

Country Name	The Project for Strengthening Technical and Vocational Training Management Skills in Technical and Vocational Training Organization
Islamic Republic of Iran	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	In Iran, youth unemployment rate with the level of around 10% was a social problem (2005). The vocational training in Iran was implemented mainly by the Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO) under the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA), which had 588 Technical and Vocational Training Centers (TVTC) throughout the country and provided vocational training to about 1.8 million people a year (2007). TVTO's training contents, however, did not meet the needs of labor market. Also, TVTO did not have an efficient instrument to review, evaluate, and improve the training courses.												
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall Goal: The CBT<sup>(Note1)</sup> approach becomes a basis of the training structure of Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO).</li> <li>Project Purpose: TVTO's training management cycle is improved.</li> </ol> <p>(Note 1) CBT stands for competency-based training, and is the training based on the needs in the industry. The CBT method is merely an instrument, and its purpose is to establish a training management cycle for implementing training that reflects the needs in the industry (gathering information on the needs in the labor market, development of curriculum and training materials based on labor needs, implementation of training, monitoring/evaluation after the training and reflecting the results in the training).</p>												
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: Tehran and Karaj</li> <li>Main activities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Training of TVTO staff, 2) development of standard and training curriculum for pilot training course, 3) develop guideline and training materials, 4) implement pilot training course, 5) develop training and monitoring system, and 6) develop training management improvement plan.</li> </ol> </li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Iranian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 8 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 29 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 8 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Project office and equipment for pilot training course</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Office equipment (PC and printers, etc.)</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>					Japanese Side	Iranian Side	1) Experts: 8 persons	1) Staff allocated: 29 persons	2) Trainees received: 8 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office and equipment for pilot training course	3) Equipment: Office equipment (PC and printers, etc.)	
Japanese Side	Iranian Side												
1) Experts: 8 persons	1) Staff allocated: 29 persons												
2) Trainees received: 8 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office and equipment for pilot training course												
3) Equipment: Office equipment (PC and printers, etc.)													
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2007	Project Period	July 2007 – December 2010	Project Cost	287 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare (MHLW), Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan</li> <li>PADECO</li> </ul>												

**II. Result of the Evaluation<sup>1</sup>****1 Relevance**

This project has been highly relevant with Iranian development policy "improvement of vocational training system" as set in the policy documents including, the Fourth Five-Year National Development Plan (2005-2009) and Fifth Five-Year National Development Plan (2010-2014), and development needs of resolving the mismatch between training standards and courses and the needs of the labor market and employment, and strengthening the improvement process of training evaluation and courses at TVTO at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion. It is also consistent with Japan's Country Assistance Plan for Iran (2007) as well as JICA's Country Assistant Program for Iran (2004) at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

On the other hand, some problems were identified in the project design during the project period. Firstly, although the CBT approach has been recognized as an effective approach in the vocational training in Iran at the time of ex-post evaluation<sup>2</sup>, the approach based on CBT was not necessarily appropriate as an area to be supported by Japan since CBT had not been commonly practiced in Japan and the Japanese resource was limited.<sup>3</sup> Secondly, in this project, the overall goal was revised two times during the project period in order to specify the expected project impact, which is very rare, as it might change the project itself.<sup>4</sup> Thirdly, the selection of the counterpart department/section and personnel which was influenced by political factors made it difficult to implement the technical transfer project. The frequent changes in the counterpart unit/department of the project and a decrease in the number of trainers who were the key agent to disseminate the CBT approach hampered the project from producing outputs as planned.

<sup>1</sup> There was a revision of overall goal as follows: (i) in PDM0 at ex-ante evaluation in 2007, the overall goal was set as "unemployment, especially of youth and women is improved"; (ii) in PDM1 at mid-term review in 2009, it was revised to "the National Vocational Qualification in labor force is improved; and (iii) in PDM2 at terminal evaluation in 2010, it was further revised to "the CBT approach becomes a basis of the training structure of TVTO".

<sup>2</sup> For example, it is confirmed that the 1,500 standards were developed and the CBT approach was mentioned in the "Guideline for Development of Curriculum and Executive Plans of TVTO".

<sup>3</sup> In order to efficiently introduce the CBT approach, the project mobilized an Australian expert in CBT. ("The Terminal Evaluation Study Report (Japanese Version), pp.32-33)

<sup>4</sup> Mentioned in the Mid-term Review Study Report (p.6) and the Terminal Evaluation Study Report (p.3)

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project aims to improve TVTO's training management cycle through introducing CBT approach.

The project purpose was achieved at the time of project completion although there were changes in Iranian counterpart section/department as well as Project Design Matrix (PDM).<sup>5</sup> The indicator 1 "Pilot training course is planned and implemented twice until the end of the project" was achieved. The project developed and implemented two pilot training courses with participation of seven instructors and 24 trainees, which covered 10 out of 21 Units of Competence (UOC)<sup>(Note 2)</sup> in the Automotive Certificate II level. The indicator 2 "Experiences and lessons from the implementation of pilot training course are analyzed and reported" was achieved. The project produced (i) the CBT manual containing manual on competency standard development, manual on CBT delivery and manual on monitoring and evaluation, (ii) the workbooks for the first pilot training course and second pilot training course, (iii) the introduction program for developing and delivering a competency based curriculum, and (iv) the report on needs assessment survey results for the pilot training courses. As for indicator 4 "Based on the experience and lessons from pilot training course, a plan for training management improvement is completed at the end of the project", it was achieved. The project produced the second edition of TVTO training management improvement plan (English version) by the project completion for institutionalizing training management cycle through introducing CBT approach to TVTO. However, the ex-post evaluation as well as the terminal evaluation did not verify the achievement of indicator 3 "The trainees' satisfaction rate of pilot training is better than that of other courses" because it was difficult to compare trainees' satisfaction between pilot trainings and other ordinary courses of TVTO since there were differences in training contents and training environment.

After project completion, TVTO has continued to conduct two pilot training courses developed by the project, and developed more than 1500 CBT standard and curricula<sup>6</sup>. According to TVTO, the experience and know-how of training management cycle based on CBT approach including steps of needs assessment, establishment of training course standard and curriculum planning, and course monitoring and evaluation, been shared with the staff of respective responsible section/department such as Training Section, Research and Planning Section including the Curriculum Development Center (CDC).

For the overall goal, "the CBT approach becomes a basis of the training structure of TVTO" has partially achieved. As for indicator 1 "CBT manual (final version) in Persian is produced", it was achieved. Regarding indicator 2 "Representatives (core instructors) of each TVTC take CBT training courses conducted by TVTO", it was achieved to some extent. Actually TVTO conducted CBT training courses for two times for 30 instructors/course, total 60 instructors. The documents shows that more than 16000 trainers from private and public- sector TVTCs were trained on CBT approach by 60 instructors those who took the training on CBT approach from 3 of core Instructors by CBT approach between 2011 and 2014<sup>7</sup>. However, due to lack of affiliation information about those trainers, status of achievement for indicator 2 was not able to be verified.<sup>8</sup>

As for impact, several positive impacts were observed. After project completion, TVTO developed the curriculum of remaining 11 UOC to complete the Automotive Certificate II level which was not covered by the two pilot training courses. In addition, TVTO newly developed three pilot training courses in industry, service and agricultural sector. Furthermore, 30 vocational training courses on the field of auto mechanics and related subjects have been designed by the Curriculum Development Center (CDC) of TVTO based on CBT approach.

There was no negative impact and the project did not associate with land acquisition and resettlement of the people.

Therefore, effectiveness/ impact of the project is fair.

(Note 2) Units of Competency (UOC) are the nationally agreed statements of the skills and knowledge required for effective performance in a particular job or job function—they describe work outcomes as agreed by industry (Source: National Skills Standard Council, Australia).

### Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project purpose) TVTO's training management cycle is improved.	(Indicator 1) Pilot training course is planned and implemented twice until the end of the project.	(Terminal Evaluation) Achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Two pilot training courses on the fields of "repair of electric system in auto mechanics" and the "inspection and maintenance of automobiles" were implemented with participation of seven instructors and 24 trainees.</li> <li>The pilot training courses covered 10 out of 21 Unit of Competence (UOC) in the Automotive Certificate II level.</li> </ul> (Ex-post evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>After the project completion, TVTO conducted two pilot training courses developed by the project with total 60 participants including instructors of Technical and Vocational Training Centers (TVTCs) and technicians of automobile industries and companies.</li> </ul>

<sup>5</sup> Although there were changes of counterpart department, local consultant could cover partly what was supposed to be done by the counterpart. (Mid-term Review Study Report (Japanese), p17)

<sup>6</sup> Confirmed by the URL: <http://research.iranvtto.ir/index.aspx?siteid=83&fkeyid=&siteid=83&pageid=3536>

<sup>7</sup> Confirmed by the Participant List (16,000 names are written down), made by Karaj ICT

<sup>8</sup> Regarding the route of dissemination of CBT approach, the ex-post evaluation could not verify if the process of implementation was carried out as proposed way in the Project Completion Report ( Japanese version p65). (Process to implement the course was proposed as follows; at development phase, course to be implemented at ITC, at pilot phase, course to be implemented at model TVTCs, and full scale implementation phase, course to be implemented at all TVTCs.)

	<p>(Indicator 2) Experiences and lessons from the implementation of pilot training course are analyzed and reported.</p>	<p>(Terminal Evaluation) Achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The following technical outputs were produced by the project based on the experiences and lessons from the implementation of pilot training course. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Introduction Program for Developing and Delivering a Competency Based Curriculum: Overview</li> <li>➤ Report on Interview Survey to Define Competency Standard for the First Cycle Pilot Training Course</li> <li>➤ Report on Interview Survey to Define Competency Standard for the Second Cycle Pilot Training Course</li> <li>➤ CBT Manual (incl. Manual on Competency Standard Development, Manual on CBT Delivery and Manual on Monitoring and Evaluation)</li> <li>➤ Workbooks for the first pilot training course and second pilot training course</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The technical outputs produced by the project have been utilized continuously by TVTO after the project completion.</li> </ul>
	<p>(Indicator 3) The trainees' satisfaction rate of pilot training is better than that of other courses.</p>	<p>(Terminal Evaluation) N.A.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It was difficult to compare trainees' satisfaction between pilot trainings and other ordinary courses of TVTO because there are differences in training contents and training environment. Therefore the terminal evaluation did not consider this indicator in making evaluation judgment.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post evaluation) N.A.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Addition to the reason pointed out at the terminal evaluation, Indicator 3 is for confirming the satisfaction level of pilot training courses but not for measuring whether the TVTO's training management cycle was improved or not, so this indicator cannot verify the achievement of the project purpose. Therefore, the ex-post evaluation does not consider this indicator in making evaluation judgment.</li> </ul>
	<p>(Indicator 4) Based on the experience and lessons from pilot training course, a plan for training management improvement is completed at the end of the project.</p>	<p>(Project completion) Achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The second edition of TVTO training management improvement plan (English version) was completed based on the result of discussions between the Japanese and Iranian sides at terminal evaluation.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>N/A</li> </ul>
<p>(Overall goal) The CBT approach becomes a basis of the training structure of TVTO.</p>	<p>(Indicator 1) CBT manual (final version) in Persian is produced.</p>	<p>(Ex-post evaluation) Achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CBT manual (final version) in Persian was produced.</li> </ul>
	<p>(Indicator 2) Representatives (core instructors) of each TVTC take CBT training courses conducted by TVTO.</p>	<p>(Ex-post evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>After the project completion, TVTO conducted CBT training courses for two times for 30 instructors/course(total 60 instructors).</li> <li>Around 93 TVTCs accounted for about 14% of 673 TVTCs in the country in total, delivered trainings on CBT approach.</li> </ul> <p>*note : At the ex-post evaluation, total number of TVTC is 673.</p>

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Interviews with counterparts

### 3 Efficiency

Although the project period was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 108%). In addition, although the outputs were produced as planned, additional inputs such as local consultants were required in order to undertake implementation of the planned activities which should had been implemented by the counterpart staff of the Iranian side. The frequent changes of the counterpart section/department as well as personnel and the decreased number of the trainers to be trained reduced efficiency of the project activities to produce the planned outputs<sup>9</sup>. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

<sup>9</sup> It is informed that personnel matters of TVTO was often intervened by political intervention (source: internal documents). Regarding the frequent changes of Counterpart department/section and person in charge was written in the mid-term review report (p.25), terminal evaluation report (p.23, p.32) and internal documents. Regarding the CBT approach was mentioned on terminal evaluation report (p.32.)

#### 4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, the CBT approach was approved by the Iranian government as a national approach in the field of TVTO Standards. However, the reform of the technical vocational training sector of the country by the Iranian government is still on going and it is expected to be completed by 2019.

Institutionally, TVTO continues to promote to institutionalize the training management cycle based on the CBT approach. The three counterpart instructors mainly received the technical transfer from the project have been working as important resource persons for promotion of CBT based training/CBT approach training as well as sharing their experience of the project to other staff. TVTO has been coordinating with Industry Reference Group (IRG) <sup>(Note 4)</sup>.

On the other hand, the ex-post evaluation could not analyze the technical and financial aspects because it was not able to collect the relevant information from TVTO.

From these findings, it is considered that the policy aspect should be continuously followed, and technical and financial aspects were not verified due to unavailability of information; therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

(Note 4) Industry Reference Group (IRG) is an advisory body of TVTO established by the project to discuss designs of training courses matched with industry needs. IRG consists of representatives from various types of automotive service and repair industry. IRG is an important mechanism for TVTO to introduce and expand the CBT system.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has achieved the project purpose and partially achieved the overall goal through improvement of TVTO's training management cycle including steps of needs assessment, establishment of training course standard and curriculum planning, and course monitoring and evaluation by introducing the CBT approach. As for impact, several positive impacts were observed such as (i) development of the curriculum of remaining 11 UOC to complete the Automotive Certificate II level which were not covered by the two pilot training courses, (ii) development of additional three pilot training courses in industry, service and agricultural sector, and (iii) designing of 30 vocational training courses on the field of auto mechanics and related subjects. As for sustainability, although the CBT approach was approved by the Iranian government as a national approach in the field of TVTO Standards, the reform of the technical vocational training sector of the country is still on going. Also it was difficult to evaluate the technical and financial sustainability due to lack of relevant information. The project cost slightly exceeded the plan.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- Since the number of the trained instructors is limited to 60, it is essential to increase the number of trainer's training and to increase the well-trained instructors in order to extend quality vocational trainings based on the CBT approach which has been introduced by the project.

#### Lessons learned for JICA

- In technical cooperation projects supported by JICA, technical transfer from Japanese experts to counterparts is the key process of capacity development in order to achieve the project purpose and the overall goal. Also, assignment of counterpart by the recipient country is the key inputs for technical cooperation. In the case of this project, the frequent changes in the counterpart unit/department hampered efficient implementation of the planned project activities to produce the outputs and to achieve the project purpose. Therefore, it is essential to carefully select the counterpart unit/department and to carefully target the counterpart staff to be transferred skills and knowledge from Japanese experts at the planning stage.
- The means such as documentation of the process and methods that the Project finalized as an output products can be the assets for the counterpart organizations which have the frequent human transfer within the relevant organizations.



(Conducting CBT Course for Trainers (1))



(Conducting CBT Course for Trainers (2))



(Conducting Automotive Course based on CBT)