

Summary of Terminal Evaluation Results

I. Outline of the Project		
Country:	Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi	Project Title: Project on Capacity Building for the Customs Administrations of the Eastern African Region (Phase 2)
Sector:	Fiscal and Financial management	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in Charge:	Public Governance and Financial Management Division, JICA HQs	Total cost (as of the time of evaluation): 780 million yen
		Implementing organizations: Revenue Authorities in 5 countries: KRA (Kenya); TRA (Tanzania); URA (Uganda); RAA (Rwanda); OBR (Burundi)
Cooperation Period	(R/D): July 6, 2009 (Kenya); November 6, 2009 (Rwanda); November 27, 2009 (Tanzania); February 26, 2010 (Uganda); September 22, 2010 (Burundi)	Organization in Japan: Customs and Tariff Bureau, Ministry of Finance
	September 2009 - September 2013	
<p>1. Background of the Project</p> <p>The Eastern African region aims for the sustainable economic growth through promoting the trade and distribution, and one of the important issues is to facilitate the Customs clearance. In order to facilitate the Customs clearance, the region has promoted One Stop Border Post (OSBP), a system contributed to the smooth distribution by streamlining Customs clearance procedures once (One Stop), which usually takes two steps, one in exporting countries and the other in importing countries.</p> <p>JICA implemented the “Project on Capacity Building for the Customs Administrations of the Eastern African Region (Phase 1)” for the Republic of Kenya (hereinafter referred to as “Kenya”), the United Republic of Tanzania (hereinafter referred to as “Tanzania”) and the Republic of Uganda (hereinafter referred to as “Uganda”), and established an OSBP Operational Model in order not only to improve the capacities of Revenue Authority (RA) in each country, but also to operate the OSBP system properly, while implementing the pilot projects (ICT equipment application and joint border surveillance: JBS) in Namanga (the border of Kenya and Tanzania) and Malaba and (the border of Kenya and Uganda).</p> <p>Through the phase 1, some lessons and suggestions have been drawn out as follows. 1) In order to introduce and implement the OSBP at borders, it is needed to continuously improve the capacities of Customs officers, such as knowledge and skills on the Customs Valuation (CV), HS Classification (HS) and Intelligence Analysis (IA); 2) It is needed to implement and expand the pilot projects (OSBP Operational Model and OSBP ICT system, namely, Real Time Monitoring System (RTMS)/ Cargo Control System (CCS), and JBS/Joint Water Surveillance (JWS) in other sites; and 3) In order to realize the streamlining Customs clearance, it is needed to improve the capacity of Customs Clearing Agents.</p> <p>Under these circumstances, the “Project on Capacity Building for the Customs Administrations of the Eastern African Region (Phase 2)” is implemented for four years as the cooperation period, from</p>		

September 2009 to September 2013, for the full East African Community (EAC) member countries of the Republic of Burundi (hereinafter referred to as “Burundi”), Kenya, the Republic of Rwanda (hereinafter referred to as “Rwanda”), Tanzania and the Republic of Uganda (hereinafter referred to as “Uganda”).

2. Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

Smooth and efficient Customs clearance is carried out with support of proper operation of OSBP.

(2) Project Purpose

Smooth and efficient Customs clearance at borders is strengthened under OSBP Concept with constructive relationship between Customs Administrations and Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents.

(3) Outputs of the Project

Output 1: The capacity of Customs administration is enhanced.

Output 2: Compliance level and capacity of Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents are enhanced through the strengthened function of Customs Clearing & Forwarding Agents Associations.

(4) Inputs (As of May 2013)

Japanese side

Japanese experts: 3 positions of long-term experts (total five experts): Chief Advisor/Customs Administration, Regional Cooperation, and Coordinator/Human Resource Development, 1 short-term expert in Customs Clearing Agents, and 50 short-term experts in total in the fields of Customs Clearing Agents Compliance, Master Trainers Programme (MTP) in Human Resource Development, Customs Valuation (CV), HS Classification (HS), and Intelligence Analysis (IA), Development of Policy Framework for the Accreditation System and Namanga D.D.

Other experts and consultants: 1 local consultant in ICT for OSBP with RTMS/CCS, and 10 experts from WCO as lecturers. In addition, consulting firms for Namanga D.D study, for the study on the Regional Accreditation System of Customs Clearing and Forwarding agents (CCFA) in the region, for Evaluation of Master Trainer Programme (MTP), for a study on the Accreditation System, and for Development of Policy Framework for Accreditation System for CCFA are deployed

Equipment: approximately JPY 262 million.

Trainees received: 71 participants, for Bench Marking Study Tours (BMST) to Vietnam and Malaysia. 22 participants for BMST in Japan

Local cost: approximately JPY 340 million in total as of May 2013

Five (5) East African countries' Side

Counterpart: 1 Project Director and 1 Project Manager in each of 5 countries (10 officers in total); 8 OSBP Working Group members: 3 from KRA, 3 from TRA and 3 from URA; 5 officers for Management Unit (MU) and 53 officers for 3 Working Group members of Master Trainers Programme (MTP). Also, 11 JBS/JWS Team members: 4 from KRA, 3 from TRA and 4 from URA; and task force for capacity building of CCFA comprising 3 members from each RAs, 1 from EAC, 1 from EA business

council and 7 from CCFA associations; and 1 senior officer from KRA for Project administration.

Facilities: Project office provided in KRA with electricity and land line telephone covered by KRA.

Operational expenses: In-kind cooperation as follows: Logistical arrangements for MTP activities including as training venue, meals and domestic transport made by host RAs; All the cost subject to the participation of the trainees of the Probationary Training in MTP activities; Operation cost of JBS/JWS born by participating RAs; Travel compensation for WG members to participate in MTP activities born by RAs to cover the difference in allowance between JICA and RAs; Domestic transport arrangement for Regional Joint Coordinating Committee (RJCC) participants made by host RAs; Domestic transport arrangement for JICA experts on business trip; and Expense for quality assurance for RTMS/CCS (borne by KRA) was made by RAs.

II. Evaluation Team

Members of the evaluation team	Koji OSHIKIRI (Leader)	Director, Public Governance and Financial Management Division, Industrial Development and Public Policy Department, JICA
	Kensuke TSUJI (Cooperation planning)	Deputy Director, Public Governance and Financial Management Division, JICA
	Yoshiro BABA (Customs administration)	Director for Technical Cooperation, Customs and Tariff Bureau, Ministry of Finance
	Tomokazu KURAMOTO (Customs administration)	Deputy Director for Technical Cooperation, Customs and Tariff Bureau, Ministry of Finance Tokyo Customs
	Masahiro KIKUCHI (Customs clearance 1)	Hakodate Customs
	Shingo TANAGAMI (Customs clearance 2)	アールクエスト
	Yukari KAWAHARA (Evaluation analysis)	
Evaluation Period	November 7-29, 2013	Evaluation type: Terminal Evaluation

III. Overview of Evaluation Results

1. Current achievements of the Project

(1) Outputs

Output 1: *The capacity of Customs administration is enhanced.*

Indicators	<p>1-1. Detailed Design of Namanga OSBP Facility is completed.</p> <p>1-2. All the cargo clearance processes by Customs and other stakeholders at Namanga, Malaba and Busia go through RTMS/CCS.</p> <p>1-3. All Working Group members of MTP are certified as Master Trainers by Revenue Authorities.</p> <p>1-4. MTP Handbooks of Customs Valuation, HS Classification and Intelligence Analysis which are produced by WG members are recognized as regional and national training materials by Revenue Authorities, EAC and WCO.</p> <p>1-5. SEO, BCC and WCC meetings for JBS/JWS are organized regularly by partner Customs administrations at Namanga, Malaba, Busia, Gatuna/Katuna, Kobero/Kabanga and Lake Victoria.</p> <p>1-6. The results of JBS/JWS activities which are carried out jointly by partner Customs administrations at Namanga, Malaba, Busia, Gatuna/Katuna, Kobero/Kabanga and Lake Victoria are regularly reported.</p> <p>1-7. Meetings between Customs administrations and Customs Clearing & Forwarding Agents are regularly held to exchange each other's views/challenges in their daily business.</p> <p>1-8. A draft Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for Customs Clearing & Forwarding Agents is developed.</p>
------------	---

Achievement of Output 1 is summarized in the following. In terms of level of achieving Outputs, some activities are still on-going, and may not be completing by the end of the Project period.

1-1. Detailed Design of Namanga OSBP Facility is completed.

Achieved.

D/D of Namanga OSBP was completed in March 2011.

1-2. All the cargo clearance processes by Customs and other stakeholders at Namanga, Malaba and Busia go through RTMS/CCS.

Not achieved. Partially practiced at Namanga.

RTMS/CCS has been in use among Customs officers at Namanga since Feb. 2013. Trainings to other government agencies for operationalizing the RTMS/CCS at Namanga are planned.

RTMS/CCS would be applied to other borders in the region, after necessary improvement of the RTMS/CCS is completed.

1-3. All Working Group members of MTP are certified as Master Trainers by Revenue Authorities.

Achieved.

53 WG members were successfully certified as MTs in the fields of CV, HS and IA. 6 officers (4 CV and 2 HS) were successfully accredited as the WCO accredited trainers.

1-4. MTP Handbooks of Customs Valuation, HS Classification and Intelligence Analysis which are

produced by WG members are recognized as regional and national training materials by Revenue Authorities, EAC and WCO.

Achieved.

Handbooks are in conformity with the WCO's standards and recognized as training materials by respective RAs and EAC. They have been delivered to the RAs and have been utilized in the trainings to the Customs officers and CCFAs.

1-5. SEO, BCC and WCC meetings for JBS/JWS are organized regularly by partner Customs administrations at Namanga, Malaba, Busia, Gatuna/Katuna, Kobero/Kabanga and Lake Victoria.

Partially achieved.

SEO, BCC and WCC meetings for JBS/JWS are periodically held by stakeholders, but not regularly held at all the places.

1-6. The results of JBS/JWS activities which are carried out jointly by partner Customs administrations at Namanga, Malaba, Busia, Gatuna/Katuna, Kobero/Kabanga and Lake Victoria are regularly reported.

Practiced.

Records of JBS/JWS are taken regularly by the RAs and reported to the Project team, RJCCs.

1-7. Meetings between Customs administrations and Customs Clearing & Forwarding Agents are regularly held to exchange each other's views/challenges in their daily business.

Meetings between Customs administrations and CCFA are held in respective countries, but not regularly.

1-8. A draft Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for Customs Clearing & Forwarding Agents is developed.

To be achieved by the end of the Project period.

Output 2: Compliance level and capacity of Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents are enhanced through the strengthened functions of Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents associations.

Indicators	2-1. Training plan which meets the expectation of Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents for improving their capacities is jointly developed by Customs administrations and Customs Clearing & Forwarding Agents Associations.
------------	--

Achieved.

Training plan for CCFAs was developed. Based on the plan, training activities to CCFAs have been implemented since Nov. 2010 in order to enhance their knowledge and skills.

(2) Project Purpose

Smooth and efficient Customs clearance at borders is strengthened under OSBP concept with constructive relationships with the Customs agents.

Indicators	<p>1. Clearance time of cargoes from the time of declaration to issue of release order at Namanga, Malaba and Busia is reduced by proper operation of RTMS/CCS.</p> <p>2. Trainee's satisfactory/ understanding ratings on trainings by Working Group members of MTP exceed 80% as practical to apply for their daily business.</p>
------------	---

- | | |
|--|--|
| | <p>3. JBS/JWS are taken as effective deterrent measures against smuggling and anti-social activities by the local communities at Namanga, Malaba, Busia, Gatuna/Katuna, Kobero/ Kabanga and Lake Victoria.</p> <p>4. Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents is developed.</p> <p>5. Trainee's satisfaction/ understanding ratings on trainings by WG members of MTP to Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents exceed 80% as practical to apply for their daily business.</p> |
|--|--|

Since achievement on some indicators is difficult to measure in a quantitative basis at the time of terminal evaluation due to the lack of information of both baseline and impact survey, those indicators have been qualitatively assessed based on reviews of activities made.

1. Clearance time of cargoes from the time of declaration to issue of release order at Namanga, Malaba and Busia is reduced by proper operation of RTMS/CCS.
It is difficult to assess at the time of terminal evaluation since RTMS/CCS has just been in operation for Customs officers at Namanga border post.
2. Trainee's satisfactory/ understanding ratings on trainings by Working Group members of MTP exceed 80% as practical to apply for their daily business.
Achieved.
According to the report of the Evaluation Panel, the WG members were assessed as rating in more than (80% (ratings ranged in 83-91%), which they are equipped with professional knowledge and skills.
3. JBS/JWS are taken as effective deterrent measures against smuggling and anti-social activities by the local communities at Namanga, Malaba, Busia, Gatuna/Katuna, Kobero/ Kabanga and Lake Victoria.
Partially achieved and in Progress.
Introduction of JBS/JWS with partner countries has shown positive impact on the advancement of surveillance since there had been no bi-lateral activities on cross border areas before. On the other hand, objective assessment is not applicable.
4. Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents is developed.
Difficult to achieve.
It is expected that a draft Policy Framework will be developed in July 2013. There has been a general understanding among the stakeholders to move forwards consolidating ideas of the Regional Accreditation System. However, it seems difficult to complete the Policy Framework with a due consensus among stakeholders since it may take longer time to let them understand in depth.
5. Trainee's satisfaction/ understanding ratings on trainings by WG members of MTP to Customs Clearing & Forwarding agents exceed 80% as practical to apply for their daily business.
Achieved and further in Progress.
More than 90% of training participants answered that they are satisfied with training contents in general. 70-90% of participants answered that they could use/ apply new knowledge into daily business.

2. Evaluation by Five Criteria

(1) Relevance

The relevance of the Project is considered very high for the following reasons.

The Project Purpose and Overall Goal remain relevant in connection with the development policy of five EAC countries. In the EAC member countries, streamlining and modernization of Customs administrations are highly prioritized in terms of realizing trade facilitation, which will be one of the key motives for economic development in the region. The Project Purpose is also consistent with the Japanese government's commitment in supporting the OSBP initiatives in Africa under the TICAD framework.

The needs for human resources development for Customs officers and CCFAs remain very high in the region in accordance with the aims stipulated above.

Means and approaches of technical transfer in the Project were also very appropriate and highly appreciated according to the result of interviews and questionnaires. Technical advantages and deep knowledge of Customs administration was well demonstrated and delivered by the Japanese experts in the trainings and other activities.

(2) Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the Project is considered moderate for the following reasons.

Project Purpose will not be fully achieved by the end of the Project period. While some indicators of the Project Purpose have already been achieved or are in progress to achieve, others are unlikely to be achieved. Introduction of RTMS/CCS to other governmental agencies at Namanga as well as expected roll outs to other borders is yet to be carried out. It may need some more time to finalize a draft Policy Framework for Regional Accreditation System for CCFAs.

On the other hand, it is evaluated that the Project has contributed significantly to raising capacity of Customs officers through completing MTP, as MT's have become important human resource assets of both national and regional level.

Necessary coordination and information exchange with other donors have been carried out at certain occasions to create a synergy for the OSBP operationalization in the EAC.

None of OSBP facilities construction has been completed at any border post in the EAC region at the time of Terminal Evaluation. The delay of construction has caused the modification of design of RTMS/CCS in order to be operational even before the completion of construction of facilities, and additional provision of equipment such as back-up power and network connectivity was required. This process also influenced to a delay of the entire schedule of the development of RTMS/CCS.

Moreover, while there are general consensus among other relevant governmental agencies on the introduction of RTMS/CCS through series of awareness raising activities, actual introduction and use of RTMS/CCS to the other governmental agencies were not realized by the time of terminal evaluation partly due to the delay of construction.

(3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is considered moderate for the following reasons.

There are some activities, which produced Outputs as a result of an efficient use of the Project inputs while other activities are underway to realize some of Outputs by the end of the Project. It is also pointed out that there is some room to improve efficiency in terms of the Project cost and implementation structure of the Project.

As for achieving Outputs, 5 out of 9 planned indicators for Outputs 1 and 2 are already completed and 1 is in progress to be completed by the end of the Project period. Full operationalization of RTMS/CCS including involvement of other governmental agencies as well as its roll out is unlikely to be completed by the end of the Project period, mainly due to the situation of assumptions mentioned above.

Inputs of both long-term and short-term experts were generally appropriate and their knowledge, approaches, capability on teaching and coordination were highly appreciated by the CPs of the member countries.

Supplied equipment is found to be utilized effectively in general, and maintained well. However, there are some rooms for further efficient use of equipment such as the boat supplied for the JWS and equipment provided for the RTMS/CCS in Malaba and Busia. As for JWS, although there were some difficulties for effective implementation due to budgetary constraints and the matter of collaboration among relevant agencies, relevant RAs have tried to solve the challenges by developing an action plan within this year based on the recommendation in the last RJCC.

The development of RTMS/CCS which is regarded as one of the key software application necessary for OSBP operation has been highly expected. During course of consideration on the development, needs of CPs have been flexibly reflected, for instance, some additional functionalities such as “Temporary Vehicle Export/Importation”. While the Project has hired one IT consultant to develop the application, it is pointed out at the terminal evaluation that further input could be considered to ensure better coordination with relevant CPs in terms of smooth introduction and establishment of sound operation and maintenance mechanism in a timely manner. On the other hand, there was a fact that additional budget became necessary in order to strengthening hardware and network environment for proper operation of the system. Although this additional cost could be regard as necessary investment for introducing and rolling out the RTMS/CCS to the region without losing its momentum, it could have been advised that relevant stakeholders could have identified and shared the necessary scopes and the associated hardware and software costs and necessary measures for proper operations at the designing stage.

At the initial stage of the Project, PDM have not necessarily been well integrated to guide the concrete approach, activities and target indicators of the Project, which was originally expected to be done at this stage. The Project experts have tried to flexibly meet the needs of CPs without baseline. As for the Project design, the PDM has been revised based on the recommendation made at the Mid-Term Review. But limitation of inputs for long-term expert was one of challenges to conduct baseline at that moment as well as strengthening of monitoring mechanism based on the PDM while the experts needed to deal with a variety of on-going activities.

It is judged that inputs of CPs were appropriately made within their affordable capacities.

It is pointed out that turn-over of substantial numbers of trained officers from RAs or changes in their duties especially related to the MTP activities may cause some risks to lessen the expected Output as an asset of human resources in the Customs office.

The delay of construction of OSBP facilities has caused some obstacles for the smooth development of RTMS/CCS. The delay of the approval of OSBP act may have caused some challenges in efficient operations of JBS.

As for implementation structure of the Project, the semi-annual RJCC has been functioning well in terms of reviewing progress of the Project activities and getting decision on the way forward, in

particular, with the top level of the RA's management. On the other hand, awareness of CPs on the necessity to monitor the progress and achievement in accordance with PDM was rather insufficient although each level of PCs has paid sufficient attention to the Project and showed their will to take part in the activities. It was also pointed out that this challenge was partly because of unclear scope and indicators of the original PDM.

(4) Impact

Impact of the Project is prospected to be high in the following reasons:

Overall Goal: Smooth and efficient Customs clearance is carried out with support of proper operation of OSBP.

Indicators	<p>Within two years after the construction of OSBP facilities at Namanga, Malaba and Busia,</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Clearance time of cargoes from the time of declaration to issue of release order reduce to within 4 hours on average. 2. OSBP operational model at Namanga, Malaba and Busia spread to other areas in the region as a key model. 3. Certified Master Trainers are consistently involved in the annual training program of respective Revenue Authorities and EAC. 4. Concept of Joint Border/Water Surveillance spread to 10 sites in the region. 5. Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for CCFAs is authorized in EAC.
------------	---

It is hard, in general, to foresee in an accurate manner on the possibility of realizing Overall Goal two year after the completion of Project. Regarding the 4 planned indicators in the PDM, to the extent to be foreseen some prospects towards achieving the Overall Goal, present progress are summarized as follows:

1. Clearance time of cargoes from the time of declaration to issue of release order reduce to within 4 hours on average.
2. OSBP operational model at Namanga, Malaba and Busia spread to other areas in the region as a key model.

As for two indicators above, it can be possibly achieved, but depends on the construction progress of the OSBP facilities.

3. Certified Master Trainers are consistently involved in the annual training program of respective Revenue Authorities and EAC.

Necessary for further initiative to achieve.

The certified MTs at every RAs are occasionally engaged in the training activities. However, each RA except RRA is yet to have a concrete plan to officially and regularly utilize the MTs as resources for trainings.

4. Concept of Joint Border/Water Surveillance spread to 10 sites in the region.

On the right track to the expansions of activities.

JBS have been expanded at 5 border areas in the Project, while JWS has not been really active since the beginning of 2013. It is expected that this concept would be expanded since necessity and

importance of JBS/JWS are highly recognized among relevant stakeholders.

Indirect impact is appearing as seen in the case of Kenya which has been seeking the similar approach of JBS with Ethiopia.

5. Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for CCFAs is authorized in EAC.

Difficult to foresee at the timing of terminal evaluation.

Achievement of the indicator depends on future progress of EAC's approval process on Policy Framework of Accreditation System to be submitted to EAC.

As for other impact, there has been advancement in the development of OSBP Bill, relevant regulations on border control and other frameworks related to Customs administration of EAC since the Project started. The outcomes and initiatives produced by the Project such as resources of MTs, handbooks, RTMS/CCS would not only be an important national asset of respective countries but also assets and experience of the EAC region. In this sense, the Project contributed to consolidating efforts of the EAC integration, and enhancing technical capacity on the Customs administration in the EAC as a whole.

(5) Sustainability

It is too early to evaluate sustainability on results during the Project period. Followings are the observation based on available information through document review, interviews on current activities.

As for policy and institutional aspects, policies of the 5 EAC member countries on seeking modernizing of Customs modernization and realization of the OSBP concept will not be changed.

As for organizational and financial aspects, its sustainability differs by RAs. Human resources development is a key issue for each agency and KRA, RRA, TRA and URA have their own training institutions with full time trainers while OBR has just started training since May 2013 with its own lecturers as a result of the MTP in the Project. There is some risk to secure sufficient budget in training and operation and maintenance of equipment to implement the same volume and range of activities carried out during the Project although each agency allocates necessary budget when necessity arise.

As for technical aspects, it is desirable that each RA considers how they maintain and expand acquired knowledge and skills of MTs with developing concrete plans to utilize them. It is observed that there are numbers of technical staff at ICT sections, who operate and maintain them in a proper manner in all 5 countries.

3. Factors contributing or inhibiting achievement of Outputs

(1) Contributing factors

- Activities where Japanese technical advantage can be executed are included in the MTP by selecting fields such as CV and HS.
- Development of RTMS/CCS is included in the Project plan, which contribute to facilitating discussions on the improvement of clearance procedures under the OSBP in the course of considering design of the system.
- Consistent and timely support from cooperating organizations in Japan and WCO that dispatched short-term experts for the successful implementation of MTP.
- Raising awareness on the necessity of joint surveillance by conducting JBS/JWS.

(2) Inhibiting factors

- Unclear indicators in the PDM may have caused less utilization of the PDM as a monitoring tool.
- Delay of approval of OSBP bill and construction of OSBP facilities have affected the smooth implementation of the development of RTMS/CCS and JBS/JWS.

4. Conclusion

As a result of terminal evaluation, it is concluded that some remaining activities which are yet to achieve the expected target in the current phase should be continuously dealt with in the succeeding Project. Among all activities which are successfully completed, the success of MTP which has created 53 certified Master Trainers is one of remarkable outcome which could be a good impact for enhanced Customs administration in respective RAs and EAC.

Relevance is very high because the Project is in line with necessity and priority of the 5 member countries and target groups. Effectiveness is evaluated moderate. Project Purpose will not be fully achieved by the end of the Project. While some activities such as MTP has completed successfully, there are remaining tasks which should be continued in the next phase. Efficiency is moderate since all Outputs are not necessarily completed within the Project period and equipment provided should have been utilized more effectively and efficiently. Impact is prospected to be high. Prospect of achieving the Overall Goal is in general not measurable at the time of terminal evaluation due to incomplete construction of OSBP facilities, but the Project has contributed to create basis of the EAC integration and consolidation on Customs administrations. It is too early to evaluate sustainability on results during the Project period. Necessary discussions and measures to ensure sustainability should be taken place between the Project Team and the RAs.

IV. Recommendations

The Project and relevant CPs are recommended as follows:

- (1) To continue necessary activities for introducing the RTMS/CCS to other governmental agencies at Namanga with a concrete plan of sensitization and training for relevant officers. It is also necessary to take into consideration the possible change of operational flow after the restructuring of governmental agencies in Kenya.
- (2) To consider a sustainable implementation structure and necessary inputs for roll out of RTMS/CCS to Malaba and Busia, taking into account ensuring good coordination with other ICT system which is carried out by relevant countries or other international donors.
- (3) To make preparatory measures including the development of operational manuals or necessary coordination among stakeholders for the introduction of OSBP in a timely manner.
- (4) To consider necessary measures for sustainable utilization of MTs in respective RAs.
- (5) To activate JWS activities base on the action plan developed by respective countries.
- (6) To develop a draft Policy Framework on the Regional Accreditation System for Customs Clearing &

Forwarding agents as scheduled.

- (7) To identify the remaining issues which should be continuously dealt with in the succeeding Project based on the progress until the completion of the current phase.
- (8) To further strengthen partnership with WCO taking into account utilizing and enhancing MTs by dispatching them to WCO workshop, for instance.

V. Lessons Learned

(OSBP introduction and operation)

- (1) The delay of construction of OSBP facility at Namanga has affected the progress of the Project activities. In addition, JBS/JWS operation is, to some extent, subject to the establishment of legal framework. Since a various factors such as legal framework, infrastructure, relevant procedures/regulations and ICT would be influencing the smooth introduction of OSBP, it is essential to carefully examine the pre-condition and important assumptions of the Project prior to the launch of the Project.
- (2) It is also desirable to modify the plan of operations in a flexible manner during the implementation stage taking into account the situation and progress of such assumptions.

(Project management)

- (1) In case of the large scale regional Project, it is necessary to properly share a detailed plan of operations with a clear scope and targeted indicators and baseline information among stakeholders at the beginning stage of the Project in order to ensure proper management of the Project.
- (2) In order to fully utilize the PDM as a monitoring tool, it is also necessary to ensure in depth understanding by CPs on the PDM and to strengthen a monitoring structure between Japanese experts and CPs.
- (3) It is expected to carefully consider the capacity of CPs to utilize and maintain equipment and proper timing of procurement to ensure effective use of equipment provided.