

Country Name	Project for Human Resource Development of Nursing/Midwifery
The Lao People's Democratic Republic	

I. Project Outline

Background	In the Lao People's Democratic Republic, nurses/midwives played an important role in providing health care services. However, due to the limited knowledge and skills, the quality of their services was low. In order to develop appropriate knowledge and skills, it was necessary to improve the education of nurses/midwives including improvement of clinical training. Also, it was essential to strengthen nursing/midwifery administration which is critical to implementation of effective education.						
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: The holistic system for development of nursing/midwifery personnel is established. Project Purpose: The basis for development of nursing/midwifery personnel is improved, and nursing/midwifery education system is strengthened. 						
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Champasak province (model province); Vientiane Capital (where College of Health Technology (CHT) is located) and 6 provinces (Vientiane, Khammuane, Savannakhet, Champasak, Luangphrabang, Oudomxayi; where Public Health Schools (PHSs), including Champasak College of Health Sciences (CHS), are located) (target sites) Main activities: (1) development of nursing and midwifery regulations and related guidelines, (2) selection and formation of technical team (TT), (3) training of trainers (TOT) by TT, and (4) development of training materials. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 16 persons (5 long-term and 11 short-term) Trainees received: 16 persons Equipment: PCs, audiovisual equipment and training equipment Others: 12 third-country experts (invited from Thailand), cost for training implementation, and construction cost of nursing/midwifery training center </td> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> Laotian Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 13 persons Land and facilities: Office for experts and land for construction of the project office (training center) Local cost: Personnel cost for C/Ps, partial cost for equipment necessary for activity implementation and consumables </td> </tr> </table> 					Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 16 persons (5 long-term and 11 short-term) Trainees received: 16 persons Equipment: PCs, audiovisual equipment and training equipment Others: 12 third-country experts (invited from Thailand), cost for training implementation, and construction cost of nursing/midwifery training center 	Laotian Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 13 persons Land and facilities: Office for experts and land for construction of the project office (training center) Local cost: Personnel cost for C/Ps, partial cost for equipment necessary for activity implementation and consumables
Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 16 persons (5 long-term and 11 short-term) Trainees received: 16 persons Equipment: PCs, audiovisual equipment and training equipment Others: 12 third-country experts (invited from Thailand), cost for training implementation, and construction cost of nursing/midwifery training center 	Laotian Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 13 persons Land and facilities: Office for experts and land for construction of the project office (training center) Local cost: Personnel cost for C/Ps, partial cost for equipment necessary for activity implementation and consumables 						
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2005	Project Period	May 2005 to May 2010	Project Cost	344 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Department of Organization and Personnel (DOP) and Department of Health Care (DHC, former Department of Curative Medicine, DCM), of Ministry of Health (MOH)						
Cooperation Agency in Japan	The Japanese Red Cross Kyushu International College of Nursing						

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance	<p>This project has been highly relevant with Lao PDR's development policy and development needs at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion. For the development policy, it is consistent with "strengthening the capacity of health staff in terms of attitudes, ethics, and technical skills" listed amongst the six key principles in the Health Strategy 2020, and "human resources development of healthcare providers" as one of the key issues of the Sixth Five-year Health Sector Plan (2006-2010). For the development needs, it is consistent with "developing nurses/midwives with appropriate knowledge and techniques", for which improvement of education of nurses/midwives and strengthening of nursing/midwifery administration were essential. It is also consistent with Japan's ODA policy, JICA's Country Assistance Program (2006), at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact	<p>This project aims to produce the two major outputs (a) improvement of nursing/midwifery administration such as development of regulations and guidelines, and (b) improvement of nursing/midwifery education focusing on establishment of the fundamental nursing training (development of teaching materials, TOT¹ and piloting of PHS-PH collaboration for clinical practice in the model province). For the project purpose, such outputs were expected to be utilized in the model province and be ready for utilization in other target sites by the end of the project period. For the overall goal, the outputs were expected to be utilized in all seven target sites as part of the holistic nursing/midwifery education system.</p> <p>As a result of the project implementation, all the outputs were produced as planned. However, the project purpose of improving the basis for nursing/midwifery personnel development was partially achieved by the time of project completion. In terms of the component (a), regulations and guidelines on clinical practice, etc. were developed and utilized in the model province. However, the Nursing Technical Supporting Committee (NTSC), which the project set up as a consultative body for TT, did not start discussions on revision of the guidelines such as Guidelines for Scope of the Nursing practice as envisaged. As for the component (b) on the fundamental nursing training, 13 TT members (registered as Central Trainers (CTs) at MOH as of</p>

¹ Training was designed in a form of cascade as follows: (1) Japanese and third-country experts train TT members; (2) TT members train nursing teachers/clinical practice instructors of PHS/PH to become Regional Trainers (RTs); and (3) RTs train in-service nurses of PH who will be the clinical practice instructors for students. It was planned that during the project implementation period, the (1) and (2) would cover all target sites and (3) would be conducted in the model province.

September 2009) were trained, and they trained 200 Regional Trainers (hereinafter referred to as 'RTs'). Then those 200 RTs trained a total of 1,673 in-service nurses in the 7 target sites including the model province by the end of the project. The interviewed PHS/PH said the training enhanced the trainees' skills on correcting common wrong practice observed in the ward such as wound care, vital sign check, and others. However, there might be some room for improvement in training methodology/skills of trainers because only a small number of trainees reached the expected skill level in some subject.

After completion of the project, the major project achievements except NTSC² have been maintained. The overall goal of establishing the holistic system for development of nursing/midwifery personnel can be said to have been partially achieved. MOH and interviewed PHSs/PHs commented that the implementation of fundamental nursing training was integrated to a routine duty at PHSs/PHs of all target sites, some non-target provinces as well as central hospitals in Vientiane Municipality at the time of ex-post evaluation. This integration was attributed to TT and RT trained by the project and the training monitoring budget allocated by MOH. The training has contributed to provide better knowledge and higher confidence in teaching and giving clinical instructions to teachers/ clinical practice instructors and in-service nurses. The remaining tasks such as establishment of training courses other than fundamental nursing and certification of trainers are being dealt with in the JICA's technical cooperation project, "Project for Sustainable Development of Human Resource for Health to Improve Maternal, Neonatal and Child Health Services (HRH Project)" (2012-2016). On the other hand, the data/information was not available to fully verify the designated indicators of the overall goal, such as employment rate of PHS graduates and implementation record of training in all target sites.

Therefore, effectiveness/ impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																					
(Project Purpose) The basis for development of nursing/midwifery personnel is improved, and nursing/midwifery education system is strengthened.	Keeping and installation condition of the Nursing and Midwifery Regulations, Guidelines for the Scope of the Nursing Practice, and School Management and Implementation Guideline at related facilities in model province.	(Project Completion) The Regulations and Guidelines were kept and installed at PHS and PH in Champasak. (Ex-post Evaluation) The Regulations and Guidelines are found useful and utilized at PHS/PH in Champasak and other target sites as well as central hospitals. They were also incorporated into the curriculum of "Nursing Ethics".																					
	NTSC will continue activities by following the term of reference (TOR) (ex. the draft revision of Guidelines for Scope of the Nursing practice is made).	(Project Completion) After established in Jan. 2008, NTSC gave comments and discussed topics following its TOR, but did not discuss revision of the Guidelines. (Ex-post Evaluation) NTSC did not continue activities related to the revision of the Guidelines due to lack of capacity/experience.																					
	The fundamental nursing training program is established (progress rate of knowledge and skills of TT members regarding fundamental nursing and teaching methods/the number of nursing teachers, clinical practice instructors and nurses who took the fundamental training course).	(Project Completion) 13 trainers were registered as CTs (TT members), who would be able to conduct training based on the gained knowledge/capacity. The number of trainees is shown in the table below. Average scores of the post- tests are higher than those of the pre-test for RTs and nurses, but in skill test of vital sign, only 20% of trainees achieved expected level. <table border="1" data-bbox="651 1265 1535 1534"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Cham-pasak CHS/ PH</th> <th>Other 6 PHS/ PH</th> <th>Central hospitals in Vientiane Municipality¹</th> <th>Training for newly hired PHS teachers²</th> <th>Training for 6 provinces in the Northern area³</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>No. of teachers and clinical practice instructors trained (to become RT) by CTs</td> <td>24</td> <td>83</td> <td>18</td> <td>18+15</td> <td>42</td> <td>200</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of trainees trained by RTs</td> <td>100</td> <td>851</td> <td>722</td> <td>-</td> <td>-</td> <td>1,673</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Cham-pasak CHS/ PH	Other 6 PHS/ PH	Central hospitals in Vientiane Municipality ¹	Training for newly hired PHS teachers ²	Training for 6 provinces in the Northern area ³	Total	No. of teachers and clinical practice instructors trained (to become RT) by CTs	24	83	18	18+15	42	200	No. of trainees trained by RTs	100	851	722	-	-	1,673
	Cham-pasak CHS/ PH	Other 6 PHS/ PH	Central hospitals in Vientiane Municipality ¹	Training for newly hired PHS teachers ²	Training for 6 provinces in the Northern area ³	Total																	
No. of teachers and clinical practice instructors trained (to become RT) by CTs	24	83	18	18+15	42	200																	
No. of trainees trained by RTs	100	851	722	-	-	1,673																	
		*1-3: Although these are not planned as a part of the project, these training courses were implemented to meet the needs. In particular, *3 was implemented upon request of MOH. (Ex-post Evaluation) See Overall Goal. No information on the number of CTs and RTs.																					
(Overall goal) The holistic system for development of nursing/midwifery personnel is established.	Employment rate of graduates from the PHS, CHT.	(Ex-post Evaluation) No information is available. PHS and CHT do not collect the date related to the employment status of the graduates. . In general, the number of new recruitment of health personnel increased for health sector (MOH's quota for new staff: 2010=600, 2013=1,000, 2014=4,000).																					
	Training program for teachers and clinical practice instructors is established.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Department of Training and Research (DTR) of MOH conducted fundamental nursing training only once (2013) after the project (for 30 representatives from schools, central and provincial hospitals were attended) due to the budget constraints. Development of the holistic nurses/midwives development system is underway in the JICA's HRH project.																					
	The number of provinces (PHS, PH) which use fundamental nursing training program and	(Ex-post Evaluation) According to MOH, fundamental training course is continuously provided as routine duty in 7 provinces, but data on frequency of training is available only from Champasak PH and two central hospitals.																					

² NTSC did not continue the activities related to the revision of the regulations after project completion. However, former NTSC members said that they still extend their regular cooperation in the way of their routine duties. Meantime, MOH submitted a new Health Care Law in early 2014, which might require alignment of the regulations to the provisions of the law. This draft bill of the Health care Law also stipulates that every related document (such as regulations on nursing) should be reviewed and improved once every two years basis.

learning materials.						
		2010	2011	2012	2013	2014
	Champasak PH and 2 central hospitals (Setthathirath and Mahosot)	1 seminar /week	1 seminar /week	1 seminar /week	1 seminar /week	1 seminar /week
	Champasak College of Health Sciences (CHS)	data is not available	data is not available	3 courses for PH/ District Hospitals (DHs)	1 course for Champasak DH	data is not available
	Oudomxay PHS	25 persons/course	25 persons/course	25 persons/course	25 persons/course	Planning
Xiengkhuang PHS (new) (non-target province)	data is not available	data is not available	data is not available	1 course for PH/DHs	1 course for PH/DHs	
	No information is available on the use of learning materials.					
The number of provinces (PHS, PH) which use the guidance for clinical practice collaboration.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Champasak CHS/PH continuously uses the guidance. In other 6 provinces, no specific guidance is used but collaboration is regularly done in the same way as mentioned in the guidance.					

Sources: Terminal Evaluation Report; Project Completion Report; questionnaires and interviews with PHSs and PHs.

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 91% and 100% respectively). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, this project is still given importance in the current development policy as the Seventh Five-year Health Sector Plan (2011-2015), Health Strategy 2020, Health Personnel Development Strategy 2020 (under Health Strategy 2020), Health Sector Reform Strategy by 2020 (a policy to accelerate Health Strategy 2020), as well as the Health Care Law (under review at the time of ex-post evaluation) all support nursing/midwifery personnel development.

In the institutional aspect, the organizational structure of DOP and DHC was strengthened compared to the structure at the time of project completion, i.e., new divisions or departments related to health care personnel development, such as DTR has been established or separated from DOP. The demarcation is that DTR is for health personnel training, while DOP focuses on personnel management. At the same time, the Health Care Professional Regulatory Office of DHC also was created. Responsibility over the fundamental nursing training is assumed by DTR from the year 2012. Although the number of staff is generally insufficient, DTR and DHC have managed.

In the technical aspect, ex-counterpart personnel of DTR and DHC are still working in the same area, and CTs continue training as well. Although there is no regular support from CTs for RTs after the project because of CTs' workload, RTs can function by themselves. Most of schools continue training by their own efforts.

The financial aspect is different by type of organization. At hospitals such as PH, as the fundamental nursing training is a part of routine work and conducted by regular budget, only a small additional budget for necessary stationary for each training is accommodated by each institute. At education institutes, they need special budget for conducting the training. They rely on donors' cooperation programs or apply to MOH for support but it is not always responded due to budget constraints of MOH. At DTR, the special budget is necessary for participants from provinces; therefore they can conduct training only when budget from MOH is available³.

From these findings, it is considered that the project has some problems in technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency; therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has partially achieved the project purpose and the overall goal. For the project purpose, the regulations and guidelines for nursing/midwifery clinical practice were developed and began utilized by PHS/PH, and the fundamental training program was developed and began provided by the trained CTs and RTs, while NTSC did not function in an expected way. For the overall goal, regulations/guidelines and the fundamental nursing training were continuously used/conducted, which constituted part of the holistic system for developing nursing/midwifery personnel, but sufficient information was not collected to fully verify the achievement level. As for sustainability, this project is still given importance in the current development policy. However, there are problems in terms of technical and financial aspects such as no regular follow-ups of RTs by CTs, and conduct of training, which is dependent on the availability of budget, is not constant.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency

(1) In order to ensure further achievement of the project purpose and overall goal, MOH, especially DTR/DHC should conduct regular monitoring and maintain use of the outputs of the project. Such activities should be integrated, monitored and well recorded. For example, utilization of developed regulations and guidelines and the fundamental nursing training system should be monitored as components of the holistic nursing/midwifery personnel development system.

(2) MOH is recommended to allocate budget to constantly hold nursing training so that every institute can carry on the nursing training with a standardized progress and quality, which will be essential in pursuit of the MOH's recent initiative for health

³ In 2013, the center got budget of 50 million kip from MOH. Then they held a two-week training for about 30 persons. For 2014, the budget is under consideration by MOH (as of July 2014).

personnel development including qualified nurses/midwives.

Lessons learned for JICA

(1) The outputs that were well maintained and continued after the project were the ones that were particularly responding to the essential needs of the Lao PDR side to develop a basic framework and human resources of nursing/midwifery. Therefore, when designing a project in which continuous use of the outputs is essential, the outputs should be fully consistent with national development needs.

(2) It is observed at the time of ex-post evaluation that the project activities are continued and outputs as well as effects are sustained, but it was difficult to objectively and quantitatively verify those situations as the monitoring tool was not defined and the operation and related data was not recorded after the project completion. It would be better to support/advise the implementing agency to develop monitoring and evaluation tools during the project period. By utilizing the developed tools, the implementing agency can understand and analyze their own progress/status and utilize the data for future activities.



Nursing Regulation Poster-Setthathirath Hosp.



Regulations/Guidelines of Nursing/Midwifery