

Country Name	The Project for Capacity Development of the Tourism Self-Management Committee
Republic of Guatemala	

I. Project Outline

Background	Guatemala has abundant touristic resources such as nature, heritages and indigenous cultures. On the other hand, potential touristic resources, which are scattered in the country, had not be well used since most foreign tourists mainly visited famous touristic areas, including Tikal and Antigua designated as UNESCO World Heritage and picturesque sites such as Lake Atitlán. In addition, natural environment conservation for touristic resources had been an urgent issue to be addressed since deforestation in rural mountainous and intermountain areas had been deteriorated. Under those circumstances, the Government of Guatemala introduced the Local Committee of Tourism in 2000 and promoted decentralization of tourism administration. The Local Committee of Tourism was reorganized as the Tourism Self-Management Committee (CATs: Comité de Autogestión Turística) in 2004. JICA supported formulation of the National Tourism Master Plan through conducting the Development Study in 2002. In that context, the Government of Guatemala requested the Government of Japan to provide technical cooperation for institutional enhancement of CATs, establishment of networks among relevant organizations as well as sustainable tourism promotion utilizing local potentials.														
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Sustainable tourism and conservation of natural and cultural tourism resources in the region are promoted, that contribute to the economic development and poverty reduction. Project Purpose: The management capacity of the Tourism Self-Management Committee is strengthened and tourism based on the use of local resources in the areas of las Verapaces and Petén is offered. 														
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Petén, Alta Verapaz and Baja Verapaz Main activities: Formulation of Tourism Strategic Plans for CATs, establishment of collaborative support mechanism for micro touristic firms, development of manuals and teaching materials and delivery of trainings for touristic resource management, marketing and promotion, implementation of tourism promotion and events. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Guatemalan Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 6 persons</td> <td>1. Staff allocated: 6 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 6 persons</td> <td>2. Land and facilities: spaces for project office, cost for electricity and water</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: PC, printer, video camera, GIS software, and so on.</td> <td>3. Cost for tourism promotion, events and seminars, and so on</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Third country training in Mexico: 39 persons</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 					Japanese Side	Guatemalan Side	1) Experts: 6 persons	1. Staff allocated: 6 persons	2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2. Land and facilities: spaces for project office, cost for electricity and water	3) Equipment: PC, printer, video camera, GIS software, and so on.	3. Cost for tourism promotion, events and seminars, and so on	4) Third country training in Mexico: 39 persons	
Japanese Side	Guatemalan Side														
1) Experts: 6 persons	1. Staff allocated: 6 persons														
2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2. Land and facilities: spaces for project office, cost for electricity and water														
3) Equipment: PC, printer, video camera, GIS software, and so on.	3. Cost for tourism promotion, events and seminars, and so on														
4) Third country training in Mexico: 39 persons															
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2007	Project Period	September 2007 to September 2010	Project Cost	253 million yen										
Implementing Agency	Guatemala Tourist Institution (INGUAT), Secretary of Planing and Programming of the Presidency (SEGEPLAN), Technical Institution for Training and Productivity (INTECAP), CATs in the target regions														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Oriental Consultants Co., Ltd.														

II. Result of the Evaluation¹

1 Relevance
This project has been highly relevant with Guatemala's development policy "tourism promotion by public and private collaboration" under the National Tourism Strategy (2000), the Agricultural Development Plan (2004) and the Guatemala National Policy for Sustainable Tourism Development 2004-2014, and development needs for tourism development utilizing local resources at the both times of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. It is also consistent with priority on sustainable economic development specified by the policy dialogue between the government of Guatemala and the government of Japan at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.
2 Effectiveness/Impact
The project supported institutional capacity building of CATs, identification and promotion of touristic products and improvement of touristic infrastructure and services in the target areas of Petén, Alta Verapace and Baja Verapace. Through those activities, the project aimed at promotion of sustainable tourism development and natural and cultural resource conservation, thereby contributing to economic development and poverty reduction in the target areas. The Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion. In terms of identification and promotion of touristic products as a part of the outputs, the maximum 10,000 copies of leaflets for touristic products of each CAT were sufficient to deliver to the tourists visiting the target areas. In addition, the number of touristic products in each municipality in the target areas increased from 66 items in 2008 to 146 items in June, 2010. Also, during the period from 2008 to 2010, the number of

¹ In March 2008, the Project Design Matrix (PDM) was revised to PDM Ver.2 since the number of verifiable indicators set in the original PDM was too much and most of them had limited availability of data.

tourism companies and employees increased in each municipality of the target areas. During the project implementation period, 4 CATs carried out 120 times of promotion activities in total. The number of CAT members increased from 144 persons in 2008 to 300 persons in 2010 while the number of business types of CAT member also increased from 73 types to 94 types for the same period. Also, the number of visitors in each touristic site of the target areas expanded. The driving force of the increase in the number of visitors was ensured year-round accessibility to touristic sites in the mountainous areas due to maintenance of the paved roads such as “the Road of Quetzal” and “Mundo Maya Corridor” in addition to the increase in total number of tourists countrywide.

After the project completion, 83 CAT members engaged in 78 businesses have been continuing the activities. The necessary number of CAT members retained in order to sustain the activities at the time of ex-post evaluation. The decrease in the number of CAT members can be attributed to a decrease in the CAT budget and in the number of promoters providing technical support for CAT due to the financial difficulty of CATs. Also, the less incentive for CAT members to continue the CAT activities may cause of

the decrease in the number of members since the INGUAT Tourism Program to promote domestic tours targeting Guatemalan people were terminated in 2012. The number of touristic products in municipalities of the target areas decreased from 118 items to 61 items at the time of ex-post evaluation. However, the necessary number of touristic products has been sustained as well. At the time of project implementation, the CAT with the network among the public sector, community and micro tourism firms have been sustaining. 4 CATs have been maintaining the networks since the project completion. On the other hand, some CATs did not maintain the network because the members prioritize their individual activities rather than activities as CAT. Some parts of the guide panels and service facilities developed by the pilot activities of the project have not been maintained. Manuals for maintenance of the facilities were lost. The majority of CAT attributed the inappropriate maintenance to the lack of budget for maintenance. The website developed by the project is not operated as a portal site of each CAT for tourism promotion since the concept of the website was not taken over by the current CATs and no responsible person is deployed for the website. However, after the project completion, the number of tourists accommodated in the target areas increased by around 18% during the period from 2010 to 2012 (from 198,967 guests in 2010 to 234,032 guests in 2012). Although data of after the project completion have not been collected, it can be assumed that the number of visitors for the touristic sites in the target areas have been increased as well.

For the Overall Goal to aim at contribution to economic development and poverty reduction in the target areas through natural and cultural resource conservation, 3 rehabilitation projects using the community maps developed by the project and 3 resource conservation projects were implemented. Although no data for the number of employees in the tourism industry has been collected, it was confirmed that the number of hotels in the target provinces increased from 363 in 2010 to 403 in 2012. Also, it is assumed that the project contributed to the local economic promotion such as the increase in the number of touristic companies and the employees despite no quantitative data of sales and revenue of the touristic companies in the target areas which participated in the seminars and the trainings organized by the project. The Salamá CAT showed a good practice for tourism promotion. Using the third country training in Mexico and experiences in the project, the Salamá CAT constructed a museum exhibiting Marimba, a traditional xylophone, and quetzal (the national bird). It attracted 800-1,000 tourists a year and periodical visits by the youth studying at the faculty of tourism. Furthermore, as a part of CAT activities, trash boxes at the touristic sites in the target areas were installed by the project. Those activities may increase awareness of natural resource conservation.

In the light of the findings of this ex-post evaluation, effectiveness/impact of the project is fair due to the insufficient continuation of the outputs and the Project Purpose and the lack of a part of data as evidence to verify achievement of the Overall Goal despite the achievement of the Project Purpose and the planned outputs by the project completion and the good practices contributing to the touristic, natural and cultural conservation and local economic development for the Overall Goal.



At Eco quetzal: Exhibition of the map developed by the project

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicator	Results
(Project Purpose) Tourism promotion using local resources in Alta Verapace, Baja Verapace and Petén	Indicator 1: Amount of annual budget of CATS	(Project Completion) The budget increased (Ex-post Evaluation) The exact amount of annual budget specific to CATS was difficult to calculate because it is allocated not only by the Directorate of CAT itself but also other departments such as the Unit of Product Development of the Planning/Administration Department to a great extent.
	Indicator 2: Items of the annual CAT budget	(Project Completion) No data available (Ex-post Evaluation) No data available
	Indicator 3: Number of tourism related establishments	(Project Completion) Increased from 2,208 companies in 2008 to 2,907 in 2010 (Ex-post evaluation)

		Verified for the Overall Goal
	Indicator 4: Number of tourism related employments	(Project Completion) Increased from 5,724 employees in 2008 to 9,353 in 2010 (Ex-post evaluation) Verified for the Overall Goal
	Indicator 5: Number of hotel rooms	(Project Completion) No data available (Ex-post Evaluation) No data available
	Supplemental Information: Number of promotion activities by CATs in the target provinces by the project completion	(Project Completion) 4 CATs implemented 120 times of activities in total by 2010. (Ex-post Evaluation) The number of CAT members who continue the activities was 83 persons. The number of new comers after the project completion was 16 persons. The number of types of business of CAT members was 78 in total.
	Supplemental Information: Number of visitors in the touristic sites of the target areas from the start to the completion of the project	(Project Completion) Increased from 0.8304 million in 2008 to 1.008 million as of June 2010. (Ex-post evaluation) The number of hotel guests in the target provinces ➤ Petén: increased from 61,000 in 2010 to 84,000 in 2012 ➤ Alta Verapace: 12,000 in 2010 to 14,000 in 2012 ➤ Baja Verapace: 12,500 in 2010 to 13,500 in 2012
(Overall Goal) Promotion of sustainable touristic and natural and cultural resource conservation and contribution to local economic development and poverty reduction by tourism promotion	Indicator 1: Number of tourist arrivals to the tourism sites	(Ex-post evaluation) Verified for the Project Purpose
	Indicator 2: Number of establishments that obtained environmental certification	(Ex-post evaluation) No data available
	[Promotion of sustainable touristic, natural and cultural resource conservation] Number of projects rehabilitation and conservation of natural and cultural resources using community maps developed by the project	(Ex-post evaluation) - Rehabilitation projects for natural and touristic resources: 3 projects - Conservation projects for natural and touristic resources: 3 projects
	[Contribution to local economic development and poverty reduction] Increase in the number of tourism related establishments in the target areas (Indicator 3 for the Project Purpose)	(Ex-post evaluation) The main tourism industry is hotels in the target provinces. The number of hotels increased from 363 in 2010 to 403 in 2013.
	Supplemental Information: Increase in the number of employees engaged in tourism related establishments after the project completion	(Ex-post evaluation) It can be assumed that the number of employees has increased since the number of hotels increased from 363 in 2010 to 403 in 2013.
	Increase in sales and revenue of tourism related establishments which participated in the seminar/training* implemented by the project (Indicator 4 for the Project Purpose)	(Ex-post evaluation) According to the interviews with the stakeholders, the sales and revenue of the tourism related establishments tend to increase despite no data of precise sales and revenue available.

Note: Tourism product development, marketing, ecotourism and so on.

Source: Terminal Evaluation Report, interviews with counterparts and stakeholders in the target areas.

3 Efficiency

Although the project period was as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 112%) because of necessity for additional activities such as activities for CAT at provincial level and monitoring after the Mid-Term Review. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, although the long-term policies, such as the Guatemala National Policy for Sustainable Tourism Development (2012-2022) and the Sustainable Tourism Master Plan (2014-2024), prioritize tourism promotion, a specific road map and activities for implementation of the policies are not clearly set forth. Institutionally, the CAT coordinator who was the counterpart of the project continuously works at INAGUAT despite that the number of the Tourism Promoters decreased from 14 persons in 2010 to 7 persons in 2014 at the time of ex-post evaluation. On the other hand, INAGUAT plans to provide supports such as trainings, project formulation, tradition conservation, and tourism development promotion through wide range of touristic companies for tourism promotion. In the technical aspect, the knowledge, experience and knowhow acquired through the trainings by the project have been taken over by the CAT coordinator of INAGUA who has been continuously working despite no further technical transfer using the CAT manual developed by the project. In addition, the tourism trainings have been continued by INAGUAT. As for the financial aspect, the exact amount of annual budget specific to CATS was

difficult to calculate but it is confirmed that the cost for activities concerning CAT such as cost for the promotion trainings and events has been covered by the budget from the Unit of Product Development of the Planning Department. The amount of total budget of INAGUAT is not changed after the project completion but the allocated amount to each department was changed. For example, the budget for the Directorate of CAT was reduced by 75% and the budget for the promotion, trainings and events has been moved to the Unit of Product Development of the Planning Department. Further, Some CATs collect membership fees in order to ensure own revenue but they cannot cover all the necessary costs for trainings and so forth.

From these findings, it is considered that the project has some problems in policy, institutional and financial aspects of the implementing agencies; therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

By the project, tourism promotion using local resource in the target three provinces as the Project Purpose has been achieved since the number of visitors in the target provinces increased through implementation and continuation of the promotion activities by CAT. As for the Overall Goal, the project contributed to the promotion of the local economies, such as the increases in the number of the touristic companies and their employees by the efforts for natural and cultural resource conservation. As for sustainability, the policy implementation has not been clear despite the importance of the tourism promotion. As a result, the number of the Tourism Promoters of INAGUAT has been reduced and the budgets for the Directorate of CAT and CATs have not been sufficient besides the budgets for trainings and events. Hence, there have been some problems in the policy, institutional and financial aspects. In terms of the technical aspect, the knowledge, experience and knowhow acquired through the project have been taken over since the counterpart of the project has been continuing the activities as the CAT coordinator of INAGUAT. As for efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan.

In the light above, this project evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

【INAGUAT】

- It is required to promptly implement specific actions to support CATs, including budget allocation for the Directorate of CAT and CATs and deployment of the Tourism Promoters, in order to materialize a long term tourism promotion policy.

Lessons learned for JICA

- At the time of the Mid-term Review and the Terminal Evaluation, it was difficult to collect data and to assess achievements since the verifiable indicators and the target values had not been appropriately determined and the data collection strategies for the verifiable indicators had not been clearly defined. Although the ex-post evaluation study tried to collect supplemental information, there was no choice to make evaluation analysis based on insufficient data. For example, in Guatemala, statistical data are not sufficiently available at national level since the National Census has not been conducted since 2002. Therefore, it is difficult to completely figure out the number of tourists, touristic companies, and their employees in the target areas of the project from the statistical data to be provided by the government. In addition, it was also hard to collect data by the same methodology and to make comparable analysis because it was unclear how to collect data at the time of the project formulation, the Mid-term Review and the Terminal Evaluation. Therefore, it is necessary to sufficiently consider adequate verifiable indicators and target values and clearly define them. Also, it is essential to collect baseline data, to conduct regular monitoring during the implementation period as well as to record how to collect data. Moreover, in the country like Guatemala where statistical data is not available, it is inevitable to examine feasibility to collect data for the indicators in long term at the time of project formulation. Also, technical transfer on measuring the indicators during the implementation period is needed to enable the counterparts to understand continuation of project effects and achievement of the Overall Goal even after the project completion.