

Country Name	Project for Capacity Strengthening on Labour-Based Technology Training at ATTI
United Republic of Tanzania	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Tanzania, only 10% in the total length of the roads under local governments were in good conditions due to insufficient maintenance caused by lack of financial resources. Under this situation, the Ministry of Infrastructure Development (MoID) announced a policy to utilize Labour Based Technology (LBT) for road construction and maintenance works in 1996. In addition, in December, 2003, MoID developed a program including preparation of basic policy of LBT, establishment of information center of LBT and establishment of core center of LBT training organization, in order to build a national framework to apply LBT in the country. In this context, the Government of Tanzania requested the Government of Japan technical cooperation to enhance training capacity of ATTI (Appropriate Technology Training Institute) under MoID.</p> <p>(note) MoID: MoID was divided in December 2010, into Ministry of Works (MOW) and Ministry of Transport (MOT). MOW is in charge of this project.</p>				
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: LBT* trainees (e.g. Local Government Authority (LGA), Contractors, Consultants, Tanzania National Road Agency (TANROADS), Community Groups, etc.) are able to plan, design and implement infrastructure works using LBT. Project Purpose: ATTI has an appropriate capacity for training provision and overall coordination as a national training institute for LBT in Tanzania. <p>(note) LBT: Labour-Based Technology is technology for construction and maintenance of public facilities in flexible and optimum manner based on quality control and economic efficiency by applying locally available resource and labour force.</p>				
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: ATTI in Rungwe District, Mbeya Region Main activities: Development of training curriculum, syllabus, training programs and training materials for LBT trainings, trainings for the trainers (ATTI officials), implementation of LBT training programs at ATTI, development of monitoring and evaluation system of LBT training programs, setting up of a unit for LBT promotion at ATTI, and Implementation of awareness campaign on LBT to decision makers, public and private sector partners. Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 6 persons Trainees received: 6 persons Equipment: Training equipment and machinery (tractor, trailer, towed grader, etc.), audio visual equipment, paving materials, and so on. Tanzanian Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 12 persons Land and facilities: land, buildings and facilities for the project, office spaces for the Japanese experts Training cost 				
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2006	Project Period	May 2006 to February 2011 (Original period: May 2006 - Mar 2010, Extension period April 2010- Feb 2011)	Project Cost	404 million yen
Implementing Agency	Appropriate Technology Training Institute (ATTI)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Eight- Japan Engineering Consultants Inc.				

II. Result of the Evaluation¹**1 Relevance**

This project has been highly relevant with Tanzania's development policy "construction and rehabilitation of rural road" as set in policy documents including, National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP) (2005), the Tanzania

¹ In the project, no target value was set for each indicator to verify degree of achievement of each output, the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal. Therefore, achievements for some indicators are assessed by analyzing the trends of those indicators from the beginning of the project to the end of the project or to the time of the ex-post evaluation. This is the same methodology of verification applied by the terminal evaluation, which was conducted in 2009. Further, supplemental information was collected to verify some indicators at the time of ex-post evaluation. .

Development Vision 2025, and National Rural Transport Program (N RTP). It has also been relevant with the development needs of improvement of capacity to implement infrastructure works using LBT at the time of both ex-ante and project completion. It was also consistent with Japan's Country Assistance Plan for Tanzania (2000) supporting for basic infrastructure including technical and administrative capacity development at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project developed training materials about LBT, conducted trainers' trainings and provided trainings of LBT, implemented M&E of training course and set up a unit for LBT promotion. Through these activities, the project aimed to improve capacity of ATTI to deliver LBT related trainings for officers of local governments and Tanzania National Road Agency (TANROADS). The trained officers would utilize the knowledge about LBT for planning, designing and implementation of road construction and rehabilitation works.

The Project Purpose was partially achieved. During the project period, 13 training courses were delivered in total and 459 participants from TANROADS, LGA and contractors were trained. The number of visitors to the Principal's Office of ATTI increased after the project started (see the details in the table below). The training curriculum and module developed by the project were expected to be "standard" in Tanzania since the training certification of ATTI was supposed to be a requirement for contractor to register with the Contractor Registration Board as LBT contractor. M&E manual was prepared in the first year but it had not been utilized because it was too complicating and difficult for users to fill in. The importance of M&E was highlighted and project period was extended for one more year in order to enhance M&E capacity. In terms of the Indicator 3 and 5, no data was available at the time of terminal evaluation because of no official evaluation were conducted by stakeholders and "Taking use of LBT to scale"² report was not issued.

After the project completion, the number of training courses and the participants at the time of ex-post evaluation, it has decreased since the participants from LGAs have also decreased despite the large training demand for regular LBT training courses of LGA officers. This is because the LGAs have not been able to allocate budget to shoulder training fees. In terms of quality of the LBT trainings at ATTI, no monitoring and evaluation (M&E) has been implemented due to lack of budget of ATTI at the time of the ex-post evaluation. The training curriculum and module developed by the project have been practically used as the standard in training at ATTI which is sole training institute for Tanzania. ATTI has been acknowledged as the national training institute for LBT in Tanzania by the International Labour Organization (ILO) and other training institutions including Kenya and Uganda. At the time of ex-post evaluation, official evaluations were still not conducted by stakeholders and in "Taking use of LBT to scale".

For the Overall Goal, there is no quantitative data to verify the achievement. This is because TULS report which was expected to report progress of utilization of LBT by conducting surveys was not actualized. It is observed that some of tenders introduced pre-requisites that technical staff should have training record in ATTI. TANROADS Regional offices in Mbeya, Tanga, Dodoma, Coast, and Kilimanjaro utilized their knowledge acquired by the training in the field of practical project management. In addition, ATTI recognizes that LBT work has been increasing.

As for other impacts, Somali officers were trained at ATTI under the JICA's third country training scheme and have been continuously applied the skills learnt after the project period. There was no negative impact observed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

Therefore, effectiveness/ impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results					
(Project Purpose) Improvement of capacity of ATTI for provision of trainings and coordination for LBT as a national training institute	Indicator 1: Number of courses and participants trained by ATTI increased compared with the one before the project (including large scale PMO-RALG (Prime Minister's Office, Regional Administration and Local Government) training)	- (Project Completion)In total, 13 training courses from 2005/06 to 2009/10					
		- In total, 459 participants attended those training courses from 2005/06-2009/10					
			2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10
		No. of training courses	2	3	1	4	3
		No. of participants	24	53	45	194	143
		source: Terminal Evaluation Report (2010 Oct)					
		(Ex-post Evaluation)					
			2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15 plan	
		Regular Course	0	0	1 (14)	2	
		Mobile Course	5 (Note) (108)				3
		Other Course	3 (32)				2

² A national framework for LBT, including the three components of policy formulation of LBT, establishment of LBT information center, and establishment of LBT training system.

		*() : No. of participants Note: mobile courses were conducted in Katavi, WPU, TANAPA				
	Indicator 2: Number of visitors to the Principal's Office of ATTI increased compared with the one in TFY (Tanzanian Fiscal Year) 2006	(Project Completion)2006	2007	2008	2009	2010
		87	168	209	162	110
		source: Terminal Evaluation Report (2010 Oct)				
	Indicator 3: Evaluation from related stakeholders on ATTI improved.	(Terminal Evaluation (Extension)) No data available (Ex-post Evaluation) No official evaluation by related stakeholders				
	Indicator 4: Standardizing training curriculum and module for LBT	(Project Completion)The training curriculum and module developed by the project were practiced in Tanzania. source: Terminal Evaluation Report (2010 Oct) (Ex-post Evaluation) They have been practically used as the national standard, but they have not been stipulated in any Acts/regulations.				
	Indicator 5: Evaluation of ATTI in "Taking use of LBT to Scale" report	(Project Completion)No data available due to no evaluation conducted. source: Terminal Evaluation Report (2010 Oct) (Ex-post Evaluation) No official evaluation conducted by Tanzanian side.				
(Overall goal) Improvement of capacity of LBT trainees to utilize knowledge for planning, designing and implementation of infrastructure works using LBT	Indicator 1: The ex-trainees can adapt the skills and knowledge to different situation and transmit it to the people he/she has to work with	(Ex-post Evaluation) No quantifiable data but some TANROADS and LGA offices have been continually procuring contractors using LBT for infrastructure works.				
	Indicator 2: X kilometers rural road constructed and/or maintained using LBT	(Ex-post Evaluation) Data not available.				

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Interviews with counterparts

3 Efficiency

Both of the project cost and period were exceed the plan (ratio against the plan: 144% and 121%) because of the extension of project period was necessary to enhance the capacity of counterpart staff of monitoring and evaluation to the planned level. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, although "Taking the use of LBT to Scale (TULS)" (December, 2003) by MoID is no longer effective at the time of ex-post evaluation, this project is still given importance in the current development policy, namely NSGRP2(2010) and the National Construction Industry Policy. They underline utilization of LBT as a key option in employment creation and poverty alleviation initiative through implementation of infrastructure works including road construction and maintenance. Further, the Local Government Transport Program 2 (LGTP2), the following phase of LGTP1³, has also launched.

Institutionally, MOW is in the last stages to merge ATTI and Morogoro Works Training Institute (MWTI) and provide the new institute with the legal status as a national institute for LBT training and for authorizing other related construction sector disciplines. . ATTI has been continuing trainings based on the training curriculum developed by the project and equipment installed by the project. In addition, ATTI has been continuously collaborating with other LBT related institutions in other countries by inviting other institutions as lecturers in ATTI training. In terms of promotion of LBT, although the number of staff of the section decreased from 4 in 2011/12 to 3 in 2012/13, the Promotion Information Section has continuously been functioning through participation to various exhibition events such as Nane-nane⁴, Public Service Week, LGA Week, Annual PMO-RALG Engineers' conferences and so on. For the system of provision of equipment for road works using LBT, ATTI is piloting equipment leasing system.

In the technical aspect, 12 trainers trained by the project have been continuously engaged in the training courses delivered by ATTI and the number of trainers has been sufficient to deliver the trainings. The trainers of ATTI have been maintaining their training skills and knowledge for the LBT training courses but no refresher training for further improvement and updating information has been available for the trainers so far due to the lack of budget. The training materials, curricula and syllabus developed by the project have been still core training materials for the LBT training courses at ATTI. Despite that the ex-trainees have been engaged in LBT contract works, no official evaluation of the ex-trainees capacity of LBT has been conducted due to lack of budget.

As for the financial aspect, LGTP2 estimated the total budget of 996.9 million USD⁵ for road construction and maintenance. Despite the delay of disbursement for new construction, maintenance budget allocation has started. LGTP emphasizes to utilize LBT for rural road development and maintenance; however there is no clear figure for LBT only. Also, the Road Fund Board (RFB) and PMO-RALG request LGAs to utilize LBT more than certain percentage of all road works and performance. The revenue of ATTI reduced from 818 million TZS in 2010/11 to 311 million TZS 2013/14 since other development partners'

³ Local Government Transport Program (LGTP) (2009-2012) prepared by PMO-RALG (Prime Minister's Office, Regional Administration and Local Government): "labour-based methods" as one of the Strategic Approaches.

⁴ 8th August, Agriculture day of Tanzania. On the day, agriculture related exhibitions take place.

⁵ The budget covers FY 2012/13- FY2016/17. 1 US dollar \approx 1663 Tanzanian Shilling as of September 2014

financial support through PMO-RALG has been terminated in 2012. The total expenditure of ATTI, including training and promotion cost, has been covered by the total revenue of ATTI. The training courses conducted based on participation fee paid by LGAs and other trainees' organization. Besides the training fee, ATTI has own revenue source from the LBT equipment leasing service which has started in 2011/12.

From these findings, it is considered that the project has some problems in technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency; therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has partially achieved the project purpose. ATTI standardized and improved quality of the LBT training courses and the trained LGA staff and contractors have been engaged in road construction and maintenance works using LBT despite of no quantifiable data. The enhanced training capacity of ATTI has been acknowledged as a quality LBT training institution by ILO and the neighboring country training institutions. However, achievement of project goal is not confirmed because two out of the five indicators defined in PDM were not verified due to lack of available data. Moreover, no data regarding achievement of the overall goal was available either. As for sustainability, NSGRP2 and the National Construction Industry Policy have endorsed the promotion of LBT-based construction works to increase employment opportunities. On the other hand, the number of training courses decreased due to the limited budgets allocated to LGAs and it brought about the reduction of ATTI revenue. While the trained trainers and the training materials have been sustained, no refresher training for the trainers and the M&E system for the ex-trainees have not been conducted. In terms of efficiency, the extension of project period to enhance capacity of the counterpart personnel increased the project cost.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

[ATTI] Since feedback from M&E should be reflected in curriculum and syllabus, M&E activities are crucially important to maintain and improve training quality. ATTI is recommended to conduct M&E activity considering practical approach within available budget and human resources such as monitoring activities by phone-calls instead of visits in person.

[PMO-RALG and MOW]

For ensured dissemination of LBT, PMO-RALG and MOW are recommended to consider accelerating participation from LGAs and contractors so that regular training will be conducted steadily. For example, admitting reallocation of RFB road maintenance fund for training budget in LGAs, and setting training record by ATTI as pre-qualification in tendering for LBT contract might be the strategies for improvement.

Lessons learned for JICA

-In this project, M&E manual was prepared in 1st year but it had not been utilized because it was too complicated and difficult for users to fill in. The importance of M&E was highlighted and project period was extended for one more year in order to enhance M&E capacity. At the ex-post evaluation, the activities introduced by project were observed but implementation of M&E activities by ATTI was not realized after the project completion due to financial constraints. Hence, because the total project period was 4 years, M&E should have been emphasized more and undertaken with much consideration for counterparts to easily use from the beginning stage.

- At the time of ex-post evaluation, it is observed relevant agencies have little incentives to receive the training and there are budget constraints for the implementation of the LBT related activities. Based on these facts, it is recommended that the project should have intervened and involved not only ATTI under MOW, training institute, but also PMO-RALG and LGAs, the key counterparts in rural road construction and management at the field level, so that they could have established the system for training participation of LGAs during the time of project implementation and project sustainability could have been strengthened.

- In this project, most of the data to measure achievement of indicators for project purpose were not obtained sufficiently. Further, those of overall goal were not available either since TULS report was not actualized. As a result, this ex-post-evaluation could not obtain any relevant quantitative data. Therefore, it is recommended for other similar projects to set indicators which are surely obtainable and measurable during the project and at the time of the ex-post evaluation.