

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project		
Country : Republic of the Philippines		Project title : Philippine Coast Guard Education and Human Resource management System Development Project
Issue : Transportation-International		Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation
Division in charge : Transportation and ICT Division 1, Economic Infrastructure Department		Total cost (At the Terminal Evaluation): 2.8 billion Yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D) : 9 th November 2007 7 th January 2008 – 6 th January 2013	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Department of Transportation and Communications (DOTC), Philippine Coast Guard (PCG)
		Supporting Organization in Japan : Japan Coast Guard (JCG)
		Related Cooperation : JICA long-term expert (Coast Guard Administration)
1-1 Background of the Project		
<p>The Philippines are facing the issues such as natural and artificial disasters, increased marine pollution, and piracy and smuggling cases though the marine transportation is main methods.</p> <p>In order to tackle these issues, the Philippines Government has established Philippine Coast Guard (PCG) in the Navy in 1974, which is responsible for implementation and enforcement of maritime transport safety policies and regulations. In 1998, PCG has been transferred to Department of Transportation and Communications (DOTC). The educational and training works implemented by the navy became the duties of PCG itself by this transfer and PCG has confronted insufficient facilities and equipment, and a lack of curriculum and trainers.</p> <p>Thus, based on the request from the Philippines government, JICA had carried out the technical cooperation project named “The Project on Philippine Coast Guard Human Resource Development” to improve the performance capability of PCG through the upgrade of educational and training programs from July 2002 to June 2007. This project has implemented training and seminars on the 4 areas, Search and Rescue (SAR), Marine Pollution (MARPOL) & Oil Spill Combating (OSC), Aids to Navigation (ATON) and Maritime Law Enforcement (MARLEN), and integrated them into syllabus and curriculum as well as expanded the basic education.</p> <p>However, there were many issues left to enhance the level of ability for accomplishing duties, and it terminal evaluation in October 2006 had pointed the establishment of full-time faculty system and continuous expansion of educational training on MARLEN and basic education as the medium and long term issues. Concerning the full-time faculty system, the development of comprehensive and continuous education and training strategy is necessary.</p> <p>Based on the above background, JICA has started the Project “Philippine Coast Guard Education and Human Resource Management System Development Project” since July 2007 with the duration of five years in cooperation with PCG.</p>		

1-2 Project Overview

The aim of the Project is to improve the service of bus operation quantitatively and qualitatively through strengthening the institutional capacity of PCG and officers

(1) Overall Goal

The Capacity of PCG as a Law Enforcement Agency is improved

(2) Project Purpose

PCG Education and Human Resource Management system is developed

(3) Outputs

Output 1: Establishment of Concurrent Instructor System

Output 2: Training programs on MARLEN are developed and strengthened

Output 3: Training programs on ship operations are developed and strengthened

(4) Inputs

Japanese side : Total cost JPY 2.8 billion

Number of Japanese experts dispatched : 6 long-term and 9 short-term experts

Number of trainee dispatched in Japan : 45

The amount of equipment provided : JPY 4,004,875

Philippines side

Number of Counterpart : 14

Land and facility Provided : Office rooms for the Project in PCG headquarter

2. Outline of the Evaluation team

Evaluation Team	Tatsuya MURASE	Executive Advisor to the Director General, Economic Infrastructure Department, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)	
	Masanori HISAKI	Senior Liaison Officer, International Affairs & Crisis Management Division, Administration Department, Japan Coast Guard (JCG)	
	Masanori KAWANO	Deputy Assistant Director, Transportation and ICT Division 1, Economic Infrastructure Department, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)	
	Chiaki YAMADA	Evaluation Analyst, Pegasus Engineering Corporation	
Period of Evaluation	15 th July 2012 to 28 th July 2012	Type of Evaluation	Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Project Achievement

(1) Achievement of the Project purpose

Project Purpose : PCG Education and Human Resource Management system is developed

As to Output1, “The establishment of Permanent Faculty System “has been modified to “The establishment of Concurrent Instructor System” during the Mid-term review after the consultation among the Project. After that, the circular of the Concurrent Instructor System has been approved

by the commandant on 28th May 2012.

As the first project activity, the database to select appropriate PCG officers for the concurrent instructor system has been established. Moreover, activities for the formulation of the career management plan and establishment of the promotion system and instructor eligibility system have been implemented in order to promote functioning the concurrent instructor system. As other outcomes for the achievements for the project purpose, training programs concerning MARLEN and Ship Operations for officers and non-officers have been developed and strengthened, and the Qualification Courses on Ship Operations have been developed for the enhancement of the institutional capacity of PCG. On the other hand, there are some challenges for fulfillment of the Project Purpose, but these challenges for the achievement of the Project Purpose are clear. Therefore, the Project Purpose is likely to be achieved before the end of the Project.

(2) Achievement of Outputs

Output 1 : Partly Achieved

The consultation and discussion on PDM during the Mid-term review has resulted in the modification from “The establishment of “Permanent Faculty System “to “The establishment of Concurrent Instructor System”. The details of the Concurrent Instructor System have been shared among the PCG. In order to promote the Concurrent Instructor System, the formulation of Career Management Plan, the establishment of both Promotion System and Instructor Eligibility System has been developed. However, there are a few indicators left which have not achieved at the terminal evaluation.

Challenges to be fulfilled by the end of the Project are clear and therefore, the likelihood of the achievement on Output 1 is considerably high. The circular of the concurrent system has been approved by the commandant on 28th May 2012, therefore, the Concurrent Instructor System has been established in PCG.

Output 2 : Achieved

The curriculums of Coast Guard Officer’s Course (CGOC) and Coast Guard Man’s Course (CGMC) have been revised, and subjects to be strengthened in each course have been determined for. Also, the necessary number of hours in each subject has been increased. Officers and non-officers have increased knowledge and improved skills through training with learning about MARLEN theoretically and practically. Moreover, the teaching syllabus and materials in Coast guard Command Staff Course (CGSCC) and Maritime Security Course (MARSEC) have been revised and new subjects have been added into courses mentioned above.

More than 6 instructors have been trained on MARLEN and additional seminars and workshop will be conducted by the end of the Project, and it may be said that the capacity of the instructors is strengthened.

Therefore, Output 2 has been achieved at the terminal evaluation.

Output 3 : Partly Achieved

With the goal of improvement on the ability of ship operation, curriculums and teaching materials on training courses for officers and non-officers have been revised and also developed. 7 qualification courses have been developed and one is going. Moreover, the PCG Certification

System for strengthening the institutional capacity of PCG has been established.

On the other hand, it is necessary to bring up instructors who are specialized in specific subjects in order to conduct training for officers and non-officers. There is only 1 instructor course developed and the development of instructor courses is expected to be increased. Moreover, the establishment of Certification System for instructors is desirable. In terms of development of Standard operation procedures for ship operation, Operation Readiness Evaluation (ORE) Manual, Watch Officer's Guide and Instruction for Shipboard Ratings will be completed by the end of the Project.

From the above, although there are some challenges for strengthening the courses developed by the end of the Project, Output 3 will be achieved.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance : High

The enhancement of maritime safety and security has been considered as one of the important issues to be tackled in the medium-Term Philippines Development Plan (2004-2010 and 2010-2016). The Government of Japan has adopted three prioritized issues for the Philippines in June 2008 and determined Country Aid Policy in March 2012, continuous economic growth through investment promotion is recognized as a prioritized issue in the medium-term aim, as well as the promotion of maritime safety. PCG has carried a plan forward to increase the number of PCG officers along with the alternation of the generations and reinforcement of the organization. Accordingly, training and human resource development for newly-hired officers must be needed for strengthening the institutional capacity of PCG.

In terms of consistency with the Philippine policy and Japan's aid policy and needs of PCG, the relevance of the Project is high. The needs of support for strengthening PCG's capacity through the Project high. The enhancement of the capacity development on PCG by the Government of Japan has resulted in the great contribution for PCG in terms of strengthening the ReCAAP's execution. From the above, the relevance of the Project is high.

(2) Effectiveness : High

Output 1-3 are contributing to the achievement of the Project purpose. Output 1 aims to establish the Concurrent Instructor System. Furthermore, Output 2 and 3 also aim to enrich the contents of the Concurrent Instructor System in terms of Training programs on MARLEN and Ship Operations. By the termination of the Project, the career management plan which encourages the concurrent instructor system is expected to be functioned and the PCG education and human resource management system will be able to be developed. Therefore, the logic/project approach has been appropriate. Most of indicators have also been achieved at the terminal evaluation. PCG recognizes activities to be implemented for the fulfillment of all indicators and the Project purpose is likely to be highly achieved.

(3) Efficiency : Moderate

According to the achievement of Output, it takes more time to achieve all indicators but Output 1-3 is likely to be largely achieved by the termination of the Project.

Activities to be implemented for the achievement of Output1 are as below:

- Formulation of the plan on maritime education
- Assignment of PCG officers for appropriate instructors
- Revision of the curriculums on PCG courses

Activities to be implemented for the achievement of Output 3 are as below:

- Establishment of the PCG certification system
- Development and qualified of ORE manual

It is found that Output 2 has already been achieved at the terminal evaluation. Following results have been found out through the interview, questionnaires to Japanese experts and C/P officers and the Project Report. The 1st one is that PCG has highly appreciated the training in Japan qualitatively and quantitatively-wise. 45 PCG officers have participated in academic and practical training. 27 PCG officers designated as instructors have participated in the training and became more confident of their improved knowledge and skills. The 2nd is that the communication between the experts and C/P officers was not smooth for the 1st and 2nd year. It sometimes resulted in a miscommunication with each other and appeared to be a disturbing factor for the progress of the Project during that early stage of project implementation. One more is that frequent changes of C/P officers happened. The transition and transfer of works between a C/P predecessor and successor was not smooth, it takes too much time for a successor to catch up and understand the overall Project.

(4) Impact : Relatively High

If PCG Education and Human Resource Management system is developed, training of PCG will be effectively and efficiently implemented. Moreover, the establishment of the concurrent instructor system will bring positive effects to PCG officers allocated 12 districts under jurisdiction in the Philippines. Namely, the institutional capacity of PCG, especially the number of missions on MARLEN and patrol vessel operations is expected to be increased. There are a few unexpected positive impacts found through the interview. One of the ripple positive effects is the start of collaboration with PMMA on maritime education, which the Project has promoted. The other positive effect is that awareness of the existence of the Project has somehow led other donors, such as the United States of America, et. al., to also provide support to PCG. Through the interview with C/P officers, some of C/P officers have started an in-house training, utilizing skills acquired from training in Japan. Furthermore, unexpected negative impacts have not been found at the terminal evaluation.

(5) Sustainability : Relatively High

Policy Aspects

The enhancement of maritime safety and security has been considered as one of the important issues to be tackled in the medium-Term Philippines Development Plan (2004-2010 and 2010-2016). The establishment of the “Regional Cooperation Agreement on Combating Piracy and Armed Robbery Against Ship in Asia” (ReCAAP) has been advocated by the Government of Japan, therefore the Government of Japan will continue the support to the Philippines in the future.

Organizational Aspects

C/P officers have taken the initiative in developing reference materials such as textbook since the middle of the project period and it can be said that the commitment of PCG has been raised. PCG has recognized the importance of the Project and is willing to continue the activities positively in the future. On the other hand, as to whether PCG is capable of following up the concurrent instructor system and human resource allocation based on the career management plan formulated or not, and also its outcomes happened cannot yet be measured during the Project.

Financial Aspects

According to the budget plan, the budget allocation for PCG has been increased and also will be increased after the end of the Project. It can be said that the likelihood of securing financial sustainability is high. The interview with C/P officers mentioned that PCG would receive its budget directly from the Department of Budget and Management starting in 2013, therefore it expects to secure higher budgets on the succeeding years. Consequently, the sustainability in terms of the financial aspects is high.

Technical Aspects

It will be difficult for PCG to conduct training for instructors same as the training provided by the Project. In order to maintain the capacity of instructors, the PCG has to secure the certain budget for specific training for instructors. Moreover, the assignment plan proposed in concurrent faculty system has to be functioned to maintain the level of instructors' training capacity.

3-3 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to planning

The change of Output 1

After the consideration of the project progress and circumstances around the Project, "permanent faculty system" has been changed to "concurrent instructor system" at the terminal evaluation.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

The enactment of the Philippine Coast Guard Law of 2009

It is found that the Philippine Coast Guard Law of 2009 which has been enacted in February 2010 was a contributing factor based on the result of interviews with C/P. This new law has led roles and responsibilities of PCG clear. Also, it is clear that instructors are so important as to function the education and human resource management effectively.

Productive training conducted in Japan

45 PCG officers in total have participated in training in Japan. There is a variety of training conducted from theoretical seminars for learning knowledge to technical seminars to undergo practical experiences. In particular, PCG officers designated as instructors have acquired a wide range of knowledge and skills.

3-4 Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to planning

Factors have not been found.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Frequency of PCG's personal changes

Frequent changes of C/P officers have happened during the Project. The transition and transfer of works between a C/P predecessor and successor was not that smooth, it takes too much time for a successor to catch up and understand the overall Project.

Communication among the project team

There was a problem in verbal communication among the project team at the beginning of the Project. This has led to a miscommunication with each other. Although the mutual communication has been better improved as the Project went forward, it initially appeared to be a disturbing factor for the progress of the Project in the early part of its implementation.

3-5 Conclusion

In conclusion, the Project purpose "PCG Education and Human Resource Management is developed" is likely to be achieved before the termination of the Project.

Concerning 5 evaluation criteria, Relevance, Efficiency and Impact are considerably acceptable results. On the other hand, Effectiveness is not a satisfactory result. Three challenges such as the formulation of the plan on maritime education, the designation of appropriate instructors and the establishment of PCG certification system are expected to be implemented. Concerning the sustainability, PCG is sure to secure the budget for implementing activities continuously, however, It is unsure that personal changes will be performed based on the career management plan in terms of the organizational/institutional aspects.

If PCG maintains the project effects, secures budgets for training to enhance the capacity of PCG officers and also secures the number of necessary officers and non-officers for MARLEN, Overall goal is expected to be achieved.

3-6 Recommendations

Recommendations suggested to PCG and Project experts as bellow in connection with 3-1 output3.

- Development of instructor's course for enhancing the training and education on shop operations
- Establishment of certification system for instructors for enhancing the PCG institutional capability to operate PCG vessels