

# Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

conducted by Saint Lucia Branch Office/Dominican Republic Office: Month, 2013

Country Name	The Project for Improvement of Fishery Infrastructure in Anse La Raye
Saint Lucia	

## I. Project Outline

Background	A catch of fish of Saint Lucia was 1,386 tons in 2005, which did not satisfy the domestic demands, and the country imported marine products. In west coast, where Anse La Raye is located, fishermen mainly practice small-scale fishery and the number of fishermen was 118 and that of registered fishing boats was 25 in Anse La Raye. Anse La Raye is 20 km distant from the capital Castries by land and had a high potential as a base to supply marine products to the metropolitan area. However, its function was declining due to generally obsolete facilities and a catch of fish was only 19 tons in 2000. In particular, a jetty was constructed for ferries and its height from the surface of the seal was not enough for the use of fishing boats. It was also damaged because it was very old and caused inconveniences for landing fish and mooring boats. Regarding the land facilities/equipment such as an ice making machine, refrigerators, fishing gear lockers, stores, etc., they became quite old since 20 years had passed after the constructions and caused loss after fishing. In addition, the Government of Saint Lucia aimed at developing fisheries in cooperation with tourism promotion.		
Objectives of the Project	To increase income by fishing and enhance employment through the improvement of fishery, augment in ice supply and tourists, and promotion of goods sales by developing fisheries facilities (jetty, fisheries complex, gear locker, workshop, venders' arcade, sanitation facilities, etc.) at Anse La Raye.		
Outputs of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project Site: Anse La Raye</li> <li>2. Japanese side Construction of the following facility(s): (1) Civil Works: jetty and accessories · up lifting facilities (2) Architectural Works: gear locker · drainage · fisheries complex · workshop · venders' arcade Protection works (the fronts of venders' arcade, fisheries complex, gear locker and workshop) and sand capping works (the front of venders' arcade) were conducted by the follow up cooperation in 2012 as middle-term countermeasures against erosion.</li> <li>3. Saint Lucia side: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· implementation of Environment Impact Statement (EIA): Environment Impact Statement (EIS)/ Social Impact Statement (SIS)</li> <li>· acquisition of permissions concerning environment/development</li> <li>· securing of place for fish landing during the construction works and instruction for fishermen who practice small-scale fishery</li> <li>· securing of temporary yard for construction</li> <li>· removal of a jetty and existing fisheries facilities in the planned site</li> <li>· securing of place for dumping soils that are left after construction works</li> <li>· connection of electricity, water and telephones, procurement of office equipment, furniture, etc.</li> <li>· tax exemption at the customs for equipment to be imported to Saint Lucia</li> </ul> </li> </ol>		
E/N Date	May, 2008	Completion Date	February, 2010
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: : 536 million yen, Contract Amount: 526 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Implementing Agency : Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries Operating Agency : Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Agriculture, Lands, Fisheries & Forestry		
Contracted Agencies	Echo Corporation (consultant), TOKURA CORPORATION (construction)		
Related Studies	Basic Design Study: September 2006 – March 2007		
Related Projects (if any)	Japan's Cooperation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Fisheries Development Project (1<sup>st</sup> term) (GA, 1987, 290 million yen)</li> <li>· Fisheries Development Project (2<sup>nd</sup> term) (GA, 1988, 360 million yen)</li> <li>· Project for Construction of Fisheries Development Center (GA, 1995, 527 million yen)</li> <li>· Project for Construction of Vieux Fort Fishery Complex (GA, 1997-1998, 200 million yen)</li> <li>· Project for Improvement of Coastal Fisheries Development (GA, 2001, 130 million yen)</li> </ul>		

## II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p>This project has been highly consistent with Saint Lucia's development policy, such as poverty alleviation and enhancement of GDP specified under "Plan for Managing the Fisheries of Saint Lucia", "Fisheries Development for 8 years 2001-2007" (at the time of preliminary study) and "Plans for Future" (at the time of ex-post evaluation). It has also been highly consistent with prioritized policies (increase in a catch of fish, improvement of post-harvest technologies and quality management, modern fishery management, development of new fishing grounds, promotion of entry into the fishery market by private enterprises, improvement fishery infrastructures/fishing boats/gears, enhancement of economic standards of fishermen and cooperation between fishery and tourism), and development needs to renovate old fishery facilities, as well as Japan's ODA policy for sustainable growth (supply of protein for the population and holding-down of expenditures in foreign currency resulted by import</p>

of marine products specified under “Japan’s ODA Charter”, at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project has largely achieved its objectives, “to improve efficiency of fisheries by renovation of facilities of Anse La Raye, increase in the number of tourists and promotion of goods sales”. Regarding improvement of landing works such as i) average time for landing fish, ii) average time for preparation before boats leave, and iii) labor for preparation and landing per boat as well as iv) decrease in the number of fishing boat repair in the area, it was confirmed that improvement in terms of quantitative factors has become clear through comparison of the figures i) before the project, ii) target year and iii) at the time of ex-post evaluation (refer to note1 of the below table).

As for the impacts, it was identified that i) demand of marine products has rapidly risen by the increase in the number of tourists with tourism events held every Friday and accordingly the market prices of the products rose by 8.14% at Anse La Raye in 2011 and ii) employment opportunities, such as selling of marine products and souvenir, have been enhanced for villagers as well as for fishermen in Anse La Raye.

No negative impact on natural environment and no land acquisition and resettlement has been reported. On the other hand, as a compressor of an ice making machine was damaged in 2012, production and sales of ice have been stopped since July 2012 and consequently, villagers have been obliged to buy ice at comparatively high price (Department of Fisheries is currently considering the method of repair and securing of repair cost). Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is fair.

### Quantitative Effects

Indicators	(Before the project) 2007 Actual	(After the project) 2010 Planned	2010 Actual	(Ex-post Evaluation) 2012Actual
Indicator 1 Improvement of landing works (1) time for landing (average) (2) time for preparation before boats leave (average) (3) labor for preparation and landing per boat	(1) 1.5 hours (2) 1.5 hours (3) 6 people	(1) 0.5 hours (2) 0.5 hours (3) 2 people	(1) 0.75 hours (2) 0.75 hours (3) below 2-3 people	Same as left (note1)
Indicator 2 Decrease in the frequency of fishing boat repairs FRP fishing boats	Once in 2 weeks due to landing system of fish	Frequency of repair decreases due to the construction of a jerry		Frequency of repair drastically decreased. (Few repairs are required.)
(Supplementary Indicator) A catch of fish per year	Approximately 25 tons/year (note2)	A catch of fish increases from 25 tons per year at Anse La Raye.	30.99 tons/year	36.23/year (note3)
(Supplementary Indicator) Frequency of jetty use by fishing boats				About 25 regular fishing boats Besides, other fishing boats and tourist boats irregularly use the jetty.

Source : Implementation Review Study (A10), Implementation Review Study Report (p4-1)

note1: Although exact time was not obtained by the interviews with fishermen, majority of responses was that required time was reduced by more than 50%.

note2: The figure of 25 tons is an average between 1993 and 2000. There are no statistics available concerning a catch of fish at Anse La Raye between 2001 and Basic Design (BD) Study. In the BD report, it is mentioned that a catch of fish at Anse La Raye is estimated to be similar scale to that at Soufrière (85 tons), however, the average at Soufrière is approximately 100 tons between 1993 and 2005 and there is no clear ground for 85 tons. Thus, in this evaluation report, the average catch between 1993 and 2000 is mentioned.

note3: There are no statistics concerning a catch of fish at Anse La Raye between 2001 and 2008. After 2009, statistics have been prepared and figures of years 2010 and 2012 are based on the statistics.

## 3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 98%), the project period slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 118%) because of the delay in procuring materials (cement) and high swell of the ocean. The outputs of the project were produced as planned. Therefore, efficiency of this project is fair.

## 4 Sustainability

Regarding facilities and equipment provided by the project, the operation and maintenance of the fisheries complex, a jetty, a workshop and fishing gear lockers were transferred to Anse La Raye/Canaries fisheries cooperative (hereinafter referred to as “the fisheries cooperative”) from the implementing agency, Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Agriculture, Lands, Fisheries & Forestry in August 2010 and vendors’ arcade has been operated and maintained by council of Anse La Raye. The implementation structure of Department of Fisheries is sustained and maintenance and management system between the department and the fisheries cooperative is also maintained. At present, Department of Fisheries has 39 permanent staff members and the current staff are able to implement necessary policies. On the other hand, the fisheries cooperative is in the process of institutional strengthening and does not fully function. As for the technical aspect, although roles of fisheries cooperative members are limited to daily operations, a system in which cooperative members receive technical supports such

as repair of freezers from Department of Fisheries and relevant corporation that refrigerates and processes marine products, has been established. Technicians/engineers, who received technical instructions particularly concerning facility repair during the project period, have techniques/skills to maintain, manage and repair equipment in the entire fisheries facilities in Saint Lucia. As to the financial aspect, the fisheries cooperative currently has very limited income and expenditures and balance sheet is not prepared due to the delay in selection of an external auditor. Main sources of income are sales of cooking gas and gears as well as facility (rest room) users fee from tourists, while main items of expenditure are salary for facility managers and purchase of materials and office supplies. For the current status of operation and maintenance, majority of machinery and equipment is regularly functioning, while part of equipment (ice making machine) is out of order and Department of Fisheries is currently considering the method of repair and securing of repair cost because the term of security and term of a guarantee by a manufacturer were over.

Therefore, there are some problems in the institutional and financial aspects and the current status of operation and maintenance and the sustainability of this project is fair.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project has largely achieved its objectives, "to improve efficiency of fisheries by renovation of facilities of Anse La Raye, enhancement of ice supply, increase in the number of tourists and promotion of goods sales", though the ice supply does not increase due to a damage of an ice making machine. It was confirmed that i) average time for landing fish, ii) average time for preparation before boats leave, and iii) labor for preparation have been improved and positive impacts such as a rise in the market prices of the marine products and enhancement of employment opportunities have been observed. As for sustainability, while Department of Fisheries has sufficient personnel who are able to implement necessary policies, the fisheries cooperative is in the process of institutional strengthening. As for the technical aspect, technicians/engineers, who received technical instructions particularly concerning facility repair during the project period, have techniques/skills to maintain, manage and repair equipment in the entire fisheries facilities in Saint Lucia. As to financial aspect, the fisheries cooperative currently has very limited income and expenditures and the balance sheet is not prepared due to the delay in selection of an external auditor. For the current status of operation and maintenance, majority of machinery and equipment is regularly functioning, while part of equipment (ice making machine) is out of order. Therefore, there are some minor problems observed in terms of institutional and financial aspects as well as current status of operation and maintenance. Regarding efficiency, the project period slightly exceeded the plan.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to implementing agency:

- **Repair of Ice Making Machine**  
It is difficult to secure the cost for repairing an ice making machine (USD 5,000 to exchange an entire compressor, USD1,000 to exchange pistons only). However, if the ice making machine functions, cost recovery is possible by the expected monthly profit of USD 100. It is necessary to consider acquiring finance including loans, if it is difficult to cover the cost by the government's budget.
- **Strengthening of the Fisheries Cooperative**  
As mentioned above, since monthly profit of USD 100 is expected by the operation of an ice making machine, it is necessary to immediately establish institutional management system including a general meeting, selection of a director, preparation of a balance sheet, inspection, etc. It is also needed to request Department of Union of Ministry of Agriculture, Lands, Fisheries & Forestry to provide supports for the establishment of the above mentioned system.
- **Cooperation between Department of Fisheries and Department of Cooperative in terms of Strengthening of the Fisheries Cooperative**  
Department of Fisheries is originally in charge of maintenance, management and effective utilization of facilities provided by grant aid, while Department of Cooperative is in charge of strengthening and supervision of the fisheries cooperative, which is entrusted to manage facilities. It is necessary that both departments establish cooperation system for capacity development of the fisheries cooperative.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- **Transfer of Facility Management to Fisheries cooperatives**  
In Saint Lucia, fisheries cooperatives are entrusted to manage facilities provided by grant aid. Institutional capacities differ depending on each cooperative and unconditional entrustment is considered to be risky. It is desirable that capacities of fisheries cooperatives be examined before entrusting and if the capacities are not satisfactory, it is adequate to entrust the management after strengthening cooperatives.
- **Financing for repair cost of an ice making machine**  
The cost for full-scale repair of an ice making machine is comparatively large, considering the budget of Department of Fisheries. The budget of the department is not enough to cover unexpected breakdowns. On the other hand, if the ice making machine functions, profits are expected and cost recovery is considered to be relatively easy. It is originally desirable for the Saint Lucia's side to take necessary measures including management of accumulated fund, which is generated by the profit of ice sales, as a separate account. In reality, however, it is difficult to realize such measures due to constraints of national accounts. Therefore, in case that a grant aid procures equipment (e.g. an ice making machine), which rarely fail but require a large amount of repair cost once they are damaged, and if they are expected to surely recover repair cost by their re-operations, it may be necessary for JICA to propose a work plan that establishes a system which incorporates a temporary loan for repair cost.



Jetty: preparation activities before boats leave and for landing of fish have been efficient.



Venders' arcade: Fishery activities and tourism have been promoted by the increase in the number of tourists.