

Country Name	The Project for the Capacity Building for the Forestry Sector Phase II
Kingdom of Cambodia	

I. Project Outline

Background	Forests in Cambodia were one of the important resources for the country's economy and for the people. The proper forest resource management was one of the prime concerns in Cambodia's domestic policy in the 2000s. There was a pressing need to train the staff of the Forest Administration (FA), and the Cambodian government requested the Government of Japan to assist human resource development of FA (1999). In response to the request, the Capacity Building Project for the Forestry Sector in Kingdom of Cambodia (hereinafter referred to as the 'Phase I') was implemented (2001-2004). The Phase I's terminal evaluation suggested that the trainees' ability to apply the acquired skills and knowledge to the practice needed to be improved.												
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Sustainable community resources* utilization by local people is secured in the area conducted participatory community resources management. *Defined as natural resources, human resources, capital resources, social resources and so forth. Forestry resources, which is a part of natural resources are the core resource for the project activities. Project Purpose: Through the capacity building of Forestry Administration (FA) officers, sustainable utilization of community resources is secured for stabilizing the living of local people in the Field Project (FP) sites. 												
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: FA, Forestry and Wildlife Training Center (FWTC), and Forestry Administration Cantonment (FAC) and Forest Administration Division (FAD) where the Field Projects (FP) are located; (i) Two FP sites were selected in 2006 and 2007(Boeng Kok Community Forests (CF) of Kampong Tralach FP in Kampong Chhnang FAC and Phnom Preah Thet CF) and (ii) Four FP sites were selected by the end of 2008 (Kampong Chhnang FP, Romeas FP, Kg.Thmar FP and Sre Ambel FP), which include five CFs at An Duong Chros CF, Toul Sarong CF, Veal Okdei CF, Nakta Thmor Prung CF and Thor Rong CF. Main activities: (1) Development of training plan/curriculum/materials, (2) Implementation of training to FA officers in the FP sites and other FA officers, (3) implementation of CF activities in FP sites Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Cambodian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 11 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 46 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 29 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Project office and other facilities</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: 125,774USD</td> <td>3) Local cost: 129,000 USD</td> </tr> </table> 					Japanese Side	Cambodian Side	1) Experts: 11 persons	1) Staff allocated: 46 persons	2) Trainees received: 29 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office and other facilities	3) Equipment: 125,774USD	3) Local cost: 129,000 USD
Japanese Side	Cambodian Side												
1) Experts: 11 persons	1) Staff allocated: 46 persons												
2) Trainees received: 29 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office and other facilities												
3) Equipment: 125,774USD	3) Local cost: 129,000 USD												
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2006	Project Period	December 2005-December 2010	Project Cost	477 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries												

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
This project has been highly consistent with Cambodia's development policy such as National Strategic Development Plan (2014-2018), National Forest Programme (NFP) (2010-2029) and other documents which regard the sustainable utilization and management of natural resources are important, development needs for capacity development of local FA officers to support local people on CF legalization and sustainable community resource management at the time of both ex-ante and project completion. It was also consistent with Japan's ODA policy (Country Assistance Program to Cambodia) at the time of ex-ante evaluation as it sets the environmental protections as one of the priority areas. Therefore, relevance of the project is high.
2 Effectiveness/Impact
The project mainly implemented (1) Development of training plan/curriculum/materials, (2) Implementation of training to FA officers in the FP sites and other FA officers, (3) implementation of CF activities in the FP sites. CF activities include (i) support for CF legalization related activities such as CF Management Committee (CFMC) election, development of CFMC's By-law, CF legislation, and boundary demarcation, (ii) Livelihood related activities such as chicken farming, vegetable cultivation, compost production, fish farming, and fruit tree production, and (iii) Forestry related activities such as CF patrolling, fire break establishment, boundary post installation, plantation, extension of forestry law, extension of forest fire, signboard installation and map sign board installation. Through these capacity development of FA officers and implementation of CF activities in FP sites, the project aimed that CF members obtain method and know-how to secure sustainable utilization of community resources. At the time of project completion ¹ , it was deemed difficult to prospect full achievement of the project purpose. It is confirmed

¹ Status at the time of terminal evaluation (June 2010) is quoted as the status of the project completion, as there is no data available at project completion.

that certain number of CF members were involved with CF activities, but those who actually applied the transferred techniques did not reach 70% of the CF members (see the details in the chart below)².

At the time of ex-post evaluation, 85% of the interviewed CF members are “involved” in their CF activities with strong motivation and commitment in sustainable utilization of their community natural resources, and 47% of interviewed CF members “applied” transferred techniques and information. For example, it is observed that skills introduced by the project such as “Compost Production” and fertilization of paddy fields are utilized by most of interviewed CF members. However, some of the techniques transferred were abandoned and not applied by the CF member as it is not practical. For instance, “Fish Farming” was abandoned by most of CF members at Boeng Kok CF due to dried up ponds during dry season. For the CF legalization process, among the 7 target CFs under the project, 3 CFs have been legalized by the ministry order (hereinafter referred to as ‘Prakas’), while the remaining 4 CFs are still on the process of the legalization at the time of ex-post evaluation³. Interviews with CF members indicate that some of the CF activities such as election of CFMC, CF patrolling, firebreak establishment and others have been carried out to some extent. However, CF activities, especially livelihood activities have been very limitedly supported by FA, particularly for the target CF without Prakas, because the budget from MAFF was not allocated for implementing CF activities. Training courses for FA officers were provided in 2011 and 2012 with financial support from JICA and DANIDA.

As for overall goal, participatory community resource management activities have been initiated outside 7 CFs, where FAs support CFs with assistance from development partners and NGOs. Especially in Kampong Thom Province, 82 CFs are carrying out CF activities and 72 CFs are supported by development partners/NGOs whose support covers preparation of CF Management Plan (CFMP) and Livelihood Supporting Program. In the whole country, the number of CFs legalized and the land area under CF management have increased (see the indicator 6 of the chart below.). However, it is hard to confirm at the time of ex-post evaluation, how the project’s achievement has contributed to this increase because the number of FA officers in other areas than the project target FP sites, who took part in the training by the project/ refer to the project and actually supported CF activities, were not available. In the target 7 CFs, interviews with CF members revealed that importance of CF activities has been widely recognized by CF Members. Most of the CF members interviewed responded that they obtain benefit from the CFs, and feel that CF activities have contributed to improve their daily livelihood, and they recognize that natural resources have been improved by CF activities. Meanwhile, some members of the CFs, which were not legalized by Prakas, are being frustrated with the long and unclear CF legalization process.

No negative impacts were observed⁴. However the issue of duplication of land with Economic Land Concession (ELC) in CF has not been solved and the affected CF have strongly requested support from MAFF regarding its legalization⁵. Positive impacts were observed in active participation of CF female committee members in their CF Activities. Most of them play leading roles in protecting the CF land encroachment. In case of Veal Okdei CF, female members have even filed their official complaints many times up to Provincial Governor to request for a proper resolution on the encroachment issues.

In light of the above, effectiveness/impact is fair.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Through the capacity building of Forestry Administration (FA) officers, sustainable utilization of community resources is secured for stabilizing the living of local people in the Field Project (FP) sites.	At each target CF, method and know-how to secure sustainable utilization of community resources are obtained by 70% of CF members by the end of the Project.	(Project Completion) 51% of interviewed CF members in 7 CFs “applied” transferred techniques and information, and 68% of interviewed CF members are “involved” in their planned activities as of June 2010. (Ex-post Evaluation) Out of 98 respondents in 7 CFs, 47% of interviewed CF members currently “applied” transferred techniques and information. 85% of the interviewees are “involved” in their CF activities.
(Overall goal) Sustainable community resources utilization by local people is secured in the area conducted participatory community resources management.	(Indicator 1) Practical examples of local people who started new activities and the kinds of resources management activities is increased.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Practical examples were not confirmed.
	(Indicator 2) Economic and social condition of local people in the area, particularly of poor people, is improved.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Most of the interviewees responded that they feel (think/ suppose) that CF activities introduced by the project have contributed to improve their daily livelihood.
	(Indicator 3) Natural resources including	(Ex-post Evaluation) Many of the interviewees have recognized

² CF members who were “involved with CF activities” refer to any members of the community who have been involved with the CF activities such as CF committee election, CF patrolling, etc. CF members “who actually applied the transferred technique” refer to any CF members who have applied the obtained technique provided by the project

³ It is informed at the time of ex-post evaluation that Local FAs (FAC) have sent their proposals to national FA and National FA has submitted those proposals to MAFF for the approval by Prakas. But the proposals were not approved. Later on some local FAs were informed that the re-submission of proposal for legalization of CF was necessary since the proposals should be categorized into “CF without conflict” and “CFs with conflict”. It was also informed that no clear indication was given by the national FA to local FAs on how local FAs should proceed and with whom local FAs should consult to solve the problem. From the interview with the related officials, the reasons why there is little progress and who should be responsible to deal with this problem could not be identified at the time of ex-post evaluation.

⁴ No negative impact on natural environment was observed. There were no land acquisition and resettlement by the project. Although the possibility of the negative impact on the vulnerable people (*) was pointed out by the ex-ante evaluation, the survey to the vulnerable people was not able to be conducted at the time of ex-post evaluation due to the time constraint.

(*) Vulnerable people are people who rely on the forest resources but unable to participate in the CF at the time. (Ex-ante evaluation sheet),

⁵ This issue has existed before the project. During the project period, MAFF informed the Japanese side that they would tackle the issue but it could not be solved.

	forestry resources are improved.	that natural resources (including forestry resources) have increased or been stable after the completion of the project.
	(Indicator 4)Number of CF members is increased.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Although precise data is not available, the number of CF members at 2 target CFs with Prakas have increased or have been maintained whereas the number has decreased at the rest of the target CFs.
	(Indicator 5)CF and community resource management activities are diversified	(Ex-post Evaluation) Practical examples were not confirmed.
	(Indicator 6)Number of newly legalized CF and approved CFMP is improved.	(Ex-post Evaluation) (as of July 2014) - Total number of CFs in Cambodia which had started their legalization process: approximately 479 CFs (409,239 ha) - The number of CFs with issued Prakas increased from 281 CFs (244,256 ha) in 2011 to 345 CFs (308,563 ha) - The number of CFs which signed agreement with FA increased from 214 CFs (170,489ha) to 304 CFs (272,282 ha).
	(Indicator 7)Land area under CF management is increased.	(Ex-post Evaluation) See indicator 6

Source : (Project completion)Terminal evaluation report (Ex-post evaluation) Interviews with counterparts and CF members

3 Efficiency

While the project period was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 129%) because of the increase of the targeted CFs (5 to 7) and the number of trainees (1,500 to 1,899). Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, community forest is still given importance in the current development policy as Community Forestry Program is one of the six programs of the National Forest Program (NFP 2010-2029) which regards the sustainable utilization and management of natural resources (the overall goal of the project) are important.

Institutionally, organizational set up is partially inadequate and the number of staff is not sufficient to cope with their scope of works. The number of staff at local FA is not sufficient to provide support to CFs and each local FA is requesting FA national level to increase staff allocation.

For the technical aspect, program 5 of NFP that includes "capacity building" has been promoted. In 2011, Capacity Building Needs Assessment (CBNA) was conducted and the additional capacity building effort at the institutional level has started in 2012 based on the CBNA's recommendations. As the results, in 2014, new training programs have been launched with an integrity at all related departments of FA. Once these programs are getting on the right track, FA intends to consider further capacity building such as the program related to legal issues and the program for broader stakeholders. As to the support from FA to CFs, National and Provincial Community Forestry Program Coordinating Committees Processes (NCFPCCC and PCFPCCCs), as the main vehicle for moving program 4 of NFP, are arranging continuing technical and financial support in addition to the routine interventions (e.g.-monitoring, training, legalization) by FA (Community Forestry Office/FA Cantonments/Divisions/Triages). The status as of July 2014, 4 out of 7 CFs initiated by this project are intensively benefitting from this on-site support in addition to the policy and legal levels support.

CF activities both in the target FP sites and other areas have been also supported by development partners/NGOs, including dispatch of their advisors.

Financially, current guidance from the Royal Government of Cambodia is to allocate 50% of FA budget to expenditures related to NFP⁶. Most of the CF training and implementation are also supported by development partners' financial assistance.

From these findings, it is considered that the project has some problems in institutional and financial aspects of the implementing agency; therefore, sustainability of effects of the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has achieved the project purpose and overall goal at a limited level. The number of CF members actually applied the techniques and information transferred by the project has not reached the target and the CF activities have not fully continued under the circumstance that CF legalization process is stagnant and support from FA is limited. As for sustainability, while the project is still given importance in the current development policy, there are problems in terms of institutional, technical and financial aspects. The number of FA officers is insufficient to cope with their scope of works, and the CFs are very much dependent on development partners/NGOs technically and financially. For efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- 1) The acceleration of the legalization process by MAFF for the existing targeted CFs is necessary and moreover, the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) should conduct inter-ministerial coordination and to some extent should implement the law enforcement which can be effectively used as the mechanism to solve the on-going problems of encroachment or misallocation of the land of CF. The completion of the legalization process is not only the mean to tackle with the existing

⁶ It includes the program 4 (the support to CFs), the program 5 (capacity building related activities) and the REDD+ operational costs. Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD) is an effort to create a financial value for the carbon stored in forests, offering incentives for developing countries to reduce emissions from forested lands and invest in low-carbon paths to sustainable development. "REDD+" goes beyond deforestation and forest degradation, and includes the role of conservation, sustainable management of forests and enhancement of forest carbon stocks. (Source: UN-REDD program, <http://www.un-redd.org/aboutredd/tabid/102614/default.aspx>)

disputes but also the effective motivation for ensuring the existing high commitment of the CF members in involving with the CF activities. It will also help reduce the individual encroachments of forest.

- 2) It is necessary for MAFF and other relevant ministries such as Ministry of Economy and Finance to pay attention to the allocation of the national budget for the activities of FA in CF training and implementation. The budget should be particularly needed on (i) increasing staff allocation to FAC, FAD and FAT to match the needed responsibilities, and (ii) support for increasing number of CFs.
- 3) It is necessary for MAFF to coordinate more with FA particularly in the matters of CFs and ELCs.
- 4)

Lessons learned for JICA1) Respect of local knowledge and field level adaptation should be more implemented at the stage of project planning or adjustment during the project implementation to avoid the case of designing or providing the inputs to the activities which is not feasible for the beneficiaries (e.g. fish farming in this case).



(Nursery plantation)



(A Community Forests board map)