

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project		
Country: Plurinational State of Bolivia (hereafter referred to as Bolivia)		Project: The Project of Establishment of Implementation System for Sustainable Rural Development Phase II(hereafter referred to as the Project)
Sector: Rural Development		Type of Cooperation: Technical Cooperation Project
Responsible Agency: Field Crop Based Farming Area Division, Rural Development Department, JICA		Amount of Cooperation: 380 Million Yen
Period of Cooperation:	(R/D): From 22th May 2009 to 21st April 2014	Local Related Agencies: University of San Francisco Xavier(hereafter referred to as USFX), Government of Chuquisaca Prefecture, Beneficiaries of 9 Municipalities
	(Extension): NA (F/U) : NA	Japanese Collaborating Agency: NA Another relative collaboration: NA
1-1. Background and Profile of the Cooperation		
<p>The northern Chuquisaca is one of the poorest areas which the poverty rate is more than 90% in Bolivia. As a result that exploitation agriculture has been practiced in limited areas of cultivation, land suitable for cultivation has been reduced and land productivity has been deteriorated caused by large-scale soil erosion and depletion of water resource, and farmers engaged in subsistence agriculture and stock farming which accounts for many of the residents has had distressed life.</p> <p>In order to demonstrate technical improvement plan, Japanese government (through Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fishery) conducted JGREEN (Japan Green Resources Corporation) for the prevention of erosion of agricultural land from 1999 to 2003 in the Department of Chuquisaca. These results were compiled as methods for the planning of rural development and the prevention of erosion. The survey demonstrated technical guidelines for the conservation of soil. On the other hand, the organization system to implement projects by those methods is still not established.</p> <p>To solve this problem, in response to the request of the Government of Bolivia, the International Cooperation Agency of Japan (hereinafter will be referred to as JICA) conducted a technical cooperation project “Project of Establishment of Implementation System of Sustainable Rural Development” with the implementing agencies, the University of San Francisco Xavier (hereinafter will be referred to as USFX) , the Interior Department of Chuquisaca (referred to hereafter as the Interior) and 4 municipalities in the project areas for two years from January 2006 to January 2008. In this cooperation, surveys for planning development, the training of human resources related to rural development and financial resource in 8 communities in 4 municipalities were conducted.</p> <p>Subsequently, in response to the additional request of the government of Bolivia, JICA is conducting a technical cooperation project “Project of Establishment of Implementation System of Sustainable Rural Development phase II” (referred to hereafter as “the project”) during the period of 5 years from May 2009 to May 2014, expanding the areas to 36 communities in 9 municipalities in the north of the department of Chuquisaca. The project aims to establish processes from planning to implementation as a “Rural Development</p>		

Model Centering on the Recovery and Conservation of Natural Resources by Local Residents” and to build the system for the implementation of sustainable rural development based on the results of Phase I.

1-2. Cooperation Overview

(1) Overall Goal:

Rural development model is extended and the quality of life of small farmers in the Northern Department of Chuquisaca is improved.

(2) Project Purpose:

Model and implementation body for sustainable rural development and its implementation system is established through implementing rural development projects in the Northern Department of Chuquisaca.

(3) Outputs:

Output1: Core human resource in agricultural rural development is trained in communities, municipalities (implementation agencies), the Government and USFX (support agencies).

Output2: Process from plan to implementation of rural development is modeled through implementation of agricultural community development plan based on rural development plan.

Output3: Development fund implementation of agricultural community development plan is procured by municipalities and the government.

Output4: Organizations system to implement sustainable integrated rural development is established in municipalities, government and USFX in the north of the department of Chuquisaca.

(4) Inputs:

Japanese Side:

380 Million Yen

Long term dispatch expert :	3 persons
Short term dispatch experts :	4 persons
Equipment :	1,680,406.44 Bolivianos (28 Million yen)
Local cost :	5,487,665.84 Bolivianos (95 Million yen)
Training in Japan/3 rd Country :	11 persons

Bolivian Side :

Counterpart : 27 persons (Total numbers)

Land and Facilities

2. Evaluation Team and Period			
Evaluation Members:	Mr. Kenichi KATO	Team Leader	Director Field Crop Based Farming Area Division, Rural Development Department, JICA
	Mr. Hitoshi KUBO	Rural Development	Chief, Project Coordinator Section Design Division, Kinki Regional Agricultural Administration Office, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
	Mr. Ryosuke MURAKAMI	Cooperation Planning	Field Crop Based Farming Area Division, Rural Development Department, JICA
	Mr. Akihiro MOCHIZUKI	Evaluation Analysis	Consultant, ICONS Inc.
	Ms. Setsuko OTAKI	Interpreter	JICE
Period of Evaluation:	23/Nov 2013 - 7/Dec/2013 (15 days) (Team Leader, Rural Development, Cooperation Planning, Interpreter) 14/Nov 2013 – 7/Dec/2013 (24 days) (Evaluation Analysis)		Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation
3. Summary of Evaluation Results			
3-1. Verification of the Project's Achievement			
(1) Achievement of outputs			
Output1: Core human resource in agricultural rural development is trained in communities, municipalities (implementation agencies), the Government and USFX (support agencies)			
<i>Indicator 1-1: 10 teachers of USFX, 8 technicians of government, 9 extension workers of municipalities, 9 municipality planners, and each community leaders are trained.</i>			
<i>Indicator 1-2: Training materials and the curriculum is developed reflecting the results of the implementation of the courses.</i>			
<i>Indicator 1-3: Training course for technicians is conducted and trainings for farmers is conducted 2 times annually in a section for research, interaction and training of human resources of USFX.</i>			
Indicators 1-1 and 1-3 are achieved and indicator 1-2 is partially achieved. Therefore Output 1 is mostly achieved.			
In Indicator 1-1, it is confirmed that targeting number of trainers to be trained in each relevant organization is achieved.			
In Indicator 1-2, it is confirmed that training materials is prepared reflecting the results of the implementation of the courses. The curriculum will be created after establishment of “Rural Development Center” in USFX.			
In Indicator 1-2, trainings for technicians were conducted 24 times and trainings for farmers were conducted 211 times in the project.			

Output 2: Process from plan to implementation of rural development is modeled through implementation of agricultural community development plan based on rural development plan.

Indicator 2-1: The 36 communities in 9 municipalities have their own plan for rural development.

Indicator 2-2: A technical list that can be utilized for the conservation of natural resources and the improvement of life is developed based on the result of monitoring and evaluation of each mini project and pilot project.

Indicator 2-3: Methodology of participatory planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of integrated rural development activities is summarized as a development cycle.

Indicator 2-1 is mostly achieved. Indicator 2-2 and 2-3 expect to be achieved within the project period.

Output 3: Development fund for implementation of agricultural community development plan is procured by municipalities and the government.

Indicator 3-1: process of funds procurement is summarized.

Indicator 3-2: Extension workers, planners and municipalities responsible for Government and USFX comprise the application process for funding application.

Indicator 3-3: In 36 communities the funding application documents are properly prepared for integrated rural development projects.

Indicator 3-4: Fund procured in 36 communities in 9 municipalities is utilized.

All indicators (3-1, 3-2, 3-3, 3-4) are achieved.

In Indicator 3-1, manuals on fund procurement process are completed.

In Indicator 3-2, 3-3 and 3-4, more than 20 times seminars and technical trainings are implemented and person in charge acquired knowledge of various fund procurement process. As a result, appropriate applications are prepared and procured fund is utilized.

Output 4: Organizations system to implement sustainable integrated rural development is established in municipalities, government and USFX in the north of the department of Chuquisaca.

Indicator 4-1: The Coordination committee is established for integrated rural development in the north of the department of Chuquisaca, and role of municipalities, Interior and USFX is agreed.

Indicator 4-2: The coordination committee is held regularly to consult and to coordinate the activities of integrated rural development.

Due to political conflict between the implementing agencies, the project aim to establish organizations

system to implement sustainable integrated rural development without the coordinating committee. Therefore, indicator 4-1 and 4-2 expect not to be achieved by the end of the project. However organizations system to implement sustainable integrated rural development is practically established. In other words, Output 4 is practically achieved.

(2) Prospect of achievement for project purpose

Model and implementation body for sustainable rural development and its implementation system is established through implementing rural development projects in the Northern Department of Chuquisaca.

Indicator 1: More than one good practice which can be presented as a rural development model is implemented in each municipality.

Indicator 2: Necessary staff is allocated to implement the model of rural development in Government, USFX and municipalities.

Indicator 3: Sections in charge of research, interaction and training of human resources is established in the Faculty of Agricultural Sciences USFX to support the activities of integrated rural development and the necessary staff is allocated.

Indicator 1 is completed. Indicator 2 and 3 are mostly achieved. Establishment of the sections for support of the integrated rural development projects and allocation of the necessary staff are mostly completed based on the policy of USFX.

Therefore the project purpose is achievable in the rest of the project period.

3-2. Summary of Evaluation

(1) Relevance: High

Necessity in target area

Chuquisaca department is a distinctive highland (over 4000m altitude) area and one of the poorest areas in Bolivia with the poverty rate above 90%. The extractive agriculture that has been practiced over years in this valley region has brought soil erosion and depletion of water resources. As a result, suitable area for cultivation and the productivity of the land are reduced and the level of poverty in the area is deteriorated.

In addition to increasing of the productivity of traditional agricultural production, improvement of the quality of life through other income generation is essential. The project aims to increase food productivity and generate revenue through integrated rural development based on recovery and conservation of natural resources, agricultural development and social development.

Therefore, the project is consistent with the need to subject areas, society and the target group of the project.

Integrity with development policy of Bolivian government

“Agenda Nacional 2025” which was published following “the National Development Plan 2006-2011” also gave priority for improvement of food productivity. Food sovereignty and food security was set as a purpose for the rural development in “the Development Plan of Cultivation Sector 2011-2015” published by Ministry of Rural Development and Land. The plan also shows eight policies containing

the cultivation production for food sovereignty and food security, productive development of cultivation, income generation, sustainable production surplus and access to irrigation water. Since the project aims to contribute to improvement of the quality of life of farmers through integrated rural development, it is consistent with the policy of Bolivian government.

Integrity with assistance policy of Japanese government

Japanese government focuses on “Support for sustainable economic growth” and “support for social development for poverty reduction” as main components of assistance. Also Japanese government attaches great importance to the assistance through social development and rural development from the point of poverty reduction. The project aims to improve the living standards of rural residents and is consistent with aid policy of the Japanese government and the national policy of JICA.

Relevance of Project approach

The target area of the Project had been selected by Bolivian side. The area is located near the urban area where the people live in extreme poverty without basic infrastructure such as water supply, electricity and so on. The northern part of Chuquisaca province is the slope area and soil erosion is likely to occur, moreover the annual rainfall is low. The project aims to promote sustainable rural development based on the recovery and conservation of natural resources (sustainable management of soil, water and vegetation) through activities that improve cultivation production and revenue. Therefore There is relevance in the approach of the project..

(2) Effectiveness: Relatively High

Prospect of Achievement for the Project Purpose

The Outputs 1, 2, 3 will be achieved during the Project period and the Output 4 remains.

Due to political discord among related organization, the coordination committee consisted from the prefectural government, municipalities and USFX has not been held. This lack of collaboration and cooperation among related organizations made negative effect towards the activities of the project.

Regardless of insufficient relationship among related organizations, the implementation system that each organization conducts each project independently is prepared. Based on this system, the model “Rural Development Model Centering on the Recovery and Conservation of Natural Resources by Local Residents” is established. Therefore, the project purpose is mostly achieved.

Relationship between Outputs and Project / Promoting Factor

By above political factors, the flow from the Outputs to the Project purpose becomes different from the way expected. The relationship between the original outputs and the original project purpose is not assumed problem. The flexible modification of the flow from the Outputs to the Project purpose considering of the political external circumstances can be cited as a promoting factor for the project purpose.

(3) Efficiency: High

Project implementation management

Due to the apparent disagreement towards implementation process and structure, it was inadequate coordination among the related organization, especially with municipalities. Regardless of insufficient relationship among related organizations, each organization conducts each project successfully.

Japanese inputs

Japanese inputs (professional, Training in Japan, third-country training, provision of equipment, local business expense) are considered adequate and appropriate for proceeding the Project activities, and used for smooth and efficient implementation of the Project activities.

In addition, it is considered high contribution for the improvement capacities of counterparts and farmers thorough the exchange experiences and technology program that have been implemented in Bolivia and third countries so far.

Bolivian inputs

Until November 2013, 27 counterparts have been assigned. The breakdown is as follows: 11 persons from USFX, 16 persons from the municipalities. It is not counted prefectural government of Chuquisaca as a counterpart because of the political discord among related organization.

(4) Impact: Relatively High

Prospect of achievement for overall goal

The project positive impact begins to expand due to disseminate of rural development model in the target villages. It is confirmed of certain impacts have started appearing that can lead to overall goal achievement.

Others

Positive effects have been confirmed such as women's participation to the Project through harvesting fungi, improving financial management capacity of village through the saving for maintenance and repair cost of mill that was granted by the Project, furthermore children could attend school without absence due to release from daily fetching water work.

(5) Sustainability: High

Policy aspect

In policy aspect, due to National Development Plan, Agenda National 2025 in both national and prefectural level have come out of the following plan like natural food production, resource and environmental protection. It is expected to utilize continuously the outputs

Organizational aspect

In organization aspect, both USFX and Government of Chuquisaca Prefecture have been dedicating for rural development as an organization so the implementation structure will be continued after the Project. In USFX, the agricultural engineers who have participated to the Project also will be deployed in rural development program. Meanwhile Government of Chuquisaca Prefecture has employed the agricultural engineers who have been employed by the Project for implementation to its own rural development program. In this circumstance, the sustainability in organizational aspect is also considered as high.

Financial aspect

In financial aspect, USFX has stable financial base through dividend distribution by cement company hold its stocks in addition to the revenue of hydrocarbon tax. Meanwhile Government of Chuquisaca Prefecture also set aside 5 years budget for rural development program up to 2018. Each organization has

its own financial base for continuity of rural development.

Technical aspect

Regarding technical aspect, agricultural engineers of USFX have acquired the capacity to elaborate the suitable development model for each village and to implement in the field using the technical lists which were prepared by the Project. Considering the circumstances, there is sustainable perspective in technical aspect.

3-3. Promoting factors

It can be said a promoting factor of the project purpose that the project flexibly changed the plan in the face of political conflict between the implementing agencies as mentioned in “3-2. Summary of Evaluation, (2) Effectiveness, Prospect of Achievement for the Project Purpose”.

3-4. Inhibiting factors

In Bolivia, staffs and policy of the organization are changed significantly when local government chiefs alternates. In this project, Counter parts and policy of the organization are changed when local government chiefs alternated. This can be said one of the inhibiting factors.

3-5. Conclusion

It is concluded that achievement of indicators are generally high, also outputs and project purpose are almost achieved. In addition overall goal will be achieved after the Project.

In regard to evaluation with DAC five criteria, relevance, effectiveness, impact and sustainability are evaluated as “High”, efficiency are “Relatively high”. In conclusion, the Project will be concluded in May 2014 as scheduled.

3-6. Recommendations

Implementing organizations of the Project should disclose and disseminate the “model of rural development” which was developed by the Project to those who have interest for rural development of department of Chuquisaca in order to be known to and utilized outputs.

It is desired for each organization which is involved in rural development of department of Chuquisaca that should respect one another the position and activities of other organizations then dedicate mutual agenda and task for rural development.

3-7. Lessons Learnt

The key point for smooth project operation is to establish good coordination among various implementing organizations. In the beginning of this Project, the coordination and linkage among related organizations worked very well. However, it has turned into difficult situation to maintain the good relation among these organizations due to the political discord among related organization.

According to the experience, it could be contribute smooth implementation of project to define a main organization which will take initiative for implementation and other organizations will collaborate as supporting organization instead of related to project as equal partner in the future.