project has been working in the capacity development of stakeholders, who are the provincial and district level of regional development officials, through conducting training relating to participatory development, subsequent practice (pilot activities) and experience sharing. Then, at the terminal evaluation survey conducted in July 2010, the extension of the cooperation period has been proposed based on the following reasons: ① it takes additional time to achieve the project goals, ② it is necessary to organize the human resources to take over the technical assistance this project has been provided, ③ it is necessary to prepare for spreading-out the project activities to areas other than Sulawesi, on request from Indonesian side. In response to this, project period is extended for two years until September 2012.</p> <p>Related Technical Cooperation Projects are as follows: Empowerment of the Poor in South Sulawesi to Support Poverty Alleviation Program (1997-2002), Regional Development Policies for Local Government (2001-2005), Project for Human Resource Development for Local Government (HRDLG) (2002-2007);</p>	

Community Empowerment Program with Civil Society (PKPM) (2004-2006).

1-2 Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

Regional developments in Sulawesi with local initiative under the collaboration of stakeholders are promoted.

(2) Project Purpose

The capacity of stakeholders for regional development in Sulawesi is strengthened and the mechanisms of collaboration among stakeholders are developed.

(3) Outputs

Output-1: The planning capacity of stakeholders for regional development is enhanced through their understanding of its process of planning and implementation.

Output-2: The management capacity of stakeholders for regional development is developed through experience of pilot activities.

Output-3: Function of Provincial Implementation Committee (PIC) to share experiences in each province is strengthened and sharing information among 6 provinces and in other regions is promoted.

Output-4: Measures for enhancing sustainability and replicability of the CDP approach are identified.

(4) Inputs (as of evaluation)

Japanese side

Long-term Expert	4 persons	Short-term Expert	7 persons
Trainees received	59 persons	Local cost	JPY 174 Million
Equipment	6 vehicles	Total amount	JPY 690 Million

Indonesian side

Counterpart	24 persons	Equipment	-
Office Facilities	1 office/province, 6 offices in total		
Local cost	IDR 13,655,475,925		

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Japanese Evaluation Team	Team Leader	TADA Tomoyuki	Senior Representative JICA Indonesia Office
	Participatory Development / Regional Development	TSUNODA Manabu	Senior Advisor JICA Headquarter
	Regional Development	INABA Makoto	Senior Advisor JICA Headquarter
	Cooperation Planning 1	YAKUSHI Hiroyuki	Deputy Director Industrial Development and Public Policy Department JICA Headquarter

	Cooperation Planning 2	ENOKI Tomoko	Project Formulation Advisor JICA Indonesia Office
	Evaluation Analysis	SAWASHITA Rie	Oriental Consultants co., ltd.
Indonesia Authorities Concerned	Ir. Gunawan, MA	Head of the Center for Management of Overseas Cooperation of the Secretariat General, Ministry of Home Affairs (MoHA)	
	Anang Handoyo, S. Kom	Staff, Division of Interstate Cooperation, Center for Administration of Overseas Cooperation, MoHA	
	Ivan Rangkuti	Head of Division of Proper Technology Usage, Directorate General for Community and Village Empowerment, MoHA	
	Farida Kurnianingrung	Head of Sub-Division of Proper Technology Usage, Directorate General for Community and Village Empowerment, MoHA	
	Arief Setyabudhi	Consultant of Division of Proper Technology Usage, Directorate General for Community and Village Empowerment, MoHA	
	DR. Royadi, SH, MM	Head of Sub-Division of Development Planning for IV Region (Sulawesi), Directorate for Regional Development Planning, MoHA	
	Lie Sinfu	Head of Sub-Division of Foreign Cooperation, Education and Training Agency, MoHA	
	Ester Vinny Ella Marpaung	Staff of Sub-Division of Foreign Cooperation, Education and Training Agency, MoHA	
Period of Evaluation	From June 10 to June 30, 2012	Type of Evaluation: Terminal	
3. Results of Evaluation			
3-1 Progress of the Project			
(1) Achievement of the Project Purpose			
For the following reasons, the project purpose is considered to be achieved.			
It is observed that seven districts/cities developed the collaboration mechanisms as of evaluation in June 2012 (cf. target in PDM: six districts/cities). Two districts: Takalar district and Wakatobi district which were in the process of the institutionalization as of June 2010, have instituted the Regent Decree in February 2011 and February 2012 respectively. While referring to these two districts' cases, other five districts/cities have launched a process of institutionalization in the past two years and been reviewing and updating drafted Regent Decrees.			
(2) Achievement of the Outputs			
1) Output-1 (3-layred trainings)			
From September 2010, the Project conducted a supplemental seminar for the policy makers and two supplemental trainings for planners in the targeted eighteen districts/cities where had not			

started activities on their initiatives. The original module for the planner's trainings has been revised to make it more practical and set it as a supplemental one. Most of the participants of the supplemental trainings were selected to those of the chiefs and unit heads of regional BAPPEDAs. These attempts led at least seven districts/cities, namely Mamuju district, North Mamuju district, North Buton district, South Konawe district, North Konawe district, Polewali Mandar District and Baubau city, to take initiatives on development of collaboration mechanisms. In addition, the training of trainers (ToT) for Community Facilitators (CFs) were conducted two times during the extension of the project period and 45 trainers were newly turned out (cf. before the extension: 13 trainers turned out, total: 58 trainers, target in PDM: 42 trainers).

2) Output-2 (Practice/Pilot Activities)

Through the two year's extension of the project period, up to May 2012, pilot activities were conducted with 3,822 participants, training and workshop programs were convened with 2,500 participants, and 34 organizations were established or strengthened (cf. before the extension: 593 participants for pilot activities, 1,268 for trainings/workshops and 20 organizations were established/strengthened).

Based on the project principles, i.e. the Japanese side shall not provide any monetary support for implementation of pilot activities, these pilot activities were implemented with the budget of local government and the resources contributed by local people. It is observed that taking advantage of human resources trained through the 3-layered trainings, the progress of the pilot activities were made at an accelerated pace, and the management capacity of stakeholders for regional development was developed.

3) Output-3 (Sharing experiences)

Since good practices are effective references to enhance capacity among stakeholders in regional development, additional 7 cases to 6 cases as of August 2010 have been analyzed and presented in the Project with an activation of pilot activities. In order to share and utilize information and resources, the "capacity development module" (CD module) are going to be completed by July 2012. As a number of good practices referred for regional development activities increased and the methods to share experiences are diversified, functions of stakeholders to share experiences are strengthened and sharing experiences are stimulated during these two years of extension period.

4) Output-4 (Sustainability and Replicability)

According to the strategies for the sustainability and replicability of the CDP approach, four provinces (North Sulawesi, Central Sulawesi, South East Sulawesi and West Sulawesi) out of six have established, or are in under approval process of, the subsequent organizations to the Provincial Implementation Committees: PICs and the other two provinces (Gorontalo and South Sulawesi) are under consideration of having such organizations. Furthermore, as to strengthen promoting CDP approach, Indonesian human resources who were qualified by the Project have established an organization called "COMMIT" (Community Initiative for Transformation, Center for Training Consulting and Publishing) in May 2012, which has 73 registered members including master facilitators and resource persons who have been trained under the Project. It was also observed that trainings developed by the Project have been utilized in different occasion outside of the target area of the Project with the appreciation of the concept of the CDP approach, and distribution of each component of the CD module to government organizations and any other individuals/entities has started.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

For the following reasons, the relevance of the Project is considered to be very high.

In Indonesia, since the revised Local Autonomy Law No. 32 and the National Development Planning Law No. 25 were enacted in 2004, the decentralized system has been promoted. These laws stipulate local government's initiatives, participatory and bottom-up approach as the requirements of planning process for regional development. Thus, the approach by the Project is corresponding to the development policy of Indonesia.

Furthermore, Japan's Country Assistance Strategy (CAS), revised in April 2012, states "redress of imbalanced development" as one of three main pillars for cooperation to Indonesia. East Indonesia is recognized as one of the disadvantaged regions, and Sulawesi is expected to be an engine of development for the area. In this context, it can be determined that the approach by the Project is corresponding to the CAS.

(2) Effectiveness

For the following reasons, the effectiveness of the Project is considered to be high.

1) Achievement

It can be determined that the project purpose, which aims at "strengthening the capacity of stakeholders for regional development in Sulawesi, and developing the mechanisms of collaboration among stakeholders in at least six districts/cities", is achieved since seven districts/cities have developed/ been developing mechanisms of collaboration among stakeholders.

2) Approach/Method to achieve the Project Purpose

- Revision of contents of training for planners, from conceptual to practical
- Reconfiguration of duration of trainings for Community Facilitators (CFs) and for planners (shorten)
- Re-examination of selection criteria on the participants for the planners training and the policy maker seminar
- Increase the number of Master Facilitator (MF. Trainers for CF training) through Training of Trainers (ToT)
- Utilize human resources and its networks trained through the original project period
- Sharing good practices

3) Utilization possibility and Replicability of the CDP approach

It was observed that there were several cases utilizing the CDP approach, that indicates high utilization possibility and replicability of the approach. The examples were; (1) village development programs in West Sulawesi and Central Sulawesi adopted the CDP approach and (2) capacity development for the extension workers initiated by provincial government in Gorontalo, Southeast Sulawesi and South Konawe with use of trainings developed by the Project.

(3) Efficiency

For the following reasons, the efficiency of the Project is considered to be high.

1) Achievement degree of the outputs

All outputs (from 1 to 4) have been achieved (see 3-1 (2) Achievement of the Outputs).

2) Causal connection between inputs and achievements

- The Project has utilized rich assets of JICA's previous regional development projects in Sulawesi. This led the Project having minimum input towards the needy stakeholders.
- With the principal for creating ownership in both communities and local governments, the Project emphasized utilization of local resources.

(4) Impact

For the following reasons, the impact of the Project is considered to be very high.

1) Promotion of dissemination of the CDP approach

It was observed that the Project conducted several activities as follows in order to promote dissemination of the CDP approach; (i) training for planners at the Training center of MoHA, (ii) trainings and workshops for RISE project (Rural Settlement Infrastructure and Kabupaten Strategic Areas Development. Yen Loan) , South-South cooperation and the third country training cooperation, (iii) increasing interests in the CDP approach from NGOs and private sector and (iv) delivering lectures in a postgraduate school.

2) Projection of the achievement degree of the Overall Goals

13 regional development programs were identified both in provincial and district level which accommodated the CDP approach (provincial level: 6 programs; 4 started and 2 planned, district level: 7 programs). It is observed that these 13 programs aim at bringing in (i) human resource development through the CDP approach or (ii) establishment of coordinating organizations to promote the CDP approach (ex. village development program in Gorontalo province, community development program in Central Sulawesi province, community development program – Bartheramas in South-east Sulawesi province, community development program – Bangun Mandar in West Sulawesi province, etc). It is expected that precursory programs will serve to stimulate other programs and a number of regional programs adopting the CDP approach will increase. Thus, when subsequent organizations of PICs are fully established and collaborative relationships among organizations concerned will be continued and strengthened, the overall goal can be expected to be achieved.

3) Expansion of opportunities for the central government to be involved in the CDP approach

It was observed that the Project has come proactively to set up opportunities for MoHA to be involved in the Project in order to strengthen a tie between the central government and the Project so that being possible to explore ways of broader spread of project achievement. Thus, the central government had opportunity to understand and grasp the current state of regional development of the districts / cities, the needs and changes in the community.

(5) Sustainability

From the comprehensive points of view as shown below, the sustainability of the Project is considered to be high.

1) Strategies for sustainability and replicability of six provinces in Sulawesi

Facing the end of the project in September 2012, since the beginning of 2011, six provincial governments have discussed and developed strategies for sustainability and replicability of the CDP approach. Establishment of the subsequent organizations of the PICs, and utilization and enhancement of trainings' alumni are parts of these strategies.

2) Subsequent organizations of the PICs

The entities to take over the PICs' roles and functions at the end of the project period have been established or are under process of establishment in each province. In addition to that, it is planned in Southeast Sulawesi and West Sulawesi that the roles and functions to be taken over from the PIC are added to the corresponded departments' duty/job descriptions in the provincial BAPPEDAs with provincial formal approvals in order to ensure the sustainability of roles and functions across the entire organization.

3) Proactive operation using local governments' own budget

As 17 districts/cities have allocated their own budget for the activities of the Project and other 7 districts/cities have indicated their intention to do so. Compared with that of at the previous terminal evaluation in July 2010, it is found that the CDP approach seems to have steadily taken root in Sulawesi.

4) CD module as dissemination and replication tools

In order to disseminate and replicate the CDP approach, the CD module which consists of 21 items such as textbook on institutionalization of the collaboration mechanism, module of planners training management based upon community and collaboration mechanism, module of CF training and documentary films has been developed. Distribution of publications/media of the CD module through MoHA, BAPPENAS, regional governments, regional BAPPEDAs, communities, PICs and any other individual and entities such as BaKTI was observed.

5) COMMIT as the resource bank of the Project

Based on the recommendation at the previous terminal evaluation, the COMMIT was consensually established through the consideration of institutional, organizational, financial, technical possibilities and feasibilities to play a core role in providing trainings and consultation services on the CDP approach. It can be said that the foundation to provide proposed services on the CDP approach has been built.

3-3 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to planning

- 1) It was observed that the outcome and human resources network in Sulawesi Island created by programs/projects under the JICA had already pervaded to some extent. Thus, in the Project, additional small-scale capacity development was enough to establish governmental implementation structure.
- 2) It was observed that the ownership of Indonesian side had been encouraged through activities such as establishment of the collaboration mechanisms. In addition, the process of institutionalization of collaboration mechanism was accorded with the conventional process of making decisions. Therefore, the Indonesian side could proactively be involved in the Project implementation based on the existing processes.
- 3) It was observed that the pilot activities prompted utilization of resources in Indonesia.

(2) Factors concerning to implementation process

- 1) The Project team structured the three-layered system for human resource development consists of policy makers, planners and CFs, and firstly started promoting policy makers' understandings of the Project concept. Owing to this strategic approach, Heads of BAPPEDAs' understandings of

the Project were followed by the human resources developments, organizational developments and institutionalizations.

- 2) Utilization of assets – personal network of JICA's previous regional development projects contributed to promotion of understanding of the Project concept and effective implementation.

3-4 Factors that impeded realization of effects

It is considered that frequent personal shifting had influences on deeper understanding of the Project and realization of effects at the implementation process.

3-5 Conclusions

As the Project has been consistent with the development policy of Indonesia on decentralization and regional development throughout project period, relevance of the Project is very high. Effectiveness of the Project is also high as the activities implemented during extension period such as the 3-layer trainings, development of the CD module, organization of the resource bank (COMMIT) and establishment of the successor agencies of PICs contributed to achievement of the project goal. Efficiency of the Project is high as inputs contributed properly with rich assets of JICA's related project in the past in Sulawesi. Also, it is confirmed that some provinces have plan to take the concept of collaboration mechanism into their regional development program, thus possibility of achievement to the overall goal is high if such initiative by the provinces is sustained. Moreover, as the result of appreciation of the CDP approach from outside Sulawesi region, impact of the Project has been spread to central government and other regions' program and even to other countries. Sustainability of the Project is high as maintaining structure of promoting collaboration mechanism within provinces has been arranged such as subsequent body of PICs and the resource bank.

To conclude, the project purpose is effectively achieved with appropriate activities during the extension period. The Study team has found great appreciation of the CDP approach by Indonesian side as a mean of creation of people's ownership and functionalization of meaningful decentralized structure in Indonesia. With the strong initiatives of Indonesian stakeholders to promote the concept of the CDP approach, it is highly expected that the asset of the Project contributes to mid-long-term regional development of Indonesia and creation of trustworthy relationship between the community and local governments.

3-6 Recommendations

- 1) It is necessary to promote constitutive functionalization of subsequent organizations to PICs. Especially in South Sulawesi province and Gorontalo province, where there is no such organization established yet, prompt measures are expected.
- 2) It is effective to hold information and experience sharing opportunities among above mentioned organizations of each province at regular bases. It is also effective to give an adequate follow-up support by JICA to the above activities for maintaining and improving the results of the Project.
- 3) It is significant to have monitoring structure of district level activities in each province in order to grasp the progress and share good practices to other districts. Result of such monitoring should be shared with all of the districts.
- 4) It is essential that each province keeps partnership with COMMIT for taking role of the project officers after completion of the Project to promote of collaboration mechanism. It is also significant that each provincial government maintains necessary working environment (e.g. transportation, office room etc.) for COMMIT to enable them to provide the same quality of work in each province.

- 5) JICA is recommended to utilize this CDP approach for the future regional and social development projects not only in Indonesia but also other countries. Besides, as many international donors, NGOs and universities show the strong interest in this approach, the CDP approach should be academically studied and disseminate widely.

3-7 Lessons learned

- 1) It is important to proactively utilize the assets of past cooperation such as methodologies of regional development and human resources networks.
- 2) The local governments' utilization of external human resources that have been accumulated in the past cooperation by Japanese government was proved to be an effective option in order to accelerate the realization of seeds of outcomes in an early stage of the Project.
- 3) Heads of targeted provinces as well as district BAPPEDAs were recognized as the strategic partners and most of them were actively involved in the process. It led the outcomes of the Project not in isolated but positioned in the existing institutional systems in Indonesia.