

# Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Senegal Office: March, 2014

Country Name Republic of the Gambia	Project for Construction of Brikama Fish Market
--	---

## I. Project Outline

Background	In Gambia, the agriculture sector, including fishery, has been prioritized in the national development plan. The Brikama Fish Market is located in a key location connecting between the coastal area and the inland area and has been functioning as a regional retail market covering not only Brikama area but also surrounding areas. The growing population in the coastal area increased the demand of food, including fresh fish. On the other hand, the inappropriate market facilities caused difficulties to keep hygienic and sanitary conditions for fresh fish. Therefore, establishment of supply system of fresh fish in the Brikama Area including the Brikama Fish Market, was the key development issue in the national fishery policy.						
Objectives of the Project	To reduce post-harvest loss of fish by construction of market facilities in Brikama area thereby contributing to increase and stabilization of supply of fish products in Brikama area.						
Outputs of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project Site: Brikama area</li> <li>2. Japanese side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Construction: Fish retail market of 1,428m<sup>2</sup>, fish stall, ice making plant, administration and other office space, public toilet, garbage depot, rainwater drainage and seepage system, concrete pavement, etc.</li> <li>2) Soft component (Technical Assistance): establishment of operation and management system, establishment of ice making facility operation and management, and capacity building of retailer.</li> </ul> </li> <li>3. Gambian side: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provision of land, removal of existing facilities and retailers, wholesalers and venders, , works for incoming of lines of electricity, telephone and water pipes, fence and planting, procurement of furniture, fittings and cleaning equipment.</li> </ul> </li> </ol>						
E/N Date	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">June 20, 2008</td> <td style="padding: 2px;">Completion Date</td> <td style="padding: 2px;">December 15, 2009</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Extension of EN: March 11, 2009</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	June 20, 2008	Completion Date	December 15, 2009	Extension of EN: March 11, 2009		
June 20, 2008	Completion Date	December 15, 2009					
Extension of EN: March 11, 2009							
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: : 630 million yen, Contract Amount: 593 million yen						
Implementing Agency	Implementing Agency : Fisheries Department, Department of State for Fisheries, Water Resources and national Assembly Matters (signer of the agreement) Operating Agency : Management Committee of Brikama Fish Market						
Contracted Agencies	Overseas Agri-Fisheries Consultants Co., Ltd, Iwata Chizaki Construction Corporation						
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: July 2007– March 2008						
Related Projects (if any)	None						

## II. Result of the Evaluation

### 1 Relevance

This project has been highly consistent with Gambia's development policy, such as ensuring food security with an increase in the supply of marine products specified under "Vision 2020" and "Strategic Plan of the Fisheries Development 2009-2013", and development needs to upgrade the Brikama Fish Market, as well as Japan's ODA policy prioritizing support for agriculture and fishery sector, at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is **high**.

### 2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project has largely achieved its objectives, "to reduce loss of fresh fish and to increase supply of fish products at Brikama Fish Market."

The loss of fresh fish in Brikama Fish Market reduced to 0% in 2010 from 10-15% in 2007. No loss of fresh fish at the Market has been sustaining at the time of ex-post evaluation. Also, freshness of fish at the Market improved owing to availability of sufficient volume of ice produced at the Market and cold storage. The ratio of volume of ice to volume of fish in the cool box used by the retailers or the venders at the Market improved for the same period. However, in 2013, the production volume decreased to around 3 tons/day which accounted for 60% of the target value because one of the plants had not been operating due to a defective spare part. The spare part was replaced and the plant resumed operations in the middle of November 2013. In terms of sales activities at the Market, most of fish stalls installed by the Project have been utilized. As a result, the number of fresh fish venders and retailers increased from 140 in 2007 to 236 in 2013. The number of dry fish retailers fluctuating by availability of dried fish in the Market. Since one of the main targets of the Project is to provide hygienic conditions for fresh fish retail, the cured fish and the processed fish retailers have been doing their business outside of the Project site.

The construction of new market facilities also improved business environment, particularly in rainy season. The improved layout of the Market increased efficiency of the market operation. On the other hand, there is a problem observed in waste water and drainage system that is not working correctly since there's a breakdown in the pump which requires frequent cleaning by the cleaning team when overflow is reported by the users. As for the impacts, the improved market facilities attract more customers which enable larger quantity of fresh fish trade. In addition, no loss of fresh fish improved profitability of retailers. According to the interviews with the retailers, their income from fish sales at the Market increased.

Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is **high**.

#### Quantitative Effects

Indicators	(Before the project) 2007 Actual	(After the project) 2010 Planned	2010 Actual	(Ex-post Evaluation) 2013 Actual
Indicator 1: Loss of fresh fish in Brikama Fish Market	10-15%	5%	0%	0%
Indicator 2: Ratio of volume of ice to volume of fish in the cool box (at retailer and vender)	Fish volume: Ice volume=1: 0.1-0.2	Volume of ice will be increased.	1:1*	1:1.18*
Indicator 3: Volume of ice production by Brikama Fish Market	0 ton	5 tons/day	4.5 tons/day	2.9-3 tons/day
Indicator 4: Sales volume of ice produced by Brikama Fish Market	0 ton	N.A.	4.5 tons/day	2.9-3 tons/day
Indicator 5: Storage volume of ice at Brikama Fish Market	0 ton	6 ton	4.5 ton/day	2.9-3 ton/day
Indicator 6: No. of fish stalls in use	-	Large: 40 sets Small: 100 sets	Large: 32 sets Small: 100 sets	Large: 39 sets Small: 100 sets
Indicator7: No. of retailers and venders in Brikama Fish Market	Fresh fish: 140 Cured fish: 40 Dry fish: 30 Fish processing: 10	Increase	Fresh fish: 226 Cured fish: 0 Dry fish: 18 Fish processing:0	Fresh fish: 236 Cured fish: 0 Dry fish: 26 Fish processing:0

Note 1: \* The figure for 2010 is estimation based on the volumes of production and sales of ice at the Market and the figure for 2013 is calculated by the date of field survey for the ex-post evaluation (January 1<sup>st</sup> - August 21<sup>st</sup> 2013).

Source : Brikama Fish Market

#### 3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 94%), project period slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 107%) because of heavy rains during the rainy seasons of 2008 and 2009, downpour was reported especially in august 2009 and which had a negative impact on the soil and thus on the construction works. The project period slightly exceeded the plan. Therefore, efficiency of this project is **fair**.

#### 4 Sustainability

The operation and maintenance of facilities and equipment constructed and installed by the project have been carried out by the operating agency, the Brikama Fish Market Management Committee. The Oversight Body and the Management Committee were established as planned. While the Oversight Body which is composed of the members from the Fishery Department, Brikama Area Council (BAC), and so on, is responsible for monitoring the compliance of market operation and activities, the Management Committee which is composed of the members from the Fishery Department, BAC, the Fish Market Manager, the Financial Manager, and market users of retailers and venders, is in charge of overall operation and maintenance of the Market. Sufficient number of staffs with sufficient knowledge and skills, who can repair minor breakdowns, has been assigned for the operation and maintenance of the market facilities. As for the financial aspect, the Market has been earning sufficient amount of revenues to cover the operation and maintenance cost. In 2012, the total revenue was 2.66 million GMD which was higher than the total expenses of 2.579 million GMD. In terms of current status of operation and maintenance of the facilities and equipment installed by the project, the drainage system and the water supply system are not maintained and operated as originally planned. Breakdown of pump in the drainage system and leakage of water system are not repaired. The Brikama Fish Market Management Committee cleans the drainage frequently to avoid overflow and bad odor and uses the alternative water supply system (combining pipe and tank) for the ice plant. The staff is experienced enough to cope with the minor problems in the current status of operation and maintenance and insure the sustainability of this project. No negative impact on natural environment and society was observed.

Therefore, the sustainability of the project is **high**.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project has largely achieved its objectives, "to reduce loss of fresh fish and to increase supply of fish products at Brikama Fish Market." as the supply of ice and cold storage eliminated loss of fresh fish at the Market. The improved freshness of fish traded at the Market and the improved market facilities increased both venders and customers. On the other hand, the ice production had been below the target due to the non-functioning ice making plant. Also, the overflows in the drainage system have been a problem. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is **High**.

As for sustainability, the operating agencies have no problem in the structural, technical and financial sustainability, as sufficient number of staff with adequate technical capacity being assigned, the plenty of revenue generated to cover the necessary expenses including the operation and the maintenance cost. However, there are some minor problems observed in terms of current status of operation and maintenance because of drainage system and water supply system are not maintained and operated as originally planned, but the Brikama Fish Market Management Committee cleans the drainage frequently to

avoid the overflow and the bad odor and uses alternative water supply system (combining pipe and tank) for the ice plant.

As for efficiency, the project period slightly exceeded the plan due to the heavy rains during construction.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be **highly satisfactory**.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to implementing agency:

[Oversight Body and Management Committee]

- To resolve the problem of congestion at the access road to Brikama Fish Market and also to prevent accidents, the oversight body and management committee has to discuss the best way to sensitize the users about the good organization and the respect of the layout in Brikama Market in general to avoid the anarchic occupation of the surrounding area.
- Brikama Fish Market has a well trained and experienced technical staff that is able to replace spare parts and repair minor breakdowns, however, it is highly recommended for the continuous activity and the sustainability of the equipment to have the support of the head office of the ice plants and cold storage maker company.

[BAC]

- It is necessary to settle up a long term plan to prevent the overproduction of waste at Brikama in general and especially at Brikama Fish Market

Lessons learned for JICA:

- It is necessary before the completion of the works to verify if the Water supply system at Brikama Fish Market is functioning effectively and to be sure if the pipes are solid enough to resist in case of soil subsidence because the market is actually supplying ice making machine by using a pipe connected to the water tab.
- It is necessary to put enough capacity on the drainage system at the basic design concept to avoid the overflow in case of overcapacity and also rain.



Retailers using fish stalls in Brikama Fish Market

Fish retailer buying ice from the ice storage facility