

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

| | | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Outline of the Project | | |
| Country : People's Republic of China | | Project title : Project on Human resource Development in Western Region of China |
| Issue/Sector : Conservation-Sustainable Use of Natural Resources | | Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation Project |
| Division in charge: JICA China office | | Total cost : about 267 million Yen |
| Period of Cooperation | Mar.1, 2010 - Feb.28, 2014 | Partner Country's Implementing Organization : State Academy of Forestry Administration, Provincial/Autonomous region Bureau of Forestry and Forestry Academy of pilot provinces (Sichuan, Shaanxi, Ningxia and Guangxi) |
| | | Supporting Organization in Japan : Forestry Agency |
| <p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>Western region of People's Republic of China (hereinafter referred to as "China") has the water source points of Chang Jiang and the Yellow river, thus, the region is regarded a crucial location in terms of environmental protection. While its importance, the western region of China has scarce forestry resources, and desertification in the region has seriously been continued. Although it is recognized the importance of promoting environmental protection in the western China, a series of actions for environmental protection including afforestation had been facing difficulties because of severe climate conditions such as dry/highlands/chilly climate, and a lack of human resources.</p> <p>Most forests in China are either collective forest, which is managed by local people (groups), or national forest; therefore, these forests need to be managed in proper manner for enhancing forest protection. In this line, the Chinese government placed importance onto the promotion of Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm. However, the pace of promoting these reforms was not so fast as expected due to severe natural conditions in the regions and insufficient number of human resources who can deal with these reforms implementation.</p> <p>In this context, a project implementation was requested by the Chinese government, whose objective is to develop an effective training system for forestry sector personnel on Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm. In response to this request, JICA started to implement the Project, namely "Project on Human resource Development in Western Region of China" from March 2010 to February 2014.</p> <p>1-2 Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal:</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm are promoted in western region of China through dissemination of the training system on both reforms, which targets forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose:</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">Training system for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels is developed through the activities at pilot provinces and autonomous regions. The developed system is to promote Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm, whose system can be applied to the western region of China.</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">* Pilot area: Sichuan, Shaanxi, Ningxia and Guangxi</p> <p>(3) Outputs:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Cooperation and coordination among related departments and organizations of forestry bureaus of provinces and autonomous regions are strengthened for trainings on both reforms at pilot areas. 2) Training system for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels is developed at pilot area. 3) Information sharing and exchange on the reform's policy, good practices, references and the training system is enhanced through various manners. | | |

| | | | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|
| (4) Inputs | | | |
| Japanese side: | | | |
| Long-term Expert | 5 persons | Equipment | 3,461,000 Yuan |
| Short-term Expert | 7 persons | Local cost | 80,633,000 Yen |
| Trainees received | 25 persons | | |
| Chinese Side: | | | |
| Counterpart (C/P) | 58 persons | Local Cost | 6,536,000 Yuan |
| 2. Evaluation Team | | | |
| Members of Evaluation Team | Leader | Deputy Director, JICA China Office | Miyazaki Suguru |
| | Forestry management | Director, International Forestry Cooperation Office, Forest Agency | Akahori Satoshi |
| | Forestry sector training | Executive Technical Advisor to the Director General Global Environment Department, JICA Headquarters | Goseki Kazuhiro |
| | Evaluation planning | JICA China Office | Hayashi Kenji |
| | Evaluation planning | JICA China Office | Li Feixue |
| | Evaluation Analysis | Sano Planning Co., Ltd | Totsukawa Jun |
| Period of Evaluation | October 20, 2013 –November 5, 2013 | | Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation |
| 3. Results of Evaluation | | | |
| 3-1 Accomplishment of the Project | | | |
| 3-1-1 Achievement of the Outputs | | | |
| (1) Output 1: Achieved | | | |
| 1) Leaders groups were established, which were composed of manager and director class personnel of line departments and organizations at pilot areas. | | | |
| 2) Leaders groups and forestry academies hold coordination meetings before and after trainings for the purpose of reporting the results and gaining lessons for the continuous actions. | | | |
| (2) Output 2: To be achieved by the end of project period | | | |
| [Reform of collective forest right system] | | | |
| 1) Training curricula and texts for county level personnel on the reform was developed 4 sets each. | | | |
| 2) Trainings were conducted at each forestry academy for county level personnel as well as the level at township and town. The number of the participants and trainings is 951 persons and 22 times each as of November 2013. | | | |
| [Reform and development on national forest farm] | | | |
| 1) Training curricula and texts for both forest farm directors and technical officers on the reform will be developed 4 sets each by January 2014. | | | |
| 2) Trainings were conducted at each forestry academy for county level personnel. The number of the participants and trainings is 1,053 persons and 23 times each as of November 2013. | | | |
| [Both reforms] | | | |
| 1) The participants of the trainings understand the contents well, whose 99% answered “understand” according to the training evaluation results. In addition, 99% of them have conducted extension training, which is to disseminate their learning contents to their colleagues. Monitoring survey for the effectiveness of training was conducted in 2012. | | | |
| (3) Output 3: To be achieved by the end of project period. | | | |
| 1) The Project team exchanged opinions with the State Forestry Administration on the reform of forestry rights. In addition, training for leaders of provinces, and seminars on Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm were | | | |

conducted twice each.

- 2) The Project started its homepage in JICA web site in 2011, and updated the project news, and related data and information.

3-1-2 Achievement of the Project Purpose (To be achieved by the end of project period)

- 1) Each forestry academy of provinces and autonomous regions of pilot area made “Training implementation manual” and “Training system manual”, taking consideration of its own regional condition.
- 2) Each forestry academy of provinces and autonomous regions of pilot area will develop training curricula and texts on both reforms by January 2014.

3-1-3 Achievement of the Overall Goal (prospect)

The overall goal is possibly achieved by the target period.

The State Forestry Administration has a plan to deliver its opinion regarding enhancement of training for forestry sector leaders. The opinion delivered by the administration is likely to refer to the training system that the Project developed. This government’s initiative can lead to achievement of the overall goal.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation

(1) Relevance : High

The Project is relevant with the Chinese development policies such as “The Twelfth Five-Year Plan” by the government, and Forestry sector specified “The Twelfth Five-year Plan” for forestry sector development by the State Forestry Administration. In addition, the Project meets the Japanese policy for assistance to China. Moreover, the targeted beneficiaries group of the Project, who are county and/or lower administration level personnel also met with the regional needs. The Project was able to effectively utilize the Japanese technical knowledge and experiences as well. In this line, it is evaluated that the Project is relevant.

(2) Effectiveness : High

Judging from the achievement level of the indicators of the PDM, the Project Purpose has been mostly achieved and is likely to be achieved by the end of the Project. In addition, the Project Purpose is being achieved as results of the achievement of the Outputs.

(3) Efficiency : Moderate

Judging from the achievement level of the indicators of the PDM, the production level of the Outputs is acceptable along with the planned schedule. The inputs of both Japanese and Chinese side have been done as planned; and have contributed the production of the Outputs. Training in Japan was also an effective input to enhance the counterparts’ capacity, which led to improvement of training contents.

(4) Impacts : High

- 1) Training system developed by the Project has already been introduced in other training courses at forestry academies of pilot provinces and autonomous regions.
- 2) Training in Japan provided chances with trainees to make personal network and to share information among trainees in addition to training opportunities. In the case of China, it is difficult to build personal network with other province due to its geographically large country. The training by the Project functioned to reinforce such opportunities.

(5) Sustainability : High

1) Policy aspect:

Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm are a part of major actions by the government towards ecological preservation and environmental protection. Capacity development in forestry sector is likely to be stressed further its importance in this line.

The State Forestry Administration is about to show direction in strengthening training activities more in relation with improvement of leader-class training. Training system by the Project possibly be introduced in its direction presented by the administration. Application of the Project’s training system can be enhanced from policy aspect.

2) Organizational aspects:

The State Academy of Forestry Administration has a reasonable organizational structure composed of divisions/departments in charge of training plan, curricula, texts, and selection of instructors. The Academy is evaluated to have sustainable organizational structure.

3) Financial aspect:

Capacity development for personnel working for Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm was regarded as important actions by the government; therefore, a half of the training cost in the Project was covered by the Chinese side. Budgetary arrangement for trainings can be prospected, as the Chinese government is showing intention to strengthen capacity development for personnel at both administration stratum and field levels.

4) Technical aspects:

The State Academy of Forestry Administration is technically able to disseminate the training system in the western region, which needs to proceed with the instruction by the State Forestry Administration regarding leader-class personnel training.

Pilot provinces have sustainable technical skills and knowledge at a certain level through participation in the Project activities.

3-3 Factors that promoted realization of effects

Survey on economic activities at forest area, which is now conducted by the third party as of the terminal evaluation period, is expected to function for improvement of the training contents.

3-4 Factors that impeded realization of effects

Nothing special

3-5 Conclusion

The Project has been implemented as scheduled, and the Project Purpose is considered to be achieved by the end of the Project. All the five evaluation categories such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability are almost secured. Thus, the Project will be terminated in February 2014 as planned.

3-6 Recommendations

(1) Issues to be done by the end of the Project

1) Development of “Training implementation manual”, “Training system manual”, and model curricula and texts.

- The State Academy of Forestry Administration needs to edit and/or develop “Training implementation manual” and “Training system manual”, curricula and texts those can be applied to the western region. In detail, indexes of trainings, texts that are showing good practices and legal issues are the targeted outputs.

2) Sharing and dissemination of outputs

- The Project’s outputs need to be uploaded on the Academy’s internet site, called as Forestry education training network by the end of February, 2014, by coordination of the international cooperation division of The State Academy of Forestry Administration. It is a necessary action for sharing information within the western region-wide beyond the pilot areas, and also for promoting Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm.

(2) Issues to be done after the end of the Project for its sustainability

- The State Academy of Forestry Administration needs to play central role for assisting forestry academies in the western region as they develop and apply the training system on Reform of collective forest right system, and Reform and development on national forest farm. The Academy should promote the actions on the basis of the instruction by the State Forestry Administration.
- While disseminating the training system in the western region, the Academy needs to share and disseminate not only hardware outputs such as manuals, curricula, and texts, but also software

outputs such as the way of training management. In this line, as the 4 pilot sites in the Project already fully share information and experiences among them, these 4 sites should be utilized as models for trainings.

3-7 Follow-up situation
Nothing special