

## 評価結果要約表（英文）

| 1. Outline of the Project   |   |   |
|---|---|---|
| Country: The People's Republic of China   |   | Project title:<br>Project for Human Resource Development of Rehabilitation in the Central and Western Region in China   |
| Sector: Support for Persons with Disabilities   |   | Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project   |
| Department in-charge:<br>Human Development Department   |   | Project cost :<br>(as of Nov. 19, 2012) 390 million yen   |
| Period of Cooperation   | R/D: Apr.21, 2008<br>Five years from Apr.1, 2008 to Mar. 31, 2013 | Implementing organization in the partner country: China Disabled Persons' Federation, China Rehabilitation Research Centre(CRRC), Shaanxi Disabled Persons' Federation, Chongqing Disabled Persons' Federation and Guangxi Disabled Persons' Federation |
|   |   | Supporting organization in Japan:<br>National Rehabilitation Center for Persons with Disabilities, International University of Health and Welfare, Japanese Physical Therapy Association and Japanese Association of Occupational Therapists            |
| <b>1-1. Background and summary of the Project</b><br>In the People's Republic of China (hereinafter simply referred to as "China"), the number of disabled people is said to have rapidly increased to some 80 million due to structural changes of diseases and injuries, in turn caused by economic development and the progressively aging society. According to a WHO forecast, the population of elderly in China will reach 250 million by 2020, suggesting a massive increase of the rehabilitation need. In the face of such need, the Government of China introduced in 2002 the strategic target of "providing a universal rehabilitation service by 2015" and has since been earnestly expanding the rehabilitation service nationwide, including the establishment of local rehabilitation centres. However, the number of workers engaged in the rehabilitation service is small and significantly falls short of meeting the actual need. As such, the development of manpower for the rehabilitation service has become an important challenge for China.<br><br>Japan has been providing assistance for China in this field for more than 20 years, achieving some tangible results. The construction of the China Rehabilitation Research Centre (CRRC) with grant aid in the 1980's was followed by two technical cooperation projects. As a result, a system has been developed which allows the disabled, particularly those in Beijing, to have access to an appropriate rehabilitation service.<br><br>Meanwhile, there is still a large gap between the centre and local areas in terms of both the quantity and quality of the human resources of the rehabilitation service. Against this background, the Government of China made a request to the Government of Japan for the implementation of "Project for Human Resources Development of Rehabilitation in the Central and Western Regions in China" (the Project) as a technical cooperation project aimed at disseminating the technical capacity and knowledge accumulated by the centre through past cooperation projects to rehabilitation workers inland (Central and Western Regions). In response to this request, the Government of Japan commenced the five-year Project in April, 2008.<br><br>In the Project, remote education systems were installed at CRRC and rehabilitation centers at targeted sites; Shaanxi province, Chongqing city, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region. Curricurams and education materials for the training for rehabilitation workers at the centres in the targeted sites were developed. One year training programs consist of live lectures and Web Based Training (WBT) are undertaken by lectureres at CRRC. |   |   |
| <b>1-2. Project Overview</b><br><b>(1)Super Goal</b><br>Improvement of the quality of the rehabilitation service provided and increase of the number of disabled people receiving the said service in the Central and Western Regions of China<br><br><b>(2) Overall Goal</b>   |   |   |

Improvement of the quality of the rehabilitation service provided and increase of the number of disabled people receiving the said service at three target sites

### (3) Project Purpose

Establishment of a new model system for human resources development for the rehabilitation service serving three target sites with the CRRC acting as the core base

### (4) Outputs

- 1) Establishment of a provincial level human resources development system through the establishment and utilisation of an integrated remote education system operating at the CRRC and three target sites
- 2) Improvement of the a) theoretical knowledge, b) technical skills and c) problem solving capacity of provincial human resources involved in the rehabilitation service
- 3) Training of core personnel at the provincial level to equip them with excellent guidance ability to provide guidance for base level personnel engaged in the provincial rehabilitation service
- 4) Improvement of awareness of the importance of the rehabilitation service, including the importance of related knowledge, among base level personnel

### (5) Inputs (as of November, 2012)

- 1) Japanese Side
  - a) Experts: Six long-term experts, including two specialising in rehabilitation education and education administration, and one chief advisor (also acting as a physiotherapist), have been dispatched by the time of the present evaluation. The total number of short-term experts dispatched during the same period is 40, including the chief advisor.
  - b) Provision of equipment: Remote education equipment, equipment for technical training on rehabilitation and other types of equipment have been provided at a total cost of 56,820,000 yen.
  - c) Training in Japan: 61 project-related Chinese personnel have been trained in Japan by the time of the present evaluation.
  - d) Local cost: 39,560,000 yen to cover general administration expenses, business trip expenses, cost of supplies, interpretation and translation expenses and others
- 2) Chinese Side
  - a) Appointment of counterpart personnel (C/Ps): Chinese counterpart personnel have been deployed at all stakeholder organizations and the three target sites in China.
  - b) Office space for the JICA expert team and provision of equipment: The project office and the remote education system management office have been set up at the CRRC while the remote education office has been set up at the rehabilitation centre at each of the three target sites.
  - c) Local cost: 11,539,000 Yuan to cover the cost of establishing a suitable environment for project-related activities, network connection expenses and miscellaneous expenses at the CRRC and the three target sites.

## 2. Outline of the Terminal Evaluation Team

|         |  |  |
|---------|--|--|
| Members | Ms. Mitsuko Kumagai, Deputy Director General. and Group Director for Higher Education and Social Security, Human Development Dept., JICA Team leader<br>Mr. Masami Akai, National Rehabilitation Center for Persons with Disabilities<br>Mr. Hitoshi Maruyama, Professor, International University of Health and Welfare<br>Mr. Tomohiro Kuwabara, Deputy Assistant Director, Social Security Division, Human Development Dept., JICA<br>Mr. Toshihiro Nishino, Consultant, International Development Center of Japan Inc. |  |
|         | Nov. 4, 2012 to Nov. 20, 2012  | <b>Type of Evaluation:</b> Terminal Evaluation |

## 3. Results of the Terminal Evaluation

### 3.1 Verification of Project Performance

#### (1) Status of Output Achievement

##### Output 1: Achieved

Even though the procurement/delivery of some equipment for the remote education system was delayed by some four months compared to the original plan, this delay was not substantial enough to adversely affect the progress of the training courses. As far as the implementation of the training courses is concerned, a system has been developed at the CRRC to facilitate trainer training and other training courses. The well planned and executed preparatory work included a lecture on guidance techniques for the training of trainers by a professor of the Capital Medical University (CMU) in Beijing. Four textbooks were prepared along with the training curricula and the provincial personnel training course and central personnel training course have so far been held three times and twice respectively with 85 staff members of the CRRC comprising the core teaching staff for these courses.

#### Output 2: Achieved

The provincial personnel training course has so far been attended by 156 people. The trainees at the three sites and other people related to this training course have shown an extremely high regard for the effective, efficient and systematic teaching of theoretical knowledge through the remote education system. Based on the improved theoretical knowledge through remote education, many of the trainees have undergone practical training at their respective sites and training in Japan to learn more advanced professional skills as well as approaches and ideas for social systems for rehabilitation and rehabilitation work. Such additional training has equipped the trainees with an improved ability to practice their rehabilitation work in general. To the eyes of the Japanese experts, trainees are now fully aware of the necessity to properly understand not only their own specialist fields but also specialist knowledge in other related fields. The newly acquired know-how and skills have been actively utilised by all of the former trainees at their workplaces at the three sites along with their participation in academic conferences and for the writing of academic papers.

#### Output 3: Achieved

Sixty-one people have so far participated in the core personnel training course. The improved guidance ability of these trained core personnel is the result of the significant contribution made by the process of reconfirming newly acquired knowledge and skills. To be more precise, this process includes preparations for and the practice of teaching as well as providing guidance for base level personnel and other related persons.

Under the Project, base level personnel training has been organized seven times. In addition, many more base level personnel training sessions have been held by the federation and rehabilitation centre at each site. The training of personnel of stakeholder organizations has also been conducted along with other types of training. There has been a strong need for the training of base level personnel and the high rating of the training contents is illustrated by the numerous enquiries regarding forthcoming training sessions and offers for the trainees to obtain practical experience. The actual contents of the base level personnel training attended by the Japanese experts are generally satisfactory.

#### Output 4: Achieved

At the three target sites, 11 booklets and seven volumes of training materials, etc. were prepared and have been actively used for training and guidance at each site. The quality of these booklets, etc. prepared with the assistance of the Japanese experts and CRRC officials is high and they have proved to be very popular at each site. The number of base level personnel who have undergone guidance is satisfactory.

The positive effects of the training and booklets include a) development of the ability of base level personnel to accurately judge those disabled people requiring rehabilitation, b) sufficient dissemination of information on projects and facilities where those disabled people requiring rehabilitation can receive the rehabilitation service and c) development of the critical foundations for the facilitation of capacity building at the base level as a result of accelerated exchanges and networking between local rehabilitation centres and base level personnel using the training as an opportunity.

#### (2) Status of Project Purpose Achievement: Achieved

The project purpose of developing a new human resources development model at the three sites has been sufficiently achieved by fulfilling the set indicators. The Project was intended to training leading personnel at provincial rehabilitation organizations by means of utilising the human resources and know-how of the CRRC which is the leading body for the training of rehabilitation personnel in China. The actual processes conceived under the Project to train such leading personnel at the provincial level are a) systematic learning of theoretical knowledge through a remote education system, b) learning of practical skills, including clinical skills, through on-the-job training at the project sites, c) learning of highly professional skills and also of social system, concept and ideas of rehabilitation through training in Japan and d) strengthening of the problem solving and guidance capacity through the practical application of the newly acquired knowledge and skills and actual practice as training instructors.

Throughout the project period, constant review and improvement of the training contents, etc. have been conducted to build up the basic know-how based on the actual experience of the preceding training sessions. The relevant issues here include a) method and contents of assistance for the capacity building of individual trainees, b) desirable human resources development where a number of methods to assist capacity building are packaged to produce a synergy effect, c) desirable way to develop an environment for smooth capacity building typified by the offer of incentives for enrolment in training and d) desirable operation management method for the entire remote education system. Through these processes, a model has been developed where central level personnel train provincial level personnel while provincial core personnel train basic level personnel in a given province. In regard to the development of suitable training models for different types of human resources, the CRRC has concluded that the various human resources development efforts and activities implemented under the Project to suit the characteristics of the three

sites can provide important lessons for future efforts to disseminate these models to various areas in the Central and Western Regions. Such evaluation of the Project by the CRRC suggests that the development of suitable training models for different types of human resources has been achieved to a certain extent.

### (3) Status of Overall Goal Achievement.

The planned improvement has been achieved at a certain level and further progress is likely to take place. The training of base level personnel by provincial core personnel, in turn trained under the Project, has produced the effect of widely disseminating the details of (a) the activities of rehabilitation-related organizations employing base level rehabilitation personnel, (b) outline of the national project to provide a free rehabilitation service and (c) screening method for disabled people requiring rehabilitation. Consequently, state of the rehabilitation service under the national project has changed from being under-subscribed to being over-subscribed, indicating the positive contribution of the Project to increasing the number of recipients of the rehabilitation service. Other progress made under the Project includes an increase of the number of recipients of the rehabilitation service provided by each centre and the establishment of community level organizations by the federations. A positive effect of the improved rehabilitation service has also been observed in many other forms. One example is that the active utilisation of the newly acquired know-how has led to the acceptance of severely and/or multiple disabled people who found it difficult to receive the rehabilitation service in the past. Another example is considerable improvement in terms of both guidance for family members and actual rehabilitation effects in relation to rehabilitation at home.

In regard to the super goal, i.e. utilisation of the new model in other provinces in the Central and Western Regions, it is too early to evaluate the achievement status of this goal. While the issue of disseminating the model to other provinces will be examined by the China Disabled Persons' Federation (CDPF) in due course, some relevant actions have been taken at the sites, including a preliminary attempt to find a way to collaborate with hospitals in other provinces.

## 3.2 Summary of the Evaluation Results

### (1) Relevance: High

Rehabilitation for the disabled people has been a priority issue since midway through China's 7<sup>th</sup> Five Year National Economic and Social Development Plan and its importance is again stressed in the latest 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan (2011 – 2015). Meanwhile, the Project can be classified in the category of "realisation of sound social development" under the priority issue of "assistance for reform and liberalisation" of the Economic Cooperation Program for China (2001) of the Government of Japan. The Project is, therefore, highly relevant to the official policies of both the Government of China and the Government of Japan. The high level of relevance is also confirmed by a) the selection of this sector by Japan for technical cooperation, b) the introduction of remote education, c) the selection of a counterpart organization and d) the selection of target sites. This judgement is supported by such relevant facts as a) the existence of an extremely large number of rehabilitation specialists and the accumulation of rehabilitation know-how in Japan, b) the excellent prospect of remote education performing well when the number of target sites increases, c) the status of the CRRC as the highest training organization for rehabilitation specialists with abundant experience of cooperation by the JICA and d) the prospect of the three target sites with different backgrounds and specialities becoming reference sites for the continuation of human resource development on rehabilitation by the Chinese side after the completion of the Project in the Central and Western Regions where economic development relatively lags behind that of other regions.

### (2) Effectiveness: High

As described earlier, the project purpose has been achieved and it is clear that the successful outputs have contributed to the fulfilment of the project purpose. Outputs related to a) institutional development, b) improved knowledge, skill and capacity regarding rehabilitation, c) improved guidance ability and d) development of human resources at the base level have become important components and the status of each component has been reviewed and improved throughout the project period. Other reviewed and improved issues are a) desirable method and contents of assistance for the capacity building of individual trainees, b) desirable human resource development where a number of methods to assist capacity building are packaged to produce a synergy effect, c) desirable way to develop an environment for smooth capacity building and d) desirable operation management method for the entire remote education system. The framework for the training of core personnel through remote education and the training of base level personnel by trained core personnel has been realised as originally planned and the basic components of this framework should effectively function in future efforts to disseminate the training model to other provinces.

(3) Efficiency: High

Both the Japanese side and the Chinese side have made sufficient inputs in terms of human resources, equipment and funding, contributing to the successful achievement of the planned outputs. These inputs are highly evaluated by all of the stakeholders. From the viewpoint of input-output relations, the Project is judged to have been efficiently implemented. Even though the progress of some activities had been slow, there has been no adverse impact on either the implementation schedule of the training courses or on the achievement of the planned outputs.

(4) Impact: High

As described earlier, the Project has made an excellent contribution to the achievement of its overall goal and is expected to make further contributions. One particularly notable impact of the Project is that local centres have commenced their role of being core rehabilitation centres in their respective provinces as capacity building efforts have evolved from individual exercises to organizational exercises and activities. Such development has only been made possible by the simultaneous training of many people based on a common training framework and method at each centre and this organizational impact is truly significant. One district of Chongqing has seen new efforts to check children of 0 to 6 years of age for any disability using the screening booklet. The fact that the Project has made this and other social impacts is highly evaluated.

(5) Sustainability: High

1) Institutional Aspect

The Government of China has firmly maintained its policy of prioritising rehabilitation and is expected to continue and develop related policies to fulfil its obligation to the people of China. Because of the fact that the target persons of the Project are working people, emphasis has been placed on the provision of appropriate incentives. When the scope of trainees is expanded to include those working at rehabilitation-related organizations other than the targeted centres in the same as well as other provinces in the coming years, the provision of incentives may well be crucial for the success of the training. It is, therefore, necessary to continue the efforts to provide concrete incentives.

For the continuation and further development of the human resources training model using the remote education system as established under the Project, the collaboration of stakeholder organizations is indispensable, including collaboration between the CDPF and provincial federations and also collaboration between provincial federations and other organizations at the base of the administrative hierarchy with a stake in the rehabilitation of the disabled persons. It is hoped that efforts to consolidate such collaboration will continue.

2) Financial Aspect

Funding to cover the communication cost, which is the direct cost for the continuous use of the remote education system introduced under the Project at the three sites, is currently secured without any problems. The rehabilitation-related budget is said to be on the increase while other permanent costs, including the personnel cost, appear to be secured. As such, there are no special problems to note in regard to the financial aspect of the Project.

3) Technical Aspect

Some of the people involved in the Project at the target sites have expressed a desire for more advanced training courses. It is hoped that the CRRC will determine an appropriate response to this request through full consultation with the organizations concerned. It is also hoped that technological innovation of the equipment for remote education will be made in due course as part of the constant efforts to develop a better remote education system.

(6) Promoting and Impeding Factors Regarding the Realisation of the Planned Outputs

1) Promoting Factors

- a) The Project has been implemented at a time when the Government of China has been actively promoting the nationwide development of the rehabilitation service for the disabled people.
- b) The human resources and accumulated know-how at the CRRC, which have become valuable assets for Japan-China cooperation over many years, have been effectively utilised along with the use of the collaborative relationship between the CRRC and Japanese stakeholder organizations.
- c) There has been a synergy effect of three elements of the Project: (i) systematic learning of knowledge through remote education, (ii) improvement of skills through the provision of guidance for individual trainees by experts and (iii) promotion of the understanding of systems and ideas through training in Japan. As training in Japan has facilitated the understanding of rehabilitation on

the part of the participating senior officials of the target provinces, their active assistance has been obtained for the implementation of the Project and the development of the local rehabilitation service.

- d) At every site or centre, the fact that each target person for training is in the position of being assigned to an important post or a post responsible for new business development in line with the expansion or development of the organization has proved to be a strong incentive for their commitment to capacity building.
- e) In view of the fact that the target persons of the training under the Project are working people, careful arrangements are made to provide incentives for the participants. These incentives include the awarding of a certificate of training course completion and the awarding of provincial level adult education credits at some sites to those who have completed the training course.

## 2) Impeding Factors

While some of the people selected for training in Japan were unable to attend the training because of procedural problems, etc., their absence has not had any major negative impact on the Project. No other major impeding factors regarding the Project have been observed.

## 3.3 Conclusions and Recommendations

### (1) Conclusions

The Project is quite ambitious in that it aims at expanding human resources development for the rehabilitation service to the base level through the effective utilisation of the assets of the CRRC accumulated under past cooperation projects to train core personnel at the provincial level. It is also an innovative project as it combines a remote education system with practical guidance in the field to ensure comprehensive capacity building.

As a result of the Project, core personnel at the provincial level have been trained and some positive results have been achieved in terms of the training of base level personnel, an improved rehabilitation service at the base level and an increase of the number of recipients of the rehabilitation service. The Project has also built the momentum for each centre to actively pursue the launch of new rehabilitation work, reorganization of the service and collaboration with other organizations in view of providing a solid rehabilitation service. It is noteworthy that the Project has had a strong impact on the innovation and further development of rehabilitation work in the target areas. It is relevant to terminate the Project as planned since the Project Purpose has been achieved

### (2) Recommendations

- 1) Both the CDPF and CRRS should utilise the model established under the Project to actively disseminate the model to other provinces in the Central and Western Regions while selecting an appropriate system in view of the constant technological innovation of equipment for remote education. It will be crucial for such efforts to establish good collaboration/cooperation with the relevant organizations at the three target sites of the Project.
- 2) The actual contents of the rehabilitation service can vary depending on the socioeconomic conditions of a given locality. As such, China should seek to develop its own rehabilitation service which reflects the unique socioeconomic circumstances of the country as well as each locality.
- 3) As the technological innovation of equipment for remote education is rapid, it is essential to constantly review the technical aspect and educational contents of remote education after the installation of a system, taking such innovation and associated expenses into consideration.
- 4) The acceptance of remote education results as credits for national adult education and the awarding of some kind of certified qualification as incentives for remote education have not yet been realised. It is hoped that the awarding of national adult education credits to those completing a rehabilitation personnel training course will become a reality in the future through continual efforts, including the introduction of a new design for the training curriculum, to make such awarding easier.
- 5) As the demand for excellent human resources is very strong at each centre, there will be a continuous need for remote education. There is also a strong demand at each centre for an advanced course aimed at those who have completed a basic course.
- 6) The teaching materials for the remote education developed by central level were written only by the CRRC staff members. In previous JICA project with the CRRC, the materials for undergraduate courses had been developed in conjunction with the outside influential individuals, and these materials have been utilized for the rehabilitation specialist training courses at more than 1000 schools nationwide. Such collaboration is worth considering.

### 3.4 Lessons Learned

- (1) When selecting a target site for training, it is necessary to establish not only the characteristics of the area but also the likely number of trainee candidates in advance so that a sufficient number of trainees can be continually secured.
- (2) Even though no sufficient data is available on the likelihood of the success of efforts to expand the training course to include people working outside the centre, there are discussions at some sites to expand the scope of the participants of the remote education courses to include those working at universities, provincial/district organizations and hospitals. The underlying idea is that such expansion is feasible if suitable working arrangements are made with these bodies to allow their staff members to take a course. It is assumed that the provincial federation will play a central role in making such arrangements. As this expansion is desirable in principle, suitable efforts should be made taking the special circumstances of a particular site into consideration.
- (3) Some of the core personnel trained under the Project have expressed the opinion that Internet facilities to enable the downloading of the training contents freely will assist their learning at home, etc. as well as the training of base level personnel. Before introducing such environment, it is essential to develop rules for the secondary use of the contents as well as strict rules for the management of personal information, i.e. privacy rules.